



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion**  
**The Record of Proceedings**

Dydd Mercher, 2 Mai 2012  
Wednesday, 2 May 2012

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |     |  |
|-----|--|
| 3   | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau<br>Questions to the Minister for Education and Skills  |
| 25  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau<br>Questions to the Minister for Local Government and Communities                             |
| 49  | Cwestiwn Brys: Cyllideb y GIG<br>Urgent Question: The NHS Budget   |
| 52  | Cynnig i Sefydlu'r Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog<br>Motion to Establish the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister              |
| 53  | Cynnig i Ethol Aelodau'r Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog<br>Motion to Elect Members to the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister |
| 54  | Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar Iechyd y Geg mewn Plant<br>The Children and Young People Committee's Report on Children's Oral Health    |
| 74  | Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Y Dreth Gyngor<br>Welsh Conservatives Debate: Council Tax   |
| 99  | Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Llywodraeth Leol<br>Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: Local Authorities   |
| 119 | Cyfnod Pleidleisio<br>Voting Time  |
| 126 | Dadl Fer: Gofal Hosbis a Gofal Lliniarol yng Nghymru<br>Short Debate: Hospice and Palliative Care in Wales   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.*

**The Presiding Officer:** The National Assembly for Wales is now in session. **Y Llywydd:** Dyma ddechrau trafodion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau Questions to the Minister for Education and Skills**

### **Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig**

**1. Rebecca Evans:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gymorth i ddysgwyr ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. OAQ(4)0117(ESK)*

**The Minister for Education and Skills (Leighton Andrews):** Support for school learners who have special educational needs is the responsibility of the relevant local authority. Later this session, we shall be going out to consultation on our proposals to reform the statutory framework for supporting additional learning needs.

**Rebecca Evans:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. Higher and further education placements are more likely to succeed if there is a managed and planned transition into them. Transition key workers are vital to making the process go smoothly. Will you provide an update on the outcomes of the Welsh Government's transition key worker pilot schemes and your plans for the next steps?

**Leighton Andrews:** The Member for Mid and West Wales has demonstrated a long-standing interest in these issues, both in the Chamber and in previous roles. I am pleased to say that we have made good progress with the pilot schemes, not just with the pilot scheme on transition key workers, but with the other additional learning needs pilot schemes that we have been carrying out. As I said, we will be going out to consultation, in preparation for the legislation, and we will be reporting more fully then on the impact of those pilot schemes.

**Angela Burns:** Minister, building on Rebecca Evans's question, when you go out to consultation, will you also consider asking

### **Special Educational Needs**

**1. Rebecca Evans:** *Will the Minister make a statement on support for learners with special educational needs. OAQ(4)0117(ESK)*

**Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau (Leighton Andrews):** Cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod lleol perthnasol yw cymorth i ddysgwyr ysgol ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Yn ddiweddarach yn y sesiwn hon, byddwn yn ymgynghori ynghylch ein cynigion i ddiwygio'r fframwaith statudol ar gyfer cefnogi anghenion dysgu ychwanegol.

**Rebecca Evans:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Mae lleoliadau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach yn fwy tebygol o lwyddo os yw'r pontio iddynt yn cael ei reoli a'i gynllunio. Mae gweithwyr pontio allweddol yn hanfodol i wneud y broses yn un esmwyth. A wnewch chi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ganlyniadau cynlluniau peilot gweithwyr pontio allweddol Llywodraeth Cymru a'ch cynlluniau ar gyfer y camau nesaf?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r Aelod dros Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru wedi dangos diddordeb ers tro yn y materion hyn, yn y Siambr ac mewn swyddogaethau blaenorol. Rwyf yn falch o ddweud ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd da gyda'r cynlluniau peilot, nid yn unig â'r cynllun peilot ar weithwyr pontio allweddol, ond gyda'r cynlluniau peilot eraill ar gyfer anghenion dysgu ychwanegol yr ydym wedi bod yn eu cynnal. Fel y dywedais, byddwn yn ymgynghori, i baratoi ar gyfer y ddeddfwriaeth, a byddwn yn adrodd yn llawnach bryd hynny ar effaith y cynlluniau peilot.

**Angela Burns:** Weinidog, gan adeiladu ar gwestiwn Rebecca Evans, pan fyddwch yn ymgynghori, a wnewch chi hefyd ystyried

for people's views on the best way of managing the transition when a parent and child do not agree with where the local authority believes the child should go for further or higher education? We now have people resorting to very costly legal resource; Careers Wales is unclear as to its role in the process and there is a lot of chaos around this particular issue. I would be very interested to know what you think the Government could do to clear that up and create a sound way forward.

**Leighton Andrews:** The Conservative spokesperson is right to raise the issue of parents being in conflict with some of the judgments of local authorities in respect of additional learning needs. Indeed, we know that there have been significant numbers of appeals against decisions by local authorities. I have discussed these issues with the president of the Special Educational Needs Tribunal for Wales. These are certainly the kind of issues that we will want to explore in a consultation; I invite the Member to submit evidence to that consultation.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, mae addysg ar gyfer plant ag anghenion arbennig yn eithriadol o bwysig. Cyfeiriaf eich sylw at blant sydd angen addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, yn arbennig y plant hynny sydd ar y sbectrwm awtistaidd. A allwch gynnal archwiliad i weld bod yr un lefel o ddarpariaeth addysgiadol ar gael ledled Cymru i blant sydd angen addysg gyfrwng Cymraeg ag sydd ar gael trwy gyfrwng y Saesneg?

**Leighton Andrews:** Deallaf ei farn ar y pwnc. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod y byddwn yn ceisio asesu'r broblem yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad yn y dyfodol agos. Felly, derbyniaf y pwynt.

gofyn am farn pobl am y ffordd orau o reoli'r pontio pan na fydd rhiant a phlentyn yn cytuno â lle y mae'r awdurdod lleol yn credu y dylai'r plentyn fynd i gael addysg bellach neu addysg uwch? Mae gennym sefyllfa yn awr lle mae pobl yn troi at adnoddau cyfreithiol costus iawn; nid yw Gyrfa Cymru yn glir o ran ei rôl yn y broses ac mae llawer o ddryswch yn y mater penodol hwn. Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mawr gwybod beth, yn eich barn chi, y gallai'r Llywodraeth ei wneud i ddatrys y mater a chreu ffordd gadarn ymlaen.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae llefarydd y Ceidwadwyr yn iawn i godi'r mater lle mae rhieni yn gwrthwynebu rhai o benderfyniadau awdurdodau lleol mewn perthynas ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol. Yn wir, gwyddom fod nifer sylweddol o apelïadau wedi bod yn erbyn penderfyniadau gan awdurdodau lleol. Rwyf wedi trafod y materion hyn gyda llywydd Tribiwnlys Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig Cymru. Mae'r rhain yn sicr yn fath o faterion y byddwn am eu harchwilio mewn ymgynghoriad; rwyf yn gwahodd yr Aelod i gyflwyno tystiolaeth i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, education for children with special educational needs is exceptionally important. I draw your attention to children who need education through the medium of Welsh, particularly those on the autistic spectrum. Can you conduct an inquiry to ensure that the same level of educational provision is available throughout Wales to children that require education through the medium of Welsh as is available through the medium of English?

**Leighton Andrews:** I understand his view on the subject. It is important to recognise that we will endeavour to assess the problem during the consultation in the near future. Therefore, I accept the point.

**Peter Black:** A short time ago, I attended the launch of the Beyond Vision project at Neath Port Talbot College. You will know that many young people have to leave Wales in order to access the further education life skills training that they want or need because of their additional needs. The Beyond Vision project would result in blind and partially-sighted learners being able to stay in Wales for their education. Do you support that project and can you envisage it being spread out further around Wales?

**Leighton Andrews:** That is a good example of a significant project in this area, and a number of Members have drawn attention to it in the past. I know that the Member will recall from his time as chair of the education committee in the second Assembly that a whole series of such issues relating to both out-of-county and out-of-country provision were raised then. As we take this agenda forward, these are some of the things that we want to engage with and they will occur during the course of our consultation. He will also recall that, shortly after taking over as Minister for education in early 2010, I established a task and finish group on post-16 special educational needs. As part of the consultation, we will be taking forward some of the remaining recommendations of that group.

**Kenneth Skates:** The number of individuals with disabilities studying at Glyndŵr University has increased fourfold in the last three years. Many come from my constituency of Clwyd South. Part of the institution's mission in recent years has been to widen access for those who face barriers to attending university; indeed, it has worked in partnership more recently with Autism Cymru and the Welsh Government. Will you look at how every university across Wales can open up higher education to a wide range of people and ensure, in particular, that students with a disability have access to a more effective transition to university so that they are able to compete with their peers on a level playing field?

**Leighton Andrews:** Indeed. Higher education institutions have a responsibility

**Peter Black:** Ychydig yn ôl, roeddwn yn bresennol yn lansiad prosiect Beyond Vision yng Ngholeg Castell-nedd Port Talbot. Gwyddoch fod yn rhaid i lawer o bobl ifanc adael Cymru er mwyn cael mynediad at yr hyfforddiant addysg bellach ar sgiliau bywyd y mae arnynt ei eisiau neu ei angen oherwydd eu hanghenion ychwanegol. Byddai'r prosiect Beyond Vision yn golygu bod dysgwyr dall a rhannol ddall yn gallu aros yng Nghymru i gael eu haddysg. A ydych yn cefnogi'r prosiect hwnnw ac a allwch rag-weld y bydd yn cael ei ddatblygu ledled Cymru?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae hwnnw'n enghraifft dda o brosiect pwysig yn y maes hwn, ac mae nifer o Aelodau wedi tynnu sylw ato yn y gorffennol. Gwn y bydd yr Aelod yn cofio o'i gyfnod fel cadeirydd y pwyllgor addysg yn yr ail Gynulliad fod cyfres gyfan o faterion o'r fath, sy'n ymwneud â darpariaeth y tu allan i sir a darpariaeth y tu allan i wlad, wedi'i chodi bryd hynny. Wrth inni symud yr agenda hon yn ei blaen, dyma rai o'r pethau yr ydym am fynd i'r afael â hwy a byddant yn digwydd yn ystod ein hymgyngoriad. Bydd hefyd yn cofio, yn fuan ar ôl cymryd yr awenau fel y Gweinidog Addysg ar ddechrau 2010, y bu imi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar anghenion addysgol arbennig ôl-16. Fel rhan o'r ymgynghoriad, byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â rhai o argymhellion y grŵp hwnnw sy'n weddill.

**Kenneth Skates:** Mae nifer yr unigolion ag anableddau sy'n astudio ym Mhrifysgol Glyndŵr wedi cynyddu bedair gwaith drosodd yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf. Daw llawer ohonynt o'm hetholaeth sef De Clwyd. Rhan o genhadaeth y sefydliad yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf yw ehangu mynediad ar gyfer y rheini sy'n wynebu rhwystrau i fynyachu prifysgol; yn wir, mae wedi gweithio mewn partneriaeth yn fwy diweddar gydag Awtistiaeth Cymru a Llywodraeth Cymru. A wnewch chi edrych ar sut y gall pob prifysgol ar draws Cymru sicrhau bod addysg uwch ar gael i ystod eang o bobl a sicrhau, yn arbennig, bod myfyrwr ag anabledd yn cael mynediad at bontio mwy effeithiol i brifysgol fel eu bod yn gallu cystadlu gyda'u cyfoedion ar yr un lefel?

**Leighton Andrews:** Gwnaf, yn wir. Mae gan sefydliadau addysg uwch gyfrifoldeb o dan

under current equalities legislation to make reasonable adjustments and provide support to students with a disability. Widening access and disability premium funding is allocated by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales to assist institutions to do that. The percentage of full-time undergraduates in receipt of disabled student allowances was higher in Wales in 2010-11 than it was across the UK as a whole and in the other home nations.

### **Buddsoddi mewn Addysg**

**2. Nick Ramsay:** *Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i fuddsoddi mewn addysg ym Mynwy. OAQ(4)0119(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Schools in Monmouthshire will benefit from the pupil deprivation grant and from our commitment to raise school spending by 1% above the block grant that we receive from the UK Government.

**Nick Ramsay:** Thank you for that response. I am sure that you will join me in congratulating Conservative-controlled Monmouthshire County Council, which has worked with the Welsh Government over the last few years to rebuild the primary school stock. Will you commit to continuing to work with Conservative-controlled Monmouthshire County Council over the next four years to help it to replenish the secondary school stock in the authority?

**Leighton Andrews:** I will certainly not prejudge the outcome of any event that may be taking place tomorrow. I am sure that the Member will want to congratulate the Welsh Government on its investment in school capital in Monmouthshire. There will be an estimated investment over the next period of some £79.5 million in capital projects in Monmouthshire, including five secondary schools and seven primary schools, with Welsh Government investment at a rate of 50%.

### **Gweithredu Strategaeth y Gymraeg**

**3. Alun Ffred Jones:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y camau i weithredu Strategaeth y Gymraeg.*

ddeddfwriaeth cydraddoldeb bresennol i wneud addasiadau rhesymol a darparu cymorth i fyfyrwyr ag anabledd. Mae cyllid premiwm anabledd ac ehangu mynediad yn cael ei ddyrannu gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru i gynorthwyo sefydliadau i wneud hynny. Roedd canran yr israddedigion amser llawn sy'n cael lwfansau myfyrwyr anabl yn uwch yng Nghymru yn 2010-11 nag yr oedd ar draws y DU yn gyffredinol ac yn y gwledydd cartref eraill.

### **Investing in Education**

**2. Nick Ramsay:** *What plans does the Minister have to invest in education in Monmouthshire. OAQ(4)0119(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Bydd ysgolion yn sir Fynwy yn elwa o'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion ac o'n hymrwymiad i godi gwariant ar ysgolion 1 y cant yn uwch na'r grant bloc a gawn gan Lywodraeth y DU.

**Nick Ramsay:** Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw. Rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymuno â mi i longyfarch Cyngor Sir Fynwy, sydd o dan reolaeth y Ceidwadwyr, sydd wedi gweithio gyda Llywodraeth Cymru dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf i ailadeiladu'r stoc ysgolion cynradd. A wnewch chi ymrwymo i barhau i weithio gyda Chyngor Sir Fynwy, sydd o dan reolaeth y Ceidwadwyr, dros y pedair blynedd nesaf i helpu i ailgyflenwi'r stoc ysgolion uwchradd yn yr awdurdod?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn sicr ni fyddaf yn rhagfarnu canlyniad unrhyw ddigwyddiad a allai ddigwydd yfory. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelod am imi longyfarch Llywodraeth Cymru am fuddsoddi mewn cyfalaf ysgolion yn sir Fynwy. Dros y cyfnod nesaf amcangyfrifir y buddsoddir £79.5 miliwn mewn prosiectau cyfalaf yn sir Fynwy, gan gynnwys pum ysgol uwchradd a saith ysgol gynradd, gyda buddsoddiad ar gyfradd o 50 y cant gan Lywodraeth Cymru.

### **Welsh Language Strategy**

**3. Alun Ffred Jones:** *Will the Minister provide an update on actions to implement the Welsh Language Strategy.*

OAQ(4)0130(ESK)

**Leighton Andrews:** Lansiwyd y strategaeth pum mlynedd newydd ar gyfer y Gymraeg, 'Iaith Fyw: Iaith Byw', ar 1 Mawrth. Daw i rym ar 1 Ebrill 2012 a bydd yn parhau mewn grym hyd at 31 Mawrth 2017.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Pa gynnydd a wnaed gyda'r addewid yn y strategaeth i'w ddefnyddio i greu cyfleoedd gwaith yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle mae'r Gymraeg dal yn iaith gymunedol?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rydym wedi lansio'r strategaeth yn ystod mis Mawrth, felly mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych ymlaen at y cynnydd sydd yn cael ei ddelifro gan y strategaeth yn y dyfodol agos.

**Keith Davies:** Croesawaf y ffaith fod y Bil Safonau a Threfniadaeth Ysgolion (Cymru) yn rhoi cynlluniau strategol y Gymraeg mewn addysg ar lefel statudol, gydag awdurdodau lleol yn gorfod creu cynlluniau a mesur y galw lle bo hynny'n briodol. Er hynny, ceir sefyllfaoedd yn Llanelli lle dywedir wrth rieni y bydd angen i'w plant teithio tu allan i'r dalgylch am fod ysgolion Cymraeg lleol yn llawn. A fydd y Bil hwn yn gwneud addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg lleol yn fwy hygrch?

**Leighton Andrews:** Gobeithiaf. Gofynnaf iddo ysgrifennu ataf i esbonio'r broblem yn y sir.

**Suzy Davies:** Mae eich cynllun gweithredu yn sôn am arwain y cynllun Twf drwy reoli cytundebau. Er ein bod yn aros am y fframwaith werthuso a addawyd, a dderbyniwch nad yw arwain a rheoli'r un peth â gosod amcanion, monitro a gwerthuso? A fyddwch yn rhagnodi gweithgareddau Twf neu'n ymddiried yn y ffaith ei fod yn gwybod beth mae'n ei wneud?

**Leighton Andrews:** Pan ydym yn buddsoddi arian cyhoeddus, mae angen i ni sicrhau ei fod yn cyrraedd ein cymunedau a'i fod yn cael effaith gadarnhaol. Rydym felly am ddatblygu fframwaith gwerthuso fel y gallwn brofi a mesur effaith y gwaith sydd i'w wneud, i hyrwyddo a hwyluso'r defnydd a

OAQ(4)0130(ESK)

**Leighton Andrews:** The new five-year Welsh language strategy, 'A Living Language: a Language for Living' was launched on 1 March. It will come into effect on 1 April 2012 and run until 31 March 2017.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** What progress has been made on the pledge in the strategy that it will be used to create employment opportunities in those areas where Welsh is still the community language?

**Leighton Andrews:** We launched the strategy during March, therefore it is important that we look to the progress that will be delivered by the strategy in the near future.

**Keith Davies:** I welcome the fact that the Standards and School Organisation (Wales) Bill will put Welsh in education schemes on a statutory basis, with local authorities having to create schemes and assess demand where appropriate. Despite this, there are situations in Llanelli where parents are told that their children will have to travel outside the catchment area because the local Welsh-medium schools are full. Will this Bill make local Welsh-medium education more accessible?

**Leighton Andrews:** I hope so. I ask him to write to me to explain the problem in the county.

**Suzy Davies:** Your action plan talks about leading the Twf scheme through contract management. Although we are awaiting the promised evaluation framework, do you accept that leading and managing are not the same as setting objectives, monitoring and assessing? Will you prescribe Twf's activities or trust that it knows what it is doing?

**Leighton Andrews:** When we are investing public money, we need to be sure that it is reaching our communities and that it is having a positive impact. We therefore want to develop an evaluation framework so that we can test and measure the impact of the work that needs to be done on promoting and

wneir o'r Gymraeg yn unol â'n strategaeth newydd, gan gynnwys Twf, wrth gwrs.

facilitating the use of the Welsh language in accordance with our new strategy, which includes Twf, of course.

### **Perfformiad Cyngor Caerdydd**

### **The Performance of Cardiff Council**

**4. Vaughan Gething:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am berfformiad Cyngor Caerdydd fel awdurdod addysg lleol. OAQ(4)0132(ESK)*

**4. Vaughan Gething:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the performance of Cardiff Council as a local education authority. OAQ(4)0132(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Following its inspection last January, Estyn judged Cardiff's education services and its prospects for improvement to be adequate. Estyn will continue to monitor the authority until it is satisfied that it is providing a better service. The next visit is due to take place before the end of the summer term.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn dilyn ei arolygiad fis Ionawr diwethaf, roedd Estyn o'r farn bod gwasanaethau addysg Caerdydd a'i ragolygon ar gyfer gwella yn ddigonol. Bydd Estyn yn parhau i fonitro'r awdurdod nes ei fod yn fodlon ei fod yn darparu gwell gwasanaeth. Bydd yr ymweliad nesaf cyn diwedd tymor yr haf.

**Vaughan Gething:** Thank you for that response, Minister. I am sure that other Members representing Cardiff are concerned, as are the constituents, about the strategic leadership of Cardiff Council or about the quality of it. You have mentioned the recent Estyn report, which also stated that progress in areas such as attendance, exclusion, and those not in education, employment or training was poor. Minister, when Estyn provides that revisit, will the Welsh Government consider again the quality of the strategic leadership of the council as a local education authority, and whether further intervention is needed?

**Vaughan Gething:** Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Rwyf yn siŵr bod yr Aelodau eraill sy'n cynrychioli Caerdydd yn pryderu, fel y mae'r etholwyr, am arweiniad strategol Cyngor Caerdydd neu am ansawdd hwnnw. Rydych wedi sôn am adroddiad diweddar Estyn, a oedd hefyd yn datgan bod y cynnydd yn wael mewn meysydd fel presenoldeb, gwaharddiadau, a'r rheini nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth neu hyfforddiant. Weinidog, pan fydd Estyn yn ail-ymweld, a fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystyried eto ansawdd arweiniad strategol y cyngor fel awdurdod addysg lleol, ac a oes angen rhagor o ymyrraeth?

**Leighton Andrews:** If further intervention were needed, we would be active in considering that. I must say that I think that the chief executive understands the challenges facing the council and has taken steps internally to address some of them. I would be very disappointed indeed if we did not see, as a result of those changes and events that may or may not take place in the next 24 hours, significant changes and improvements to the delivery of school performance in Cardiff.

**Leighton Andrews:** Pe byddai angen rhagor o ymyrraeth, byddem yn mynd ati o ddifrif i ystyried hynny. Rhaid imi ddweud fy mod yn credu bod y prif weithredwr yn deall yr heriau sy'n wynebu'r cyngor ac mae wedi cymryd camau'n fewnol i roi sylw i rai ohonynt. Byddwn yn siomedig iawn yn wir pe na fyddem yn gweld, o ganlyniad i'r newidiadau a'r digwyddiadau hynny a fydd o bosib yn digwydd yn ystod y 24 awr nesaf, newidiadau a gwelliannau sylweddol i sicrhau perfformiad ysgolion yng Nghaerdydd.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Andrew R.T. Davies):** In order to improve attainment levels in schools, working with local education authorities on delivering some of the legislation that has been passed in this

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Andrew R.T. Davies):** Er mwyn gwella lefelau cyrhaeddiad mewn ysgolion, mae gweithio gydag awdurdodau addysg lleol ar weithredu rhywfaint o'r ddeddfwriaeth sydd wedi cael ei



institution is key. The Healthy Eating in Schools (Wales) Measure 2009 is an important tool that will improve attainment levels throughout Wales, but particularly in South Wales Central. Why is that Measure not being commenced sooner than 2013, because many local authorities are keen to implement the actions arising from it?

**Leighton Andrews:** The leader of the opposition is wrong. The First Minister explained yesterday when the Measure will be implemented. It comes into force for primary schools in September 2012 and for secondary schools in September 2013. Therefore, he is wrong in respect of primary schools. We are implementing the Measure and the Member should be supporting us in that.

**Eluned Parrott:** Reading from the same Estyn report that you mentioned in response to the question from the Member for Cardiff South and Penarth, you will note that the inspectors praised many attribute of Cardiff as a local education authority:

‘Elected members have shown strong leadership and consistent support for education services’.

It also praises the allocation of resources, the corporate parenting strategy, schools reorganisations and states that Cardiff has met or exceeded all the Welsh Government’s benchmark expectations for the past four years. Given the views that you have expressed this afternoon, are you suggesting that perhaps your benchmarks are inappropriate?

**Leighton Andrews:** Estyn’s report judged Cardiff’s education services and its prospects for improvement to be ‘adequate’. As I have said before, that means barely good enough.

### Sefydliadau Addysg Uwch

**5. Angela Burns:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi’r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynigion arfaethedig i uno sefydliadau Addysg Uwch. OAQ(4)0128(ESK)*

phasio yn y sefydliad hwn yn allweddol. Mae Mesur Bwyta'n Iach mewn Ysgolion (Cymru) 2009 yn arf pwysig a fydd yn gwella lefelau cyrhaeddiad ledled Cymru, ond yn arbennig yng Nghanol De Cymru. Pam nad yw'r Mesur hwnnw'n cael ei gychwyn yn gynt na 2013, oherwydd mae llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn awyddus i weithredu'r camau sy'n deillio ohono?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn anghywir. Eglurodd y Prif Weinidog ddoe pryd y bydd y Mesur yn cael ei weithredu. Daw i rym ym mis Medi 2012 ar gyfer ysgolion cynradd, ac ym mis Medi 2013 ar gyfer ysgolion uwchradd. Felly, mae'n anghywir o ran yr ysgolion cynradd. Rydym yn gweithredu'r Mesur a dylai'r Aelod ein cefnogi yn hynny o beth.

**Eluned Parrott:** Wrth ddarllen o'r un adroddiad Estyn a grybwyllwyd gennych mewn ymateb i'r cwestiwn gan yr Aelod dros Dde Caerdydd a Phenarth, byddwch yn nodi bod yr arolygwyr wedi canmol sawl priodoledd gan Gaerdydd fel awdurdod addysg lleol:

‘Mae aelodau etholedig wedi dangos arweinyddiaeth gref a chefnogaeth gyson ar gyfer gwasanaethau addysg’.

Mae hefyd yn canmol y dyraniad o adnoddau, y strategaeth rhianta corfforaethol, ad-drefnu ysgolion ac mae'n datgan bod Caerdydd wedi cwrdd neu'n rhagori ar holl ddisgwyliadau meincnodi Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer y pedair blynedd diwethaf. O ystyried y farn yr ydych wedi'i mynegi y prynhawn yma, a ydych yn awgrymu bod eich meincnodau yn amhriodol efallai?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae adroddiad Estyn o'r farn bod gwasanaethau addysg Caerdydd a'i ragolygon ar gyfer gwella yn ‘ddigonol’. Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud o'r blaen, ystyr hynny yw prin ddigon da.

### Higher Education Institutions

**5. Angela Burns:** *Will the Minister give an update on the proposed mergers of Higher Education institutions. OAQ(4)0128(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** We are making good progress towards delivering our commitment to a smaller number of stronger universities that are more sustainable and better equipped to meet the needs of learners and the Welsh economy.

**Angela Burns:** Thank you for that, Minister. I welcome the appointment of Professor Steve Smith to conduct a more arm's-length and objective review of this. Will you commit to sharing his findings with us, when they arrive on your desk, and can you tell us when you expect that to happen?

**Leighton Andrews:** Steve Smith has a distinguished background in higher education, as vice-chancellor of the University of Exeter and as chair of Universities UK. He is advising us on progress towards the creation of a single post-1992 institution in south-east Wales. He will contribute to the decisions that we will take in due course following our discussions with the interested parties.

1.45 p.m.

**Angela Burns:** Thank you for that, Minister, but it does give me cause for concern. Yesterday, the First Minister spoke again about openness and transparency, and when you have the vice-chancellor of the University of Wales, Newport publicly saying that he felt that there was a conspiracy against his university and those kinds of comments abounding, and given that this is a difficult situation and the hostility in some quarters and concerns in a great many others, do you not think that it would be better for the advice given by anyone that you are bringing in to advise you on this matter to be made public so that we can see that there is fairness and transparency? Otherwise, this will just become a nastier and nastier fight, will it not?

**Leighton Andrews:** To describe what is going on as a conspiracy is ridiculous. Let me remind the Chamber of the transparent and open way in which these issues have been discussed in the past. The Audit Committee of the previous Assembly published a report in 2009—and the committee was chaired by

**Leighton Andrews:** Rydym yn gwneud cynnydd da at gyflawni ein hymrwymiad i gael nifer llai o brifysgolion cryfach sy'n fwy cynaliadwy ac mewn sefyllfa well i ddiwallu anghenion dysgwyr ac economi Cymru.

**Angela Burns:** Diolch am hynny, Weinidog. Rwyf yn croesawu penodiad yr Athro Steve Smith i gynnal adolygiad mwy gwrthrychol a hyd braich o hyn. A wnewch chi ymrwymo i rannu ei ganfyddiadau gyda ni, pan fyddant yn cyrraedd eich desg, ac a allwch ddweud wrthym pryd y byddwch yn disgwyl i hynny ddigwydd?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae gan Steve Smith gefndir nodedig mewn addysg uwch, fel is-ganghellor Prifysgol Caerwysg ac fel cadeirydd Prifysgolion y DU. Mae'n rhoi cyngor inni ar y cynnydd at greu un sefydliad ôl-1992 yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru. Bydd yn cyfrannu at y penderfyniadau y byddwn yn eu gwneud maes o law yn dilyn ein trafodaethau gyda'r partïon â diddordeb.

**Angela Burns:** Diolch am hynny, Weinidog, ond mae hyn yn destun pryder imi. Ddoe, siaradodd y Prif Weinidog eto am fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw, a phan mae is-ganghellor Prifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd yn dweud ar goedd ei fod yn teimlo bod cynllwyn yn erbyn ei brifysgol a llawer o sylwadau o'r math, ac o gofio bod hon yn sefyllfa anodd a'r drwgdeimlad mewn rhai mannau a phryderon mewn nifer fawr o fannau eraill, onid ydych yn meddwl y byddai'n well i'r cyngor a roddir gan unrhyw un yr ydych yn gofyn iddynt eich cyngori ar y mater hwn fod ar gael i'r cyhoedd fel y gallwn weld bod tegwch a thryloywder yn bodoli? Fel arall, oni fydd hyn yn mynd yn sefyllfa fwy annymunol?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae dweud bod yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn gynllwyn yn chwerthinllyd. Gadewch imi atgoffa'r Siambr am y modd tryloyw ac agored y trafodwyd y materion hyn yn y gorffennol. Cyhoeddodd Pwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad blaenorol adroddiad yn 2009—a David Melding oedd cadeirydd y

David Melding at the time—recommending that the Welsh Government use core funding to ensure that the reconfiguration agenda took place and that it should do so more robustly. That was then set out in my remit letter to the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales in 2010. HEFCW subsequently published its advice on the configuration of the higher education sector in Wales. In the summer of 2010, following a Cabinet discussion, I made an oral statement here on the reconfiguration of higher education. In the Assembly election manifesto of the incoming Government last year, it was clearly set out that we sought a smaller number of stronger universities. I made a subsequent statement, following the publication of advice by HEFCW to me on reconfiguration. In the autumn, I then made a further statement in the Chamber on that very subject, and we have continued at every stage to put into the public domain the way in which we are approaching these issues. In addition, of course, I have met representatives of the institutions involved, including the chair and vice-chancellor of Newport university.

**Simon Thomas:** Wrth gwrs, mae'r Senedd hefyd wedi dweud ei barn, ac wedi dweud yn glir nad ydym o blaid uno gorfodol prifysgolion. Rwy'n croesawu penodiad Steve Smith, a chofiaf y cyfraniad a wnaeth i Brifysgol Aberystwyth pan oedd yno. Serch hynny, rwy'n gofidio bod yr anghydfod a'r anghytuno presennol dros uno yn neddwyrain Cymru yn arwain at gwestiynu enw da addysg uwch yng Nghymru. A yw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy mhryder ynghylch y mater hwnnw, yn enwedig o gofio bod gostyngiad eisoes yn nifer y myfyrwyr o Loegr sy'n dod i astudio yng Nghymru? Pa bwysau yr ydych yn eu rhoi, Weinidog, ar y ffactor hwn yn y modd yr ydych yn bwriadu bwrw ymlaen â'r cynlluniau?

**Leighton Andrews:** The Member is premature in suggesting that there is a reduction in the number of students from England coming to Wales. What we are looking at currently are application figures, not final acceptance figures. In respect of the HEFCW proposals on student numbers, HEFCW published its proposals as a consultation and there was discussion on

pyllgor ar y pryd—gan argymhell bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn defnyddio cyllid craidd i sicrhau bod yr agenda ad-drefnu yn digwydd ac y dylai wneud hynny yn fwy pendant. Gosodwyd hynny wedyn yn fy llythyr cylch gwaith i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru yn 2010. Ar ôl hynny, cyhoeddodd CCAUC ei gyngor ar ad-drefnu'r sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Yn ystod haf 2010, yn dilyn trafodaeth y Cabinet, gwnes ddatganiad llafar yma ar ad-drefnu addysg uwch. Ym maniffesto'r darpar Lywodraeth ar gyfer etholiad y Cynulliad y llynedd, nodwyd yn glir ein bod am geisio cael nifer llai o brifysgolion cryfach. Gwnes ddatganiad dilynol, yn dilyn cyhoeddi'r cyngor imi gan CCAUC ar ad-drefnu. Yn yr hydref, gwnes ddatganiad arall wedyn yn y Siambr ar yr union bwnc hwnnw, ac rydym wedi parhau ym mhob cam i roi gwybod i'r cyhoedd sut yr ydym yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn. Yn ogystal, wrth gwrs, rwyf wedi cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr y sefydliadau dan sylw, gan gynnwys cadeirydd ac is-ganghellor Prifysgol Casnewydd.

**Simon Thomas:** Of course, the Senedd has also had its say, and has clearly stated that we are not in favour of the compulsory merger of universities. I welcome the appointment of Steve Smith, and I remember his contribution to Aberystwyth University when he was there. However, I am concerned that the current dispute and disagreement over mergers in south-east Wales will lead to compromising the reputation of higher education in Wales. Does the Minister share my concern about that, particularly bearing in mind that there is already a reduction in the number of students from England coming to study in Wales? What pressure are you bringing to bear, Minister, on that factor in the way in which you intend to proceed with the plans?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r Aelod yn rhoi'r cart o flaen y ceffyl wrth awgrymu bod gostyngiad yn nifer y myfyrwyr o Loegr sy'n dod i Gymru. Yr hyn yr ydym yn edrych arno ar hyn o bryd yw ffigurau ymgeisio, nid ffigurau derbyn terfynol. O ran cynigion CCAUC ar nifer y myfyrwyr, cyhoeddodd CCAUC ei gynigion fel ymgynghoriad a chafwyd trafodaeth ar y materion hynny cyn

those issues before it then published its outcome figures. I remind the Member that I am implementing a policy that was a policy of the One Wales Government and was signed up to in Cabinet by his colleagues, the Member for Arfon, the Member for Ynys Môn, the Member for South Wales East and the Member for Ceredigion. Indeed, I believe that he was an adviser to that Government at the time the paper went to Cabinet.

**Simon Thomas:** I never gave advice that anything should happen other than voluntary mergers. We look forward to that.

I droi at stori ychydig mwy hapus, yn ne-orllewin Cymru, mae uno gwirfoddol yn llwyddo ac rwy'n croesawu hynny. Bydd adnoddau Prifysgol Cymru, o bosibl, yn mynd i mewn i'r sefydliad newydd honno. Pa drafodaethau pellach yr ydych wedi'u cael i sicrhau bod yr adnoddau hynny, lle bynnag y byddant yn bennu yn gyfreithiol, ar gael i addysg uwch drwy Gymru gyfan?

**Leighton Andrews:** The allocation of funding is, of course, a matter for the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, not for me. However, I am pleased at the progress that has been made on reconfiguration in south-west Wales and I look forward to a strong institution emerging as a result.

**Aled Roberts:** Weinidog, derbynïaf fod gennych addewid yn eich maniffesto ynghylch sefyllfa prifysgolion, ond, mewn ymateb i gwestiwn a gyflwynwyd drwy'r Gwasanaeth Ymchwil, mae'n blaen nad oes disgwyl i'r Athro Smith gyflwyno adroddiad i'r Llywodraeth ynghylch uno prifysgolion yn y de-ddwyrain. Pa gyfle fydd gan y Cynulliad, felly, i graffu ar unrhyw benderfyniad a wneir ac a fydd, fel y dywedwyd gennych eisoes, wedi'i seilio ar dystiolaeth gadarn?

**Leighton Andrews:** The Assembly has had the opportunity to scrutinise me on this subject repeatedly, both during questions and the oral statements that I have made regularly on this subject over the past two years, and, indeed, in committee. I am sure that there will be further opportunities for you to do

iddo wedyn gyhoeddi ffigurau ei ganlyniadau. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelod fy mod yn gweithredu polisi a oedd yn bolisi Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un ac a gafodd ei lofnodi yn y Cabinet gan ei gyd-Aelodau, yr Aelod dros Arfon, yr Aelod dros Ynys Môn, yr Aelod dros Ddwyrain De Cymru a'r Aelod dros Geredigion. Yn wir, credaf ei fod yn gynghorydd i'r Llywodraeth honno pan aeth y papur i'r Cabinet.

**Simon Thomas:** Ni ddywedais erioed y dylai unrhyw beth arall ddigwydd heblaw am uno gwirfoddol. Rydym yn edrych ymlaen at hynny.

To turn to a slightly happier tale, in south-west Wales, there is a successful voluntary merger, and I welcome that. It is possible that University of Wales resources will go into that new institution. What further discussions have you had to ensure that those resources, wherever they end up legally, are available for higher education throughout Wales?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae dyrannu cyllid, wrth gwrs, yn fater i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, nid i mi. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn falch o'r cynnydd a wnaed ar ad-drefnu yn y de-orllewin, ac rwyf yn edrych ymlaen at weld sefydliad cryf yn codi o ganlyniad.

**Aled Roberts:** Minister, I accept that you made a manifesto pledge in respect of the universities situation, but, in response to a question submitted through the Research Service, it is clear that there is no expectation that Professor Smith will submit a report to the Government on the merger of universities in the south-east. What opportunity will the Assembly have, therefore, to scrutinise any decision made and which, as you have already said, is to be based on robust evidence?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r Cynulliad wedi cael cyfle i graffu arnaf ar y pwnc hwn dro ar ôl tro, yn ystod y cwestiynau a'r datganiadau llafar yr wyf wedi'u gwneud yn rheolaidd ar y pwnc hwn yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, ac, yn wir, yn y pwyllgor. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd rhagor o gyfleoedd ichi

that again.

**Aled Roberts:** Yn ystod unrhyw drafodaethau, neu yn sgîl unrhyw dystiolaeth a dderbynnir, a fydd unrhyw addewidion yn cael eu gwneud am osgoi diswyddiadau?

**Leighton Andrews:** We are looking at how we take forward the proposal for a single post-1992 institution in south-east Wales. That has been the basis on which we have had the conversations with the management and governing bodies of higher education institutions. We have also met with representatives of trade unions representing staff, including Unison and the University and College Union. I expect also to have meetings with representatives of student unions. Once we have concluded those discussions, we will take forward our recommendations.

**David Rees:** In addition to the mergers that you have referred to a lot this afternoon, the paper looked at collaboration between HE institutions and at the direction of research collaboration in particular. Could you provide an update on the progress of research collaboration in the HE sector?

**Leighton Andrews:** I think that the Member for Aberavon will be aware that we recently published the science strategy, developed by the chief scientific adviser, which makes some important recommendations about future research collaboration. From our meetings with the research councils, it is true to say that they are fully supportive of our agenda for greater collaboration, so as to ensure more sustainable and more substantial bids to the research councils so that Wales achieves the level of research funding it should. We have some good examples across Wales in a number of fields—history, neuroscience and other areas—where there has been good collaboration between institutions and we want to build on those examples.

### Gwella Sgiliau Pobl Ifanc

**6. Paul Davies:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i wella sgiliau ymysg

wneud hynny eto

**Aled Roberts:** During any discussions, or in the wake of any evidence submitted, will any promises be made as regards avoiding redundancies?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rydym yn edrych ar sut y byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â'r cynnig am un sefydliad ôl-1992 yn y de-ddwyrain. Hynny sydd wedi bod yn sail i'n trafodaethau â rheolwyr a chyrrff llywodraethu sefydliadau addysg uwch. Rydym hefyd wedi cyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr undebau llafur sy'n cynrychioli staff, gan gynnwys Unsain a'r Undeb Prifysgol a Choleg. Rwyf yn disgwyl cael cyfarfodydd hefyd gyda chynrychiolwyr undebau myfyrwyr. Ar ôl inni gael y trafodaethau hynny, byddwn yn cyflwyno ein hargymhellion.

**David Rees:** Yn ogystal â'r uno yr ydych wedi cyfeirio llawer ato y prynhawn yma, roedd y papur yn edrych ar gydweithio rhwng sefydliadau Addysg Uwch ac ar gyfeiriad cydweithio ym maes ymchwil yn benodol. A allwch roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynnydd cydweithio ym maes ymchwil yn y sector Addysg Uwch?

**Leighton Andrews:** Credaf y bydd yr Aelod dros Aberafan yn ymwybodol ein bod wedi cyhoeddi'r strategaeth wyddoniaeth yn ddiweddar, a ddatblygwyd gan y prif gynghorydd gwyddonol, ac mae'n gwneud argymhellion pwysig am gydweithio ym maes ymchwil yn y dyfodol. Yn dilyn ein cyfarfodydd gyda'r cynghorau ymchwil, mae'n wir dweud eu bod yn gwbl gefnogol i'n hagenda ar gyfer mwy o gydweithio, er mwyn sicrhau ceisiadau mwy cynaliadwy a mwy sylweddol i'r cynghorau ymchwil fel bod Cymru yn cyrraedd y lefel o gyllid ymchwil y dylai wneud. Mae gennym enghreifftiau da ledled Cymru mewn sawl maes—hanes, niwrowyddoniaeth a meysydd eraill—lle bu cydweithio da rhwng sefydliadau ac rydym yn awyddus i adeiladu ar yr enghreifftiau hynny.

### Improving the Skills of Young People

**6. Paul Davies:** What is the Welsh Government doing to improve skills amongst

*pobl ifanc yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. OAQ(4)0118(ESK)*

**The Deputy Minister for Skills (Jeff Cuthbert):** I thank the Member for that question. The Welsh Government is committed to improving the skills levels of young people throughout Wales. That is why we implemented new employability programmes last August, introduced measures to extend apprenticeship opportunities and, last month, established Jobs Growth Wales, which will create 4,000 job opportunities per year for young people aged 16 to 24.

**Paul Davies:** I agree very much with the Deputy Minister that apprenticeships play a key role in improving skills, especially among young people. Given that Pembrokeshire is probably the energy capital of the UK, it is important that local apprenticeships equip young adults in the area with the necessary skills to enter that workforce. Will the Deputy Minister outline what the Welsh Government is doing to encourage local businesses and industries in the energy sector to offer apprenticeships in my constituency?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Just a couple of weeks ago, I visited Pembrokeshire College and was very impressed to see the collaboration between the energy sector, particularly the refining sector, and the college to provide apprenticeship opportunities for young people. However, putting it generally, we are investing, with anchor companies and regionally significant companies, which will include the ones I think you are alluding to, to make sure that they offer apprenticeships to young people. In respect of smaller companies, we have the young recruits programme, which will provide a subsidy of £50 per week for those taking on young people.

**William Powell:** Last year, I had the opportunity to visit the annual Welsh summer school of the Prince's Foundation for Building Community, which has hosted at Tŷ-Mawr Lime at Llangorse in my region. The charity seeks to foster knowledge and develop skills in sustainable building practices throughout the UK. To what extent are you familiar with the work of the charity,

*young people in Mid and West Wales. OAQ(4)0118(ESK)*

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Sgiliau (Jeff Cuthbert):** Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymrwmo i wella lefelau sgiliau pobl ifanc ledled Cymru. Dyna pam y gwnaethom roi rhaglenni cyflogadwyedd newydd ar waith fis Awst diwethaf, cyflwyno mesurau i ymestyn cyfleoedd prentisiaeth a, mis diwethaf, sefydlu Twf Swyddi Cymru, a fydd yn creu 4,000 o gyfleoedd gwaith y flwyddyn i bobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 24 oed.

**Paul Davies:** Cytunaf yn fawr iawn gyda'r Dirprwy Weinidog fod prentisiaethau yn chwarae rôl allweddol wrth wella sgiliau, yn enwedig ymhlith pobl ifanc. Gan mai sir Benfro, yn ôl pob tebyg, yw canolbwynt ynni'r DU, mae'n bwysig bod prentisiaethau lleol yn rhoi'r sgiliau angenrheidiol i oedolion ifanc yn yr ardal er mwyn iddynt allu ymuno â'r gweithlu. A wnaiff y Dirprwy Weinidog amlinellu'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i annog busnesau a diwydiannau lleol yn y sector ynni i gynnig prentisiaethau yn fy etholaeth?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Ychydig wythnosau yn ôl yn unig, ymwelais â Choleg Sir Benfro ac roeddwn yn falch iawn o weld y cydweithio rhwng y sector ynni, yn enwedig y sector puro, a'r coleg i ddarparu cyfleoedd prentisiaeth i bobl ifanc. Fodd bynnag, gan ei roi yn gyffredinol, rydym yn buddsoddi, gyda chwmnïau angor a chwmnïau sy'n bwysig yn rhanbarthol, a fydd yn cynnwys y rheini yr wyf yn credu eich bod yn cyfeirio atynt, er mwyn gwneud yn siŵr eu bod yn cynnig prentisiaethau i bobl ifanc. O ran cwmnïau llai, mae gennym y rhaglen recriwtiaid newydd, a fydd yn rhoi cymhorthdal o £50 yr wythnos i'r rheini sy'n cymryd pobl ifanc.

**William Powell:** Y llynedd, cefais gyfle i ymweld ag ysgol haf flynyddol Cymru Sefydliad y Tywysog ar Adeiladu Cymunedau, a gafodd ei chynnal yn Tŷ-Mawr Lime yn Llan-gors yn fy rhanbarth. Mae'r elusen yn ceisio meithrin gwybodaeth a datblygu sgiliau mewn arferion adeiladu cynaliadwy ledled y DU. I ba raddau ydych gyfarwydd â gwaith yr elusen, ac a ydych

and do you agree that close collaboration between such charities and our other education institutions is vital to ensure the future supply of traditional skills, such as those of hedgers, masons and thatchers?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Of course I agree that collaboration is important. These are matters that I have discussed with ConstructionSkills. I have certainly discussed them with my colleague, Huw Lewis, the Minister for heritage, when looking at sustainable building and heritage skills. That is a key issue for us. Indeed, on this matter, a few months ago, I met His Royal Highness Prince Charles when we discussed building skills, particularly as far as his trust is concerned.

yn cytuno bod cydweithio agos rhwng elusennau o'r fath a'n sefydliadau addysg eraill yn hanfodol i sicrhau cyflenwad sgiliau traddodiadol yn y dyfodol, fel sgiliau gwrychwyr, seiri maen a thowyr?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Wrth gwrs fy mod yn cytuno bod cydweithio yn bwysig. Dyma'r materion yr wyf wedi'u trafod gyda Sgiliau Adeiladu. Rwyf yn sicr wedi eu trafod gyda fy nghyd-Aelod, Huw Lewis, y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth, wrth edrych ar adeiladu cynaliadwy a sgiliau treftadaeth. Mae hynny'n fater allweddol inni. Yn wir, ar y mater hwn, ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, cyfarfûm ag Ei Uchelder Brenhinol y Tywysog Charles pan gawsom gyfle i drafod sgiliau adeiladu, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun ei ymddiriedolaeth.

### Diwygio Lles

**7. Mark Drakeford:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am waith Grŵp Gorchwyl a Gorffen y Gweinidog ar gyfer Diwygio Lles. OAQ(4)0123(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** The ministerial task and finish group on welfare reform has been set up in response to our concerns over the UK Government's planned welfare reforms. It is responsible for analysing and monitoring the cumulative impact of welfare reform on Wales, to ensure a co-ordinated and robust Welsh Government response.

**Mark Drakeford:** During the Easter recess, Cuts Watch Cymru published its latest research report, dealing this time with the cuts already made to crisis loans from the social fund. Do you share my concerns at the information in that report: Welsh families with children are being denied the help of crisis loans, are being left without food and heating, and have no recourse to anywhere else in the social security system? Will you make sure that that report is drawn to the attention of the ministerial task and finish group? Will it form part of the evidence on which the Welsh Government will draw when making its plans for any devolution of the social fund to Wales?

### Welfare Reform

**7. Mark Drakeford:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the work of the Ministerial Task and Finish Group for Welfare Reform. OAQ(4)0123(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen y gweinidog ar ddiwygio lles wedi cael ei sefydlu mewn ymateb i'n pryderon ynghylch diwygiadau arfaethedig Llywodraeth y DU i les. Mae'n gyfrifol am ddadansoddi a monitro effaith gronol diwygio lles ar Gymru, er mwyn sicrhau ymateb cyd-gysylltiedig a chadarn gan Llywodraeth Cymru.

**Mark Drakeford:** Yn ystod toriad y Pasg, cyhoeddodd Cuts Watch Cymru ei adroddiad ymchwil ddiweddaraf, yn delio y tro hwn â'r toriadau a wnaed eisoes i fenthyciadau argyfwng o'r gronfa gymdeithasol. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryderon ynghylch y wybodaeth yn yr adroddiad hwnnw: Mae teuluoedd Cymru sydd â phlant yn cael eu hamddifadu o gymorth benthyciadau argyfwng, yn cael eu gadael heb fwyd a gwres, ac ni allant droi at un man arall yn y system nawdd cymdeithasol? A wnewch chi sicrhau bod grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen y gweinidog yn cael gwybod am yr adroddiad hwnnw? A fydd hyn yn rhan o'r dystiolaeth y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei defnyddio i wneud ei chynlluniau ar gyfer unrhyw ddatganioli o'r gronfa gymdeithasol i Gymru?

**Leighton Andrews:** I am certainly happy to do that. I say to the Member for Cardiff West that the Minister for Local Government and Communities is considering that evidence at present in respect of the social fund. The First Minister and I had a very useful meeting with representatives of Cuts Watch Cymru last week, when we were able to discuss a number of issues of mutual concern. He will also be aware that the ministerial task and finish group held a stakeholder event with representatives of a wide variety of third sector organisations and others who have concerns about a number of these issues. We will return to those stakeholders with a future meeting during June.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Minister, it is a matter of regret that when the Work and Pensions Committee held an inquiry into housing benefit changes in 2010, your Government made no contribution, and that when the Social Security Advisory Committee consulted on the Housing Benefit (Amendment) Regulations 2010, only one contribution was sent—not from Welsh Labour Ministers, but from the head of housing. Do you believe that that was an acceptable way to represent Wales during the debate on the future of welfare reform? Can you explain why you and other Ministers failed to submit a full response, given your criticism of the UK Government's reforms?

**Leighton Andrews:** My ministerial colleagues and I have made many representations to the UK Government on a wide variety of issues relating to its welfare reform agenda. I have met Iain Duncan Smith, Chris Grayling, Maria Miller and Lord Freud to discuss several of these issues and I know that my ministerial colleagues have also had meetings with their counterparts in the UK Government. There remain significant philosophical differences between the Welsh Government and the Government of the United Kingdom over the welfare reform programme, and we will continue to make our case and to stand up for Wales.

**Lindsay Whittle:** There is now an urgent

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf yn sicr yn hapus i wneud hynny. Dywedaf wrth yr Aelod dros Orllewin Caerdydd fod y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn ystyried y dystiolaeth honno ar hyn o bryd mewn perthynas â'r gronfa gymdeithasol. Cafodd y Prif Weinidog a minnau gyfarfod defnyddiol iawn gyda chynrychiolwyr Cuts Watch Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf, pan lwyddom i drafod nifer o faterion a oedd yn peri pryder i'r ddwy ochr. Bydd yn ymwybodol hefyd fod grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen y gweinidog wedi cynnal digwyddiad rhanddeiliaid gyda chynrychiolwyr o amrywiaeth eang o sefydliadau'r trydydd sector ac eraill sydd â phryderon am nifer o'r materion hyn. Byddwn yn cynnal cyfarfod gyda'r rhanddeiliaid hynny yn ystod mis Mehefin.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Weinidog, mae'n destun gofid na wnaeth eich Llywodraeth gyfrannu at ymchwiliad a gynhaliodd y Pwyllgor Gwaith a Phensiynau i newidiadau mewn budd-dal tai yn 2010, a phan oedd y Pwyllgor Cynghori ar Nawdd Cymdeithasol yn ymgynghori ynghylch Rheoliadau Budd-dal Tai (Diwygio) 2010, dim ond un cyfraniad a anfonwyd—nid gan Weinidogion Llafur Cymru, ond gan y pennaeth tai. A ydych yn credu bod hynny'n ffordd dderbyniol o gynrychioli Cymru yn ystod y ddadl ar ddyfodol diwygio lles? A allwch esbonio pam yr ydych chi a Gweinidogion eraill wedi methu â chyflwyno ymateb llawn, o ystyried eich beirniadaeth o ddiwygiadau Llywodraeth y DU?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae fy nghyd-Weinidogion a minnau wedi cyflwyno nifer o sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU am amrywiaeth eang o faterion yn ymwneud â'i agenda diwygio lles. Rwyf wedi cael cyfarfod gydag Iain Duncan Smith, Chris Grayling, Maria Miller a'r Arglwydd Freud i drafod nifer o'r materion hyn a gwn fod fy nghyd-weinidogion hefyd wedi cael cyfarfodydd gyda'u cymheiriaid yn Llywodraeth y DU. Mae gwahaniaethau athronyddol sylweddol yn dal i fodoli rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig dros y rhaglen diwygio lles, a byddwn yn parhau i gyflwyno'n hachos ac i sefyll dros Gymru.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Mae taer angen i



necessity for the Welsh Government to accelerate its capital investment programme in order to lessen dependence in Wales on the welfare state. When will you start, please?

**Leighton Andrews:** We are already making significant capital investments in a variety of places across Wales, not least in Caerphilly.

Lywodraeth Cymru gyflymu ei rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf er mwyn lleihau'r ddibyniaeth yng Nghymru ar y wladwriaeth les. Pryd y byddwch yn dechrau hyn, os gwelwch yn dda?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rydym eisoes yn gwneud buddsoddiadau cyfalaf sylweddol mewn amrywiol leoedd ar draws Cymru, yn enwedig yng Nghaerffili.

### Ysgolion ar gyfer yr Unfed Ganrif ar Hugain

**8. Simon Thomas:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau pa bryd y bydd cyllid yn dechrau cael ei ryddhau i'r rhaglen Ysgolion ar gyfer yr 21ain ganrif. OAQ(4)0129(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Nodwyd yn fy natganiad ysgrifenedig, dyddiedig 5 Rhagfyr 2011, y byddai'r cyllid ar gyfer y rhaglen ysgolion ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yn dechrau ym mlwyddyn ariannol 2014-15. Bydd Llywodraeth Cymru, fodd bynnag, yn ceisio mynd ati i gyflymu'r broses a rhoi prosiectau ar waith mewn ysgolion unigol fel y bydd cyllid cyfalaf ychwanegol ar gael.

**Simon Thomas:** Diolch, Weindog, am yr ateb hwnnw. Mae sawl awdurdod lleol yn dweud wrthyf eu bod mewn cyfyng gyngor ar hyn o bryd gan fod y rhaglen ysgolion ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain wedi ei chynllunio i symud ymlaen fesul cam, ac mae angen cyflwyno achos busnes ar gyfer pob cam.

2.00 p.m.

A oes unrhyw beth pellach y gallwch chi ei wneud, gyda'ch swyddogion, i gyflymu a symleiddio'r broses hon, gan fod gweld yr ysgolion newydd hyn yn cael eu hadeiladu hefyd yn rhan o'r ymateb i'r dirwasgiad presennol?

**Leighton Andrews:** I hope that fewer local authorities will be in a quandary after the next 24 hours, because they will have excellent leaderships from Welsh Labour. The reality is that every local authority has been well aware throughout this process that to receive funding under the twenty-first century schools programme, they need to

### Twenty-first Century Schools

**8. Simon Thomas:** *Will the Minister confirm when funding will begin to be released for the twenty-first century schools programme. OAQ(4)0129(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** My written statement, issued on 5 December 2011, advised that funding for the twenty-first century schools programme would commence in the financial year 2014-15. However, the Welsh Government will seek to accelerate the programme and bring forward individual schools' projects as and when additional capital funds become available.

**Simon Thomas:** Thanks, Minister, for that answer. Several local authorities have told me that they are in a predicament at the moment because the twenty-first century schools programme has been designed to move forward step by step, and a business case has to be presented for each stage.

Is there anything further that you can do, along with your officials, to speed up and simplify this process, because seeing these schools built also forms part of the response to the current recession?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd llai o awdurdodau lleol mewn cyfyng gyngor ar ôl y 24 awr nesaf, oherwydd byddant yn cael arweiniad rhagorol gan blaid Lafur Cymru. Y gwir amdani yw bod pob awdurdod lleol wedi bod yn ymwybodol iawn drwy gydol y broses hon fod yn rhaid iddynt gyflwyno achos busnes llwyddiannus

mount a successful business case and demonstrate that they are making the requisite investments. We have agreed the way forward, I think, with all of the local authorities and the Welsh Local Government Association. I look forward to that exceptional public investment in school capital going ahead.

**Russell George:** I doubt that there will be political leadership from Labour in Powys County Council. There are still concerns in Powys that while the application put forward has been accepted in its broadest terms, the challenging of individual bids is ongoing, which is creating some uncertainty. When is the scrutiny of bids due to conclude, and will you be making further statements to the Chamber to confirm any changes made?

**Leighton Andrews:** I thank the councillor for that question. I am happy that we are making good progress in the delivery of this programme. Inevitably, some projects will move in and out of capital programmes. It may be that there will be changes to priorities as a result of events in the next 24 hours, when people may have different views about the distribution of school organisation at a local level. We have to retain an element of flexibility in the way we approach this programme.

### Cyllido Addysg Uwch

**9. Jocelyn Davies:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido addysg uwch. OAQ(4)0122(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** In 2012-13, over £370 million will be made available to Welsh universities via the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales.

**Jocelyn Davies:** The higher education funding council's new system for funding universities uses, in part, your priorities of science, technology, engineering and modern languages in its allocation policy. It also uses research income, spin-out companies and the number of foreign students as criteria. Under this system, the University of Wales, Newport estimates a loss of about 20% of its

a dangos eu bod yn gwneud y buddsoddiadau angenrheidiol er mwyn cael arian o dan y rhaglen ysgolion ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Rydym wedi cytuno ar ffordd ymlaen, rwyf yn credu, gyda phob un o'r awdurdodau lleol a chyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y buddsoddiad cyhoeddus eithriadol hwnnw mewn cyfalaf ysgolion.

**Russell George:** Mae'n amheus gennyf ai arweiniad gwleidyddol gan y blaid Lafur a welir ar Gyngor Sir Powys. Mae pryderon o hyd ym Mhowys, er bod y cais a gyflwynwyd wedi cael ei dderbyn yn gyffredinol, mae'r broses o herio ceisiadau unigol yn dal i fynd rhagddi, ac mae hynny'n creu rhywfaint o ansicrwydd. Pryd y bydd y broses craffu ar geisiadau yn dod i ben, ac a fyddwch yn gwneud datganiadau pellach i'r Siambr i gadarnhau unrhyw newidiadau a wnaed?

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolch i'r cynghorydd am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Rwyf yn hapus ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd da o ran cyflwyno'r rhaglen hon. Yn anochel, bydd rhai prosiectau yn symud i mewn ac allan o raglenni cyfalaf. Efallai y bydd newidiadau i flaenoriaethau o ganlyniad i ddigwyddiadau yn ystod y 24 awr nesaf, pan fydd gan bobl farn wahanol am ddsbarthu trefniadaeth ysgolion ar lefel leol. Rhaid inni gadw elfen o hyblygrwydd o ran y ffordd yr ydym yn ymdrin â'r rhaglen hon.

### Higher Education Funding

**9. Jocelyn Davies:** *Will the Minister make a statement on higher education funding. OAQ(4)0122(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn 2012-13, bydd dros £370 miliwn ar gael i brifysgolion Cymru drwy Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae system newydd y Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch ar gyfer cyllido prifysgolion yn defnyddio, yn rhannol, eich blaenoriaethau at wyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianeg ac ieithoedd modern yn ei pholisi dyrannu. Mae hefyd yn defnyddio incwm ymchwil, cwmnïau deilliedig a nifer y myfyrwyr tramor fel meini prawf. O dan y system hon, mae Prifysgol Cymru,

full-time places. Could some consideration be given to the widening of participation in the funding system?

**Leighton Andrews:** The approach that has been taken by HEFCW is in line with the 'For Our Future' strategy that was published by the One Wales Government, which she signed up to as a Deputy Minister in that Government. In respect of the recent announcements by HEFCW, this is a matter for the funding council to determine. The good news that comes out of the approach that HEFCW has taken is that all universities are expected to be better off financially under the new scheme. We are in accord with HEFCW in the priorities it has set out.

**William Graham:** A study by the Higher Education Policy Institute says that there is a continuing political dissatisfaction with Wales's university sector and its relationship with the Welsh Government; would the Minister care to comment?

**Leighton Andrews:** I have read the study thoroughly—I do not know whether the Member has—and I will be referring to it in a lecture in the near future. On the whole, it is a pretty well balanced study, but I do not think that some of the conclusions that it has drawn are borne out by the overall evidence it provides.

**David Rees:** Postgraduate study has always been outside the traditional funding arrangements, and I understand why. However, increasing numbers of graduates are seeking postgraduate qualifications, either as full-time or part-time students, to enhance their employability. Will the Welsh Government review the support that is offered to graduates who wish to extend their qualifications and skills, or who may wish to change career paths as a consequence of taking postgraduate qualifications?

**Leighton Andrews:** There is an issue that we need to look at in respect of future postgraduate funding. Inevitably, the priority in the context of the decisions that have been taken elsewhere in the United Kingdom has been for us to focus on how we support

Casnewydd yn amcangyfrif colled o tua 20 y cant o'i lleoedd amser llawn. A ellid rhoi sylw i ehangu cyfranogiad yn y system ariannu?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r dull a gymerwyd gan CCAUC yn dilyn y strategaeth 'Er Mwyn ein Dyfodol' a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un, y cytunodd hi iddi fel Dirprwy Weinidog yn y Llywodraeth honno. O ran y cyhoeddiadau diweddar gan CCAUC, mae hwn yn fater i'r cyngor cyllido benderfynu arno. Y newyddion da sy'n dod o'r dull y mae CCAUC wedi'i ddefnyddio yw y disgwylir i'r holl brifysgolion fod yn well eu byd yn ariannol o dan y cynllun newydd. Rydym yn cytuno â CCAUC o ran y blaenoriaethau y mae wedi'u gosod.

**William Graham:** Mae astudiaeth gan y Sefydliad Polisi Addysg Uwch yn dweud bod anfodlonrwydd gwleidyddol parhaus gyda sector prifysgol Cymru a'i berthynas gyda Llywodraeth Cymru; a hoffai'r Gweinidog wneud sylwadau?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf wedi darllen yr astudiaeth yn fanwl—nid wyf yn gwybod a yw'r Aelod wedi gwneud—a byddaf yn cyfeirio ato mewn darlith yn y dyfodol agos. Ar y cyfan, mae'n astudiaeth eithaf cytbwys, ond nid wyf yn credu bod rhai o'r casgliadau y mae wedi'i wneud yn cael eu cadarnhau gan y dystiolaeth gyffredinol y mae'n ei rhoi.

**David Rees:** Mae astudiaethau ôl-radd yn wastad wedi bod y tu allan i'r trefniadau ariannu traddodiadol, ac rwyf yn deall pam. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer cynyddol o raddedigion yn chwilio am gymwysterau ôl-radd, naill ai fel myfyrwyr amser llawn neu ran-amser, er mwyn gwella eu cyflogadwyedd. A fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn adolygu'r gefnogaeth a gynigir i raddedigion sy'n dymuno datblygu eu cymwysterau a'u sgiliau, neu a all fod yn dymuno newid llwybr gyrfa o ganlyniad i ddilyn cymwysterau ôl-radd?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae problem y mae angen inni edrych arni o ran ariannu cymwysterau ôl-radd yn y dyfodol. Yn anochel, y flaenoriaeth yng nghyd-destun y penderfyniadau a wnaed mewn manau eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig oedd inni ganolbwyntio

undergraduates with their studies. I am sure that the Member will agree that we have one of the most generous funding systems for undergraduate study in the United Kingdom. The challenges that the overall financial costs of that scheme pose mean that it is difficult for us, other than in certain areas, including the incentives we provide in respect of teacher education and one or two other vocational areas, to provide additional support. I am willing to return to that subject in the future, and I think that it is an important subject for us to focus on.

### Sgiliau Sylfaenol

**10. Ieuan Wyn Jones:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am nifer y disgyblion sy'n gadael ysgolion uwchradd heb sgiliau sylfaenol. OAQ(4)0120(ESK)*

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I thank the Member for Ynys Môn for that question. This Government's priority is to raise standards in literacy and numeracy in schools throughout Wales. The Minister and I are committed to ensuring that more pupils leave school equipped with the skills that they need to help them to succeed.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yn yr haf eleni, bydd 8,000 o ddisgyblion 16 oed yn gadael yr ysgol heb sgiliau sylfaenol. Mae hynny'n un o bob pump o'r boblogaeth 16 oed. Pa mor dderbyniol yw hynny?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** We are not satisfied with the current levels of English and Welsh literacy and of numeracy. That is why we have introduced the national literacy programme and why we have similar plans for a numeracy programme. However, the national survey of adult basic skills in Wales, for those aged 16-65, shows improvements, particularly in literacy and, very slightly, in numeracy. This is a key matter for the qualifications review; part of its work stream is to ensure that literacy and numeracy issues are being properly addressed in our qualifications system.

ar sut yr ydym yn cefnogi israddedigion gyda'u hastudiaethau. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelod yn cytuno bod gennym un o'r systemau cyllido mwyaf hael ar gyfer astudiaethau gradd yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'r heriau a ddaw yn sgîl costau ariannol cyffredinol y cynllun hwnnw yn golygu ei bod yn anodd inni ddarparu cymorth ychwanegol, ac eithrio mewn meysydd penodol, gan gynnwys y cymhellion a ddarparwn mewn perthynas ag addysg athrawon ac un neu ddau o feysydd galwedigaethol eraill. Rwyf yn barod i ddychwelyd at y pwnc hwnnw yn y dyfodol, ac rwyf yn credu ei fod yn bwnc pwysig inni ganolbwyntio arno.

### Basic Skills

**10. Ieuan Wyn Jones:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the number of pupils leaving secondary school without basic skills. OAQ(4)0120(ESK)*

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ynys Môn am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Blaenoriaeth y Llywodraeth hon yw codi safonau ym maes llythrennedd a rhifedd mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru. Mae'r Gweinidog a minnau wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod mwy o ddisgyblion yn gadael yr ysgol gyda'r sgiliau y mae eu hangen arnynt i'w helpu i lwyddo.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** This summer, 8,000 16-year-old pupils will leave school without basic skills. That equates to one in five of the 16-year-old population. How acceptable is that to you?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Nid ydym yn fodlon â'r lefelau presennol o lythrennedd Cymraeg a Saesneg a rhifedd. Dyna pam ein bod wedi cyflwyno'r rhaglen llythrennedd genedlaethol a pham y mae gennym gynlluniau tebyg ar gyfer rhaglen rhifedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r arolwg cenedlaethol o sgiliau sylfaenol i oedolion yng Nghymru, ar gyfer y rheini rhwng 16 a 65 oed, yn dangos gwelliannau, yn enwedig mewn llythrennedd ac, ychydig bach, mewn rhifedd. Mae hwn yn fater allweddol ar gyfer yr adolygiad o gymwysterau; rhan o'i ffrwd gwaith yw sicrhau bod materion llythrennedd a rhifedd yn cael sylw priodol yn ein system gymwysterau.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Minister, the Equality and Human Rights Commission's report entitled 'How fair is Wales?' revealed that differences in educational attainment by ethnicity are notable at age 16 in Wales. It went on to say that

'Chinese pupils are more than twice as likely to achieve a grade C or above in all core subjects at GCSE than Black Caribbean and Black African pupils'.

What is the Minister doing to tackle the problem of black and ethnic minority children underachieving in core subjects in Wales?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The measures that I have introduced will apply equally to all children, and I look forward to seeing that all categories and ethnic groups are following the literacy and numeracy test regimes and that the programmes we have in place—the 14-19 pathways—are providing a variety of means for all children to benefit, particularly in terms of functional literacy and numeracy.

### Anghenion Arbennig

**11. Mick Antoniw:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu cyrsiau coleg ôl-16 yng Nghymru sydd wedi'u hanelu at bobl ag anghenion arbennig. OAQ(4)0124(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Further education institutions in Wales offer a number of qualifications that are aligned to the needs of learners with learning difficulties and/or disabilities. These include awards and certificates in skills for independent living and skills for supported employment.

**Mick Antoniw:** Minister, I recently met with a number of pupils of Ysgol Tŷ Coch, which is a special needs residential school in my constituency, with which you will be familiar. These pupils have high-dependency special needs. They are rather disappointed about the number of options available to them when they leave school, particularly at the new Taf Ely learning campus, and they

**Mohammad Asghar:** Weinidog, datgelodd adroddiad y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol sy'n dwyn yr enw 'Pa mor deg yw Cymru?' fod gwahaniaethau o ran cyrhaeddiad addysgol yn ôl ethnigrwydd yn amlwg yn 16 oed yng Nghymru. Aeth ymlaen i ddweud

'Mae disgyblion Tsieineaidd yn fwy na dwywaith mwy tebygol o gyflawni gradd C neu uwch yn yr holl bynciau craidd mewn TGAU na disgyblion Du Caribiaidd a Du Affricanaidd'.

Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem o blant du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn tangyflawni yn y pynciau craidd yng Nghymru?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Bydd y camau yr wyf wedi'u cyflwyno yr un mor berthnasol i bob plentyn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld bod pob categori a grŵp ethnig yn dilyn y drefn profi llythrennedd a rhifedd, a bod y rhaglenni sydd gennym ar waith—y llwybrau 14-19—yn darparu amrywiaeth o ddulliau i bob plentyn gael budd, yn enwedig o ran llythrennedd a rhifedd.

### Special Needs

**11. Mick Antoniw:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of post-16 college courses in Wales aimed at people with special needs. OAQ(4)0124(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae sefydliadau addysg bellach yng Nghymru yn cynnig nifer o gymwysterau sydd yn cyfateb i anghenion dysgwyr ag anawsterau dysgu a/neu anabledau. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys dyfarniadau a thystysgrifau mewn sgiliau ar gyfer byw'n annibynnol a sgiliau ar gyfer cyflogaeth dan gymorth.

**Mick Antoniw:** Weinidog, cyfarfûm yn ddiweddar â nifer o ddisgyblion Ysgol Tŷ Coch, sy'n ysgol breswyl anghenion arbennig yn fy etholaeth, y byddwch yn gyfarwydd â hi. Mae gan y disgyblion hyn anghenion arbennig â dibyniaeth fawr. Maent yn eithaf siomedig ynghylch y nifer yr opsiynau sydd ar gael iddynt pan fyddant yn gadael yr ysgol, yn enwedig ar gampws dysgu newydd Taf

are impacted upon by the proposals in respect of Remploy. In view of your announcement about an inquiry, would you write directly to the schools and the pupils there to outline the Government's plans with regard to that inquiry?

**Leighton Andrews:** I would be very happy to do that. If there are issues in respect of the provision at Coleg Morgannwg, I hope that you will talk directly to the college about that. I know that it has always taken learners from Tŷ Coch school at the Rhydyfelin campus and that it works closely with staff to ensure stable transitions for those learners. It plans a pre-entry course at the Taf Ely learning campus, which should extend its provision there as well. On Remploy, you are aware of the work that we are currently undertaking in order to try to secure the future of Remploy jobs in Wales.

**Mark Isherwood:** The headteacher of a school providing education for pupils on the autistic spectrum contacted me to give me the good news that the school works with Careers Wales to find the most suitable provision for each pupil at FE level. This could be support from a local FE college, a special education department within a local FE college, a day specialist college or a residential specialist college. How, therefore, do you respond to that headteacher's concern that this is not equally available across all counties and that only certain counties can offer all of these options? Surely, all pupils should have a right to the same provision.

**Leighton Andrews:** That is a fair question, and I congratulate that school on the work that it has done in partnership with others. However, it is precisely those kinds of challenges that led me to establish the task and finish group on post-16 special educational needs, shortly after becoming responsible for the education portfolio, and we have been taking the recommendations of that group forward. There are still challenges, and I referred to them in my earlier answer to the Liberal Democrat Member for South Wales West, in relation to the level of out-of-county and out-of-country provision on

Elái, ac mae'r cynlluniau yng nghyswllt Remploy yn effeithio arnynt. O ystyried eich cyhoeddiad ynghylch ymchwiliad, a fydddech yn ysgrifennu'n uniongyrchol at yr ysgolion a'r disgyblion yno i amlinellu cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth o ran yr ymchwiliad hwnnw?

**Leighton Andrews:** Byddwn yn hapus iawn i wneud hynny. Os oes materion yn codi o ran y ddarpariaeth yng Ngholeg Morgannwg, rwyf yn gobeithio y byddwch yn siarad yn uniongyrchol â'r coleg am hynny. Gwn ei fod yn wastad wedi cymryd dysgwyr o ysgol Tŷ Coch ar gampws Rhydyfelin a'i fod yn gweithio'n agos gyda staff i sicrhau pontio sefydlog ar gyfer y dysgwyr hynny. Mae'n bwriadu cynnal cwrs cyn-mynediad ar gampws dysgu Taf Elái, a dylai hyn ehangu ei ddarpariaeth yno hefyd. Ynghylch Remploy, byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud ar hyn o bryd er mwyn ceisio sicrhau dyfodol swyddi Remploy yng Nghymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** Gwnaeth pennaeth ysgol sy'n darparu addysg ar gyfer disgyblion ar y sbectrum awtistig gysylltu â mi i roi'r newyddion da fod yr ysgol yn gweithio gyda Gyrfa Cymru i ddod o hyd i'r ddarpariaeth fwyaf addas ar gyfer pob disgybl ar lefel Addysg Bellach. Gallai hyn fod yn gymorth gan goleg Addysg Bellach lleol, adran addysg arbennig mewn coleg Addysg Bellach lleol, coleg diwrnod arbenigol neu goleg preswyl arbenigol. Sut, felly, yr ydych yn ymateb i bryder y pennaeth hwnnw nad yw hyn ar gael i bawb ar draws yr holl siroedd ac mai dim ond rhai siroedd sy'n gallu cynnig yr holl opsiynau hyn? Siawns nad oes gan bob disgybl yr hawl i'r un ddarpariaeth.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn teg, a hoffwn longyfarch yr ysgol honno ar y gwaith y mae wedi'i wneud mewn partneriaeth ag eraill. Fodd bynnag, y mathau hyn o heriau yn union a'm harweiniodd at sefydlu'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar anghenion addysgol arbennig ôl-16, yn fuan ar ôl dod yn gyfrifol am y portffolio addysg, ac rydym wedi bod yn bwrw ymlaen ag argymhellion y grŵp hwnnw. Mae heriau yn bodoli o hyd, a chyfeiriais atynt yn fy ateb cynharach i Aelod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol dros Orllewin De Cymru, mewn perthynas â lefel y ddarpariaeth y tu allan i sir

which we are still reliant. I hope that as a result of the education Bill that we will be introducing next year, on which we will be consulting shortly, we will be able to address some of these challenges.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Mae'r Bil safonau ysgolion yn cynnwys pwerau i Weinidogion ofyn i awdurdodau lleol ystyried cynnig darpariaeth ranbarthol ar gyfer anghenion arbennig. Beth fydd goblygiadau hyn ar addysg ôl-16 i'r rhai sy'n cael addysg anghenion arbennig? A oes syniadau gennyh eisoes am sut y gall y pwerau hyn gael eu defnyddio yn awr?

**Leighton Andrews:** It is certainly the case that there could be greater collaboration between local authorities on a regional basis in respect of provision for special educational needs of a number of kinds. I would expect those issues to be discussed in more detail as a result of the consultation that we will be embarking on shortly on additional learning needs.

### Remploy

**12. Mick Antoniw:** *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch sefyllfa ffatrioedd Remploy yng Nghymru. OAQ(4)0125(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** I have met Maria Miller, the UK Minister for Disabled People, and have discussed Remploy issues with her by phone as well. The First Minister and I have corresponded with Ministers in the UK Government on these issues. The Welsh Government has also provided a detailed response to the consultation on the Sayce review. We maintain our opposition to the closure of Remploy factories in Wales.

**Mick Antoniw:** The staff at the two Welsh Remploy factories not yet scheduled for closure by the coalition Government, including the factory at Porth, where a number of my constituents are employed, are understandably worried about their futures, as are those workers who have already been told that their factories are earmarked for closure. Will the Minister clarify what the Government's input will be into the UK

a'r ddarpariaeth y tu allan i wlad yr ydym yn dal yn ddibynnol arni. Rwyf yn gobeithio o ganlyniad i'r Bil Addysg y byddwn yn ei gyflwyno y flwyddyn nesaf, ac y byddwn yn ymgynghori yn ei gylch cyn bo hir, y byddwn yn gallu ymdrin â rhai o'r heriau hyn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** The school standards Bill contains powers for Ministers to ask local authorities to consider making regional provision for special educational needs. What implications will this have for the post-16 education of those in special education? Do you have any ideas as to how these powers could be used now?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n sicr yn wir y gallai fod mwy o gydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau lleol ar lefel ranbarthol mewn perthynas â darpariaeth ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig o sawl math. Byddwn yn disgwyl i'r materion hynny gael eu trafod yn fanylach yn sgil yr ymgynghoriad y byddwn yn dechrau arno'n fuan ar anghenion dysgu ychwanegol.

### Remploy

**12. Mick Antoniw:** *What discussions has the Minister had with the UK Government regarding the position of Remploy factories in Wales. OAQ(4)0125(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf wedi cwrdd â Maria Miller, Gweinidog y DU dros Bobl Anabl, ac wedi trafod materion Remploy gyda hi dros y ffôn yn ogystal. Mae'r Prif Weinidog a minnau wedi gohebu gyda Gweinidogion yn Llywodraeth y DU ar y materion hyn. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru hefyd wedi darparu ymateb manwl i'r ymgynghoriad ar adolygiad Sayce. Rydym yn dal i wrthwynebu cau ffatrioedd Remploy yng Nghymru.

**Mick Antoniw:** Mae'r staff yn y ddwy ffatri Remploy yng Nghymru nad yw'r Llywodraeth glymblaid yn mynd i'w cau hyd yma, gan gynnwys y ffatri ym Mhorth, lle mae nifer o'm hetholwyr yn cael eu cyflogi, yn poeni am eu dyfodol wrth reswm, fel y mae'r gweithwyr hynny sydd eisoes wedi cael gwybod bod eu ffatrioedd yn mynd i gael eu cau. A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro beth fydd cyfraniad y Llywodraeth i werthusiad

Government's ongoing evaluation of the two factories not yet listed for closure, as well as the steps being taken to ensure that workers at other Welsh Remploy factories are protected?

**Leighton Andrews:** As the Member for Pontypridd knows, the factory at Porth is in my constituency and he and I have visited it together. I have visited all of the Remploy factories in Wales in recent weeks, therefore I and officials have a good understanding of the opportunities that those factories have for future work and the nature of the skills that exist within them and the resources that they have. My officials are now working through what is feasible for each of the factories. We are seeking to establish where expressions of interest are likely to be made for the future work of those factories. We have also established an external group with partners from outside who have an interest in the continuation of some of that work, and indeed, possibly, working in collaboration through social enterprises with those partners. We have worked with the Wales Co-operative Centre and with Social Firms Wales to look at some of the future opportunities for Remploy workers in Wales.

It is fair to say that we are in the middle of a process. We still have questions to ask. We are seeking further information from the Department for Work and Pensions and Remploy, and we will be assisting teams of workers, managers and others who will want to take forward business plans to develop work for those factories.

**Mark Isherwood:** Social ownership of these factories by employees was mentioned in the Sayce review, and I questioned you about that last November. However, I have also met Maria Miller and put my case forward for Wrexham, pointing out the contracts the factory has with Wrexham council, and she told me that these are matters that need to be considered within the consultation, alongside the other proposals and the fact that the budget for supporting disabled people into employment is being increased not reduced. However, how do you respond to her letter to

parhaus Llywodraeth y DU o'r ddwy ffatri nad ydynt wedi'u rhestru i gau eto, yn ogystal â'r camau a gymerir i sicrhau bod gweithwyr yn y ffatrioedd Remploy eraill yng Nghymru yn cael eu diogelu?

**Leighton Andrews:** Fel y gŵyr yr Aelod dros Bontypridd, mae'r ffatri ym Mhorth yn fy etholaeth, ac mae ef a minnau wedi ymweld â hi gyda'n gilydd. Rwyf wedi ymweld â phob un o ffatrioedd Remploy yng Nghymru dros yr wythnosau diwethaf, felly mae gennyf fi a swyddogion ddealltwriaeth dda o'r cyfleoedd sydd gan y ffatrioedd hynny ar gyfer gwaith yn y dyfodol a natur y sgiliau sy'n bodoli ynddynt a'r adnoddau sydd ganddynt. Mae fy swyddogion yn gweithio yn awr i weld beth sy'n ymarferol i bob un o'r ffatrioedd. Rydym yn ceisio gweld lle mae datganiadau o ddiddordeb yn debygol o fod o ran gwaith y ffatrioedd hynny yn y dyfodol. Rydym hefyd wedi sefydlu grŵp allanol gyda phartneriaid o'r tu allan sydd â diddordeb mewn parhau â rhywfaint o'r gwaith hwnnw, ac yn wir, gweithio ar y cyd, o bosibl, drwy fentrau cymdeithasol gyda'r partneriaid hynny. Rydym wedi gweithio gyda Chanolfan Cydweithredol Cymru a chyda Chwmnïau Cymdeithasol Cymru i edrych ar rai o'r cyfleoedd yn y dyfodol i weithwyr Remploy yng Nghymru.

Mae'n deg dweud ein bod yng nghanol proses. Mae gennym gwestiynau i'w gofyn o hyd. Rydym yn chwilio am wybodaeth bellach gan yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a Remploy, a byddwn yn cynorthwyo timau o weithwyr, rheolwyr ac eraill a fydd yn awyddus i fwrw ymlaen â chynlluniau busnes i ddatblygu gwaith ar gyfer y ffatrioedd hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn adolygiad Sayce, soniwyd am berchnogaeth gymdeithasol o'r ffatrioedd hyn gan weithwyr, ac fe'ch holais am hyn fis Tachwedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, rwyf hefyd wedi cwrdd â Maria Miller a chyflwyno fy achos dros Wrecsam, gan dynnu sylw at y contractau sydd gan y ffatri â chynghor Wrecsam. Dywedodd wrthyf fod y rhain yn faterion y mae angen eu hystyried yn yr ymgynghoriad, ochr yn ochr â'r cynigion eraill a'r ffaith bod y gyllideb ar gyfer cefnogi pobl anabl i gael gwaith yn cael ei chynyddu, nid ei lleihau. Fodd bynnag, sut yr ydych yn



all Assembly Members and Members of Parliament last week, which stated, quite clearly, that all decisions about proposed factory closures and redundancies are subject to ongoing collective consultation and that no final decisions have been made?

2.15 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** Clearly, appropriate consultations are currently going on between Remploy and the relevant trade unions about the future, but the UK Government has made it very clear that it is withdrawing the subsidy from the seven factories in Wales, and Remploy, as a result of the loss of that subsidy, subsequently decided to close them. We would have liked the subsidy that currently underpins those factories to have been transferred to the Welsh Government and I think that we could have then created a solid and sustainable future for those factories.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Minister, we heard yesterday from the First Minister—and, indeed, you have confirmed it today—that the London Government has refused to devolve the budget for Remploy. Are you in a position to share any further correspondence on that matter?

**Leighton Andrews:** I think that we have made it clear publicly that we would have liked the budget to be devolved, but the UK Government has made it clear that it will not do that. The issue now, as we go forward, is to identify the best route for us, alongside the workers and their trade unions, to establish a sustainable future for those factories, and that is what we are working on.

ymateb i'w llythyr at holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r holl Aelodau Seneddol yr wythnos diwethaf, a oedd yn datgan yn glir fod pob penderfyniad ynghylch y bwriad i gau ffatrioedd a diswyddo pobl yn amodol ar ymgynghori parhaus ar y cyd ac nad oes dim penderfyniadau terfynol wedi cael eu gwneud?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn amlwg, mae ymgynghoriadau priodol yn cael eu cynnal ar hyn o bryd rhwng Remploy a'r undebau llafur perthnasol am y dyfodol, ond mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi ei gwneud yn glir iawn ei bod yn tynnu'r cymhorthdal oddi ar y saith ffatri yng Nghymru, a bod Remploy, o ganlyniad i golli'r cymhorthdal hwnnw, wedi penderfynu eu cau. Byddem wedi hoffi pe byddai'r cymhorthdal sy'n cynnal y ffatrioedd hynny ar hyn o bryd yn cael ei drosglwyddo i Lywodraeth Cymru ac rwyf yn credu y gallem fod wedi creu dyfodol cadarn a chynaliadwy i'r ffatrioedd hynny wedyn.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Weinidog, clywsom ddoe gan Brif Weinidog Cymru—ac, yn wir, rydych wedi cadarnhau hynny heddiw—fod y Llywodraeth yn Llundain wedi gwrthod datganoli'r gyllideb ar gyfer Remploy. A ydych mewn sefyllfa i rannu unrhyw ohebiaeth bellach am y mater hwnnw?

**Leighton Andrews:** Credaf ein bod wedi dweud yn glir ar goedd y byddem wedi hoffi i'r gyllideb gael ei datganoli, ond mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi dweud yn glir na fydd yn gwneud hynny. Y mater yn awr, wrth inni symud ymlaen, yw adnabod y llwybr gorau inni, ochr yn ochr â'r gweithwyr a'u hundebau llafur, er mwyn sefydlu dyfodol cynaliadwy ar gyfer y ffatrioedd hynny, a dyna beth yr ydym yn gweithio arno.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau Questions to the Minister for Local Government and Communities**

### **Diogelwch ar y Ffyrdd**

### **Road Safety**

**Kirsty Williams:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu pa gamau y mae'n eu cymryd i wella diogelwch ar rwydwaith ffyrdd Cymru. OAQ(4)0124(LGC)*

**I. Kirsty Williams:** *Will the Minister outline what steps he is taking to improve safety on Wales' road network. OAQ(4)0124(LGC)*

**The Minister for Local Government and Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a**

**Communities (Carl Sargeant):** The Welsh Government works closely with our partners to improve safety across the Welsh road network. We provide substantial financial support at a national and local level, and there have been significant reductions in the number of people killed and seriously injured on Welsh roads in recent years.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams):** I thank the Minister for his answer. Despite the fall in the number of casualties, Brecon and Radnorshire, which has a large section of Wales's trunk road network running through it, is still the site of too many fatal accidents—most recently, on the A40, where a motorcyclist was killed and a local resident seriously injured following a collision. What discussions have you had with police forces in Wales to tackle the problem of unsafe motorcycle driving on our trunk roads, which is particularly prevalent during the summer months and during periods of good weather?

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for her question. I am aware of the incident that she mentioned and I will, perhaps, guard my comments on that until a coroner's inquest has been completed. However, the Member raises an important issue regarding road safety and motorcycles, and their use on our trunk road network and our local roads. My team of transport officials work with the police authorities and police officers across Wales through the Wales road casualty reduction partnership and GoSafe to make a significant change to the way that riders use the roads and their motorcycles. However, any incident on Welsh roads is regrettable and is one too many.

**Christine Chapman:** Recent works carried out to the A4059 in Mountain Ash by Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council will significantly improve the safety of motorists and pedestrians along one of the busiest stretches of road in my constituency. Will you join me, Minister, in welcoming

**Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant):** Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gweithio'n agos gyda'n partneriaid i wella diogelwch ar draws rhwydwaith ffyrdd Cymru. Rydym yn darparu cefnogaeth ariannol sylweddol ar lefel genedlaethol ac ar lefel leol, ac mae nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu lladd a'u hanafu'n ddifrifol ar ffyrdd Cymru wedi lleihau'n sylweddol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

**Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams):** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb. Er bod nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu lladd a'u hanafu wedi lleihau, mae llawer gormod o ddamweiniau angheuol yn dal i ddigwydd ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, sy'n cynnwys rhan fawr o rwydwaith cefnffyrdd Cymru. Yn fwyaf diweddar, cafodd beiciwr modur ei ladd a chafodd preswilydd lleol ei anafu'n ddifrifol yn dilyn gwrthdrawiad ar yr A40. Pa drafodaethau rydych wedi'u cael â'r heddluoedd yng Nghymru i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem o yrru beiciau modur yn anniogel ar ein cefnffyrdd, sy'n amlwg iawn yn ystod misoedd yr haf ac yn ystod cyfnodau o dywydd da?

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei chwestiwn. Rwyf yn ymwybodol o'r digwyddiad y soniodd amdano, ac efallai y byddaf yn dal fy sylwadau ynghylch hynny yn ôl nes y bydd cwêst crwner wedi cael ei gwblhau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Aelod yn codi mater pwysig yng nghyswllt diogelwch ar y ffyrdd a beiciau modur, a'r modd y maent yn cael eu defnyddio ar ein rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd a'n ffyrdd lleol. Mae fy nhîm o swyddogion trafndiaeth yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau'r heddlu a swyddogion yr heddlu ar hyd a lled Cymru drwy bartneriaeth lleihau anafiadau ffyrdd Cymru a GanBwyll, er mwyn newid yn sylweddol y modd y mae beicwyr modur yn defnyddio'r ffyrdd a'u beiciau modur. Fodd bynnag, mae unrhyw ddigwyddiad ar ffyrdd Cymru yn destun gofid, ac yn un digwyddiad yn ormod.

**Christine Chapman:** Bydd y gwaith a wnaed gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf ar yr A4059 yn Aberpennar yn ddiweddar yn gwella diogelwch modurwyr a cherddwyr yn sylweddol ar hyd un o'r ffyrdd prysuraf yn fy etholaeth. A wnewch ymuno â mi, Weinidog,

these developments and in paying tribute to the council's continued commitment to improving its road infrastructure, thereby improving safety and economic development?

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for the Cynon Valley. Yes, of course, safety on our roads is important and, where improvements are made, they should be commended. I join you in congratulating the administration.

**Russell George:** Traffic Wales is a vital traffic information service, delivering accurate and timely information to the public to ensure the effectiveness and safe management of the Welsh road network. However, yesterday, it was completely in the dark regarding the movement of an abnormal load from Oswestry across Montgomeryshire to an existing windfarm, which occurred right in the middle of yesterday morning's rush hour. Does the Minister have any information as to what went wrong with the channels of communication at Traffic Wales?

**Carl Sargeant:** No. I have noted the Member's contribution today and I will write to him on this matter.

**Elin Jones:** Weinidog, mae nifer gymharol uchel o ddamweiniau car ar gefnffordd yr A487 rhwng Aberaeron ac Aberystwyth yn fy etholaeth i, gyda'r ffordd yn cael ei chau yn gyfan gwbl yn aml oherwydd damweiniau car. Mae'r cyngor sir yn awyddus iawn i weld rhai gwelliannau ar y ffordd hon er mwyn lleihau'r risg o ddamweiniau. A wnewch chi sicrhau eich bod yn cael trafodaeth gyda'r cyngor sir i weld pa welliannau y gallwch eu darparu ar y gefnffordd hon i wella diogelwch?

**Carl Sargeant:** Of course, it is about working in partnership with local authorities. We issue a regional transport grant to consortia that consider all aspects of modernising the road infrastructure. I would expect the Welsh Government to be part of those discussions in terms of the overall benefit to the road network and improving safety for the people who use it.

**Arbedion Effeithlonrwydd**

i groesawu'r datblygiadau hyn ac i ganmol ymrwymiad parhaus y cyngor i wella ei seilwaith ffyrdd sydd, o ganlyniad, yn gwella diogelwch a datblygiad economaidd?

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Gwm Cynon. Wrth gwrs, mae diogelwch ar ein ffyrdd yn bwysig, a phan fydd gwelliannau'n cael eu gwneud, dylid eu canmol. Rwyf ffinau, fel chithau, yn llongyfarch y weinyddiaeth.

**Russell George:** Mae Traffig Cymru yn wasanaeth hollbwysig sy'n rhoi gwybodaeth am draffig, ac yn darparu gwybodaeth gywir ac amserol i'r cyhoedd er mwyn sicrhau bod rhwydwaith ffyrdd Cymru yn effeithiol ac yn cael ei reoli'n ddiogel. Er hynny, nid oedd yn gwybod dim byd ddoe am lwyth anarferol a oedd yn cael ei symud o Groesoswallt ar draws sir Drefaldwyn i fferm wynt, a ddigwyddodd yng nghanol yr oriau brig fore ddoe. A oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw wybodaeth am yr hyn a aeth o'i le gyda sianelau cyfathrebu Traffig Cymru?

**Carl Sargeant:** Nac oes. Rwyf wedi nodi cyfraniad yr Aelod heddiw, a byddaf yn ysgrifennu ato ynghylch y mater hwn.

**Elin Jones:** Minister, there is a relatively high number of car accidents on the A487 trunk road between Aberaeron and Aberystwyth in my constituency, with the road often being closed completely as a result of car accidents. The county council is keen to see some improvements made to this road in order to minimise the risk of accidents. Will you ensure that you hold discussions with the county council in order to see what improvements you can provide on this trunk road in order to improve safety?

**Carl Sargeant:** Wrth gwrs, mae'n bwysig gweithio ar y cyd ag awdurdodau lleol. Rydym yn darparu grant trafndiaeth rhanbarthol i gonsortia sy'n ystyried pob agwedd ar foderneiddio'r seilwaith ffyrdd. Byddwn yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth Cymru fod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau hynny yng nghyswllt y budd cyffredinol i'r rhwydwaith ffyrdd, a gwella diogelwch i'r bobl sy'n ei ddefnyddio.

**Efficiency Savings**

**2. Lindsay Whittle:** *Pa waith y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i annog cydweithio agosach rhwng awdurdodau lleol ym maes arbedion effeithlonrwydd. OAQ(4)0133(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for South Wales East. The compact for change with local authorities sets out an ambitious programme of reform agreed with local government to improve services and achieve efficiencies.

**Lindsay Whittle:** In light of the success of one council in maintaining high-quality service delivery while keeping council tax frozen for two years—modesty prevents me from naming Caerphilly County Borough Council—does the Minister agree that the poor performance of nearby authorities highlights the need for far greater collaboration and sharing of best practice across Wales’s local authorities?

**Carl Sargeant:** I have seen a number of projects by councils of all colours across Wales that I am confident will deliver better public services. This is something that I clearly support now and will continue to support in the future.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Minister, Tony Travers of the Institute for Government has recently raised concerns that the collaboration agenda has the potential to leave parts of Wales out on a limb; I hope that the Minister will regard that as constructive criticism. What evaluation has been made of the collaboration agenda to date, and what attempts have been made to quantify the value of efficiency savings incurred under that agenda?

**Carl Sargeant:** We have seen much evidence of the actions taken by local authorities and the broader public sector across Wales. Individuals are entitled to their opinion, but different people often have different opinions. I recognise what Mr Travers has said, but our agenda is to improve public services through collaboration.

**2. Lindsay Whittle:** *What work is the Welsh Government doing to encourage closer collaboration between local authorities on efficiency savings. OAQ(4)0133(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ddwyrain De Cymru. Mae'r compact ar gyfer newid gydag awdurdodau lleol yn amlinellu rhaglen ddiwygio uchelgeisiol y cytunwyd arni gyda llywodraeth leol, i wella gwasanaethau ac i sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Yn sgîl llwyddiant un cyngor i barhau i gyflenwi gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel gan gadw'r dreth gyngor wedi'i rhewi am ddwy flynedd—mae gwyleidd-dra yn fy atal rhag enwi Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili—a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod perfformiad gwael awdurdodau cyfagos yn pwysleisio'r angen i gydweithio a rhannu arferion gorau llawer mwy ar draws awdurdodau lleol Cymru?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf wedi gweld nifer o brosiectau gan gynghorau o bob lliw ledled Cymru, ac rwyf yn ffyddiog y byddant yn cyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gwell. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth rwyf yn amlwg yn ei gefnogi ar hyn o bryd, ac y byddaf yn parhau i'w gefnogi yn y dyfodol.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Weinidog, mae Tony Travers o elusen Institute for Government wedi mynegi pryderon yn ddiweddar y gallai'r agenda gydweithio adael rhannau o Gymru mewn sefyllfa fregus; rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried hynny'n feirniadaeth adeiladol. Pa werthusiad sydd wedi cael ei wneud o'r agenda gydweithio hyd yma, a pha ymdrechion sydd wedi cael eu gwneud i fesur gwerth yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd sy'n cael eu sicrhau o dan yr agenda honno?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rydym wedi gweld llawer o dystiolaeth o'r camau a gymerwyd gan awdurdodau lleol a'r sector cyhoeddus ehangach ledled Cymru. Mae gan bob unigolyn hawl i'w farn, ond mae gan bobl wahanol farn wahanol yn aml. Rwyf yn cydnabod yr hyn y mae Mr Travers wedi'i ddweud, ond ein hagenda ni yw gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy gydweithio.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** I thank the Minister for that answer. When do you intend to bring a statement to the Chamber outlining the efficiency savings to date, the improvements, if any, to local service delivery, and instances where collaboration may not be working as well? That would provide all Assembly Members with an opportunity to properly scrutinise and monitor the collaboration process.

**Carl Sargeant:** The opposition Member knows that there is an opportunity every week to bring an opposition debate to the Chamber. That could be a debate on improvement in local services, as opposed to a debate about local government for a second week in a row.

### Rheoliadau Raliau Ceir

**3. Aled Roberts:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei gyfrifoldebau datganoledig o ran rheoliadau Raliau Ceir. OAQ(4)0131(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for North Wales. Under section 13 and 13A of the Road Traffic Act 1988, Welsh Ministers have the power to make regulations authorising, or providing for authorising, competitions or trials but not races or trials of speed on public ways or off road.

**Aled Roberts:** Thank you for that response, Minister. You will be aware that the regulations with regard to rallies go back to 1969. In England, these regulations were amended in 2010 and the accompanying explanatory memorandum stated that the Welsh Government had confirmed that it intended to propose similar amendments. Can you give us a timeline with regard to when those amendments might come forward? I have seen recent examples in the Wrexham area of rallies being held at 4 a.m., with local residents only being given notice that the rally was taking place, with no right to object.

**Carl Sargeant:** Safety considerations for

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Pryd ydych yn bwriadu cyflwyno datganiad yn y Siambr yn amlinellu'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd a wnaed hyd yma, y gwelliannau—os o gwbl—a wnaed yng nghyswllt y gwasanaethau lleol a ddarperir, ac achosion lle nad yw cydweithio yn gweithio cystal o bosibl? Byddai hynny'n rhoi cyfle i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad fonitro a chraffu'n briodol ar y broses gydweithio.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae Aelod yr wrthblaid yn gwybod y ceir cyfle bob wythnos i gyflwyno dadl yr wrthblaid yn y Siambr. Gallai honno fod yn ddadl ar wella gwasanaethau lleol, yn hytrach na dadl ar lywodraeth leol am yr ail wythnos yn olynol.

### Car Rally Regulations

**3. Aled Roberts:** *Will the Minister make a statement on his devolved responsibilities regarding Car Rally regulations. OAQ(4)0131(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ogledd Cymru. O dan adran 13 ac 13A o Ddeddf Traffig Ffyrdd 1988, mae gan Weinidogion Cymru'r pŵer i wneud rheoliadau sy'n awdurdodi, neu'n paratoi ar gyfer awdurdodi, cystadlaethau neu dreialon ond nid rasys na threialon cyflymder ar ffyrdd cyhoeddus nac oddi ar y ffordd.

**Aled Roberts:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y rheoliadau mewn perthynas â raliau yn dyddio'n ôl i 1969. Yn Lloegr, cafodd y rheoliadau hyn eu diwygio yn 2010, ac roedd y memorandwm esboniadol cysylltiedig yn datgan bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cadarnhau ei bod yn bwriadu cynnig gwelliannau tebyg. A allwch roi amserlen inni o ran pryd y gallai'r gwelliannau hynny gael eu cyflwyno? Rwyf wedi gweld enghreifftiau yn ardal Wrecsam yn ddiweddar o raliau'n cael eu cynnal am 4 a.m., gyda phreswylwyr lleol ond yn cael gwybod bod y rali'n cael ei chynnal, heb hawl i wrthwynebu.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae ystyriaethau diogelwch

rallies on public highways and roads are extremely important. If further legislation is required, we will consider its appropriateness. I will work closely with the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science to see whether we need to bring forward new legislation or consider amendments to existing legislation.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Minister, a number of constituents contacted me in the run-up to the recent Rali Llŷn about their concerns over the event, which, as I think Aled Roberts has already said, took place between midnight and 4 a.m., and the impact that it would have on their lives. Can you confirm what discussions you and your representatives have had with rallying organisations about how they and local authorities can improve communication with affected residents so that the choice of route and the timing of the rally cause minimum disruption to people living nearby?

**Carl Sargeant:** The Motor Sports Association is recognised by the Federation Internationale de L'Automobile as the national governing body for four-wheeled motor sports in the UK. The association and our major events unit, which forms part of the BETS department, are in regular discussion with the motor industry. I would consider it good practice to inform residents of motor rallies and when they have the potential to impose on their daily lives.

#### Amodau Gwaith

**4. Aled Roberts:** *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal gydag awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn ag amodau gwaith gweithwyr sy'n ymwneud â phrosiectau cydweithredol rhwng yr awdurdodau lleol a'r awdurdodau iechyd hynny. OAQ(4)0130(SJL)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I have not been asked to enter into any such discussions.

**Aled Roberts:** Minister, although I am sure that we all welcome collaborative projects between health boards and local authorities, there are difficulties with regard to areas such

ar gyfer raliâu ar briffyrdd a ffyrdd cyhoeddus yn eithriadol bwysig. Os oes angen deddfwriaeth bellach, byddwn yn ystyried addasrwydd hynny. Byddaf yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth i weld a oes angen inni gyflwyno deddfwriaeth newydd neu ystyried gwelliannau ar gyfer y ddeddfwriaeth bresennol.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Weinidog, gwnaeth nifer o etholwyr gysylltu â mi cyn Rali Llŷn a gynhaliwyd yn ddiweddar ynghylch eu pryderon am y digwyddiad a gafodd, fel rwyf yn meddwl bod Aled Roberts eisoes wedi dweud, ei chynnal rhwng hanner nos a 4 a.m., a'r effaith y byddai'n ei chael ar eu bywydau. A allwch gadarnhau pa drafodaethau rydych chi a'ch cynrychiolwyr wedi'u cael â sefydliadau raliio ynghylch sut y gallant hwy ac awdurdodau lleol gyfathrebu'n well â phreswylwyr y mae hyn yn effeithio arnynt, er mwyn sicrhau bod llwybr ac amseriad y rali'n amharu cyn lleied â phosibl ar y bobl sy'n byw gerllaw?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae Federation Internationale de L'Automobile yn cydnabod mai Motor Sports Association yw'r corff llywodraethu cenedlaethol ar gyfer chwaraeon modur pedair olwyn yn y DU. Mae'r gymdeithas a'n huned digwyddiadau mawr, sy'n rhan o'r adran Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth, yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd â'r diwydiant moduro. Byddwn yn ei ystyried yn arfer da hysbysu preswylwyr o raliâu modur a phan allent amharu ar eu bywydau bob dydd.

#### Working Conditions

**4. Aled Roberts:** *What discussions has the Minister held with local authorities regarding the working conditions of employees that are involved in collaborative projects between those local authorities and health authorities. OAQ(4)0130(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Nid oes neb wedi gofyn imi gynnal unrhyw drafodaethau o'r fath.

**Aled Roberts:** Weinidog, er fy mod yn siŵr bod pob un ohonom yn croesawu prosiectau cydweithredol rhwng byrddau iechyd ac awdurdodau lleol, ceir anawsterau gyda

as occupational therapy, where the terms and conditions operating in the health service are very different to those within local authorities. I ask you and the Minister for Health and Social Services to look into this issue, because it has led to problems with recruitment of occupational therapists in certain local authorities.

**Carl Sargeant:** We already have some work streams looking at this. The public service leadership group and the workforce partnership council are both looking at the difficulties of transition between parts of the public service. We recognise that there are issues to do with pay and conditions and contractual arrangements between different organisations. Nevertheless, we see this as an opportunity to continue to press for collaboration on improving public services rather than as an obstacle to stop progress.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** The 2011 Cochrane review study, which included input from academics on secondment to the Welsh Government at the time, entitled 'Collaboration Between Local Health and Local Government Agencies for Health Improvement', did not identify any reliable evidence that inter-agency collaboration, compared with standard services, necessarily leads to health improvements. How will the Welsh Government ensure that health improvements are made while the benefits of collaborative working for employees, agencies, infrastructure, third parties and so on are retained? Will you look into engaging further with the private and third sectors to achieve the health improvements that are so far lacking here in Wales?

**Carl Sargeant:** The Member raises an important issue, I am sure. The issue for me is to be up to date with what we are doing now. The public service leadership group is leading the whole public sector together. Local health boards, police and fire services and local authorities all sit round the table to discuss how they can improve public service delivery. We have moved a long way in a

meysydd fel therapi galwedigaethol, lle mae'r telerau ac amodau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn wahanol iawn i'r telerau ac amodau mewn awdurdodau lleol. Gofynnaf i chi a'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ymchwilio i'r mater hwn, oherwydd mae wedi arwain at broblemau yng nghyswllt recriwtio therapyddion galwedigaethol mewn rhai awdurdodau lleol.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae gennym eisoes ffrydiau gwaith sy'n edrych ar hyn. Mae grŵp arwain y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a chynghor partneriaeth y gweithlu yn edrych ar y problemau pontio rhwng rhannau o'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Rydym yn cydnabod y ceir problemau ynghylch cyflog ac amodau a threfniadau contractiol rhwng gwahanol sefydliadau. Serch hynny, rydym yn ystyried hyn yn gyfle i barhau i bwysu am gydweithredu fel ffordd o wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn hytrach nag fel rhwystr i atal cynnydd.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Yn astudiaeth adolygiad Cochrane 2011, 'Collaboration Between Local Health and Local Government Agencies for Health Improvement'—a oedd yn cynnwys mewnbwn gan academyddion ar secondiad i Lywodraeth Cymru ar y pryd—ni ddaethpwyd o hyd i unrhyw dystiolaeth ddibynadwy bod cydweithredu rhyngasiantaethol, o'i gymharu â gwasanaethau safonol, o reidrwydd yn arwain at welliannau iechyd. Sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn sicrhau y bydd gwelliannau iechyd yn cael eu gwneud ar yr un pryd â chadw buddion cydweithredu i weithwyr, asiantaethau, seilwaith, trydydd partiön ac ati? A wnewch ystyried ymgysylltu ymhellach â'r sector preifat a'r trydydd sector i sicrhau'r gwelliannau iechyd nad ydynt i'w gweld fawr ddim yma yng Nghymru?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r Aelod yn codi mater pwysig, rwyf yn siŵr. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig i mi yw gwybod yn union beth rydym yn ei wneud ar hyn o bryd. Mae grŵp arwain y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn arwain y sector cyhoeddus cyfan. Mae byrddau iechyd lleol, gwasanaethau tân a'r heddlu, ac awdurdodau lleol i gyd yn eistedd o amgylch y bwrdd i drafod sut y gallant wella'r gwasanaethau

very short time on delivering better public services with a framework for measurement so that we can demonstrate the benefits of collaboration and the models used to deliver services.

cyhoeddus a gyflenwir. Rydym wedi mynd ymhell mewn cyfnod byr iawn o ran cyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gwell gyda fframwaith mesur er mwyn inni allu dangos buddion cydweithredu a'r modelau a ddefnyddir i gyflenwi gwasanaethau.

### Y Seilwaith Trafnidiaeth

**5. Paul Davies:** *Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i wella'r seilwaith trafndiaeth yng ngorllewin Cymru. OAQ(4)0123(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for Preseli Pembrokeshire for his question Our programme for improving transport infrastructure in west Wales is set out in my prioritised national transport plan, published last December.

**Paul Davies:** Minister, I am sure that you are aware of a petition submitted to the Assembly to improve Fishguard town centre. The petition calls for investment to be made in a town-centre improvement scheme for Fishguard, including pedestrian and traffic management measures. I am aware that the Minister has recently been unable to support a funding application for this purpose. However, given the need for improvement, will the Minister reconsider this request and commit to looking at this issue by working with key stakeholders to improve the town's infrastructure?

**Carl Sargeant:** Of course, infrastructure is important to many Members across the Chamber. The Member's comments today are noted.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, a fydddech yn derbyn bod y cysylltiadau rhwng Llanbedr Pont Steffan a Chaerfyrddin yn eithriadol o bwysig i drigolion de-orllewin Cymru? Beth yr ydych am ei wneud i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth bws yn cael ei ailgyflwyno i drigolion Cwmann a Phencarreg?

2.30 p.m.

**Carl Sargeant:** The Member will be aware of the discussions that I am having with bus operators across Wales about creating a new

### The Transport Infrastructure

**5. Paul Davies:** *What is the Welsh Government doing to improve the transport infrastructure in west Wales. OAQ(4)0123(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Breseli Sir Benfro am ei gwestiwn. Mae ein rhaglen ar gyfer gwella'r seilwaith trafndiaeth yn y gorllewin wedi'i hamlinellu ym mlaenoriaethau'r cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol, a gyhoeddwyd fis Rhagfyr diwethaf.

**Paul Davies:** Weinidog, rwyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o ddeiseb a gyflwynwyd i'r Cynulliad i wella canol tref Abergwaun. Mae'r ddeiseb yn galw am fuddsoddi mewn cynllun gwella canol y dref ar gyfer Abergwaun, gan gynnwys mesurau rheoli traffig a cherddwyr. Rwyf yn ymwybodol bod y Gweinidog wedi methu â chefnogi cais am gyllid at y diben hwn yn ddiweddar. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried yr angen am welliant, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ailystyried y cais hwn, ac ymrwymo i edrych ar y mater hwn drwy weithio gyda rhanddeiliaid allweddol i wella seilwaith y dref?

**Carl Sargeant:** Wrth gwrs, mae seilwaith yn bwysig i nifer o Aelodau ar draws y Siambr. Mae sylwadau'r Aelod heddiw wedi cael eu nodi.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, would you accept that the links between Lampeter and Carmarthen are exceptionally important for the residents of south-west Wales? What are you going to do to ensure that the bus service is reinstated for the people of Cwmann and Pencarreg?

**Carl Sargeant:** Bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol o'r trafodaethau rwyf yn eu cael â gweithredwyr bysiau ym mhob cwr o



service agreement, as opposed to a fuel subsidy, to ensure that we invest in our services. I am sure that the Member for Plaid Cymru will be supportive of those proposals as we bring them forward.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rwy'n falch iawn eich bod chi'n cael y trafodaethau hynny, ond nid yw hynny'n llawer o gysur i drigolion Pencarreg a Chwmann sydd wedi colli'u cysylltiad bws yn gyfan gwbl, sy'n golygu nad ydynt yn gallu cael mynediad i wasanaethau lleol. Y cwestiwn sylfaenol oedd: beth ydych chi'n mynd i'w wneud i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth hwnnw'n cael ei ailsefydlu? Mae'r Pwyllgor Deisebau, dan gadeiryddiaeth William Powell, eisoes wedi derbyn deiseb ar y mater hwn. A wnewch chi gynnal trafodaethau gydag Arriva i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth hwnnw'n cael ei ailsefydlu?

**Carl Sargeant:** I refer the Member to my response to his first question; I am in discussions with Arriva and many operators across Wales with regard to the services they provide for constituents right across Wales. Of course, the Member is representing his local interests and I note his comments.

#### Defnyddwyr Trafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus

**6. Eluned Parrott:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer defnyddwyr trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. OAQ(4)0127(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I am committed to a sustainable and integrated transport policy and to the delivery of my priorities in the national transport plan.

**Eluned Parrott:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. I am sure you will be aware that the franchise for the West Coast main line, which serves north Wales, is currently out to tender. What discussions have you had with the Department for Transport to ensure that services for transport users in north Wales are protected and improved during that franchising process?

Gymru ynghylch creu cytundeb gwasanaeth newydd, yn hytrach na chymhorthdal tanwydd, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn buddsoddi yn ein gwasanaethau. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelod dros Blaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynigion hynny wrth inni eu cyflwyno.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am very pleased that you are having those discussions, but that is not much comfort to the people of Pencarreg and Cwmann who have lost their bus connection entirely, which means that they cannot access local services. The fundamental question was: what are you going to do to ensure that that service is reinstated? The Petitions Committee, chaired by William Powell, has already received a petition on this matter. Will you conduct discussions with Arriva to ensure that that service is reinstated?

**Carl Sargeant:** Cyfeiriai yr Aelod at fy ymateb i'w gwestiwn cyntaf; rwyf wrthi'n trafod ag Arriva a nifer o weithredwyr ym mhob cwr o Gymru ynghylch y gwasanaethau y maent yn eu darparu i etholwyr ar hyd a lled Cymru. Wrth gwrs, mae'r Aelod yn cynrychioli ei fuddiannau lleol, ac rwyf yn gwneud nodyn o'i sylwadau.

#### The Users of Public Transport

**6. Eluned Parrott:** *Will the Minister make a statement on his priorities for public transport users. OAQ(4)0127(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf wedi ymrwymo i bolisi trafndiaeth integredig a chynaliadwy, ac i gyflawni fy mlaenoriaethau yn y cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol.

**Eluned Parrott:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Rwyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod y fasnachfrait ar gyfer prif reilffordd Arfordir y Gorllewin, sy'n gwasanaethu'r gogledd, wedi cael ei rhoi allan ar dendr ar hyn o bryd. Pa drafodaethau rydych wedi'u cael â'r Adran Drafndiaeth i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau ar gyfer defnyddwyr trafndiaeth yn y gogledd yn cael eu hamddiffyn a'u gwella yn ystod y broses

masnachfreinio honno?

**Carl Sargeant:** I have many discussions with the DfT. I met the Minister in London only last week for discussions on all aspects of transport that relate to decisions that are made in Westminster.

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf wedi cael amryw o drafodaethau â'r Adran Drafnidiaeth. Cefais gyfarfod â'r Gweinidog yn Llundain yr wythnos diwethaf i drafod pob agwedd ar drafnidiaeth sy'n gysylltiedig â phenderfyniadau a wneir yn San Steffan.

**William Graham:** Will the Minister join me in congratulating the All Aboard transport challenge last month, which celebrated Disability Wales's work over the last four decades in campaigning to remove disabling barriers in society? Clearly, many issues arose from this challenge. Will the Minister indicate when he might meet with the group?

**William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i longyfarch her drafnidiaeth All Aboard a gynhaliwyd y mis diwethaf, a oedd yn dathlu gwaith Anabledd Cymru dros y pedwar degawd diwethaf yn ymgychu i gael gwared ar rwystrau i bobl anabl yn y gymdeithas? Yn amlwg, mae'r her hon wedi codi amryw o faterion. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi syniad o pryd y gallai gael cyfarfod â'r grŵp?

**Carl Sargeant:** I would certainly congratulate any advances in opening access to all across Wales and the UK. I am aware of the Member's contribution, and organisations will continue to press Government and private sector organisations to ensure that nobody is disadvantaged because of a disability that they may be suffering from.

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddwn yn sicr yn llongyfarch unrhyw ddatblygiadau sy'n sicrhau mynediad i bawb ledled Cymru a'r DU. Rwyf yn ymwybodol o gyfraniad yr Aelod, a bydd sefydliadau'n parhau i bwysu ar y Llywodraeth ac ar sefydliadau yn y sector preifat er mwyn sicrhau nad oes neb o dan anfantais oherwydd bod ganddynt anabledd.

**Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas:** Roeddwn yn falch iawn o glywed y Gweinidog yn defnyddio'r gair 'integredig' yn gynharach. Y peth pwysicaf i ni sydd yn ddefnyddwyr wythnosol, a dyddiol bron, o gardiau teithio rhatach ar fysiau a rheilffyrdd yw gallu cysylltu'r gwasanaethau. Pa bryd y bydd cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol Cymru, a gyflwynwyd gan ei ragflaenydd, Ieuan Wyn Jones, pan oedd yn Weinidog trafnidiaeth, yn sicrhau gwell integreiddio, yn enwedig yng nghanolbarth Cymru?

**Lord Elis-Thomas:** I was very pleased to hear the Minister use the word 'integrated' earlier. The most important thing for those of us who are weekly and daily users of concessionary travel cards on buses and trains is the connection between services. When will the national transport plan for Wales, which was introduced by his predecessor, Ieuan Wyn Jones, when he was Minister for transport, ensure better integration of services, especially in mid Wales?

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for his question and for his support in taking this agenda of transport integration forward. The Member will also be aware that there were no priorities in the former national transport plan, which I consequently amended to ensure that we do have some timelines for delivery. We are currently trialling a process for smartcards that can be used on buses and trains, which is just one of many actions that we will consider to enhance the opportunities for people to use not only their concessionary

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei gwestiwn, ac am ei gefnogaeth wrth inni fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda trafnidiaeth integredig hon. Bydd yr Aelod hefyd yn ymwybodol nad oedd unrhyw flaenoriaethau yn y cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol blaenorol a fy mod i, o'r herwydd, wedi'i ddiwygio er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym amserlenni ar gyfer cyflawni. Ar hyn o bryd, rydym yn treialu proses ar gyfer cardiau call y gellir eu defnyddio ar fysiau a threnau. Dim ond un o nifer o gamau yw hyn, y byddwn yn

bus travel passes, but the broader community bus and transport networks across Wales.

eu hystyried i wella'r cyfleoedd i bobl ddefnyddio eu cardiau teithio rhatach ar fysiau yn ogystal â'r rhwydweithiau trafniadaeth a bysiau cymunedol ehangach ar hyd a lled Cymru.

### **Menter Benthycu Llywodraeth Leol**

### **The Local Government Borrowing Initiative**

**7. Jenny Rathbone:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am Fenter Benthycu Llywodraeth Leol Llywodraeth Cymru. OAQ(4)0135(LGC)*

**7. Jenny Rathbone:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government's Local Government Borrowing Initiative. OAQ(4)0135(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for Cardiff Central for her question. I am providing local authorities with an additional £4 million in 2012-13, rising to £12 million by 2014-15, which will allow all local authorities to self-finance borrowing of up to £170 million of capital investment, which is to be made in Welsh highways improvements over the next three years.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ganol Caerdydd am ei chwestiwn. Rwyf yn darparu £4 miliwn ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol yn 2012-13, a bydd hyn yn cynyddu i £12 miliwn erbyn 2014-15. Bydd hyn yn caniatáu i bob awdurdod lleol hunan-gyllido cael benthycu hyd at £170 miliwn o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf i wella priffyrdd Cymru dros y tair blynedd nesaf.

**Jenny Rathbone:** The initiative is very welcome, as it enables local authorities to have a structured programme of road maintenance rather than just having to patch up pot-holes that become pot-holes again as soon the first frost arrives. While that is a welcome initiative, could I press you further to consider what we can do to encourage more people to use public transport, which would mean fewer pot-holes on our roads? Sadly, the Liberal Democrat-led Cardiff Council has not been able to rebuild the central bus station during the last four years. Will this initiative enable this money to be invested in public transport or is it exclusively for roads?

**Jenny Rathbone:** Croesewir y fenter yn fawr, gan ei bod yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol i gael rhaglen strwythuredig ar gyfer cynnal a chadw ffyrdd yn hytrach na dim ond gorfod trwsio tyllau sy'n mynd yn dyllau eto cyn gynted ag y bydd yn dechrau rhewi. Er bod honno'n fenter i'w chroesawu, a allwn bwysu arnoch ymhellach i ystyried beth y gallwn ei wneud i annog rhagor o bobl i ddefnyddio trafniadaeth gyhoeddus, a fyddai'n golygu llai o dyllau ar ein ffyrdd? Yn anffodus, nid yw Cyngor Caerdydd, a arweinir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, wedi llwyddo i ail-adeiladu'r orsaf fysiau ganolog yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf. A fydd yn bosibl, o ganlyniad i'r fenter hon, buddsoddi'r arian hwn mewn trafniadaeth gyhoeddus, ynteu a yw'n benodol ar gyfer ffyrdd yn unig?

**Carl Sargeant:** The Member raises an important issue for the area that she represents. The Welsh Government has provided Cardiff Council with a considerable sum of money for the development of a new bus station for the people of Cardiff. I wrote to Cardiff Council on 22 February about the bus station to ask whether it was a case of business as usual regarding the construction of a new station. I also asked about the cost of a new station. I will write to the Member

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r Aelod yn codi mater pwysig i'r ardal y mae'n ei chynrychioli. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi rhoi swm sylweddol o arian i Gyngor Caerdydd i ddatblygu gorsaf fysiau newydd ar gyfer pobl Caerdydd. Ysgrifennais at Gyngor Caerdydd ar 22 Chwefror ynghylch yr orsaf fysiau, i ofyn a oedd popeth yn mynd rhagddo'n unol â'r arfer o ran adeiladu gorsaf newydd. Holais hefyd am gost gorsaf newydd. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod pan gaf ymateb i'r

when I receive a response to that letter.

**Paul Davies:** Will the Minister tell us what discussions, if any, he has had with his colleague the Minister for Finance on looking at other models of raising finance where local authorities can fund capital projects?

**Carl Sargeant:** I have had many such discussions.

**Simon Thomas:** I wish to press the Minister a little further on the question raised by Paul Davies. [*Laughter.*] Minister, when you announced this local government borrowing initiative in February with the Minister for Finance, you said clearly that this was exactly the kind of investment that supports your wider Wales infrastructure investment plan. So, to ask the same question in a different way: apart from support for highways, are you, as a Government, looking to use these types of financial borrowing abilities to invest in other capital projects in local authorities as part of your response to the recession?

**Carl Sargeant:** Yes.

**Peter Black:** In the same vein, we had an interesting presentation at the Finance Committee this morning on what is happening in Scotland with regard to local authorities using tax increment financing to raise capital expenditure. Another example is Scottish Futures Trust—a non-profit distribution company, which is a limited form of private finance initiative, which is, again, delivering a lot of capital projects in Scottish local authorities. To what extent have you made progress in the Welsh Government on introducing similar processes for Welsh local councils?

**Carl Sargeant:** The Member will be aware that I have made a statement in the past on tax increment financing. The Minister for Finance, the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science and I have had discussions on trying to understand what the implications may be for local authorities and how a different style of funding would best serve projects across Wales, but as and when further decisions are

llythyr hwnnw.

**Paul Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa drafodaethau, os o gwbl, y mae wedi'u cael â'i gyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Cyllid, ynghylch ystyried modelau eraill o ddod o hyd i gyllid lle gall awdurdodau lleol gyllido prosiectau cyfalaf?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf wedi cael amryw o drafodaethau o'r fath.

**Simon Thomas:** Hoffwn bwysu ychydig mwy ar y Gweinidog ynghylch y cwestiwn a ofynnodd Paul Davies. [*Chwerthin.*] Weinidog, pan gyhoeddech y fenter benthycu llywodraeth leol hon fis Chwefror gyda'r Gweinidog Cyllid, dywedoch yn glir mai dyma'r union fath o fuddsoddiad sy'n cefnogi eich cynllun buddsoddi mewn seilwaith i Gymru ehangach. Felly, gan ofyn yr un cwestiwn mewn ffordd wahanol: ar wahân i gefnogaeth ar gyfer priffyrdd a ydych chi, fel Llywodraeth, yn ystyried defnyddio'r mathau hyn o fenthycu ariannol i fuddsoddi mewn prosiectau cyfalaf eraill mewn awdurdodau lleol, fel rhan o'ch ymateb i'r dirwasgiad?

**Carl Sargeant:** Ydym.

**Peter Black:** I'r un perwyl, cawsom gyflwyniad diddorol yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid y bore yma am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn yr Alban, o ran awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio cyllid cynyddrannau treth i godi gwariant cyfalaf. Mae Scottish Futures Trust yn enghraifft arall—cwmni dosbarthu dielw, sy'n fath cyfyngedig o fenter cyllid preifat ac sydd, unwaith eto, yn cyflwyno llawer o brosiectau cyfalaf yn awdurdodau lleol yr Alban. I ba raddau rydych wedi gwneud cynnydd yn Llywodraeth Cymru i gyflwyno prosesau tebyg ar gyfer cynghorau lleol Cymru?

**Carl Sargeant:** Bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi gwneud datganiad yn y gorffennol ar gyllid cynyddrannau treth. Mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid, y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth a minnau wedi cael trafodaethau i geisio deall beth yw'r goblygiadau posibl i awdurdodau lleol, a sut y byddai dull cyllido gwahanol yn gwasanaethu prosiectau ledled Cymru. Byddwn yn gwneud datganiad i'r Siambr

made on that, we will make a statement to the Chamber.

**Peter Black:** You do travel well, so it might be worth you going up to Scotland to understand how Scottish councils are already benefiting from this. Tax increment financing has made sufficient progress in Scotland and it is being introduced in England. The regulations are in place in England and you have the power to introduce similar regulations in Wales. How much time do you need to come to your conclusions as to the effectiveness of this form of capital financing and what sort of timescale are you working to before you can make that statement?

**Carl Sargeant:** Just because it is right for Scotland, it does not mean that it is right for Wales. We have to ensure that the right decisions are made considering the difficult finances that we have been given following decisions made by the UK Government. The scheme, as mentioned by the Member, is being considered by Ministers and if it is the right scheme for Wales, then it will be introduced at the appropriate time.

### Cynghorau Tref a Chymuned

**8. William Powell:** *Pa gymorth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei roi i Gynghorau Tref a Chymuned ledled Cymru. OAQ(4)0134(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** We work closely with One Voice Wales and others to develop the capacity of local councils to respond effectively to the needs and aspirations of their communities. Last year's Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011 extended local councils' powers to take action, working in collaboration with unitary authorities and others, as appropriate.

**William Powell:** Thank you, Minister, for that answer. Given the critical role that town and community councils play in local governance and political representation, it is clear that member training provides an essential platform upon which successful local governance can be built. Given your close relationship with One Voice Wales in this respect, can you outline what steps you

wrth i benderfyniadau pellach gael eu gwneud ynghylch hynny.

**Peter Black:** Rydych yn teithio'n dda, felly efallai y byddai'n werth ichi fynd i'r Alban er mwyn deall sut mae cynghorau'r Alban eisoes yn elwa o hyn. Mae cyllid cynyddrannau treth wedi gwneud cynnydd digonol yn yr Alban, ac yn cael ei gyflwyno yn Lloegr. Mae'r rheoliadau ar waith yn Lloegr, ac mae gennych y pŵer i gyflwyno rheoliadau tebyg yng Nghymru. Faint o amser y mae arnoch ei angen i benderfynu ynghylch effeithiolrwydd y math hwn o gyllido cyfalaf, a pha fath o amserlen rydych yn gweithio iddi cyn y gallwch wneud y datganiad hwnnw?

**Carl Sargeant:** Nid yw'r ffaith ei fod yn iawn ar gyfer yr Alban yn golygu ei fod yn iawn ar gyfer Cymru. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y penderfyniadau cywir yn cael eu gwneud, o ystyried y sefyllfa ariannol anodd rydym yn ei hwynebu yn sgîl y penderfyniadau a wnaed gan Lywodraeth y DU. Mae'r cynllun, fel y soniodd yr Aelod, yn cael ei ystyried gan Weinidogion, ac os dyma'r cynllun iawn i Gymru, bydd yn cael ei gyflwyno ar yr adeg briodol.

### Town and Community Councils

**8. William Powell:** *What support does the Minister give to Town and Community Councils across Wales. OAQ(4)0134(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Rydym yn gweithio'n agos gydag Un Llais Cymru ac eraill i ddatblygu gallu cynghorau lleol i ymateb yn effeithiol i anghenion a dyheadau eu cymunedau. Mae Mesur Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2011 y llynedd wedi ehangu pwerau cynghorau lleol i weithredu, gan weithio ar y cyd ag awdurdodau unedol ac eraill, fel y bo'n briodol.

**William Powell:** Diolch, Weinidog, am yr ateb hwnnw. O ystyried y rôl hanfodol y mae cynghorau tref a chymuned yn ei chwarae o ran cynrychiolaeth wleidyddol a llywodraethu lleol, mae'n amlwg bod hyfforddiant aelodau yn darparu llwyfan hanfodol y gellir seilio prosesau llywodraethu lleol llwyddiannus arno. O ystyried eich perthynas agos ag Un Llais Cymru yn hyn o

are taking to ensure that training programmes continue to provide this so that the service levels can be further improved? This is particularly relevant ahead of tomorrow's elections when hundreds of new town and community councillors will emerge to serve their communities across Wales.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am hoping that the hundreds of Labour councillors who will be elected tomorrow, as the Member mentioned, along with the members of other parties who will be elected, will take advantage of the training for town and community councillors across Wales. Following the Aberystwyth study, we established the national training advisory group, now chaired by One Voice Wales, which is instrumental in articulating and delivering on the training and development needs of community and town councillors, whose contribution I value to the changing landscape of our communities.

**Russell George:** Town and community councils in Montgomeryshire are very concerned for two reasons about a Government traffic order that will intermittently close two of the county's busiest roads, the A483 and the A470, to allow the movement of abnormal loads carrying windfarm components. First, they are very concerned that although restrictions will prohibit vehicles, pedestrians and cyclists from using these routes while a load is being moved, no alternative routes have been proposed to redirect them. Secondly, they are concerned that the order spans a 12-month period, which seems to be unreasonable. Will the Minister provide me with clarification on these two points to alleviate the concerns of town and community councils in my area? Perhaps he may also want to write to me on this point.

**Carl Sargeant:** I would be delighted to write to the Member on this point. However, I will also inform him today that I am sure that he is aware of the appropriateness of consultation with town and community councils and unitary authorities, as I explained to him in a recent committee that I attended. I will certainly write to the Member with the details that he may wish to use with

beth, a allwch amlinellu pa gamau rydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod rhaglenni hyfforddi yn parhau i wneud hyn er mwyn gallu gwella lefelau gwasanaeth ymhellach? Mae hyn yn arbennig o berthnasol cyn yr etholiadau yfory, pan fydd cannoedd o gynghorwyr tref a chymuned newydd yn dod i'r amlwg i wasanaethu eu cymunedau ledled Cymru.

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd y cannoedd o gynghorwyr Llafur a gaiff eu hethol yfory, fel y soniodd yr Aelod, ynghyd ag aelodau o bleidiau eraill a fydd yn cael eu hethol, yn manteisio ar yr hyfforddiant sydd ar gael ar gyfer cynghorwyr tref a chymuned ar draws Cymru. Yn dilyn astudiaeth Aberystwyth, aethom ati i sefydlu'r grŵp cynghori cenedlaethol ar hyfforddiant, sydd bellach yn cael ei gadeirio gan Un Llais Cymru. Mae'r grŵp yn gyfrwng i fynegi a chyflwyno anghenion hyfforddi a datblygu cynghorwyr cymuned a thref, ac rwyf yn gweld gwerth mawr yn eu cyfraniad at sefyllfa newidiol ein cymunedau.

**Russell George:** Mae cynghorau tref a chymuned yn sir Drefaldwyn yn bryderus iawn am ddau reswm ynghylch gorchymyn traffig y Llywodraeth a fydd, am gyfnod, yn cau dwy o ffyrdd prysuraf y sir, sef yr A483 a'r A470, i ganiatáu symud llwythi anarferol a fydd yn cludo cydrannau ar gyfer fferm wynt. Yn gyntaf, er y bydd cyfyngiadau yn gwahardd cerbydau, cerddwyr a beicwyr rhag defnyddio'r llwybrau hyn tra bydd llwyth yn cael ei symud, maent yn poeni nad oes unrhyw lwybrau eraill wedi cael eu cynnig i'w hailgyfeirio. Yn ail, maent yn poeni bod y gorchymyn yn cwmpasu cyfnod o 12 mis, sy'n ymddangos yn afresymol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi eglurhad imi ynghylch y ddau bwynt hyn i leddfu pryderon y cynghorau tref a chymuned yn fy ardal i? Efallai y byddai hefyd yn dymuno ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch y pwynt hwn.

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i ysgrifennu at yr Aelod ynghylch y pwynt hwn. Fodd bynnag, dywedaf wrtho heddiw hefyd fy mod yn siŵr ei fod yn ymwybodol o briodoldeb ymgynghori â chynghorau tref a chymuned ac awdurdodau unedol, fel yr eglurais iddo mewn pwyllgor yn ddiweddar. Byddaf yn sicr yn ysgrifennu at yr Aelod gyda'r manylion y gallai eu defnyddio gyda'i

his local councils.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Weinidog, nid oes gan rai ardaloedd unrhyw gynghorau cymunedol o gwbl. Sut, felly, ydych yn siarad â phobl yn y sector ynghylch sut y gall pobl ddod yn rhan o wleidyddiaeth os nad yw'r cynghorau hynny ar gael? Mae pwerau cynghorau cymunedol yn amrywio o un le i'r llall. A oes unrhyw ffordd y gallem roi mwy o bwysau ar y cynghorau i ddysgu o ardaloedd eraill a sicrhau y gall pobl ddod yn rhan gynhenid o wleidyddiaeth yn eu hardal hwy?

**Carl Sargeant:** I recognise the Member's question with regard to representation. There is nowhere in Wales that is not represented by some form of government, whether that is at parish and community council level or unitary authority level. However, through the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011, which we introduced in the last administration, the Welsh Government of the time provided new powers and opportunities for town, community and parish councils to make it much easier for them to be created in the future. As I said earlier, I recognise the good work of local councils and the impact that they can have in their communities. I would encourage members of communities in areas that do not currently have community councils to start considering the new opportunities that the Measure may provide.

### Gwella Ffyrdd

**9. Gwyn R. Price:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am sut y dylai cynghorau ymgynghori ar wella ffyrdd. OAQ(4)0129(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I would expect councils to consult on significant road improvement schemes on their road network, as we do as the highways authority when we undertake major projects on the trunk road network. Where it is a safety issue, however, councils may have to act quickly and so consultation could be difficult or inappropriate.

**Gwyn R. Price:** Thank you for that answer. Minister, as you are aware, considerable

gynghorau lleol, pe bai'n dymuno.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Minister, some areas do not have any community councils. Therefore, how are you speaking to people in the sector about ways in which people can play a part in politics if those councils are not there? The powers of community councils vary from one place to another. Is there any way in which we could put more pressure on councils to learn from other areas and to ensure that people can play an integral part in politics in their area?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf yn cydnabod cwestiwn yr Aelod o safbwynt cynrychiolaeth. Nid oes unman yng Nghymru nad yw'n cael ei gynrychioli gan ryw fath o lywodraeth, boed hynny ar lefel cynghorau cymuned a phlwyf neu ar lefel awdurdod unedol. Fodd bynnag, drwy gyfrwng Mesur Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2011, a gyflwynom yn ystod y weinyddiaeth ddiwethaf, sicrhodd Llywodraeth Cymru ar y pryd bwerau a chyfleoedd newydd i gynghorau tref, cymuned a phlwyf fel y byddai'n llawer haws iddynt gael eu creu yn y dyfodol. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, rwyf yn cydnabod gwaith da cynghorau lleol a'r effaith y gallant ei chael ar eu cymunedau. Byddwn yn annog aelodau o gymunedau mewn ardaloedd nad oes ganddynt gynghorau cymuned ar hyn o bryd, i ddechrau ystyried y cyfleoedd newydd y gall y Mesur eu darparu.

### Road Improvements

**9. Gwyn R. Price:** *Will the Minister make a statement on how councils should consult over road improvements. OAQ(4)0129(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddwn yn disgwyl i gynghorau ymgynghori ar gynlluniau sylweddol i wella ffyrdd ar eu rhwydwaith ffyrdd, fel rydym ni'n ei wneud, fel yr awdurdod priffyrdd, pan fyddwn yn cynnal prosiectau mawr ar y rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd. Fodd bynnag, pan fo'r mater yn ymwneud â diogelwch, mae'n bosibl y bydd yn rhaid i gynghorau weithredu'n gyflym, ac felly gallai fod yn anodd neu'n amhriodol ymgynghori.

**Gwyn R. Price:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw. Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch, mae

concern was expressed by residents in Maesycwmmmer in my Islwyn constituency about the recent changes to the road that goes through the village. Many residents were unhappy with the consultation process, and I attended a number of public meetings.

preswylwyr ym Maesycwmer yn fy etholaeth i, sef Islwyn, wedi mynegi pryderon sylweddol am y newidiadau diweddar i'r ffordd sy'n mynd drwy'r pentref. Roedd llawer o'r preswylwyr yn anfodlon â'r broses ymgynghori, a bûm mewn nifer o gyfarfodydd cyhoeddus.

2.45 p.m.

The scheme is no longer going ahead due to reservations from your department. Minister, what further guidance could be given to local authorities to ensure that the legitimate concerns of residents are heard, even in Caerphilly?

Nid yw'r cynllun yn mynd rhagddo mwyach, oherwydd amheuan eich adran chi. Weinidog, pa arweiniad pellach y gellid ei roi i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod pryderon dilys y preswylwyr yn cael eu clywed, hyd yn oed yng Nghaerffili?

**Carl Sargeant:** I would hope that all councils ensure that they use good-quality consultation processes. It is incumbent upon them to do so. I should congratulate the Member on his continuing lobbying on the Maesycwmmmer improvements and the way that he was able to articulate to my officials and me the local residents' concerns about this. He is quite right that I made a decision not to carry on with the improvements in the third stage of this scheme.

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddwn yn gobeithio bod pob cyngor yn sicrhau ei fod yn defnyddio prosesau ymgynghori o ansawdd da. Mae'n ddyletswydd arnynt i wneud hynny. Dylwn longyfarch yr Aelod ar ei waith lobiö parhaus ynghylch gwelliannau Maesycwmer, a'r modd y llwyddodd i gyfleu pryderon y preswylwyr lleol ynghylch hyn wrth fy swyddogion ac wrthyf fi. Mae'n gwbl gywir wrth ddweud fy mod wedi penderfynu peidio â bwrw ymlaen â'r gwelliannau yn nhrydydd cam y cynllun hwn.

**Mark Isherwood:** As you know, as the result of a public inquiry, plans to widen the A494 up to the A55 Ewloe interchange at the top of Aston hill in Flintshire were withdrawn. Your predecessor wrote that, as part of that decision, he had decided to review the proposals to the Ewloe interchange, but that the preferred route remained protected. Correspondence from the local residents' group says that, since the public inquiry, it has been told several times that plans are being reviewed and that consideration is being given to the overwhelming opinion of local residents. What action do you therefore propose to ensure that, before you announce your preferred options, there is consultation with local residents in order to avoid a rehash of what happened last time, which ended up, as you know, in a public inquiry?

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel y gwyddoch, o ganlyniad i ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, cafodd cynlluniau i ledu'r A494 hyd at gyfnewidfa Ewloe ar yr A55 ar gopa Aston hill yn sir y Fflint eu tynnu'n ôl. Ysgrifennodd eich rhagflaenydd ei fod, fel rhan o'r penderfyniad hwnnw, wedi penderfynu adolygu'r cynigion ar gyfer cyfnewidfa Ewloe, ond bod y llwybr a ffeirir yn dal wedi'i gadw. Dywed gohebiaeth gan grŵp y preswylwyr lleol eu bod wedi cael gwybod droeon, ers yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, bod y cynlluniau yn cael eu hadolygu a bod barn gref y preswylwyr lleol yn cael ei hystyried. Felly pa gamau ydych yn eu cynnig i sicrhau, cyn ichi gyhoeddi'r opsiynau a ffeirir, yr ymgynghorir â phreswylwyr lleol er mwyn osgoi ailadrodd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd y tro diwethaf a arweiniodd, fel y gwyddoch, at ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn y pen draw?

**Carl Sargeant:** I will be cautious in my response as this is my local area and any determination about any future road network that goes through my constituency may be subject to a decision made by me or one of

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddaf yn ymateb yn ofalus gan fod hyn yn fy ardal leol i, ac mae'n bosibl y bydd unrhyw benderfyniad am unrhyw rwydwaith ffordd yn y dyfodol sy'n mynd drwy fy etholaeth i yn amodol ar



my fellow Ministers. On the broader issue raised in Mark Isherwood's question, it is important that there is appropriate consultation with local residents in terms of understanding the scale of the issues of a new road scheme, wherever it may be in Wales. Local public inquiries incur a huge cost to the public purse and should that be preventable by early dialogue and early consultation with residents, I would ask my officials to continue with that. There is a legal duty upon my department to ensure that the appropriate consultation processes are put in place, and this is all subject to legal challenge. I will leave responding in any further detail to that question, if I may, Llywydd.

**Kenneth Skates:** Minister, I welcome your decision to open the Wrexham industrial estate relief road ahead of schedule on 16 July this year. The £35 million road has been built with 100% funding from the Welsh Government and will not only help to improve access to the estate, which houses around 300 businesses, but also give an important economic boost to the whole of north-east Wales. Will you look at how further important road and rail infrastructure projects such as this can help to boost new business start-ups in north-east Wales and help the region to trade its way out of recession?

**Carl Sargeant:** The Member raises an important issue, and represents Clwyd South well. The issue for me is to ensure that we get the best value for money. Regional transport consortia across Wales are duty bound to look at funding for local road schemes. I am happy to consider all good-quality business cases on that basis of improving viable opportunities for businesses across Wales.

### Gwasanaethau Cynghori

**10. Julie Morgan:** *A oes gan Lywodraeth Cymru unrhyw gynlluniau i roi rhagor o gymorth i wasanaethau cynghori yng Nghymru ar gyfer pobl sydd angen cyngor*

benderfyniad a wneir gennyf fi neu gan un o'm cyd-Weinidogion. O ran y mater ehangach a godwyd yng nghwestiwn Mark Isherwood, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ymgynghori'n briodol â phreswylwyr lleol er mwyn deall graddfa'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â chynllun ffordd newydd, lle bynnag yng Nghymru y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Mae ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus lleol yn costio llawer i'r pwrs cyhoeddus, a phe bai modd osgoi hynny drwy drafod ac ymgynghori'n gynnar â phreswylwyr, byddwn yn gofyn i fy swyddogion fwrw ymlaen â hynny. Mae dyletswydd gyfreithiol ar fy adran i sicrhau bod y prosesau ymgynghori priodol yn cael eu rhoi ar waith, ac mae hyn i gyd yn rhwym wrth her gyfreithiol. Ni roddaf unrhyw fanylion pellach am y cwestiwn hwnnw, os caf, Lywydd.

**Kenneth Skates:** Weinidog, rwyf yn croesawu eich penderfyniad i agor ffordd liniaru ystâd ddiwydiannol Wrecsam yn gynharach na'r disgwyl ar 16 Gorffennaf eleni. Llywodraeth Cymru sydd wedi talu holl gostau'r ffordd, sydd wedi costio £35 miliwn. Bydd yn helpu i wella mynediad i'r ystâd—sy'n gartref i oddeutu 300 o fusnesau—yn ogystal â rhoi hwb economaidd pwysig i'r gogledd-ddwyrain drwyddo draw. A wnewch edrych ar sut y gall rhagor o brosiectau seilwaith rheilffyrdd a ffyrdd pwysig fel hyn helpu i roi hwb i fusnesau newydd sy'n cael eu sefydlu yn y gogledd-ddwyrain, a helpu'r rhanbarth i fasnachu ei ffordd o'r dirwasgiad?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r Aelod yn codi mater pwysig, ac mae'n cynrychioli De Clwyd yn dda. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig i mi yw sicrhau ein bod yn cael y gwerth gorau am arian. Mae gan y consortia trafniadaeth rhanbarthol ar draws Cymru ddyletswydd i edrych ar gyllid ar gyfer cynlluniau ffyrdd lleol. Rwyf yn fodlon ystyried yr holl achosion busnes o ansawdd da ar y sail honno o wella cyfleoedd ymarferol i fusnesau ym mhob cwr o Gymru.

### Advice Services

**10. Julie Morgan:** *Does the Welsh Government have any plans to increase support for advice services in Wales to people who need free advice.*

*am ddim arnynt. OAQ(4)0136(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I am aware of the pressures currently being faced by the advice sector in Wales resulting from legal aid reform and changes in UK Government funding. Given these pressures, I will shortly be commissioning a review of advice services and I will consider any recommendations for future provision.

**Julie Morgan:** I thank the Minister for that response and I welcome the Welsh Government's support for free advice services in Wales. As he said, with legal aid on many social welfare matters about to be removed, what role does he see for the committed and hard-working legal aid solicitor firms that have, in the past, specialised in such social welfare legal work, and what assistance can he give to ensure that their desperate clients still get the help they need?

**Carl Sargeant:** We believe that the demand for advice services, legal aid and so on will increase due to the actions of the UK Government in relation to welfare reform and other elements that it plans to introduce. Communities and our constituents will come under increased pressure, and I will be conducting a review of advice services in Wales to ensure that we make good use of what little money we have to invest in the services following the UK cuts to our budget and that we can ensure that quality services are provided by good-quality advice units across Wales.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Minister, do you recognise the role played by Citizens Advice in providing free advice, and will you join me in welcoming the additional £10.5 million in funding given to Citizens Advice to strengthen its role in providing free advice to people in England and Wales?

**Carl Sargeant:** Citizens Advice Cymru

*OAQ(4)0136(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf yn ymwybodol o'r pwysau y mae'r sector cyngori yng Nghymru yn ei wynebu ar hyn o bryd yn sgîl diwygio cymorth cyfreithiol a newidiadau cyllid Llywodraeth y DU. O ystyried y pwysau hwn, byddaf yn comisiynu adolygiad o wasanaethau cyngori yn fuan, a byddaf yn ystyried unrhyw argymhellion ar gyfer darpariaethau yn y dyfodol.

**Julie Morgan:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw, ac rwyf yn croesawu cefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru i wasanaethau cyngori am ddim yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd, gyda chymorth cyfreithiol ar lawer o faterion lles cymdeithasol ar fin cael ei ddileu, pa rôl y mae'n credu y bydd gan y cwmnïau cyfreithwyr cymorth cyfreithiol ymrwymedig a gweithgar sydd, yn y gorffennol, wedi arbenigo mewn gwaith cyfreithiol o'r fath yng nghyswllt lles cymdeithasol, a pha gymorth y gall ei gynnig i sicrhau bod eu cleientiaid sydd wir angen help yn dal i gael yr help y mae arnynt ei angen?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rydym yn credu y bydd y galw am wasanaethau cyngori, cymorth cyfreithiol ac ati yn cynyddu o ganlyniad i weithredoedd Llywodraeth y DU mewn perthynas â diwygio lles ac elfennau eraill y mae'n bwriadu eu cyflwyno. Bydd mwy o bwysau'n cael ei roi ar gymunedau a'n hetholwyr, a byddaf yn cynnal adolygiad o wasanaethau cyngori yng Nghymru i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud defnydd da o'r ychydig o arian sydd gennym i fuddsoddi yn y gwasanaethau yn dilyn toriadau'r DU i'n cyllideb, a'n bod yn gallu sicrhau bod gwasanaethau o safon yn cael eu darparu gan unedau cyngori o ansawdd da ar draws Cymru.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Weinidog, a ydych yn cydnabod rôl Cyngor ar Bopeth yng nghyswllt darparu cyngor am ddim, ac a wnewch ymuno â mi i groesawu'r £10.5 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol a roddwyd i Gyngor ar Bopeth i gryfhau ei rôl yng nghyswllt darparu cyngor am ddim i bobl yng Nghymru a Lloegr?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae Cyngor ar Bopeth

provides an excellent service to the public, as do other, smaller providers. I am aware of others, such as the Speakeasy Advice Centre and Riverside Advice, all of which provide quality advice, which is essential at a time when constituents are under increasing pressure as a result of decisions made by the UK Government.

Cymru yn darparu gwasanaeth ardderchog i'r cyhoedd, yn yr un modd â darparwyr llai eraill. Rwyf yn ymwybodol o ddarparwyr eraill, fel Canolfan Cyngori Speakeasy a Riverside Advice, sy'n darparu cyngor o safon, ac mae hynny'n hanfodol ar adeg pan mae etholwyr o dan bwysau cynyddol o ganlyniad i'r penderfyniadau a wneir gan Lywodraeth y DU.

### **Arwyddion i Dwristiaid ar Gefnffyrdd**

*II. Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cymru i ddatblygu polisi newydd ar gyfer arwyddion i dwristiaid ar y rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd. OAQ(4)0137(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for Arfon for the question. My officials will be presenting me with the results of the public consultation exercise undertaken on this subject shortly, and I will announce my decision on the way forward shortly.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n falch o glywed y bydd argymhellion achos, ar hyn o bryd, mae polisi Llywodraeth Cymru'r un fath yn union â pholisi Lloegr. Mae'r arwyddion hyn yn bwysig o ran rhoi gwybodaeth i ymwelwyr ac, wrth gwrs, i atyniadau, sydd, yn eu tro, yn rhan bwysig iawn o economïau lleol. A fyddwch yn barod i amrywio'r amodau presennol a ystyrir yn llawer rhy gaeth gan lawer yn y diwydiant twristiaeth?

**Carl Sargeant:** I do not want to pre-empt the outcome of the recent consultation by making an announcement in the Chamber today. The new tourism signage policy will be clear and transparent and applied fairly and consistently across Wales. I recognise the issue the Member raises about balancing the impact of the tourism industry; that can always be enabled and supported by correct, good signage on the trunk road network.

You are quite right to raise the issue that we are currently governed under the traffic signs to tourist attractions and facilities in England order. We will, of course, consider how we will replace that with a new order following the consultation I have mentioned.

### **Tourist Signage on Trunk Roads**

*II. Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister provide an update on the Welsh Government's plans to develop a new policy for tourist signs on the trunk road network. OAQ(4)0137(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Arfon am y cwestiwn. Byddaf yn cael canlyniadau'r ymarfer ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus a gynhaliwyd ar y pwnc hwn gan fy swyddogion cyn bo hir, a byddaf yn cyhoeddi fy mhenderfyniad ar y ffordd ymlaen yn fuan.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I am pleased to hear that there will be recommendations because, at present, Welsh Government policy is exactly the same as the policy in England. These signs are important in giving information to visitors and, of course, to attractions, which, in turn, are a very important part of local economies. Will you be willing to vary the current conditions, which are considered to be much too restrictive by many in the tourist industry?

**Carl Sargeant:** Nid wyf am achub y blaen ar ganlyniad yr ymgynghoriad diweddar drwy wneud cyhoeddiad yn y Siambr heddiw. Bydd y polisi arwyddion twristiaeth newydd yn glir ac yn dryloyw, a bydd yn cael ei roi ar waith yn deg ac yn gyson ledled Cymru. Rwyf yn cydnabod y mater y mae'r Aelod yn ei godi ynghylch cydbwysio effaith y diwydiant twristiaeth; gall arwyddion da a chywir ar y rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd alluogi a chefnogi hynny.

Rydych yn gwbl gywir wrth godi'r mater ein bod yn cael ein rheoli o dan orchymyn arwyddion traffig ar gyfer atyniadau a chyfleusterau i dwristiaid Lloegr ar hyn o bryd. Wrth gwrs, byddwn yn ystyried sut y byddwn yn disodli hynny â gorchymyn

newydd yn dilyn yr ymgynghoriad rwyf wedi sôn amdano.

**Angela Burns:** Minister, I am delighted that we will very soon have a new policy because, as you will recall, I have raised this subject many times over the past four years. When the Member for Arfon was the Minister, he promised a brown sign policy and that never materialised. When the former leader of Plaid Cymru was a Minister, he promised a brown sign policy and that never materialised. I am delighted to hear that we may finally be coming to the end of fudge, because in my constituency of Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire, tourism signs are vital to the local economy.

**Angela Burns:** Weinidog, rwyf yn falch iawn y bydd gennym bolisi newydd yn fuan oherwydd, fel y byddwch yn cofio, rwyf wedi codi'r pwnc hwn droeon dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Pan mai'r Aelod dros Arfon oedd y Gweinidog, addawodd y byddem yn cael polisi arwyddion brown, ond ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Pan oedd cyn arweinydd Plaid Cymru yn Weinidog, addawodd yntau y byddem yn cael polisi arwyddion brown, ond ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Rwyf yn falch iawn o glywed ein bod, o'r diwedd, yn gweld diwedd y llastr hwnnw, oherwydd yn fy etholaeth i, sef Gorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro, mae arwyddion twristiaeth yn hollbwysig i'r economi leol.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am not sure how many tourism signs will be advertising fudge, but you can be assured that this Minister is standing up for Wales in terms of delivering a brown sign policy.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae arwyddion twristiaeth yn hollbwysig i'r economi, a gallwch fod yn sicr bod y Gweinidog hwn yn sefyll yn gadarn dros Gymru o ran darparu polisi arwyddion brown.

### **Dyfodol Cymunedau yn Gyntaf**

### **The Future of Communities First**

**12. Mark Isherwood:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu dyfodol Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. OAQ(4)0125(LGC)*

**12. Mark Isherwood:** *Will the Minister outline the future of Communities First. OAQ(4)0125(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Communities First is a community-focused programme that will support the most disadvantaged people in our most deprived areas with the aim of contributing to alleviating persistent poverty. We will focus on the actions that can have the greatest impact on education, skills, economic and health outcomes.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn rhaglen sy'n canolbwyntio ar y gymuned a fydd yn cefnogi'r bobl fwyaf difreintiedig yn ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, gyda'r nod o gyfrannu at liniaru tloedi parhaus. Byddwn yn canolbwyntio ar y camau gweithredu a all gael yr effaith fwyaf ar ganlyniadau addysg, sgiliau, economeg ac iechyd.

**Mark Isherwood:** As you are aware, the Welsh Government's proposals for Communities First involve a cluster model, and you have been receiving submissions recently from different areas on their proposals for that. Welsh Government guidelines initially led to Wrexham County Borough Council consulting on a three-cluster model over four months, and Flintshire County Council consulting on a two-cluster model, but then the Welsh Government announced that it did not agree

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae cynigion Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cynnwys model clwstwr, ac rydych wedi bod yn derbyn gwybodaeth yn ddiweddar gan ardaloedd gwahanol ynghylch eu cynlluniau ar gyfer hynny. I ddechrau, yn sgîl canllawiau Llywodraeth Cymru, ymgynghorodd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam ar fodel tri chlwstwr am dros bedwar mis, ac ymgynghorodd Chyngor Sir y Fflint ar fodel dau glwstwr, ond yna cyhoeddodd

with the number of clusters and, despite the consultations, it wanted just two clusters in Wrexham and one in Flintshire. What is going on, Minister?

**Carl Sargeant:** I thought that consultation was about consultation—talking to people about the opportunities that there may or may not be. The Member has always had bit of a downer on Communities First. Listen: Labour is the only party that is committed to Communities First, and we will not turn our backs on the most deprived, unlike the Member's party opposite.

**David Rees:** I welcome the Communities First programme. It has been excellent in my constituency and has benefitted many people. I also welcome the introduction of the new programme of Communities First and the move towards a cluster organisation of these programmes. Could you provide an update on the progress being made in establishing those clusters, as has been mentioned, and perhaps look at the identification of the grant-receiving bodies for those clusters?

**Carl Sargeant:** Good progress is being made on the development of the new programme. I am very aware of the excellent, award-winning programme in Neath Port Talbot. As I have mentioned previously, the programme will be moving to a reduced number of programmes in clusters, with the number of grant-recipient bodies being significantly reduced as well. It is all on target. Change never happens without hiccups along the way, but I am confident that we will be able to deliver for our communities, and for the most deprived, in a much more effective way, with governance arrangements that are appropriate for this century.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, rydych yn hoff iawn o ddweud mai Plaid Llafur yw'r unig blaid sy'n cefnogi Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Rwy'n gobeithio y byddech yn derbyn ein bod ni bob amser wedi cefnogi'r egwyddor o Gymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac mae hynny wedi bod yn gwbl glir ym mhob maniffesto ein bod wedi ei gyhoeddi.

Llywodraeth Cymru nad oedd yn cytuno â nifer y clystyrau ac, er gwaethaf yr ymgynghoriadau, dim ond dau glwstwr roedd arni ei heisiau yn Wrecsam ac un yn sir y Fflint. Beth sy'n digwydd, Weinidog?

**Carl Sargeant:** Roeddwn i'n meddwl mai pwrpas ymgynghori oedd ymgynghori—siarad â phobl am y cyfleoedd posibl. Mae'r Aelod bob amser wedi bod braidd yn negyddol tuag at raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Gwrandewch: Llafur yw'r unig blaid sydd wedi ymrwymo i raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac ni fyddwn yn troi ein cefnau ar y bobl fwyaf difreintiedig, yn wahanol i blaid yr Aelod gyferbyn.

**David Rees:** Rwyf fi'n croesawu'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae wedi bod yn wych yn fy etholaeth i, ac wedi bod o fudd i lawer o bobl. Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu cyflwyno rhaglen newydd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a'r symud tuag at sefydliad clwstwr o'r rhaglenni hyn. A allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd a wneir yng nghyswllt sefydlu'r clystyrau hynny, fel y crybwyllwyd, ac efallai ystyried enwi'r cyrff sy'n derbyn grantiau ar gyfer y clystyrau hynny?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae cynnydd da'n cael ei wneud i ddatblygu'r rhaglen newydd. Rwyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r rhaglen arobryn wych yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. Fel rwyf wedi crybwyll o'r blaen, bydd y rhaglen yn symud i nifer llai o raglenni mewn clystyrau, gyda nifer y cyrff sy'n derbyn grantiau yn cael ei leihau'n sylweddol hefyd. Mae popeth ar y trywydd cywir. Mae newidiadau bob amser yn cynnwys problemau bach ar hyd y ffordd, ond rwyf yn ffyddiog y byddwn yn gallu cyflawni ar gyfer ein cymunedau, ac ar gyfer y bobl fwyaf difreintiedig, mewn ffordd fwy effeithiol o lawer, gyda threfniadau llywodraethu sy'n briodol ar gyfer y ganrif hon.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, you are very fond of saying that Labour is the only party that supports Communities First. I hope that you would accept that we have always supported the principle of Communities First, and that has been perfectly clear in every manifesto that we have published.

Fodd bynnag, o ran clystyru, sut y byddwch yn sicrhau bod atebolrwydd lleol a bod llais gan y cymunedau eu hunain er mwyn sicrhau bod y cynlluniau sy'n cael eu cyflwyno o fantais i'r cymunedau hynny a'r bobl sy'n byw ynddynt?

**Carl Sargeant:** The Member is absolutely right about the cluster arrangements and local interaction. I am keen to ensure that my development team creating the new Communities First programme ensures that community engagement is taken forward as the programme develops. Accountability is always important. I believe that local people know what is going on in their communities and they can make the real difference. That is what Communities First has benefitted from in the past, and I will not be departing from that—it is just that, in terms of the way that we operate the whole scheme, we can get much more effective front-line service delivery by using the cluster model.

### Y Rhwydwaith Cefnffyrdd

**13. Darren Millar:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd yng Ngogledd Cymru. OAQ(4)0122(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I will continue to deliver on our programme for government to maximise reliability, improve journey times, improve safety on the trunk road network, and improve our infrastructure.

**Darren Millar:** Minister, you will be aware that, following the grounding of the MV Carrier off the coast of Llanddulas, and the big rescue operation and clean-up mission that is now under way, the A55 trunk road was affected for two days and there is still a 40 mph speed limit zone on the eastbound carriageway. Could you give us an update on progress in terms of the demolition at that site, and the impact on the A55, including a date for when that speed limit zone might be ended?

**Carl Sargeant:** The salvage operation is

However, in terms of clustering, how will you ensure local accountability and that the communities themselves have a voice in order to ensure that the schemes that are introduced are of benefit to those communities and the people who live in them?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r Aelod yn llygad ei le ynghylch y trefniadau clystyru a rhyngweithio lleol. Rwyf yn awyddus i sicrhau bod fy nhîm datblygu sy'n creu'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf newydd yn sicrhau bod y cymunedau'n cael eu cynnwys wrth i'r rhaglen ddatblygu. Mae atebolrwydd bob amser yn bwysig. Rwyf yn credu bod pobl leol yn gwybod beth sy'n digwydd yn eu cymunedau, a gallant hwy wneud gwahaniaeth go iawn. Dyna mae Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi elwa ohono yn y gorffennol, ac ni fyddaf yn gwyro oddi wrth hynny—y broblem yw, o ran y ffordd rydym yn gweithredu'r cynllun cyfan, gallwn gael gwasanaethau rheng-flaen llawer mwy effeithiol drwy ddefnyddio'r model clystyrau.

### The Trunk Road Network

**13. Darren Millar:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the trunk road network in North Wales. OAQ(4)0122(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddaf yn parhau i gyflawni ein rhaglen lywodraethu i sicrhau dibynadwyedd, i wella amseroedd teithio, i wella diogelwch ar y rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd ac i wella ein seilwaith.

**Darren Millar:** Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y Cludydd MV a darodd y ddaear oddi ar arfordir Llanddulas a'r ymgyrch achub fawr a'r gwaith glanhau sy'n mynd rhagddo yn awr, wedi effeithio ar gefnffordd yr A55 am ddau ddiwrnod, ac mae parth terfyn cyflymder o 40 milltir yr awr mewn grym o hyd ar y ffordd ddeuol i'r dwyrain. A allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y cynnydd yng nghyswllt y gwaith dymchwel ar y safle hwnnw, a'r effaith ar yr A55, gan gynnwys dyddiad ar gyfer pryd y gallai'r parth terfyn cyflymder hwnnw ddod i ben?

**Carl Sargeant:** Disgwylir i'r ymgyrch adfer

expected to take around two months in total. Work is well under way. I am sure that the Member is very aware, living in the area, of the issues surrounding the possibility of having to close the A55 on a bank holiday weekend. That was resisted, and we have managed to continue with a fully open network, and that was achieved through all the emergency services and planning teams in north Wales working hard 24 hours a day, seven days a week.

3.00 p.m.

We managed to minimise the effects of a difficult and potentially life-threatening disaster in north Wales. The 40 mph restriction is a small price to pay for ensuring the safety of people who use the carriageway. If there is any change to the detail of the salvage and recovery operation, I will inform the Member, as I have done in the past.

#### Trafnidiaeth Gymunedol

**14. Mark Isherwood:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am werthusiad pellach o gynlluniau trafndiaeth gymunedol. OAQ(4)0126(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** My officials have started the review. They have asked each scheme for details of passenger numbers and journeys, and other detailed information. As a follow-up, they will meet the sponsors of each scheme in May and June to assess this information.

**Mark Isherwood:** While it had been understood previously that you were to end the schemes in March, a letter was then read out to the cross-party group on older people and ageing announcing that evaluation. At the next business statement on 21 January, I called for a statement on the matter, but was told that you had already made one. In fact, you had not. You made a statement two days later on 23 January. You announced again that the funding for the projects would not end but would continue while the evaluation took place. How do you respond to concerns that some of those schemes are still going ahead with redundancies—cutting employed staff—because of the short notice given?

bara tua deufis i gyd. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo'n dda. Rwyf yn siŵr bod yr Aelod yn ymwybodol iawn, ac yntau'n byw yn yr ardal, o'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r posibilrwydd o orfod cau'r A55 ar benwythnos gŵyl y banc. Gwrthwynebwyd hynny, ac rydym wedi llwyddo i barhau â rhwydwaith cwbl agored, diolch i holl wasanaethau brys a thimau cynllunio'r gogledd sy'n gweithio'n galed 24 awr y dydd, saith niwrnod yr wythnos.

Llwyddom i leihau effeithiau trychineb anodd a allai fod wedi bod yn angheuol yn y gogledd. Mae cyfyngiad cyflymder o 40 milltir yr awr yn bris bach i'w dalu am sicrhau diogelwch pobl sy'n defnyddio'r ffordd. Os bydd unrhyw newid ym manylion yr ymgyrch adfer, byddaf yn rhoi gwybod i'r Aelod, fel rwyf wedi'i wneud yn y gorffennol.

#### Community Transport

**14. Mark Isherwood:** *Will the Minister provide an update on the further evaluation of community transport schemes. OAQ(4)0126(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae fy swyddogion wedi dechrau ar yr adolygiad. Maent wedi gofyn i bob cynllun am fanylion nifer y teithwyr a'r teithiau, ac am fathau eraill o wybodaeth fanwl. Yn dilyn hynny, byddant yn cael cyfarfod â noddwyr pob cynllun ym mis Mai a Mehefin i asesu'r wybodaeth hon.

**Mark Isherwood:** Er ein bod wedi cael ar ddeall yn y gorffennol y byddech yn dod â'r cynlluniau i ben fis Mawrth, cafodd llythyr ei ddarllen i'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar bobl hŷn a heneiddio yn cyhoeddi'r gwerthusiad hwnnw. Yn y datganiad busnes nesaf ar 21 Ionawr, galwais am ddatganiad ar y mater, ond dywedwyd wrthyf eich bod eisoes wedi gwneud un. Ond, nid oeddech wedi gwneud hynny. Gwnaethoch ddatganiad ddau ddiwrnod yn ddiweddarach ar 23 Ionawr. Gwnaethoch gyhoeddi eto na fyddai'r cyllid ar gyfer y prosiectau yn dod i ben ac y byddai'n parhau tra byddai'r gwerthusiad yn mynd rhagddo. Sut ydych yn ymateb i bryderon bod rhai o'r cynlluniau hynny yn dal

What assurances can you provide that can allow those schemes that still have staff to ensure that there is some sustainability?

**Carl Sargeant:** Let us put the facts on the table, Mark: there has been no reduction in the funding to any of these organisations. I have asked for a review to be conducted because some of the passenger journey figures relating to the costs of community concessionary fares vary from a journey cost of £2.85 to a cost of £26.06, which is a significant difference. I have asked my team to explain the variance in figures to understand better the consequences of having a funding regime for concessionary fares. There has been no change to the financing of these organisations across Wales. I am, therefore, surprised that any of them are continuing with their redundancy packages.

#### **Meiri Etholedig (Refferenda)**

**15. David Melding:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y mecanwaith i sbarduno refferenda ar gyfer Meiri etholedig mewn Awdurdodau Lleol. OAQ(4)0128(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for South Wales Central for his question. The Local Authorities (Referendums) (Petitions and Directions) (Wales) Regulations 2001 provide that a petition signed by at least 10% of the electorate, and submitted to the proper office of a local authority during the six-month petition period will trigger a referendum for a directly elected mayor.

**David Melding:** Minister, 10 of England's major cities that have not already held a referendum will hold one tomorrow. Are you concerned that if many of these cities vote to establish a mayor, our cities may be left behind? Cities such as Cardiff and Swansea, for instance, could benefit from the particular advantages of marketing and leadership that a mayor can bring. We need some leadership, and perhaps the first thing that you could do is offer to pay the cost of holding referenda centrally, as the current Government at Westminster has done.

i fwrw ymlaen â diswyddiadau—lleiau nifer y staff cyflogedig—oherwydd bod hyn mor fyr rybudd? Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi er mwyn i'r cynlluniau hynny y mae ganddynt staff o hyd allu sicrhau cynaliadwyedd?

**Carl Sargeant:** Gadewch inni roi'r ffeithiau ar y bwrdd, Mark: ni fu unrhyw ostyngiad yn y cyllid a roddir i unrhyw un o'r sefydliadau hyn. Rwyf wedi gofyn am adolygiad oherwydd bod rhai o ffigurau teithiau teithwyr sy'n ymwneud â chostau tocynnau teithio rhatach ar drafnidiaeth gymunedol yn amrywio o £2.85 i £26.06 y daith, sy'n wahaniaeth mawr. Rwyf wedi gofyn i fy nhîm egluro'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y ffigurau er mwyn deall yn well beth yw canlyniadau cael trefn gyllido ar gyfer tocynnau teithio rhatach. Ni fu unrhyw newid yn sefyllfa gyllido'r sefydliadau hyn ar draws Cymru. Felly, rwyf yn synnu bod unrhyw un ohonynt yn parhau â'u pecynnau diswyddo.

#### **Elected Mayors (Referenda)**

**15. David Melding:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the mechanism to trigger referendums for elected Mayors in Local Authorities. OAQ(4)0128(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ganol De Cymru am ei gwestiwn. Mae Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Refferenda) (Deisebau a Chyfarwyddiadau) (Cymru) 2001 yn sicrhau y bydd deiseb sydd wedi cael ei llofnodi gan o leiaf 10 y cant o'r etholwyr, a'i chyflwyno i swyddfa briodol awdurdod lleol yn ystod y cyfnod deisebu chwe mis, yn sbarduno refferendwm ar gyfer maer etholedig uniongyrchol.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, bydd 10 o ddinasoedd mwyaf Lloegr nad ydynt eisoes wedi cynnal refferendwm, yn cynnal un yfory. A ydych yn pryderu pe bai llawer o'r dinasoedd hyn yn pleidleisio o blaid sefydlu maer, y gallai ein dinasoedd ni gael eu gadael ar ôl? Gallai dinasoedd fel Caerdydd ac Abertawe, er enghraifft, elwa o'r manteision penodol sy'n deillio o brosesau marchnata ac arweinyddiaeth y gall maer eu cynnig. Mae arnom angen rhywfaint o arweiniad, ac efallai mai'r peth cyntaf y gallech ei wneud yw cynnig talu'r gost o gynnal refferenda yn ganolog, fel y mae Llywodraeth bresennol



San Steffan wedi'i wneud.

**Carl Sargeant:** I believe that the opportunity for the election of a mayor, or for having a mayoral system, is down to the electorate, and local authorities can make that decision. Let me give you some real numbers in respect of how this could work. In Blaenau Gwent, for instance, to trigger a referendum would require only 5,400 people. I am sure that if 5,418 people were interested in electing a local mayor, it would not be that hard to achieve. I am sure that the Member and his party would agree that this is about local democracy and local people making a choice. The opportunity to elect mayors rests in the hands of the electorate.

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf fi o'r farn mai'r etholwyr ddylai benderfynu a ydynt am gael cyfle i ethol maer, neu i beidio â chael system maer, a gall awdurdodau lleol wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw. Gadewch imi roi rhywfaint o ffigurau go iawn ichi ynghylch sut y gallai hyn weithio. Ym Mlaenau Gwent, er enghraifft, dim ond 5,400 o bobl fyddai eu hangen i sbarduno refferendwm. Rwyf yn siŵr pe bai 5,418 o bobl yn awyddus i ethol maer lleol, ni fyddai'n anodd iawn cyflawni hynny. Rwyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Aelod a'i blaid yn cytuno bod hyn yn ymwneud â democratiaeth leol, a phobl leol yn penderfynu. Mae'r cyfle i ethol meiri yn nwylo'r etholwyr.

### Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

#### Cyllideb y GIG The NHS Budget

**The Presiding Officer:** I have accepted a request for an urgent question under Standing Order No. 12.66.

**Y Llywydd:** Rwyf wedi derbyn cais am gwestiwn brys o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 12.66.

*Andrew R.T. Davies: Yn ychwanegol at ddatganiad ysgrifenedig y Gweinidog heddiw, a'r newyddion y bu angen cymorth ariannol ychwanegol gan Lywodraeth Cymru ar dri bwrdd iechyd lleol, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad brys ar y goblygiadau ar gyfer cyllideb y GIG. EAQ(4)0120(HSS)*

*Andrew R.T. Davies: Further to the Minister's written statement today, and the news that 3 Local Health Boards have required additional financial assistance from the Welsh Government, will the Minister make an urgent statement on the implications for the NHS budget. EAQ(4)0120(HSS)*

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths):** The provisional outturn for the NHS for the last financial year, which I announced today, indicates that all NHS organisations met their statutory duty to break even. That is a remarkable achievement, which places NHS Wales in the strongest possible position to deliver the improvements that will underpin its success in the future.

**Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths):** Mae alldro dros dro y GIG ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol diwethaf, y cyhoeddwyd gennyf heddiw, yn dangos bod holl sefydliadau'r GIG wedi bodloni eu dyletswydd statudol i adennill costau. Mae hynny'n dipyn o gamp, ac mae'n rhoi GIG Cymru yn y sefyllfa orau bosibl i gyflawni'r gwelliannau a fydd yn sail i'w lwyddiant yn y dyfodol.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Thank you, Minister, for your answer. The press release that you issued today is quite remarkable, in the Enron economics that it highlighted you are using. Will you confirm that, if the £12.4 million had not been able to be transferred from this

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am eich ateb. Mae'r datganiad i'r wasg y gwnaethoch ei gyhoeddi heddiw yn eithaf rhyfeddol, wrth iddo dynnu sylw at y ffaith eich bod yn defnyddio economeg Enron. A wnewch chi gadarnhau na fyddai tri

year's financial settlement to last year's financial settlement, three local health boards in Wales would not have balanced their budgets?

**Lesley Griffiths:** I am grateful for this opportunity to reinforce the scale of the achievement of the NHS in 2011-12. I congratulate local health boards and NHS trusts on that remarkable achievement, given the financial pressures that NHS Wales has faced in the past financial year. The money did not come from this year's money, for 2012-13. It came from a contingency fund that I hold centrally in my department. It is a new financial regime that I have introduced. I stand for open books and transparency in the NHS. I could have chosen to manage the finances of the NHS in a closed way, but I have chosen not to. While I am Minister, I will ensure that there is wise financial management in the NHS, and I aim to ensure that we make the best use of every pound of NHS money.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Weinidog, ym mis Hydref 2011, dywedasoch eich bod yn rhoi £100 miliwn yn ychwanegol i awdurdodau iechyd lleol ar yr amod eu bod yn cadw o fewn eu cyllideb. Nid ydynt wedi cadw o fewn eu cyllideb. Felly, a chithau'n Weinidog, rhaid ichi ateb pam eich bod wedi talu £12.4 miliwn yn ychwanegol, ar ôl dweud nad oedd ceiniog ychwanegol i gael. How proud are you, Minister, of a headline that reads

“Remarkable achievement”: NHS Wales breaks-even”?

Is it not true that, in debate after debate, in question after question and in evidence to committees in this place, you said that there was not a single penny extra to the £100 million that you had promised them? You are now telling the people of Wales that an extra £12.4 million is being paid to them. Is it not true, therefore, that you have rolled over and caved in, and that every local health board in Wales knows that, if it runs out of money, you will always bail it out?

bwrdd iechyd lleol yng Nghymru wedi gallu mantoli eu cyllidebau pe na byddai modd trosglwyddo'r £12.4 miliwn o setliad ariannol eleni i setliad ariannol y llynedd?

**Lesley Griffiths:** Rwyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle hwn i atgyfnerthu cyflawniad y GIG yn 2011-12. Rwyf yn llongyfarch byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG ar y cyflawniad penigamp hwnnw, o ystyried y pwysau ariannol y mae GIG Cymru wedi ei wynebu dros y flwyddyn ariannol diwethaf. Ni ddaeth yr arian o arian eleni, ar gyfer 2012-13. Daeth o gronfa wrth gefn sydd gennyf yn ganolog yn fy adran i. Mae'n drefn ariannol newydd rwyf fi wedi ei chyflwyno. Rwyf yn cefnogi llyfrau agored a thryloywder yn y GIG. Gallwn fod wedi dewis rheoli cyllid y GIG mewn ffordd gaeedig, ond rwyf wedi dewis peidio â gwneud hynny. Tra byddaf finnau'n Weinidog, byddaf yn sicrhau bod materion ariannol y GIG yn cael eu rheoli'n ddoeth, a fy nod yw sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio bob punt o arian y GIG yn y ffordd orau bosibl.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Minister, in October 2011, you said that you were giving an additional £100 million to local health authorities with the proviso that they kept within their budgets. They have not kept within their budgets. Therefore, as Minister, you must answer for why you have given an additional £12.4 million after saying that not a single penny more would be available. Pa mor falch ydych chi, Weinidog, o weld pennawd sy'n dweud

“Llwyddiant arbennig”: GIG Cymru yn cadw'r ddysgl yn wastad”?

Onid yw'n wir eich bod wedi dweud, mewn dadl ar ôl dadl, mewn cwestiwn ar ôl cwestiwn ac mewn tystiolaeth i bwyllgorau yn y lle hwn, nad oedd yr un geiniog ar gael yn ychwanegol i'r £100 miliwn roeddech wedi ei addo iddynt? Rydych bellach yn dweud wrth bobl Cymru bod £12.4 miliwn yn ychwanegol yn cael ei dalu iddynt. Onid yw'n wir, felly, eich bod wedi ildio, a bod pob bwrdd iechyd lleol yng Nghymru yn gwybod y byddwch bob amser yn rhoi cymorth ariannol iddo yn ddi-amod pe bai'n rhedeg allan o arian?

**Lesley Griffiths:** First, this is absolutely not a bail-out. Any money that has been drawn down is conditional. For an LHB to receive the support, the chair, chief executive, director of finance and chair of the audit committee all have to write to me formally acknowledging their requirement for some end-year flexibility. As a condition of that flexibility, my officials have commissioned a vigorous external financial review of the organisation's financial plans. I am currently awaiting the final report for the year. If there are any shortcomings in the financial leadership of any of the LHBs, I will take strong action. It cannot be called a bail-out, because they will not be allowed to draw down money year on year. Any requests for end-year flexibility—which is only the same as local government and other areas of the public sector have for three years—will be granted only if they undertake not to draw down any further funding for a period of three years.

**Kirsty Williams:** Could the Minister explain the difference between a contingency plan and a bail-out? Could she also confirm that, apart from the three boards that have not been able to meet their targets, at least two others have been able to meet their targets only because of in-year so-called 'strategic assistance', or additional support that was made available? Perhaps most significantly of all, Minister, could you give the Chamber an analysis of whether the savings that have undoubtedly been achieved are recurrent savings that will put the NHS in Wales on a sustainable financial footing, or are they one-off emergency measures such as cancelling clinics for the last month of the financial year or not paying for doctors' sessions until the new financial year?

**Lesley Griffiths:** This really is a good-news story. I cannot believe that opposition Members cannot accept the huge scale of achievement that the NHS in Wales has achieved. *[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Let the

**Lesley Griffiths:** Yn gyntaf, nid cymorth ariannol di-amod mo hyn. Mae unrhyw arian sydd wedi'i dderbyn yn amodol. Er mwyn i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol dderbyn y cymorth, rhaid i'r cadeirydd, y prif weithredwr, y cyfarwyddwr cyllid a chadeirydd y pwyllgor archwilio i gyd ysgrifennu ataf i gydnabod yn ffurfiol eu cais am rywffaint o hyblygrwydd ddiwedd blwyddyn. Mae fy swyddogion wedi comisiynu adolygiad ariannol allanol trylwyr o gynlluniau ariannol y sefydliad, fel un o amodau'r hyblygrwydd hwnnw. Rwyf yn disgwyl am yr adroddiad terfynol ar gyfer y flwyddyn ar hyn o bryd. Os ceir unrhyw ddiffygion yn arweinyddiaeth ariannol unrhyw un o'r Byrddau Iechyd Lleol, byddaf yn cymryd camau cryf. Ni ellir galw hynny'n gymorth ariannol di-amod, oherwydd ni fyddant yn cael derbyn arian flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Dim ond os byddant yn ymrwymo i beidio â derbyn dim arian pellach am gyfnod o dair blynedd y bydd unrhyw gais am hyblygrwydd ddiwedd blwyddyn—sydd yr un fath â'r hyn sydd gan lywodraeth leol a meysydd eraill o'r sector cyhoeddus am dair blynedd—yn cael ei ganiatáu.

**Kirsty Williams:** A allai'r Gweinidog egluro'r gwahaniaeth rhwng cynllun wrth gefn a chymorth ariannol di-amod? A allai hefyd gadarnhau bod o leiaf ddau fwrdd arall, ar wahân i'r tri bwrdd nad ydynt wedi llwyddo i gyrraedd eu targedau, ddim ond wedi gallu cyrraedd eu targedau oherwydd 'cymorth strategol' yn ystod y flwyddyn, fel y'i gelwir, neu gymorth ychwanegol a oedd ar gael? Efallai yn fwyaf arwyddocaol, Weinidog, a allwch roi i'r Siambr ddadansoddiad sy'n dangos a yw'r arbedion sy'n ddi-os wedi'u cyflawni yn arbedion rheolaidd a fydd yn sicrhau bod GIG Cymru'n gynaliadwy yn ariannol, neu ai mesurau brys untro ydynt, fel canslo clinigau ar gyfer mis olaf y flwyddyn ariannol neu beidio â thalu am sesiynau meddygon tan y flwyddyn ariannol newydd?

**Lesley Griffiths:** Mae hyn wir yn newyddion da. Ni allaf gredu na all Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau dderbyn bod GIG Cymru wedi cyflawni cymaint. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Rhowch gyfle i'r Gweinidog ymateb.

**Lesley Griffiths:** This achievement of financial balance has also been delivered against a pattern of general improvement and maintenance against key delivery priorities. I am confident that, when the accounts of the English NHS trusts—which the Liberals and the Tory UK Government will have given massive bail-outs—are published, you will all be agreeing with me that the scale of achievement in NHS Wales is fantastic.

**Mark Drakeford:** Minister, do you agree that today's end-of-year outturn figures demonstrate two key things? First, they demonstrate the remarkable efforts that the NHS in Wales has made to deliver substantial savings, to meet its statutory financial targets, and to achieve clinical advances in key areas, such as stroke services and emergency readmission to hospital at one and the same time? Secondly, does the rather phoney hoo-ha around the Chamber not demonstrate the urgent need to consider reform of current accounting arrangements when short-term financial reporting arrangements can obstruct rather than assist the longer term processes of reform?

**Lesley Griffiths:** Yes, I absolutely agree, and I thank all those concerned for their hard work over the past year, which has brought about this excellent result. The Wales Audit Office was agreeable to the arrangements that we put in place, and as a result of this new financial regime—and I am sure that Darren Millar, as Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, will welcome this—no NHS bodies have had their accounts qualified by the Wales Audit Office. Year on year, NHS organisations were bailed out with no strings attached. I have introduced a new financial regime. It should be welcomed and everyone should join me in accepting that NHS Wales has achieved a great deal during this past financial year.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Llwyddwyd i sicrhau balans ariannol yn erbyn patrwm o waith cynnal a chadw a gwelliannau cyffredinol yn erbyn blaenoriaethau cyflenwi allweddol. Rwyf yn hyderus y bydd pob un ohonoch yn cytuno â mi bod GIG Cymru wedi llwyddo i gyflawni ar raddfa wych pan fydd cyfrifon ymddiriedolaethau GIG Lloegr—y bydd Llywodraeth Doriâidd a Rhyddfrydol y DU wedi rhoi llawer iawn o gymorth ariannol di-amod iddynt—yn cael eu cyhoeddi.

**Mark Drakeford:** Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno bod ffigurau alldro ddiwedd blwyddyn heddiw'n dangos dau beth allweddol? Yn gyntaf, maent yn dangos yr ymdrechion hynod y mae GIG Cymru wedi eu gwneud i sicrhau arbedion sylweddol, i gyrraedd ei dargedau ariannol statudol, ac i gyflawni datblygiadau clinigol mewn meysydd allweddol, fel gwasanaethau strôc ac aildderbyn i'r ysbyty ar frys, i gyd ar yr un pryd? Yn ail, onid yw'r ffug ffwdan yn y Siambr yn dangos yr angen brys i ystyried diwygio trefniadau cyfrifyddu cyfredol pan fo trefniadau ar gyfer adroddiadau ariannol tymor byr yn gallu rhwystro, yn hytrach na chynorthwyo, prosesau diwygio tymor hwy?

**Lesley Griffiths:** Ydy, cytunaf yn llwyr, a diolch i bawb dan sylw am eu gwaith caled dros y flwyddyn diwethaf, sydd wedi arwain at y canlyniad ardderchog hwn. Mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru wedi cytuno i'r trefniadau rydym wedi eu rhoi ar waith, ac o ganlyniad i'r drefn ariannol newydd hon—ac rwyf yn siŵr y bydd Darren Millar, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus, yn croesawu hyn—nid yw Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru wedi archwilio cyfrifon yr un o gyrff y GIG. Flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, roedd sefydliadau'r GIG yn cael cymorth ariannol heb unrhyw amodau ynghlwm. Rwyf fi wedi cyflwyno trefn ariannol newydd. Dylid ei chroesawu a dylai pawb ymuno â mi wrth dderbyn bod GIG Cymru wedi cyflawni llawer iawn yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol diwethaf.

### **Cynnig i Sefydlu'r Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog Motion to Establish the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister**

*Cynnig NDM4969 Rosemary Butler*

*Motion NDM4969 Rosemary Butler*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 16.5:*

*1. Yn sefydlu Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog; a*

*2. Yn cytuno mai cylch gwaith y Pwyllgor fydd craffu ar waith y Prif Weinidog am unrhyw fater sy'n berthnasol i'r gwaith o arfer swyddogaethau Llywodraeth Cymru.*

**The Minister for Finance and Leader of the House (Jane Hutt):** I move the motion.

**The Presiding Officer:** The proposal is that the motion be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is not. In accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36, I therefore declare the motion agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

### **Cynnig i Ethol Aelodau'r Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog Motion to Elect Members to the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister**

*Cynnig NDM4970 Rosemary Butler*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.3, yn ethol:*

*1. Paul Davies (Ceidwadwyr), Mark Drakeford (Llafur), Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru), David Melding (Ceidwadwyr) ac Eluned Parrott (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol) yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog; a*

*2. David Melding (Ceidwadwyr) yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog.*

**The Minister for Finance and Leader of the House (Jane Hutt):** I move the motion.

**The Presiding Officer:** The proposal is that the motion be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is not. In accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36, I therefore declare the motion agreed.

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 16.5:*

*1. Establishes a Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister; and*

*2. Agrees that the remit of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister is to scrutinise the First Minister on any matter relevant to the exercise of the functions of the Welsh Government.*

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau y cynnig.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cynnig yw bod y cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36, felly, rwyf yn datgan y caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

*Motion NDM4970 Rosemary Butler*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 17.3, elects:*

*1. Paul Davies (Conservatives), Mark Drakeford (Labour), Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru), David Melding (Conservatives) and Eluned Parrott (Liberal Democrats) as members of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister; and*

*2. David Melding (Conservatives) as Chair of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister.*

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau y cynnig.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cynnig yw bod y cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36, felly, rwyf yn datgan y caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

## **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar Iechyd y Geg mewn Plant The Children and Young People Committee's Report on Children's Oral Health**

*Cynnig NDM4971 Christine Chapman*

*Motion NDM4971 Christine Chapman*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar yr ymchwiliad i iechyd y geg ymhlith plant, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Chwefror 2012.*

*Notes the report of the Children and Young People Committee on the inquiry into children's oral health, which was laid in the Table Office on 22 February 2012.*

**Christine Chapman:** I move the motion.

**Christine Chapman:** Cynigiau y cynnig.

Toothache. The mere mention of the word will inspire memories of relentless throbbing and nagging pain in anyone who has been unfortunate enough to suffer from it. It is not something that you would want to associate with children and childhood but, unfortunately, for too many children in Wales, that is the sad reality. In fact, although it is preventable, tooth decay—or dental caries, to give it its proper title—is still the most common childhood disease, and the dental health of children in Wales is among the worst in the UK.

Y ddannoedd. Mae crybwyll y gair yn ddigon i atgoffa unrhyw un sydd wedi bod yn ddigon anffodus i'w dioddef am y cur creulon a'r boen ddi-baid. Nid yw'n rhywbeth y byddech am ei gysylltu â phlant a phlentyndod, ond, yn anffodus, i ormod o blant yng Nghymru, dyna'r gwirionedd trist. A dweud y gwir, er bod modd ei osgoi, pydredd dannedd yw'r clefyd mwyaf cyffredin yn ystod plentynod o hyd, ac mae iechyd dannedd plant Cymru ymhlith y gwaethaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig.

The most recent child dental health survey found that over 50% of five-year-old children in Wales suffer dental decay, with disease levels being highest in deprived areas. In addition, dental epidemiological surveys have shown an increased severity of dental disease in those children who suffer from it.

Canfu'r arolwg diweddaraf o iechyd deintyddol plant fod dannedd dros 50 y cant o blant pum mlwydd oed yng Nghymru yn pydru, a bod y clefyd ar ei waethaf mewn ardaloedd di-fraint. At hynny, mae arolygon epidemiolegol deintyddol wedi dangos bod afiechyd deintyddol yn fwy difrifol ymhlith y plant hynny sy'n dioddef ohono.

The Children and Young People Committee therefore agreed to undertake its first inquiry into children's oral health and, more specifically, to examine the effectiveness of the Welsh Government's Designed to Smile programme at improving the oral health of children in Wales, particularly in deprived areas. We took evidence from a wide range of organisations and health professionals, and our report, published in February, contained 10 recommendations for the Welsh Government. I thank the Minister for her positive response to our inquiry and her

Cytunodd y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc felly i gynnal ei ymchwiliad cyntaf i iechyd y geg mewn plant, ac yn fwy penodol, i archwilio pa mor effeithiol oedd rhaglen Cynllun Gwên Llywodraeth Cymru i wella Iechyd y Geg i blant yng Nghymru, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd di-fraint. Cafwyd tystiolaeth gan ystod eang o sefydliadau a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, ac yn ein hadroddiad a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Chwefror, roedd 10 argymhelliad i Lywodraeth Cymru. Rwyf yn diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb cadarnhaol i'n hymchwiliad ac am dderbyn

acceptance of all but one of our recommendations.

One of the most shocking pieces of evidence we heard was the extent to which general anaesthetics were being used on children for dental work. Approximately 9,000 children were treated under general anaesthetic in Wales in 2010. To put that into context, that is, on average, two children in a class of 30. Almost as shocking was the view presented by the British Society of Paediatric Dentistry that many parents saw the extraction of their child's baby teeth under general anaesthetic as the norm.

3.15 p.m.

In her evidence to the committee, the Minister highlighted some of the difficulties in obtaining robust data on extractions under general anaesthetic. Nonetheless, the committee felt that this was one way of monitoring whether child health is improving. I am pleased that the Minister was able to accept our recommendation that the Welsh Government ensures that data on the number of general anaesthetics administered to children and young people for dental in Wales are collated and reported as part of the monitoring of Designed to Smile.

We also felt that it is important to change parents' attitudes towards toothbrushing and oral hygiene to ensure that brushing in school is supplemented by brushing at home. We were told that there is some evidence that this is starting to happen, with children asking to brush their teeth after meals, but we feel that this needs to be more widespread. We have therefore recommended that the Government ensures that action is taken to better educate parents about Designed to Smile to ensure that they understand the importance of getting fluoride onto children's teeth as part of home brushing. I am very pleased that the Minister was able to accept this recommendation.

We also heard some concerns about the way

pob un o'n hargymhellion heblaw un.

Un o'r darnau tystiolaeth mwyaf ysgytwol a glywsom oedd i ba raddau yr oedd anesthetig cyffredinol yn cael ei ddefnyddio ar blant er mwyn gwneud gwaith deintyddol. Cafodd oddeutu 9,000 o blant driniaeth o dan anesthetig cyffredinol yng Nghymru yn 2010. A rhoi hynny yn ei gyd-destun, mae'n golygu dau blentyn mewn dosbarth o 30 ar gyfartaledd. Roedd y farn a gyflwynwyd gan Gymdeithas Deintyddiaeth Bediatrig Prydain bron â bod yr un mor ysgytwol, sef bod llawer o rieni'n meddwl mai'r norm oedd tynnu dannedd babi eu plentyn o dan anesthetig cyffredinol.

Yn ei thystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, tynnodd y Gweinidog sylw at rai o'r anawsterau sy'n codi wrth geisio cael gafael ar ddata cadarn ynglŷn â thynnu dannedd o dan anesthetig cyffredinol. Serch hynny, teimlai'r pwyllgor mai dyma un ffordd o fonitro a yw iechyd plant yn gwella. Rwyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi gallu derbyn ein hargymhelliad bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn sicrhau bod data am nifer y triniaethau deintyddol a roddir i blant a phobl ifanc o dan anesthetig cyffredinol yng Nghymru'n cael eu casglu ac yn cael eu cynnwys mewn adroddiad fel rhan o waith monitro'r Cynllun Gwên.

Roeddem yn teimlo hefyd ei bod yn bwysig newid agweddau rhieni at lanhau dannedd a hylendid y geg er mwyn sicrhau bod glanhau'r dannedd yn yr ysgol yn cael ei ategu drwy eu glanhau gartref. Dywedwyd wrthym fod hyn yn dechrau digwydd, a bod plant yn gofyn am gael glanhau eu dannedd ar ôl bwyta, ond rydym yn teimlo bod angen i hyn ddigwydd yn fwy cyffredinol. Felly, rydym wedi argymhell bod y Llywodraeth yn sicrhau bod camau'n cael eu cymryd i addysgu rhieni'n well am y Cynllun Gwên er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn deall pwysigrwydd rhoi fflworid ar ddannedd plant fel rhan o'r drefn lanhau gartref. Rwy'n falch iawn bod y Gweinidog wedi gallu derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn.

Clywsom fod rhai'n poeni hefyd am y ffordd

in which the element in Designed to Smile for those up to the age of three was being implemented and about the challenges of reaching play groups and pre-school activities. Therefore, I welcome the Government's commitment to setting out the way in which it plans to ensure the effective implementation of this element and, more specifically, how it intends to involve key staff, such as health visitors, in promoting the scheme.

As tooth decay tends to be more widespread and more severe in children from disadvantaged communities, Designed to Smile targets only young children in the areas of greatest need. However, the committee was concerned that this targeting might result in some children with poor oral health being missed, particularly where there are pockets of deprivation in more affluent areas. The Minister confirmed that it is her intention to continue to target the programme in those areas where a greater proportion of children have experienced tooth decay and that there are no plans for the universal roll-out of Designed to Smile. We therefore recommended that the Government sets out how it intends to improve the oral health of all children in Wales, including those who are not currently targeted by Designed to Smile, and I am grateful for the Minister's acceptance of this recommendation.

As I said earlier, I welcome the Minister's acceptance of the majority of our recommendations. However, I am disappointed that she was not able to accept our recommendation that consideration should be given to incorporating Designed to Smile into the school curriculum to ensure that it is better integrated into initiatives such as Healthy Schools. We were told that the integration of Designed to Smile with other Government initiatives, such as Healthy Schools, varied greatly across Wales, and we were told that because it was not part of the curriculum, Designed to Smile did not have as much importance in a school. In evidence, we were also told that

'If a school has to do away with something, the first things to go are those that are not part of the curriculum.'

yr oedd yr elfen honno yn y Cynllun Gwên i'r rhai hyd at dair oed yn cael ei rhoi ar waith a'i bod yn anodd cyrraedd cylchoedd chwarae a gweithgareddau cyn ysgol. Felly, rwyf yn croesawu ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i egluro sut mae'n bwriadu sicrhau bod yr elfen hon yn cael ei rhoi ar waith yn effeithiol ac, yn fwy penodol, sut mae'n bwriadu cynnwys staff allweddol, megis ymwelwyr iechyd, i hyrwyddo'r cynllun.

Oherwydd bod pydredd dannedd yn tueddu i fod yn fwy cyffredin ac yn fwy difrifol ymhlith plant o gymunedau di-fraint, dim ond plant ifanc iawn y mae'r Cynllun Gwên yn eu targedu yn yr ardaloedd lle mae'r angen ar ei fwyaf. Serch hynny, roedd y pwyllgor yn poeni y gallai'r targedu hwn olygu bod rhai plant nad oedd iechyd eu ceg yn dda iawn yn cael eu hepgor o'r cynllun, yn enwedig lle mae pocedi di-fraint mewn ardaloedd mwy cefnog. Cadarnhaodd y Gweinidog mai ei bwriad yw parhau i dargedu'r rhaglen yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle mae cyfran fwy o blant wedi dioddef pydredd dannedd ac nad oes cynlluniau i ledaenu'r Cynllun Gwên i bob ardal. Felly, ein hargymhelliad ni oedd y dylai'r Llywodraeth ddweud sut mae'n bwriadu gwella iechyd y geg i holl blant Cymru, gan gynnwys y rheini nad ydynt yn cael eu targedu ar hyn o bryd gan y Cynllun Gwên, ac rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am dderbyn yr argymhelliad hwn.

Fel y dywedais gynnau, rwyf yn croesawu bod y Gweinidog yn derbyn y rhan fwyaf o'n hargymhellion. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn siomedig na allai dderbyn ein hargymhelliad y dylid ystyried cynnwys y Cynllun Gwên yng nghwricwlwm yr ysgolion er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei integreiddio'n well i gynlluniau megis Ysgolion Iach. Dywedwyd wrthym fod integreiddio'r Cynllun Gwên â chynlluniau eraill y Llywodraeth, megis Ysgolion Iach, yn amrywio'n fawr ledled Cymru, a dywedwyd wrthym, oherwydd nad oedd yn rhan o'r cwricwlwm, nad oedd y Cynllun Gwên yn cael ei ystyried mor bwysig mewn ysgol. Yn y dystiolaeth, dywedwyd wrthym hefyd

Os bydd yn rhaid i ysgol hepgor rhywbeth, y pethau cyntaf i ddiplannu yw'r rheini nad ydynt yn rhan o'r cwricwlwm.



This is why we are disappointed by the Minister's response.

Finally, I would like to thank everyone who took the time to participate in the inquiry, either in writing or in person. I would particularly like to thank David Morris, the headteacher of Jenner Park Primary School, and the school's class 2 for allowing us to launch our report at their school and see the Designed to Smile programme in action.

**Suzy Davies:** I would like to thank my fellow committee members and the committee staff for their work on this report. It was the first inquiry that we undertook and, with the majority of committee members coming from the new intake of AMs, I am sure that I speak for us all when I say how much we appreciated the professional and sympathetic guidance of the staff as well as the Chair during the early months.

The first thing that I hope Members will notice is that this inquiry was about children's oral health and not just the Government's Designed to Smile programme. However, Designed to Smile did feature in our investigation and it raised a number of concerns, especially as the Government is extending the scheme. I think that it would be difficult to argue that the Government's objectives for Designed to Smile are at issue. Poor dental health not only causes pain and discomfort, but leads to embarrassment, loss of function and other costs to the NHS down the line. Effective prevention of dental decay is an achievable goal. The rot—literally, in this case—begins in childhood, so that is a logical period in which to consider intervention.

However, the consistent comment from witnesses was that even with good anecdotal information, it was too early to tell if Designed to Smile was achieving everything that the Government had hoped. That leads to the question of whether the phase 2 extension of the scheme to pre-school children should proceed just yet, and I mean 'just yet' and not 'not at all'. Instinct may say that the sooner

Dyna pam yr oeddem yn siomedig o glywed ymateb y Gweinidog.

Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a dreuliodd amser yn cymryd rhan yn yr ymchwiliad, naill ai drwy lythyr neu drwy ddod gerbron y pwyllgor. Hoffwn ddiolch yn benodol i David Morris, pennaeth Ysgol Gynradd Jenner Park a dosbarth 2 yr ysgol am ganiatáu inni lansio ein hadroddiad yn eu hysgol a gweld rhaglen y Cynllun Gwên ar waith.

**Suzy Davies:** Hoffwn ddiolch i fy nghyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor ac i staff y pwyllgor am eu gwaith ar yr adroddiad hwn. Dyma'r ymchwiliad cyntaf inni ei gynnal a chan fod y rhan fwyaf o aelodau'r pwyllgor yn dod o blith criw newydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad, rwyf yn siŵr fy mod yn siarad ar ein rhan ni i gyd wrth ddweud gymaint yr oeddem yn gwerthfawrogi arweiniad proffesiynol a chefnogol y staff a'r Cadeirydd hefyd yn ystod y misoedd cyntaf.

Y peth cyntaf yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yr Aelodau'n sylwi arno yw mai ymchwiliad i iechyd y geg mewn plant oedd hwn, ac nid dim ond i raglen Cynllun Gwên y Llywodraeth. Serch hynny, roedd y Cynllun Gwên yn rhan o'n hymchwiliad ac fe godwyd nifer o bryderon yn ei gylch, yn enwedig gan fod y Llywodraeth yn estyn y cynllun. Credaf y byddai'n anodd dadlau yn erbyn amcanion y Llywodraeth ar gyfer y Cynllun Gwên. Mae iechyd deintyddol gwael nid yn unig yn achosi poen ac annifyrrwch, ond mae'n arwain hefyd at embaras, colli gallu gweithredol, a chostau eraill i'r GIG yn nes ymlaen. Mae atal pydredd dannedd mewn ffordd effeithiol yn nod y gellir ei gyflawni. Mae'r pydredd—yn llythrennol, yn yr achos hwn—yn dechrau yn ystod plentyndod, felly dyna'r adeg gall i rywun ystyried ymyrryd.

Fodd bynnag, y sylw a gafwyd yn gyson gan dystion oedd, er bod yr wybodaeth storiol yn dda, ei bod yn rhy fuan gwybod a oedd y Cynllun Gwên yn cyflawni popeth yr oedd y Llywodraeth wedi gobeithio y byddai'n ei gyflawni. Mae hynny'n codi'r cwestiwn a ddylid bwrw ymlaen ar hyn o bryd i estyn y cynllun i gyfnod 2, sef i blant cyn-ysgol, ac 'ar hyn o bryd' yr wyf yn ei olygu, nid 'o

children and families develop the habit of brushing their teeth, the better, but the taxpayer needs to be assured that the Government is not just relying on instinct. Money is tight, so I draw Members' attention to recommendations 1 and 4, and I hope that the Minister will be able to give us not just a reassurance—and I am sure that she can—but also details of how her roll-out of the scheme will be evaluated for us to scrutinise in the near future.

I also ask whether money is available to assist with recommendation 2. If we are spending money on publicly supervised brushing until the age of six, we should be able to get some reassurance that parents and carers are continuing that supervision if we are spending money on brushing at home after the age of six. I fully accept that monitoring of what happens at home is incredibly difficult to do, but I ask the Minister to consider whether there is a sensitive and non-intrusive way of reinforcing the message at home and ensuring that the brushing habit is not just something that children associate with school. The committee's recommendation 6 was just one suggestion about how the Minister could do that, and I am sorry that that was not accepted.

Another concern for me and for the rest of the committee was how the Government intends to fulfil its responsibility for the dental health of all children. I can understand why this particular scheme is targeted at areas of deprivation, because that is where the problem is more extensive. However, if we are talking about the rights of the child, then all children have the right to Government attention on this.

Parents and carers have the first responsibility, but some children get bad teeth even when they do not live in Flying Start areas. So, I draw Members' attention to recommendations 5, 8 and 9. Members will notice that recommendations 9 and 10 focus on consistency of oral healthcare for children across Wales and how difficult it is to assess that consistency. With three health boards overspending in the last year, we know that the financial pressures will continue. We

gwbl'. Efallai mai ein greddf yw dweud gorau po gyntaf y bydd plant a theluoedd yn meithrin yr arfer o lanhau eu dannedd, ond rhaid i'r trethdalwr deimlo'n sicr nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn dibynnu ar reddf yn unig. Mae arian yn brin ac felly tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at argymhellion 1 a 4, gan obeithio y bydd y Gweinidog nid yn unig yn gallu tawelu ein meddwl—ac rwyf yn siŵr y gall—ond hefyd y bydd yn gallu rhoi manylion ynglŷn â sut y gwerthusir lledaenu'r cynllun er mwyn inni graffu arno yn y dyfodol agos.

Rwyf am ofyn hefyd a oes arian ar gael i helpu gydag argymhelliad 2. Os ydym yn gwario arian ar lanhau dannedd o dan oruchwyliaeth gyhoeddus nes bod plant yn chwech oed, dylem allu cael rhywfaint o sicrwydd bod rhieni a gofalwyr yn parhau â'r oruchwyliaeth honno, os ydym yn gwario arian ar lanhau dannedd gartref ar ôl iddynt gyrraedd chwech oed. Rwyf yn derbyn yn llwyr fod monitro'r hyn sy'n digwydd gartref yn anhygoel o anodd, ond gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried a oes ffordd sensitif nad yw'n rhy ymyrrol o atgyfnerthu'r neges gartref a sicrhau nad dim ond rhywbeth y mae plant yn ei gysylltu â'r ysgol yw'r arfer. Un awgrym yn unig oedd argymhelliad 6 y pwyllgor ynglŷn â sut y gallai'r Gweinidog wneud hynny ac mae'n ddrwg gennyf na chafodd hwnnw ei dderbyn.

Testun pryder arall i mi ac i weddill y pwyllgor oedd sut mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ysgwyddo'i chyfrifoldeb am iechyd deintyddol pob plentyn. Gallaf ddeall pam mae'r cynllun penodol hwn wedi'i dargedu at ardaloedd di-fraint, oherwydd dyna lle mae'r broblem ar ei gwaethaf. Serch hynny, os ydym yn sôn am hawliau'r plentyn, yna mae gan bob plentyn yr hawl i sylw'r Llywodraeth yn hyn o beth.

Rhieni a gofalwyr sy'n bennaf gyfrifol, bydd dannedd rhai plant yn mynd yn ddrwg, er nad ydynt yn byw mewn ardal Dechrau'n Deg. Felly, tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at argymhellion 5, 8 a 9. Bydd yr Aelodau'n sylwi bod argymhellion 9 a 10 yn canolbwyntio ar gysondeb gofal iechyd y geg i blant ledled Cymru a pha mor anodd yw cael gafael ar y cysondeb hwnnw. Gan fod tri bwrdd iechyd wedi gorwario yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, gwyddom y bydd y pwysau ariannol yn

need to be clear about how money ring-fenced for Designed to Smile is spent. As you said earlier, Minister, it is about open books and transparency.

This is especially relevant as the programme is delivered by the community dental service. The committee was not able to obtain a clear picture of how the CDS works across Wales. Minister, you told the committee that the additional funding provided to local health boards as a result of Designed to Smile has enabled the CDS to provide oral healthcare and promotion where dental services have not always been accessed or easily available. However, Designed to Smile is delivered in Flying Start areas, of which there are very few in rural Wales. It is worth bearing in mind that one of the three LHBs that overspent, as revealed today, serves a huge and sparsely populated area of Wales, and whose services have not always been accessed or readily available, will not benefit in any meaningful way from Designed to Smile funds.

Minister, Designed to Smile is a scheme to prevent postcodes determining poor health outcomes. We agree with that. However, that rationale applies across Wales and not just in deprived areas. I hope that you will commit to undertaking a review of the community dental service to ensure that it has enough money to provide a high standard of care for all children across Wales.

**Julie Morgan:** I echo the thanks that the Chair and Suzy Davies gave to the staff for their help with our first report. The Chair and Suzy Davies have covered the report in some detail, so I just want to make a few additional points and re-emphasise some of the points.

The first point that I have to re-emphasise is the shocking statistic about the number of children who had general anaesthetic at such

parhau. Mae angen inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â sut y gwerir arian sy'n cael ei neilltuo ar gyfer y Cynllun Gwên. Fel y dywedasoeh gynnau, Weinidog, mae a wnelo hyn â llyfrau agored a thryloywder.

Mae hyn yn arbennig o berthnasol gan fod y rhaglen yn cael ei darparu gan y gwasanaeth deintyddol cymunedol. Nid oedd y pwyllgor yn gallu cael darlun clir o sut mae'r gwasanaeth hwn yn gweithio ledled Cymru. Weinidog, dywedasoeh wrth y pwyllgor fod yr arian ychwanegol a roddwyd i fyrrdau iechyd lleol yn sgil y Cynllun Gwên wedi galluogi'r gwasanaeth deintyddol cymunedol i ddarparu gofal a hyrwyddo iechyd y geg mewn mannau lle nad yw pobl bob tro wedi manteisio ar y gwasanaethau hyn neu lle nad oeddent ar gael yn rhwydd. Serch hynny, darperir y Cynllun Gwên mewn ardaloedd Dechrau'n Deg, ac ychydig iawn o'r rheini sydd yn y Gymru wledig. Mae'n werth cofio bod un o'r tri BILL sydd wedi gorwario, fel y datgelwyd heddiw, yn gwasanaethu ardal enfawr a thenau ei phoblogaeth yng Nghymru, lle nad yw pobl wedi gallu manteisio bob tro ar ei wasanaethau neu lle nad oedd y gwasanaethau hynny ar gael yn rhwydd, ac mae hwn yn fwrdd na fydd yn elwa mewn unrhyw ffordd ystyrlon yn sgil arian y Cynllun Gwên.

Weinidog, cynllun i sicrhau na fydd codau post yn gyfrifol am ganlyniadau iechyd gwael yw'r Cynllun Gwên. Rydym yn cytuno â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rhesymeg honno'n berthnasol ym mhob rhan o Gymru, ac nid dim ond mewn ardaloedd di-fraint. Rwyf yn gobeithio y gwnewch ymrwymo i adolygu'r gwasanaeth deintyddol cymunedol er mwyn sicrhau bod ganddo ddigon o arian i ddarparu gofal o safon uchel i bob plentyn drwy Gymru.

**Julie Morgan:** Hoffwn innau ategu diolch y Cadeirydd a Suzy Davies i'r staff am eu cymorth gyda'n hadroddiad cyntaf. Mae'r Cadeirydd a Suzy Davies wedi trafod yr adroddiad yn eithaf manwl, felly nid wyf ond am gynnig ambell sylw ychwanegol ac ail-bwysleisio rhai o'r pwyntiau.

Y pwynt cyntaf y mae'n rhaid imi ei ail-bwysleisio yw'r ystadegyn ysgytwol ynglŷn â nifer y plant a oedd yn cael anesthetig

a young age. I was unaware of the large numbers that this covered, and, as the Chair said, that equates to two children having general anaesthetic in every class of 30 five-year-olds. It is absolutely shocking in view of the fact that, as both speakers have already said, this is a preventable disease. There is every reason for the Welsh Government to take strong action on this. The horrific findings absolutely justify the efforts and resources that the Welsh Government has put into Designed to Smile. The dental school in Cardiff on the University Hospital of Wales site is in my constituency, and I remember meeting Elizabeth Treasure, who was then the head of the dental school. She had just come down from Scotland where Child Smile had been introduced. She came down very enthusiastic about Child Smile in Scotland and I thought at the time how wonderful it would be if this could be introduced in Wales, and of course it was introduced by the previous Minister for health. It is very good that we have introduced this. It is being monitored now and we are waiting to see the final results, but in view of the extreme figures we have heard, this is an effort we must all support.

It is important to remember the other elements of Designed to Smile because, as well as toothbrushing, it encourages healthy eating and drinking—which we know are the keys to nearly all of the health issues we discuss in this Chamber—fissure sealant, fluoride varnish and dental screening. All of these are part of Designed to Smile. However, in our inquiry we concentrated mainly on toothbrushing.

The other issue I want to raise is fluoridisation. We were told that the purpose of the toothbrushing is to get a bit of fluoride onto the children's teeth, so it is good that the Government has agreed to keep under review the issue of fluoridisation. From my point of view, it is definitely the way ahead. Lastly, Members have already raised the issue of extending this policy to areas it has not already reached. These include my constituency of Cardiff North, where there are children who need help through this scheme. However, it does not qualify through

cyffredinol mor ifanc. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol bod cynifer yn cael triniaeth fel hyn, ac fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, mae hynny'n cyfateb i ddau blentyn yn cael anesthetig cyffredinol ym mhob dosbarth o 30 o blant pum mlwydd oed. Mae'n gwbl ysgytwol ac ystyried y ffaith, fel y mae'r ddwy sydd wedi siarad wedi dweud eisoes, fod hwn yn glefyd y mae modd ei osgoi. Mae pob rheswm i Lywodraeth Cymru gymryd camau cryf yn y cyswllt hwn. Mae'r canfyddiadau erchyll yn ddiamau'n cyfiawnhau ymdrechion Llywodraeth Cymru a'r adnoddau y mae wedi'u rhoi i'r Cynllun Gwên. Mae ysgol ddeintyddol Caerdydd ar safle Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru yn fy etholaeth, ac rwyf yn cofio cyfarfod ag Elizabeth Treasure, a oedd yn bennaeth yr ysgol ddeintyddol ar y pryd. Roedd newydd ddod yno o'r Alban lle'r oeddent newydd gyflwyno'r cynllun Child Smile. Meddyliais ar y pryd pa mor wych fyddai hi petai modd cyflwyno'r cynllun hwn yng Nghymru, ac wrth gwrs, fe wnaeth y Gweinidog Iechyd blaenorol hynny. Mae'n cael ei fonitro yn awr ac rydym yn disgwyl gweld y canlyniadau terfynol, ond, ac ystyried y ffigurau eithafol yr ydym wedi'u clywed, mae'r ymdrech hon yn un y mae'n rhaid inni i gyd ei chefnogi.

Mae'n bwysig cofio elfennau eraill y Cynllun Gwen oherwydd, yn ogystal â glanhau'r dannedd, mae'n annog pobl i fwyta ac yfed yn iach. Gwyddom mai dyma'r allwedd i bob problem iechyd, fwy neu lai, y byddwn yn ei thrafod yn y Siambr hon. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys selio holltau, farnais fflworid a sgrinio'r dannedd. Mae'r elfennau hyn i gyd yn rhan o'r Cynllun Gwên. Serch hynny, yn ein hymchwiliad, ar lanhau'r dannedd y buom yn canolbwyntio yn bennaf.

Y mater arall yr hoffwn ei godi yw fflworeiddio. Dywedwyd wrthym mai pwrpas glanhau'r dannedd yw cael ychydig o fflworid ar ddannedd y plant, felly mae'n beth da bod y Llywodraeth wedi cytuno i gadw golwg ar fater fflworeiddio. O'm rhan i, yn sicr dyna'r ffordd ymlaen. Yn olaf, mae Aelodau eisoes wedi codi mater estyn y polisi hwn i'r ardaloedd hynny nad yw wedi'u cyrraedd eto. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys fy etholaeth i, sef Gogledd Caerdydd, lle mae 'na blant y mae angen help y cynllun hwn arnynt. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n gymwys

being a Flying Start area or an area that automatically qualifies for Designed to Smile. Are there ways the scheme could be extended?

In conclusion, this is a very worthwhile report. As the Chair said at the beginning, you only have to think of children having toothache and being in pain to realise that if there is anything we in this Assembly can do to alleviate that, we should do it. I commend this scheme and the report to the Assembly.

**Simon Thomas:** As has already been said, this was the first inquiry for many of us, and I would like to thank everyone who assisted us in it. I would like to start where Julie Morgan finished. Of course, it is terrible to see children with toothache and dental decay. It is even worse when you stand here at 48 with the effects of terrible decay in your childhood. I will be having root canal work in two weeks' time. I do not expect any sympathy for the benches opposite; they probably wish that it goes very badly indeed. [*Laughter.*] However, it is a direct result of a culture in the 1970s that was very different in terms of its attitudes to dental decay and looking after your teeth. It is not that I was not told or brought up to brush my teeth because I can still remember the little rhyme on the red toothbrush mug in my bathroom. I was certainly told to brush my teeth every day and did so twice a day. However fluoride was not so widely available in toothpaste then and the effect of certain foods on our teeth was not so widely known. There were tuck shops outside schools selling very cheap sweets, which was part of my downfall, I am sorry to say.

I want to ensure that the next generation of children avoids that health problem, which has an effect throughout your life. It is not just to do with baby teeth; your dental health has an effect on your general health throughout your life. I am glad to say that, touch wood, my two children have no fillings or caries at all because of the changes that

oherwydd nid yw'n ardal Dechrau'n Deg nac yn ardal sy'n gymwys yn awtomatig ar gyfer y Cynllun Gwên. A oes ffyrdd o estyn y cynllun?

I gloi, mae'r adroddiad hwn yn un gwerthfawr iawn. Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd ar y dechrau, nid oes ond rhaid ichi feddwl am blant yn cael y ddannoedd ac yn dioddef poen i sylweddoli, os oes rhywbeth y gallwn ni yn y Cynulliad ei wneud i liniaru hynny, y dylem ei wneud. Cymeradwyaf y cynllun hwn a'r adroddiad i'r Cynulliad.

**Simon Thomas:** Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, dyma'r ymchwiliad cyntaf i lawer ohonom, a hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a fu'n gymorth inni. Hoffwn ddechrau lle y gorffennodd Julie Morgan. Wrth gwrs, mae'n ofnadwy gweld plant a'r ddannoedd arnynt a'u dannedd yn pydru. Mae'n waeth byth, a chithau'n sefyll yn y fan hon yn 48 oed yn wynebu effeithiau pydredd ofnadwy yn eich plentyndod. Byddaf yn cael gwaith ar lwybr gwreiddiau fy nannedd ymhen pythefnos. Nid wyf yn disgwyl cydymdeimlad gan y meinciau gyferbyn, mae'n siŵr eu bod yn dymuno imi ddioddef yn ofnadwy. [*Chwerthin.*] Fodd bynnag, canlyniad uniongyrchol diwylliant yn yr 1970au yw hyn pan oedd yr agwedd at bydredd dannedd a gofalu am eich dannedd yn wahanol iawn. Nid na chefais i fy ngorchymyn a'm magu i lanhau fy nannedd oherwydd rwyf yn dal i gofio'r pennill bach ar gwpan coch y brwshys dannedd yn fy ystafell ymolchi. Yn sicr, dywedwyd wrthyf am lanhau fy nannedd bob dydd ac roeddwn yn gwneud hynny ddwywaith y dydd. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd fflworid ar gael mor rhwydd mewn past dannedd bryd hynny ac nid oeddem yn gwybod cymaint am effaith bwydydd penodol ar ein dannedd. Roedd siopau y tu allan i'r ysgol yn gwerthu losin rhad iawn, a dyna oedd rhan o'r broblem i mi, mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud.

Rwyf am sicrhau bod y genhedlaeth nesaf o blant yn osgoi'r broblem iechyd honno, sy'n effeithio arnoch drwy gydol eich oes. Nid oes a wnelo hyn â dannedd babi'n unig, mae eich iechyd deintyddol yn effeithio ar eich iechyd cyffredinol drwy gydol eich oes. Rwyf yn falch o ddweud, diolch byth, nad oes gan fy nau blentyn na llenwad na phydredd o gwbl

have taken place and the way in which attitudes have changed over time.

However, we found that there is a definite link between deprivation and bad dental health. Of that there is no doubt. We also found that the cultural change that I just referred to has sadly not reached all parts of Wales, and there are still some who subscribe to the idea that the baby teeth are disposable, a reflection of the disposable culture elsewhere in society.

3.30 p.m.

That means that those young teeth are not looked after and that bad habits come in, which then affects the way that adult teeth are looked after. Nonetheless, we came across some curious information; for example, the teeth of children aged over 12 in Wales did not compare that badly to Scandinavian children's teeth, but we never got to the bottom of why that was the case. Nevertheless, the investigation and report allowed us to see that direct result and also to answer a fundamental question: is it the Government's job to tell parents to brush their children's teeth? Is it the Government's job, or schools' job, to do something that you would assume is a natural parental responsibility? Whether you like it or not, the conclusion that we came to was that this is an essential part of how we must work with young children in our schools. It has a very positive effect and it is part of building up a more robust attitude towards dental care in Wales.

I was also very concerned to see how many young children in Wales had had anaesthetic, but I was more concerned that we did not really collect or analyse the figures. I hope that the Government will think about that and perhaps take forward a more robust policy around reducing the number of general anaesthetics that are used for dental treatment in Wales. That would be a good aim for the Government. We also came across patchy delivery of the community dental service across Wales and very strong evidence that a different dental contract that, instead of rewarding dentists for treating already

oherwydd y newidiadau sydd wedi digwydd a'r ffordd y mae agweddau wedi newid gyda'r oes.

Serch hynny, gwelsom fod cysylltiad pendant rhwng amddifadedd ac afiechyd deintyddol. Nid oes amheuaeth ynglŷn â hynny. Gwelsom hefyd nad yw'r newid diwylliannol y cyfeiriais i ato gynnu wedi cyrraedd pob rhan o Gymru, a bod rhai o hyd sy'n meddwl bod dannedd babi'n bethau y gellir gwneud hebddynt. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu'r diwylliant 'taflu ymaith' a welir mewn mannau eraill yn ein cymdeithas.

Mae hynny'n golygu nad yw'r dannedd ifanc hynny'n cael gofal a bod arferion gwael yn cychwyn, sydd wedyn yn effeithio ar y ffordd y gofelir am ddannedd oedolion. Serch hynny, gwelsom rywfaint o wybodaeth ryfedd, er enghraifft, nad oedd dannedd plant dros 12 oed yng Nghymru mor wael â hynny o'u cymharu â dannedd plant Scandinafia, ond ni lwyddwyd byth i ddeall pam. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod yr ymchwiliad a pharatoi'r adroddiad, cawsom weld y canlyniad uniongyrchol hwnnw a chael ateb i gwestiwn sylfaenol: ai gwaith y Llywodraeth yw dweud wrth rieni am lanhau dannedd eu plant? Ai gwaith y Llywodraeth, ynteu gwaith yr ysgolion yw gwneud rhywbeth y byddech yn tybio ei fod yn gyfrifoldeb naturiol i rieni? Hoffi'r peth neu beidio, ein casgliad oedd bod hyn yn rhan hanfodol o sut y mae'n rhaid inni weithio gyda phlant ifanc yn ein hysgolion. Mae'n cael effaith gadarnhaol iawn ac mae'n rhan o feithrin agwedd fwy cadarn at ofal deintyddol yng Nghymru.

Roeddwn yn poeni'n fawr hefyd o weld faint o blant ifanc yng Nghymru a oedd wedi cael anesthetig, ond yn poeni'n fwy nad oeddem yn wir yn casglu nac yn dadansoddi'r ffigurau. Rwyf yn gobeithio y gwnaiff y Llywodraeth feddwl am hynny ac o bosibl yr aiff ar drywydd polisi cadarnach i leihau nifer y triniaethau dan anesthetig cyffredinol a ddefnyddir wrth roi triniaeth ddeintyddol yng Nghymru. Byddai hwnnw'n nod da i'r Llywodraeth. Clywsom hefyd fod y gwasanaeth deintyddol cymunedol yn ddarniog ei ddarpariaeth drwy Gymru a thystiolaeth gref iawn y byddai contract

decayed teeth, rewarded them for providing preventative dental care, would be more beneficial in the long-term for Welsh dental health. I am glad that the Minister has agreed to look at that when the present pilot scheme has come to an end. I can see from the Minister's response to our report that there might be some financial implications in that, but I hope that we can look at the issue of salaried dentists. We also need to accept that, although NHS dentistry has improved over the last five years, there are still some parts of Wales, particularly in rural areas, where NHS dentistry is thin on the ground and difficult to access.

The other evidence that came through very strongly was that the Designed to Smile programme was really about the application of fluoride to teeth. It was not so much about tooth cleaning; it was about the application of fluoride to teeth. It was emphasised to us by dental professionals that this is what makes the big difference. Although I am not in favour of compulsory fluoridation in Wales, we must look at alternative ways of getting fluoride to children's teeth, including by varnish application and the sealants process. I recommend that the Government looks again at some aspects of this report, and I commend the Government for responding so positively to it on the whole.

**Aled Roberts:** As a new Member of the Assembly, I must say that the vast majority of us on the Children and Young People Committee thought that this was a very worthwhile inquiry—and I speak as someone who lost a crown over the lunch hour. [*Laughter.*] Many of the points that have already been made were shared by all members of the committee. Certainly, the number of children who have had general anaesthetic for dental treatment has to be a cause for concern. Echoing what Simon Thomas has just said, I was astounded at the rather uncertain way in which even those statistics were collected. As Suzy Davies mentioned, although we were looking at children's oral health as a whole, the reality of the situation is that it is too early in the

deintyddol gwahanol a fyddai, yn hytrach na gwobrwyo deintyddion am drin dannedd sydd wedi pydru eisoes, yn eu gwobrwyo am ddarparu gofal deintyddol ataliol, o fwy o fudd i iechyd deintyddol Cymru yn y tymor hir. Rwyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi cytuno i edrych ar hynny pan fydd y cynllun peilot presennol wedi dod i ben. Gallaf weld, o ymateb y Gweinidog i'n hadroddiad, y gall fod rhai goblygiadau ariannol ynghlwm wrth hynny, ond rwyf yn gobeithio y gallwn ystyried mater deintyddion ar gyflog. Mae angen inni dderbyn hefyd, er bod deintyddiaeth y GIG wedi gwella dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, fod rhannau o Gymru o hyd, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd gwledig, lle mae deintyddiaeth y GIG yn denau iawn ac yn anodd cael gafael arni.

Y dystiolaeth arall a ddaeth drwodd yn gryf iawn oedd bod a wnelo rhaglen y Cynllun Gwên mewn gwirionedd â rhoi fflworid ar ddannedd. Nid oedd a wnelo gymaint â glanhau'r dannedd; roedd a wnelo â rhoi fflworid ar ddannedd. Pwysleisiodd y deintyddion proffesiynol wrthym mai hyn sy'n gwneud y gwahaniaeth mawr. Er nad wyf o blaid fflworeiddio gorfodol yng Nghymru, rhaid inni edrych ar wahanol ffyrdd o sicrhau bod fflworid yn cyrraedd dannedd plant, gan gynnwys drwy roi farnais arnynt a'r broses selio. Rwyf yn argymhell i'r Llywodraeth ystyried rhai agweddau ar yr adroddiad hwn unwaith eto, a chymeradwyaf y Llywodraeth am ymateb mor gadarnhaol iddo ar y cyfan.

**Aled Roberts:** A minnau'n Aelod newydd o'r Cynulliad, rhaid imi ddweud bod y rhan fwyaf helaeth ohonom ar y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc yn meddwl bod yr ymchwiliad hwn yn un gwerthfawr iawn—ac rwyf yn siarad fel un a gollodd gorun dant dros yr awr ginio. [*Chwerthin.*] Roedd pob aelod o'r pwyllgor yn cytuno â llawer o'r pwyntiau sydd wedi'u codi eisoes. Yn sicr, mae nifer y plant sydd wedi cael triniaeth ddeintyddol o dan anesthetig cyffredinol wrth gwrs yn destun pryder. Gan adleisio'r hyn y mae Simon Thomas newydd ei ddweud, roedd y dull ansicr braidd a ddefnyddid i gasglu'r ystadegau hynny hyd yn oed yn fy syfrdanu. Fel y crybwyllodd Suzy Davies, er ein bod yn edrych ar faes iechyd y geg mewn plant yn ei grynsyth, y gwir yw ei bod yn rhy fuan yn

Designed to Smile scheme to say whether or not it is the success that we all hope it will be. The evidence of Huw Bennett from Public Health Wales really hit us between the eyes. He pointed out that tooth decay in children is an almost totally preventable disease and is completely unacceptable in the twenty-first century—it would not be tolerated in any other facet of healthcare. A dentistry survey in 2005-06, just prior to the introduction of the scheme, showed that 53% of children in Wales had experienced dental decay by the age of five.

Julie Morgan mentioned the Scottish example. Scotland set targets for improvement in 2005 and what staggered me was that, in five years, the Scottish Government had been able to achieve the targets that it had set itself. However, in Wales, the programme concentrates on particular geographical areas. While I can understand the principle behind that—we see that child tooth decay is concentrated in areas of deprivation—I would suggest that there is a current weakness in the programme if we exclude from it children living in pockets of deprivation in more affluent areas. That is why, as a committee, we put forward recommendation 6, which suggests that the Welsh Government should consider the evidence for incorporating, as Christine Chapman outlined, Designed to Smile into the school curriculum to ensure that it is better integrated into initiatives such as Healthy Schools. Although I welcome the stance that the Minister has taken overall, I am disappointed that this particular recommendation has been rejected.

The committee also made recommendation 7 that the Government, as Simon Thomas outlined, should make changes to the NHS dental contract to enable better integration of prevention and treatment across dental practices and to ensure that it encouraged dentists to undertake preventative work rather than, as we heard, be paid for the number of extractions and fillings that they undertook. I accept that the pilot scheme will run until March 2013, but I look forward to receiving

oes y Cynllun Gwên inni wybod a yw'n llwyddo i'r graddau yr ydym i gyd yn gobeithio y gwnaiff. Cawsom ein taro oddi ar ein hechel go iawn gan dystiolaeth Huw Bennet o Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru. Dywedodd wrthym fod pydredd dannedd mewn plant yn glefyd y gellid ei atal yn llwyr fwy neu lai a'i fod yn gwbl annerbyniol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain—ni fyddai'n cael ei oddef mewn unrhyw agwedd arall ar ofal iechyd. Mewn arolwg deintyddiaeth yn 2005-06, ychydig cyn cyflwyno'r cynllun, dangoswyd bod rhai o ddannedd 53 y cant o blant Cymru wedi pydru erbyn iddynt gyrraedd pump oed.

Crybwyllwyd enghraifft yr Alban gan Julie Morgan. Gosododd yr Alban dargedau ar gyfer gwella yn 2005 a'r hyn a'm syfrdanodd i oedd bod Llywodraeth yr Alban wedi llwyddo i gyflawni'r targedau yr oedd wedi'u gosod iddi'i hun o fewn pum mlynedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rhaglen yng Nghymru yn canolbwyntio ar ardaloedd daearyddol penodol. Er fy mod yn gallu deall yr egwyddor sy'n gefn i hynny—gwelwn fod pydredd dannedd mewn plant ar ei waethaf mewn ardaloedd di-fraint—byddwn yn awgrymu bod gwendid yn y rhaglen ar hyn o bryd os ydym yn eithrio plant sy'n byw mewn pocedi di-fraint mewn ardaloedd mwy cefnog. Dyna pam y cyflwynwyd argymhelliad 6 gennym ni'r pwyllgor, sy'n awgrymu y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ystyried y dystiolaeth o blaid cynnwys, yn unol â'r hyn a ddywedodd Christine Chapman, y Cynllun Gwên yng nghwricwlwm yr ysgol er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei integreiddio'n well i gynlluniau megis Ysgolion Iach. Er fy mod yn croesawu safbwynt y Gweinidog yn gyffredinol, rwyf yn siomedig bod yr argymhelliad penodol hwn wedi'i wrthod.

Cyflwynodd y pwyllgor argymhelliad 7 hefyd sef y dylai'r Llywodraeth, fel y dywedodd Simon Thomas, newid contract deintyddol y GIG er mwyn gallu integreiddio gwasanaeth atal a thrin yn well ar draws practisiau deintyddol ac er mwyn sicrhau bod deintyddion yn cael eu hannog i wneud gwaith ataliol yn hytrach na'u bod, fel y clywsom, yn cael tâl am nifer y dannedd y byddant yn eu tynnu a'u llenwi. Rwyf yn derbyn y bydd y cynllun peilot ar waith tan



the Government's proposals with regard to the new arrangements. It is quite clear that a wholesale review of the community dental service is required. It should not be the case that this service is driven by traditional means and methods of delivery. I also think, given the urgent question that we had this afternoon, that the Minister needs to consider the evidence taken from Dr Sandham, clinical director of the Community Dental Service in north Wales, who stated that possible rationalisation of the CDS estate, due to pressures on the NHS budget, might very well affect CDS provision in areas where it had previously been strong, such as north Wales. That is particularly important given that CDS provision in those regions is concentrated in areas of deprivation.

I also think that we need to consider how NHS dental services are provided. As Simon Thomas has outlined, the reality is that there are still areas in Wales where access to NHS dentistry is difficult. I carried out a survey, for example, and currently, only 22.5% of dental practices in north Wales are open for NHS patients.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is up.

**Darren Millar:** I was pleased to see the publication of this report and although I am not a member of the committee, I have taken an interest in looking at the detail in the report and the Minister's response to it. I am pleased that the Minister has accepted the overwhelming majority of recommendations—all but one, in fact. It is worth repeating that the situation in Wales is pretty dire when it comes to children's oral health. That is why it is right that there is a programme, which has been initiated by the Government, to improve the quality of dental and oral health for our children and young people.

The situation in north Wales, while a little better, as has been acknowledged by Aled Roberts, is still very poor. Around 1,000

fis Mawrth 2013, ond rwyf yn edrych ymlaen at weld cynigion y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â'r trefniadau newydd. Mae'n eithaf amlwg bod angen adolygu'r gwasanaeth deintyddol cymunedol o'i gwr. Ni ddylai'r gwasanaeth hwn gael ei yrru gan y moddau a'r dulliau darparu traddodiadol. Credaf hefyd, ac ystyried y cwestiwn brys a gawsom y prynhawn yma, fod angen i'r Gweinidog ystyried y dystiolaeth a gafwyd gan Dr Sandham, cyfarwyddwr clinigol y Gwasanaeth Deintyddol Cymunedol yn y gogledd, a ddywedodd y gallai'r rhesymoli posibl ar ystâd y Gwasanaeth Deintyddol Cymunedol, yn sgil pwysau ar gyllideb y GIG, effeithio ar ddarparu'r gwasanaeth mewn ardaloedd lle'r oedd gynt wedi bod yn gryf, megis yn y gogledd. Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig a chofio bod darpariaeth y gwasanaeth deintyddol cymunedol yn y rhanbarthau hynny'n canolbwyntio ar ardaloedd di-fraint.

Credaf hefyd fod angen inni ystyried sut y darperir gwasanaethau deintyddol y GIG. Fel y dywedodd Simon Thomas, y gwir yw bod ardaloedd yng Nghymru o hyd lle mae'n anodd cael gafael ar wasanaethau deintyddol y GIG. Cynhaliais arolwg, er enghraifft, ac ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 22.5 y cant o bractisiau deintyddol yn y gogledd sydd ar agor i gleifion y GIG.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben.

**Darren Millar:** Roeddwn yn falch o weld cyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn ac er nad wyf yn aelod o'r pwyllgor, roedd gennyf ddiddordeb mewn edrych ar fanylion yr adroddiad ac ymateb y Gweinidog iddo. Rwyf yn falch i'r Gweinidog dderbyn y rhan fwyaf helaeth o'r argymhellion—pob un heblaw un, mewn gwirionedd. Mae'n werth ailadrodd bod y sefyllfa'n eithaf difrifol o ran iechyd y geg mewn plant yng Nghymru. Dyna pam mae'n iawn fod gennym raglen, a honno wedi'i rhoi ar waith gan y Llywodraeth, i wella safon iechyd deintyddol ac iechyd y geg i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc.

Mae'r sefyllfa yn y gogledd, er ei bod fymryn yn well, fel y mae Aled Roberts wedi derbyn, yn wael iawn o hyd. Mae oddeutu 1,000 o

operations a year are being undertaken on children under 10. One horrific case was highlighted in the *Daily Post* just last month about a three-year-old who had 14 of his 20 baby teeth taken out under general anaesthetic in Wrexham Maelor Hospital. We have to work hard as a National Assembly on a cross-party basis to prevent such situations.

I was pleased to hear Simon Thomas refer to parental responsibility when it comes to oral health and hygiene. If one thing has been missing from the Government's programme—I would like to see a greater emphasis on this—it is the focus on the parents and the fact that they should be taking responsibility for the health and wellbeing of their children, whether dental health or otherwise. Minister, you agreed, in line with recommendation 2, to have a look at how you may be able to improve this in order to accommodate parents and engage them in the programme a little more. How will you monitor that?

Suzy Davies made reference to the fact that there was not a full evaluation of the pilot scheme before it was rolled out into other areas. We are still waiting for the publication of the report, which was due around the end of January, on the evaluation of the three-year scheme to date and its impact across Wales. It is suggested that there has been little impact so far, in terms of tangible evidence of improvement in oral health. In a recent report in the *Daily Post*, John Clewett, deputy clinical director of the Community Dental Service in north Wales, said that he does not think that there has been an improvement over the last 10 years. Obviously, the Designed to Smile scheme has only been running for three years, and it will take some time to feed through into the statistics and figures for tooth decay, but it is important that we only move forward with these schemes when there is robust evidence that they work. While there is much anecdotal evidence in the paper, robust pieces of evidence are still lacking. It would be interesting to hear, Minister, whether the evaluation that was due in January is available to be circulated to Members.

The one recommendation that you rejected

blant o dan 10 oed yn cael triniaeth bob blwyddyn. Tynnwyd sylw at un achos erchyll yn y *Daily Post* fis diwethaf lle'r oedd plentyn tair oed wedi cael tynnu 14 o'i 20 dant babi o dan anesthetig cyffredinol yn Ysbyty Wrecsam Maelor. Rhaid inni weithio'n galed ar draws y pleidiau yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i atal sefyllfaoedd o'r fath.

Roeddwn yn falch o glywed Simon Thomas yn cyfeirio at gyfrifoldeb rhieni o ran iechyd a hylendid y geg. Os oes un peth wedi bod ar goll yn rhaglen y Llywodraeth—hoffwn weld rhagor o bwyslais ar hyn—canolbwyntio ar rieni yw hwnnw a'r ffaith y dylent fod yn ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb am iechyd a lles eu plant, boed hynny o ran iechyd eu dannedd neu fel arall. Weinidog, gwnaethoch gytuno, yn unol ag argymhelliad 2, i ystyried sut y gallech wella hyn er mwyn rhoi ychydig mwy o le i rieni a'u cynnwys yn y rhaglen hon. Sut y gwnewch chi fonitro hynny?

Cyfeiriodd Suzy Davies at y ffaith na chafodd y cynllun peilot ei werthuso'n llawn cyn ei ledaenu i ardaloedd eraill. Rydym yn dal i ddisgwyl gweld cyhoeddi'r adroddiad a oedd i fod i ymddangos tua diwedd mis Ionawr, sy'n gwerthuso'r cynllun tair blynedd hyd yn hyn a'i effaith ledled Cymru. Awgrymir mai prin fu'r effaith hyd yn hyn, o ran tystiolaeth amlwg bod iechyd y geg yn gwella. Mewn adroddiad diweddar yn y *Daily Post*, dywedodd John Clewett, dirprwy gyfarwyddwr clinigol y Gwasanaeth Deintyddol Cymunedol yn y gogledd, nad yw'n meddwl bod pethau wedi gwella dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Wrth gwrs, nid yw'r Cynllun Gwên ond wedi bod ar waith ers tair blynedd a bydd angen tipyn o amser iddo ddylanwadu ar yr ystadegau a'r ffigurau pydredd dannedd, ond mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn symud ymlaen â'r cynlluniau hyn nes bod gennym dystiolaeth gadarn eu bod yn gweithio. Er bod llawer o dystiolaeth storiol yn y papur, prin o hyd yw'r darnau cadarn o dystiolaeth. Byddai'n ddiddorol clywed, Weinidog, a yw'r gwerthusiad a oedd i fod yn barod ym mis Ionawr ar gael i'w ddosbarthu i'r Aelodau.

Yr unig argymhelliad a wrthodwyd gennych

was the one about including Designed to Smile as part of the school curriculum. I was a little surprised by that, because I thought that it was quite an easy thing to do, given the various healthy schools initiatives that already exist across Wales. It is important that healthy schools initiatives that are already part of the general curriculum pay proper regard to oral health. I wonder whether you could explain a little more—I have read your response—about why you are so resistant to at least including some reference to Designed to Smile within that programme. I noted that there was evidence that suggested that some headteachers did not want to participate in the scheme because they thought that it would be time consuming and that they would avoid it because it was not part of the curriculum.

As a party, we have highlighted our opposition to handing out free toothbrushes; we clearly feel that that ought to be a parental responsibility. We believe that the scheme is worthwhile overall, but if you were not handing out free toothbrushes, Minister, you could use those resources elsewhere. I wonder whether that might give you some resources to do some targeting in other parts of the Designed to Smile scheme.

**Keith Davies:** Fel Aled Roberts, rwy'n un o'r bechgyn newydd ar y pwyllgor, ond mae gennyf fantais gan fy mod i yn yr ysgol pan lansiodd y cyn Weinidog y cynllun yn Llanelli ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Rwy'n falch fy mod bellach ar y pwyllgor sydd wedi cyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn.

Mae cyhoeddi'r adroddiad yn amserol dros ben, gan fod Confensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn wedi dod i rym yr wythnos hon, gyda Chymru yn arwain y ffordd fel y wlad gyntaf i gynnwys hyn mewn penderfyniadau gweinidogol. Dyma gam sy'n sefydlu lle diogel i blant ar yr agenda yng Nghymru.

Fodd bynnag, fel fy nghyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor, cefais fy synnu â rhai o'r ffigurau ger ein bron—er enghraifft, mae gan 50% o blant dan bum mlwydd oed bydredd dannedd, ac mae'r bwlch yn cynyddu rhwng plant o ardaloedd o amddifadedd ac ardaloedd

oedd hwnnw am gynnwys y Cynllun Gwên yn rhan o Gwricwlwm yr Ysgolion. Roedd hynny'n syndod imi braidd, oherwydd roeddwn yn meddwl bod hynny'n beth eithaf hawdd ei wneud, ac ystyried y gwahanol gynlluniau ysgolion iach sydd eisoes ar waith ledled Cymru. Mae'n bwysig bod cynlluniau ysgolion iach sydd eisoes yn rhan o'r cwricwlwm cyffredinol yn rhoi sylw priodol i iechyd y geg. Tybed a allech esbonio ychydig yn rhagor—rwyf wedi darllen eich ymateb—pam yr ydych mor gyndyn o gynnwys rhyw gyfeiriad o leiaf at y Cynllun Gwên yn y rhaglen honno. Sylwais fod tystiolaeth a oedd yn awgrymu nad oedd rhai penaethiaid yn awyddus i gymryd rhan yn y cynllun oherwydd eu bod yn meddwl y byddai'n draul ar amser ac y byddent yn ei osgoi oherwydd nad oedd yn rhan o'r cwricwlwm.

Mae ein plaid ni wedi dweud ein bod yn gwrthwynebu rhannu brwsys dannedd am ddim; rydym yn amlwg yn teimlo mai cyfrifoldeb rhieni y dylai hynny fod. Credwn fod y cynllun yn un gwerthfawr ar y cyfan, ond pe na baech yn rhannu brwsys dannedd am ddim, Weinidog, gallech ddefnyddio'r adnoddau hynny yn rhywle arall. Tybed a fyddai'n rhoi rhywfaint o adnoddau ichi dargedu'r Cynllun Gwên mewn ardaloedd eraill.

**Keith Davies:** Like Aled Roberts, I am one of the new boys on the committee, but I have an advantage, because I was present at the school when the former Minister launched the scheme in Llanelli two years ago. I am pleased that I am now on the committee that has brought out this report.

The publication of the report is timely, because this week the UN Convention on the Right of the Child came into force, with Wales leading the way as the first country to include it in ministerial decisions. This is a step that establishes a safe place for children on the agenda in Wales.

However, like my fellow committee members, I was surprised at some of the figures that were put before us—for example, 50% of five-year-olds have tooth decay and there is a growing gap between children from deprived and non-deprived areas. We have to

breintiedig. Mae'n rhaid cael strategaeth atal fel ein nod, a dyna a wna'r cynllun hwn. Croesawaf hefyd fod y cynllun yn cydreded â'r cynllun dileu tlodi plant yng Nghymru, a'u bod yn cydlynu'r nod i sianelu gwasanaethau i'r ardaloedd o amddifadedd.

Yn y flwyddyn a aeth heibio, rwyf wedi ymweld â dwy ysgol sy'n gweithredu'r cynllun. Yn y ddwy ysgol, pwysleisiodd yr athrawon a'r plant eu bod yn hapus iawn wrth weithredu'r cynllun. Yn sicr, mae'r cynllun wedi gwneud argraff bositif ar rieni yn ogystal ag ar blant, gyda chyfartaledd cenedlaethol o 94% o rieni'n caniatáu i'w plant gymryd rhan. Bu'r athrawon yn gweld gwelliannau a bu'r plant yn dysgu ac yn mwynhau'r broses.

3.45 p.m.

Fel Julie Morgan yn gynharach, croesawaf y ffaith bod sawl rhan i'r cynllun, sef brwsio dannedd, sgrinio deintyddol a bwyta'n iach. Mae'r cynllun yn fwy cymhleth na dim ond dysgu plant sut i frwsio eu dannedd, oherwydd achosir pydredd dannedd gan sawl ffactor. Er enghraifft, credaf fod bwyta'n iach ar ei ben ei hun yn agwedd bwysig o'r cynllun, yn enwedig gan ystyried rhai problemau ynglŷn ag agweddau am fwyd heddiw. Mae'n hanfodol bod plant yn derbyn addysg a gwybodaeth sylfaenol yn gynnar yn eu bywydau am faterion pwysig fel hyn. Dywed 95% o athrawon yn yr ardaloedd peilot fod y rhaglen yn cyd-fynd yn dda iawn â'u mentrau iechyd pellach, sy'n dangos bod ei llwyddiant wedi bwydo i mewn i gyd-destun iechyd eang.

Mae ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r adroddiad yn dweud mai cynllun atal ydyw yn bennaf, ac yn gynllun addysgol yn ail. Dengys y wybodaeth a roddir i rieni fod agwedd addysgol y cynllun yn ystyriaeth bwysig. Gyda 10,000 o rieni'n ymweld â rhyw fath o sesiwn hyrwyddo iechyd erbyn mis Mawrth 2011 a thystiolaeth yn dangos fod y pecynnau cartref wedi cael effaith bositif, credaf fod hyn yn llwyddiannus iawn a bod dulliau addysgol wedi bwydo i mewn i'r amcanion atal.

Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, rwy'n falch i groesawu ymateb y Llywodraeth i

have a prevention strategy as our aim, and that is what this scheme does. I also welcome the fact that this scheme runs alongside the scheme to eradicate child poverty in Wales and that it co-ordinates with the aim of channelling services to deprived areas.

In the past year, I have visited two schools that are implementing the scheme. In both schools, teachers and pupils emphasised that they were very happy to be involved. The scheme has certainly made a positive impression on parents and children, with a national average of 94% of parents giving consent for their children to take part. Teachers have seen improvements and children have learned and have enjoyed the process.

Like Julie Morgan earlier, I also welcome the fact that there are many aspects to the programme, namely toothbrushing, dental screening and healthy eating. The programme is more complex than simply teaching children how to brush their teeth, because tooth decay has many causes. For example, I think that healthy eating alone is an important aspect of the programme, particularly bearing in mind certain problems regarding attitudes to food these days. It is vital that children receive education and basic information early in their lives on important matters such as this. Some 95% of teachers in the pilot areas say that the programme matches up very well with their other health initiatives, which shows that its success has fed into a wider health context.

The Government's response to the report states that it is mainly a preventative programme, and the educational aspect is secondary. The information that is given to parents shows that the educational element of the programme is an important consideration. With 10,000 parents visiting some kind of health promotion session by March 2011 and evidence showing that the home packs have had a positive impact, I believe that this is a great success and that educational methods have fed into the preventative objectives.

As I said earlier, I am pleased to welcome the Government's response to the

argymhellion yr adroddiad ac yn edrych ymlaen at weld pydredd dannedd plant Cymru yn gostwng yn sylweddol yn y dyfodol agos. Gyda buddsoddiad blynyddol o £3.7 miliwn gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cymru, rwy'n hyderus y bydd gwelliannau mawr yn digwydd ac rwy'n croesawu'r adroddiad yn fawr iawn.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths):** I begin by thanking committee members, under the chairmanship of Christine Chapman, for their report and the opportunity that it has provided today to debate the issue of children's oral health in Wales. I am pleased to say that many of the committee's recommendations support our current policy direction and also recognise the excellent progress made to date on establishing the Designed to Smile programme, which I believe is a fantastic and well-managed scheme. The majority of the recommendations are either already in place or planned, and the current development of a national oral health plan will have Designed to Smile as one its key themes.

The Welsh Government is determined to tackle oral health inequalities and the gap between the oral health of children from the most deprived and the least deprived families in Wales. Dental decay is a disease of lifestyle with multiple causes. It is clear that direct and innovative methods of delivering preventive care are necessary if advances in child oral health are to be made. In the absence of fluoridation of water supplies in Wales, we need to get more teeth in contact with fluoride via alternative methods. Several Members referred to the fact that I rejected recommendation 6, which I did because Designed to Smile is a preventative programme first and an educational programme second. The essential core principle of Designed to Smile is to get more children's teeth in contact with fluoride. It is delivered by the Community Dental Service, as Members have pointed out, and it sets out to achieve this by targeting young children in the areas of greatest need. The scheme is targeted and priority is given to areas on the basis of deprivation and epidemiological data on oral health provided by the Welsh oral health information unit at Cardiff University.

recommendations in the report and look forward to seeing decay in the teeth of Welsh children substantially declining in the near future. With an annual investment of £3.7 million by the Welsh Labour Government, I am confident that great improvements will be made and I welcome the report very warmly.

**Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths):** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch i aelodau'r pwyllgor, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Christine Chapman, am eu hadroddiad a'r cyfle y mae wedi'i gynnig inni heddiw i drafod iechyd y geg mewn plant yng Nghymru. Rwyf yn falch o ddweud bod llawer o argymhellion y pwyllgor yn cefnogi trywydd ein polisi presennol a'u bod hefyd yn cydnabod y cynnydd rhagorol sydd wedi'i wneud hyd yn hyn i sefydlu rhaglen y Cynllun Gwên, sydd, yn y fy marn i, yn gynllun gwych sy'n cael ei reoli'n dda. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r argymhellion naill ai wedi'u rhoi ar waith eisoes neu maent yn yr arfaeth a bydd y Cynllun Gwên yn un o brif themâu'r cynllun cenedlaethol ar gyfer iechyd y geg sydd wrthi'n cael ei ddatblygu.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn benderfynol o fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau o ran iechyd y geg a'r bwlch yn y cyswllt hwnnw sydd rhwng plant y teuluoedd mwyaf difraint a phlant y teuluoedd lleiaf difraint yng Nghymru. Clefyd ffordd o fyw yw pydredd dannedd ac mae llu o bethau'n ei achosi. Mae'n amlwg bod angen defnyddio dulliau uniongyrchol ac arloesol o ddarparu gofal ataliol er mwyn gwella iechyd y geg mewn plant. Gan nad ydym yn fflworeiddio'r cyflenwad dŵr yng Nghymru, mae angen inni ddefnyddio dulliau eraill o sicrhau bod fflworid yn cyrraedd mwy o ddannedd. Cyfeiriodd sawl Aelod at y ffaith imi wrthod argymhelliad 6. Gwneuthum hynny oherwydd rhaglen ataliol yn y lle cyntaf yw'r Cynllun Gwên a rhaglen addysgol yn ail. Egwyddor graidd hanfodol y Cynllun Gwên yw sicrhau bod fflworid yn cyrraedd dannedd rhagor o blant. Fe'i darperir gan y Gwasanaeth Deintyddol Cymunedol, fel y mae Aelodau wedi dweud, ac mae'n ceisio cyflawni hyn drwy dargedu plant ifanc yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf anghenus. Targedir y cynllun at ardaloedd ar sail amddifadedd a data epidemiolegol ynglŷn ag iechyd y geg a

ddarperir gan uned gwybodaeth iechyd y geg Cymru ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd. Rhoddir blaenoriaeth i'r ardaloedd hynny.

As Julie Morgan pointed out, it is important to highlight that Designed to Smile is much more than simply teaching children how to brush their teeth. The scheme also delivers direct clinical interventions that are shown to prevent dental decay. I would encourage all Assembly Members to visit a school—I visited Ninian Park Primary School in Mark Drakeford's constituency, and it was great to see the involvement of parents there. Parents had come in to assist and, as Members have pointed out, 94% of parents have consented to their children taking part.

As was highlighted in the submissions to the committee, it is still too early to confirm whether the Designed to Smile programme is delivering improved health outcomes for children. We have evidence of good uptake in the targeted schools, but we will have to await the outcome of future epidemiological surveys of children to establish whether dental decay in children in Wales has reduced. However, the preventative interventions used in the scheme are strong and well established. I think that it was Aled Roberts who pointed out that Designed to Smile is very similar to the Childsmile programme, which has been running in disadvantaged communities across Scotland since 2005. The results there have shown that the dental health of children in those communities is improving.

Darren Millar and Suzy Davies spoke for the Welsh Conservatives. Darren Millar contradicted his welcome for the scheme by criticising us for handing out toothbrushes and Suzy Davies told me that monitoring what happens at home is incredibly difficult. I would say that it is impossible. I do not know how you would expect the Welsh Government to monitor what happens in people's homes.

The ongoing development of a national oral health plan for Wales will clearly align oral health with public health, through links with smoking, alcohol consumption and child nutrition. An integral part of the plan's

Fel y dywedodd Julie Morgan, mae'n bwysig pwysleisio bod a wnelo'r Cynllun Gwên â mwy o lawer na dim ond dysgu plant sut mae glanhau eu dannedd. Mae'r cynllun hefyd yn darparu ymyriadau clinigol uniongyrchol y dangoswyd eu bod yn atal pydredd dannedd. Byddwn yn annog pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad i ymweld ag ysgol—ymwelais i ag Ysgol Gynradd Ninian Park yn etholaeth Mark Drakeford, ac roedd yn wych gweld y rhieni'n cymryd rhan yno. Roedd rhieni wedi dod i'r ysgol i helpu, ac fel y mae'r Aelodau wedi dweud, mae 94 y cant o rieni wedi cydsynio i'w plant fod yn rhan o'r cynllun.

Fel y pwysleisiwyd yn y cyflwyniadau i'r pwyllgor, mae'n rhy fuan o hyd inni gadarnhau a yw'r rhaglen Cynllun Gwên yn sicrhau gwell canlyniadau iechyd i blant. Mae gennym dystiolaeth fod nifer dda'n manteisio arni yn yr ysgolion a dargedir, ond bydd yn rhaid inni aros am ganlyniad arolygon epidemiolegol ar blant yn y dyfodol i weld a fydd llai o blant yn dioddef o bydredd dannedd yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ymyriadau ataliol a ddefnyddir yn y cynllun yn rhai cryf sydd wedi'u defnyddio ers tro. Credaf mai Aled Roberts a ddywedodd fod y Cynllun Gwên yn debyg iawn i'r rhaglen Childsmile, sydd wedi bod ar waith mewn cymunedau di-fraint ledled yr Alban ers 2005. Mae'r canlyniadau yno wedi dangos bod iechyd deintyddol plant yn y cymunedau hynny'n gwella.

Siaradodd Darren Millar a Suzy Davies ar ran Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Roedd Darren Millar yn gwrth-ddweud ei groeso i'r cynllun drwy ein beirniadu am rannu brwsys dannedd a dywedodd Suzy Davies wrthyf ei bod yn anhygoel o anodd monitro'r hyn sy'n digwydd gartref. Byddwn i'n dweud ei bod yn amhosibl. Nid wyf yn gwybod sut y byddech yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth Cymru fonitro'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng nghartrefi pobl.

Bydd y gwaith sydd ar y gweill i ddatblygu cynllun cenedlaethol iechyd y geg i Gymru yn amlwg yn cysylltu iechyd y geg ag iechyd cyhoeddus, drwy greu cysylltiadau ag ysmegu, yfed alcohol a maeth plant. Bydd

delivery will be the Designed to Smile programme.

Oral health is an important part of general health, and the plan will stress the need to prevent poor oral health as well as the treatment of disease. There will be a particular focus on those groups of people who have persistently high levels of disease, such as children under five and those whose general health makes them more vulnerable to oral ill health.

I accept that further development of the programme will be required to increase the targeting of children aged nought to three, to strengthen the links with other programmes such as Healthy Schools and Flying Start to ensure that consistent action and messages are part of the ongoing development of the scheme. This is being addressed through a national Designed to Smile forum and by establishing local steering groups to ensure integration with other national and local initiatives.

My decision to extend the ring-fencing of the dental contract budget until March 2015, which includes the resources for Designed to Smile, sends a strong message to local health boards and the profession about protecting dental provision and it supports the Labour manifesto and programme for government commitment to continue to build on Designed to Smile. My announcement also gave me the opportunity to remind LHBs of the Welsh Government's commitment to the community dental service.

Huge progress has been made in oral health and hygiene and in the provision of dentists in recent years. I am only a little older than Simon Thomas. Unfortunately, Simon, I can echo your experiences, so you have my sympathy in needing root canal work in the near future.

I believe that more time is needed for hard clinical outcomes to be evidenced through national dental surveys. The success of the roll-out of Designed to Smile in targeted areas across Wales is already clear, but I will

rhaglen y Cynllun Gwên yn rhan hanfodol o gyflawni'r cynllun.

Mae iechyd y geg yn rhan bwysig o iechyd cyffredinol, a bydd y cynllun pwysleisio bod angen atal afiechyd y geg, yn ogystal â'i drin. Canolbwyntir yn benodol ar y grwpiau hynny o bobl sy'n dioddef yn wael byth a hefyd o'r clefyd, megis plant o dan bump a'r rheini y mae eu hiechyd cyffredinol yn golygu eu bod yn fwy tebygol o ddioddef afiechyd y geg.

Rwyf yn derbyn y bydd gofyn datblygu'r rhaglen eto er mwyn targedu mwy o blant rhwng dim a thair oed, i gryfhau'r cysylltiadau â rhaglenni eraill megis Ysgolion Iach a Dechrau'n Deg er mwyn sicrhau bod camau a negeseuon cyson yn rhan o ddatblygiad parhaus y cynllun. Gwneir hyn drwy gyfrwng fforwm cenedlaethol Cynllun Gwên a thrwy sefydlu grwpiau llywio lleol i sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei integreiddio â chynlluniau cenedlaethol a lleol eraill.

Mae fy mhenderfyniad i estyn cyfnod neilltuo cyllideb y contract deintyddol tan fis Mawrth 2015, gan gynnwys yr adnoddau ar gyfer y Cynllun Gwên, yn anfon neges gref at fyrddau iechyd lleol ac i'r proffesiwn ynglŷn â gwarchod y ddarpariaeth ddeintyddol ac mae'n cefnogi maniffesto Llafur a'r ymrwymiad yn y rhaglen lywodraethu i barhau i adeiladu ar y Cynllun Gwên. Roedd fy nghyhoeddiad yn gyfle hefyd imi atgoffau'r BILlau am ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru i'r gwasanaeth deintyddol cymunedol.

Mae camau breision wedi'u gwneud o ran iechyd a hylendid y geg ac o ran darparu deintyddion yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Nid wyf ond fymryn yn hŷn na Simon Thomas. Yn anffodus, Simon, cefais innau brofiadau tebyg, felly rwyf yn cydymdeimlo â chi eich bod yn gorfod cael gwaith ar lwybr gwreiddiau'ch dannedd yn y dyfodol agos.

Credaf fod angen rhagor o amser er mwyn inni gael tystiolaeth o ganlyniadau clinigol pendant drwy arolygon deintyddol cenedlaethol. Mae llwyddiant lleadaenu'r Cynllun Gwên mewn ardaloedd a dargedir

publish the evaluation in due course. I am confident that the programme will deliver much needed improvements in the oral health of children in our most vulnerable communities.

**Christine Chapman:** First, I thank all Members who have contributed to the debate. I also want to put on record my thanks to the committee clerks who have helped to develop this report. I would also like to thank all those people who gave evidence to us, because for all of us who worked on the report, it was about shining a spotlight on this vitally important issue that affects the wellbeing of our children. As Julie Morgan mentioned, we found a really awful picture of children's dental health in Wales. Of course, it is not just about teeth; it affects their general health and it can, for example, have an impact on educational achievement. There is a whole range of reasons as to why this should be improved.

I think that we would all agree that this was a really interesting inquiry. Designed to Smile is obviously a very good programme, but, as Members, we did raise some questions and concerns. Mainly, those were about the fact that we should not lose momentum. We recognise that this is a good programme, but it is important not to lose momentum or the priority given to it.

Suzy Davies talked about monitoring and whether it is about ensuring that the funding would be available. We also had a discussion about parents, because this will have an impact on what parents do. We discussed how this could work.

One of the main issues is that the programme is a preventative one and, as Simon Thomas said, it is about changing the culture by encouraging children to adopt good habits. We were also made aware of the fact that, quite often, because parents thought that it was perfectly normal for them to have many teeth out, this would be the normal course of action. It is about changing those bad habits into good habits. A number of Members, including Aled Roberts, talked about the dental contract; I think that we are all aware

ledled Cymru yn amlwg eisoes, ond fe gyhoeddaf y gwerthusiad maes o law. Rwyf yn hyderus y bydd y rhaglen yn sicrhau gwelliannau mawr eu hangen ym maes iechyd y geg i blant yn ein cymunedau mwyaf agored i niwed.

**Christine Chapman:** Yn gyntaf, diolch i bob Aelod sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddaidl. Rwyf hefyd am gofnodi fy niolch i glercod y pwyllgor sydd wedi helpu i ddatblygu'r adroddiad hwn. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'r holl bobl hynny a roddodd dystiolaeth inni, oherwydd i bawb ohonom a fu'n gweithio ar yr adroddiad, roedd a wnelo hyn â thafllu goleuni ar y mater hollbwysig hwn sy'n effeithio ar les ein plant. Fel y crybwyllodd Julie Morgan, gwelsom ddarlun echrydus o iechyd deintyddol plant yng Nghymru. Wrth gwrs, mae a wnelo hyn â mwy na dim ond dannedd, mae'n effeithio ar eu hiechyd cyffredinol ac fe all, er enghraifft, effeithio ar eu cyflawniad addysgol. Mae lluo o resymau dros wella hyn.

Credaf y byddem i gyd yn unfarn fod yr ymchwiliad hwn yn un gwirioneddol ddiddorol. Mae'r Cynllun Gwên yn amlwg yn rhaglen dda iawn, ond codwyd ambell gwestiwn a phryder gennym ni'r Aelodau. Yn bennaf, roedd a wnelo'r rheini â'r ffaith na ddylem golli momentwm. Rydym yn sylweddoli bod hon yn rhaglen dda, ond mae'n bwysig peidio â cholli momentwm na'r flaenoriaeth a roddir iddi.

Soniodd Suzy Davies am fonitro ac a oes a wnelo hyn â sicrhau y byddai'r arian ar gael. Trafodwyd rhieni hefyd, oherwydd bydd hyn yn effeithio ar yr hyn a wnaiff rhieni. Trafodwyd sut y gallai hyn weithio.

Un o'r prif ystyriaethau yw mai rhaglen ataliol yw hon, ac, fel y dywedodd Simon Thomas, mae a wnelo â newid y diwylliant drwy annog plant i fabwysiadu arferion da. Cawsom ar ddeall hefyd, oherwydd bod rhieni'n aml iawn yn meddwl ei bod yn hollol normal iddynt gael tynnu llawer o ddannedd, mai hyn a fyddai'n digwydd yn naturiol. Mae a wnelo hyn â throi'r arferion gwael hynny'n arferion da. Soniodd nifer o'r Aelodau, gan gynnwys Aled Roberts, am y contract deintyddol. Credaf ein bod i gyd yn



of the fear that people have traditionally had about dentists, but perhaps reviewing the dental contract would encourage more people to think of their dentists as friends rather than as enemies.

Keith Davies talked about home packs. Certainly, when we visited the schoolchildren in Barry, we were very much taken by their enthusiasm, and I know that some of those children had not been in the habit of brushing their teeth. Children can be powerful advocates, I think, in taking the messages home to their parents as well. A number of Members mentioned that.

There is also the issue of fluoridation. There were certainly mixed views in the committee about universal fluoridation—putting fluoride in tap water. However, we all recognise that there is a debate to be had, and we accepted that the Government is keeping the evidence under review. That is right and proper, and a number of Members mentioned that as well.

I think that I have mentioned everybody; I hope that I have not missed anybody out. I would like to thank everybody for their contributions, and I thank the Minister for her positive response. I am sure that she was listening to some of the detailed issues that we have raised, and will take them forward. As a committee, we would like to think that she will do some further work on this, and I know that we will be scrutinising this carefully. Darren Millar mentioned looking at more extensive data evaluation, and I would agree with that.

I thank everybody for their contributions. It was a fascinating inquiry, and I hope to see the day when we get a real improvement in children's teeth.

**The Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to note the Children and Young People Committee's report. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections, and therefore the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

ymwybodol bod pobl yn draddodiadol wedi ofni'r deintydd, ond efallai y byddai adolygu'r contract deintyddol yn annog rhagor o bobl i feddwl mai ffrind yn hytrach na gelyn yw eu.

Soniodd Keith Davies am becynnau i'r cartref. Yn sicr, pan ymwelwyd â'r plant ysgol yn y Barri, gwnaeth eu brwdfrydedd argraff fawr arnom, a gwn fod rhai o'r plant hynny heb arfer glanhau eu dannedd. Gall plant fod yn eiriolwyr pwerus, mi gredaf, o ran mynd â'r negeseuon adref i'w rhieni hefyd. Soniodd nifer o'r Aelodau am hynny.

Hefyd, mae mater fflworeiddio. Yn sicr, roedd barn y pwyllgor yn amrywio ynglŷn â fflworeiddio'r cyflenwad dŵr tap ym mhobman. Serch hynny, rydym i gyd yn sylweddoli bod angen trafod hyn, a sylweddolwn fod y Llywodraeth yn adolygu'r dystiolaeth o hyd. Mae hynny'n iawn ac yn briodol, a soniodd nifer o'r Aelodau am hynny hefyd.

Credaf imi grybwyll pawb; rwyf yn gobeithio nad wyf wedi anghofio neb. Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb am ei gyfraniad, a diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb cadarnhaol. Rwyf yn siŵr ei bod yn gwrando ar rai o'r materion manwl a godwyd gennym ac y bydd yn bwrw ymlaen â hwy. Byddem ni'r pwyllgor yn hoffi meddwl y gwnaiff ragor o waith ar hyn, a gwn y byddwn yn craffu ar y gwaith hwnnw'n ofalus. Soniodd Darren Millar am ystyried gwerthuso'r data ar raddfa ehangach, a byddwn innau'n cytuno â hynny.

Diolch i bawb am ei gyfraniad. Roedd yn ymchwiliad hynod ddiddorol, ac rwyf yn gobeithio gweld y dydd pan welwn welliant go iawn yn nannedd plant.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cynnig yw nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad, ac felly derbynnir y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 12.36.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) i'r Gadair am 3.57 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) took the Chair at 3.57 p.m.*

## **Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate**

### **Y Dreth Gyngor Council Tax**

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 3, 4 a 6 yn enw Peter Black. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.23, nid wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 7 yn enw Peter Black. Os derbynnir gwelliant 2, caiff gwelliannau 3 a 4 eu dad-ddethol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 3, 4 and 6 in the name of Peter Black. In accordance with Standing Order 12.23, I have not selected amendment 7 in the name of Peter Black. If amendment 2 is agreed, amendments 3 and 4 will be deselected.

*Cynnig NDM4972 William Graham*

*Motion NDM4972 William Graham*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn nodi:*

*1. Notes:*

*a) y manteision i economi Cymru a fyddai'n dod yn sgîl rhewi'r dreth gyngor;*

*a) the benefits a council tax freeze would bring to the Welsh economy;*

*b) yr arian canlyniadol gwerth £38.9m gan Lywodraeth y DU o ganlyniad i gyllido rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn Lloegr;*

*b) the £38.9m consequential from the UK Government as a result of funding for a council tax freeze in England;*

*c) y byddai cost rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn y flwyddyn ariannol 2012-13 yn sylweddol is na'r £38.9m;*

*c) the cost of a council tax freeze for the financial year 2012-13 would be significantly lower than £38.9m;*

*d) y manteision y gellid eu gwireddu gyda gweddill yr arian i helpu busnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru.*

*d) the benefits that could be realised with the remaining monies to help SMEs in Wales.*

*2. Yn galw am dryloywder, atebolrwydd ac effeithlonrwydd llwyr mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.*

*2. Calls for full transparency, accountability and efficiency in public expenditure in Wales.*

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** I move the motion.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Cynigaf y cynnig.

I am extremely proud to move the motion tabled in the name of William Graham, Assembly Member for South Wales East. Be in no doubt that the Welsh Conservatives wish to propose that the National Assembly for Wales notes the benefits a council tax freeze would bring to the Welsh economy; the £38.9 million consequential from the UK

Rwyf yn arbennig o falch o gael cynnig y cynnig a gyflwynwyd yn enw William Graham, Aelod Cynulliad Dwyrain De Cymru. Nid oes dim amheuaeth bod y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn dymuno cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi'r manteision i economi Cymru a fyddai'n dod yn sgîl rhewi'r dreth gyngor; yr arian

Government as a result of funding for a council tax freeze in England; that the cost of a council tax freeze for the financial year 2012-13 would be significantly lower than £38.9 million; and the benefits that could be realised with the remaining moneys to help SMEs in Wales. Secondly, the motion calls for full transparency, accountability and efficiency in public expenditure in Wales.

I am pleased to move this motion today. The motion is premised on the belief that a freeze in council tax would provide an excellent helping hand for hard-pressed working families and individuals in these difficult economic times. We have also brought this motion before the National Assembly for Wales because research undertaken on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives has shown that the cost of reducing the council element of band E council tax back to 2011-12 levels in all local authorities in Wales, taking into account the increase in the tax base between the two years, would be of the order of just £21.3 million. Essentially, this means that the Welsh Government could and should have passed on part of the consequential to our local councils in order to fund a freeze, while still having £17.6 million—

4.00 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You mention that figure of £21 million; you do not mention the figure of £23.4 million, which will be the consequence of the fact that council tax benefits are being devolved. There is a 10% shortfall in the finance.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** With respect to the Assembly Member, this debate is fundamentally about a council tax freeze; it is about £39 million that came from the UK Government. Your point is irrelevant to what I am discussing.

Welsh Conservatives believe, first and foremost, that this money should have been passed on to fund a council tax freeze. In doing that, the Welsh Government would have been putting money back into the pockets of our hard-pressed ratepayers, in a

canlyniadol gwerth £38.9 miliwn gan Lywodraeth y DU o ganlyniad i gyllido rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn Lloegr; y byddai cost rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn y flwyddyn ariannol 2012-13 yn sylweddol is na'r £38.9 miliwn; a'r manteision y gellid eu gwireddu gyda gweddill yr arian i helpu busnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru. Yn ail, mae'r cynnig yn galw am dryloywder, atebolrwydd ac effeithlonrwydd llwyr mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Rwyf yn falch o gynnig y cynnig hwn heddiw. Mae'r cynnig yn seiliedig ar y gred y byddai rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn rhoi help llaw rhagorol i deuluoedd ac unigolion sy'n gweithio ac sydd o dan bwysau yn y cyfnod economaidd anodd hwn. Rydym hefyd wedi dod â'r cynnig hwn gerbron Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru oherwydd bod ymchwil a wnaed ar ran y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig wedi dangos mai dim ond oddeutu £21.3 miliwn fyddai cost lleihau elfen cyngor y dreth gyngor band E yn ôl i lefelau 2011-12 ym mhob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, gan ystyried y cynnydd mewn sylfaen drethi rhwng y ddwy flynedd. Yn ei hanfod, mae hyn yn golygu y gallai ac y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru fod wedi trosglwyddo rhan o'r arian canlyniadol i'n cynghorau lleol er mwyn cyllido rhewi'r dreth gyngor, ar yr un pryd â dal i gael £17.6 miliwn—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rydych yn sôn am y ffigur £21 miliwn; nid ydych yn sôn am y ffigur £23.4 miliwn, sef canlyniad y ffaith bod budd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor yn cael eu datganoli. Ceir diffyg o 10 y cant yn yr arian.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Â phob parch i'r Aelod Cynulliad, mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn y bôn; mae'n ymwneud â £39 miliwn a ddaeth gan Lywodraeth y DU. Mae eich pwynt yn amherthnasol i'r hyn rwyf yn ei drafod.

Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn credu, yn anad dim arall, y dylid bod wedi trosglwyddo'r arian hwn ymlaen i dalu am rewi'r dreth gyngor. Drwy wneud hynny, byddai Llywodraeth Cymru wedi bod yn rhoi arian yn ôl ym mhocedi ein trethdalwyr sydd

manner consistent with the experience of ratepayers across the border in England and in Scotland. The Welsh Government, supported by you, Rhodri, Plaid Cymru and the Lib Dems, has argued that the £39 million is better spent on a fiscal stimulus. However, that flies in the face of economic sense. A consensus exists in business circles, reiterated by economists, such as Plaid Cymru's own Dr Eurfyl ap Gwilym, that money put back into the pockets of householders would provide a confidence boost and would be recycled by individuals in the local economy. What better form of economic stimulus is there? Instead of treating the state as the alpha and omega of the economy, Welsh Conservatives recognise that it is the small and medium-sized enterprises that make up our local economies that need our special attention and will provide the jobs and growth in the future.

Voters on the doorsteps are very angry that the National Assembly has failed to provide them with the council tax relief that they deserve. In some areas facing increases of 3% to 4% or more, there is widespread consternation that such rises can be justified when wages and living standards have not seen a similar rate of increase. Welsh Conservatives agree with that viewpoint, and there should be no doubt as to how we would have done things differently. Had this Chamber listened to our Members, and had the Welsh Government followed our policy, the people of Wales would currently be £21.3 million better off, and, at the same time, would have benefitted from an extra £3.5 million spent on enterprise zones, £3 million on Skills Growth Wales and an additional £11.1 million to fund 4,094 extra apprenticeships.

It would have been possible for us to support amendments 1 and 2, including Plaid Cymru's call for greater help for business, had they not simultaneously opted to delete our calls for a council tax freeze. The fact is that our motion proves that it is possible to have both. Naturally, amendment 3 is unacceptable to us, as is amendment 4. The latter in particular shows that Peter Black and his Liberal Democrat colleagues would prefer to stick their heads in the sand rather than

o dan bwysau. Dyma yw profiadau trethdalwyr dros y ffin yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru, gyda'ch cefnogaeth chi, Rhodri, Plaid Cymru a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, wedi dadlau ei bod yn well gwario'r £39 miliwn ar ysgogiad ariannol. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n mynd yn groes i synnwyr economaidd. Ceir consensws mewn cylchoedd busnes, a ailadroddir gan economegwyr fel Dr Eurfyl ap Gwilym, Plaid Cymru, y byddai rhoi arian yn ôl ym mhocedi pobl yn rhoi hwb i hyder ac y byddai'n cael ei ailgylchu gan unigolion yn yr economi leol. Pa fath gwell o ysgogiad ariannol sy'n bodoli? Yn hytrach na thrin y wladwriaeth fel alffa ac omega'r economi, mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn cydnabod bod angen ein sylw arbennig ar y busnesau bach a chanolig sy'n gwneud ein heconomïau. Y busnesau hyn fydd yn darparu'r swyddi a'r twf yn y dyfodol.

Ar garreg yr aelwyd mae pleidleiswyr yn flin iawn bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi methu â darparu'r rhyddhad treth gyngor y maent yn ei haeddu. Mewn rhai ardaloedd sy'n wynebu cynnydd o 3 y cant i 4 y cant neu ragor, ceir cryn syndod bod modd cyfiawnhau'r fath gynnydd pan nad yw cyflogau na safonau byw wedi gweld cynnydd ar yr un gyfradd. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig o'r un farn, ac ni ddylid bod dim amheuaeth ynghylch sut y byddem ni wedi gwneud pethau'n wahanol. Os byddai'r Siambr hon wedi gwrandao ar ein Haelodau, ac os byddai Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dilyn ein polisi, byddai pobl Cymru £21.3 miliwn ar eu hennill ar hyn o bryd, ac, ar yr un pryd, byddent wedi elwa yn sgîl gwario £3.5 miliwn ychwanegol ar ardaloedd menter, £3 miliwn ar Sgiliau Twf Cymru a £11.1 miliwn ychwanegol i ariannu 4,094 o brentisiaethau ychwanegol.

Byddai wedi bod yn bosibl i ni gefnogi gwelliannau 1 a 2, gan gynnwys galwad Plaid Cymru am ragor o help i fusnesau, oni bai eu bod wedi dewis dileu ein galwadau am rewi'r dreth gyngor ar yr un pryd. Y gwir amdani yw bod ein cynnig yn profi ei bod yn bosibl cael y naill a'r llall. Yn naturiol, mae gwelliant 3 yn annerbyniol i ni, yn yr un modd â gwelliant 4. Mae'r ail, yn benodol, yn dangos y byddai'n well gan Peter Black a'i gyd-Aelodau Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol roi

listen to our argument.

eu pennau yn y tywod yn hytrach na gwrando ar ein dadl.

**Peter Black:** Will you give way?

**Peter Black:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Go on, then.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** I ffwrdd â chi, felly.

**Peter Black:** I thank the Member for taking an intervention; I have pulled my head out of the sand a bit. [*Laughter.*] One of the reasons why we wanted to delete point 1(c) is because you claimed that the cost of a freeze would be significantly lower than £38.9 million. Can you tell me how much it would be and the basis for your calculations?

**Peter Black:** Rwyf yn diolch i'r Aelod am dderbyn ymyriad; rwyf wedi tynnu fy mhen allan o'r tywod rywfaint. [*Chwerthin.*] Un o'r rhesymau pam roeddem am ddileu pwynt 1(c) yw oherwydd i chi honni y byddai'r gost o rewi yn sylweddol is na'r £38.9 miliwn. A allwch ddweud wrthyf faint fyddai'r gost a beth yw'r sail ar gyfer eich cyfrifiadau?

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** You did not pull your head out of the sand quickly enough, because the figure has been reiterated twice: it is £21.3 million. It is possible to fund both an economic stimulus package and a council tax freeze. Perhaps if the parties opposite had done their research prior to tabling their amendments, rather than rejecting a Conservative motion point blank, they would have realised that.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Nid oeddech wedi tynnu eich pen allan o'r tywod yn ddigon cyflym, oherwydd mae'r ffigur wedi cael ei ailadrodd ddwywaith: £21.3 miliwn. Mae'n bosibl ariannu pecyn ysgogiad ariannol a rhewi'r dreth gyngor. Efallai petai'r pleidiau gyferbyn wedi gwneud eu gwaith ymchwil cyn cyflwyno eu gwelliannau, yn hytrach na gwrthod cynnig gan y Ceidwadwyr ar ei ben, byddent wedi sylweddoli hynny.

As for amendment 6, it is incorrect to say that Conservative councils are failing to follow Conservative party policy. Although Welsh Conservatives would prefer to see a council tax freeze, what has happened in England has been a decision to empower local councils of all colours to make their own decisions and choices with regard to the setting of council tax. Sadly, no such financial empowerment was granted in Wales. The Liberal Democrats used to be for localism, and their amendments today leave me baffled as to why it is that they have lost sight of this in Wales.

O ran gwelliant 6, mae'n anghywir dweud bod cynghorau Ceidwadol yn methu â dilyn polisi'r blaid Geidwadol. Er y byddai'n well gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig weld y dreth gyngor yn cael ei rhewi, yr hyn a welwyd yn Lloegr oedd penderfyniad i rymuso cynghorau lleol o bob lliw i wneud eu penderfyniadau a'u dewisiadau eu hunain o ran gosod y dreth gyngor. Yn anffodus, ni welwyd y fath rymuso ariannol yng Nghymru. Arferai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fod o blaid lleoliaeth, ac mae eu gwelliannau heddiw wedi fy nrysu'n lân ynghylch pam eu bod wedi colli golwg ar hyn yng Nghymru.

**Mick Antoniw:** Will you give way?

**Mick Antoniw:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Sorry, I have taken two interventions already. Next time, Mick.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, rwyf wedi derbyn dau ymyriad yn barod. Tro nesaf, Mick.

When we last debated council tax in the Chamber, we were accused by Plaid and the Lib Dems of being anti-devolution. Today, I argue that we are the true party of devolution and our vision is for local communities and individuals to be empowered to make their

Y tro diwethaf i ni gael dadl am y dreth gyngor yn y Siambr, cawsom ein cyhuddo gan Plaid a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o fod yn erbyn datganoli. Heddiw, rwyf yn dadlau mai ni yw gwir blaid datganoli. Ein gweledigaeth ni yw bod cymunedau lleol ac

own choices. Passing on the consequential gives local authorities the tools that they need to do this job. Unlike other Members, we recognise that true devolution and localism does not begin and end in Cardiff bay. Beyond Cardiff bay and in the wider country of Wales, people will not care for the political point-scoring that may go on today. Rather, they will judge us on our record of inaction. I urge all Members to support today's motion on the grounds that this National Assembly could have delivered a council tax freeze to bolster local economies and give a helping hand to ratepayers, while simultaneously providing an economic stimulus, had we chosen to do so.

*Gwelliant 1 Jocelyn Davies*

*Ym mhwynt 1, dileu 'rhewi'r dreth gyngor' a rhoi yn ei le 'rhagor o wariant ar seilwaith'.*

*Gwelliant 2 Jocelyn Davies*

*Ym mhwynt 1, dileu popeth ar ôl 'yn' a rhoi yn ei le 'Lloegr ac yn credu y dylid defnyddio'r arian hwn i ysgogi economi Cymru, gan gynnwys helpu busnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru.'*

*Gwelliant 5 Jocelyn Davies*

*Cynnwys ar ddiwedd pwynt 2: 'yn cynnwys gwneud gwell defnydd o wariant ar seilwaith'.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiad welliannau 1, 2 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Rwyf yn falch iawn o gynnig y gwelliannau hyn i'r cynnig hwn, lle mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig fel petaent yn dweud mai'r hyn sy'n fuddiol i awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru yw eu bod yn gwrando ar yr hyn sy'n cael ei gynnig yn San Steffan gan David Cameron a George Osborne, a bod hynny yn mynd i fod yn fuddiol i awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru. Mae'n rhaid i'r Ceidwadwyr sylweddoli bod y sefyllfa yng Nghymru yn amrywio o'r naill awdurdod lleol i'r llall. Gallai rhewi'r dreth fod yn fuddiol. Mae awdurdod lleol Caerffili, er enghraifft, sy'n awdurdod arbennig o

unigolion yn cael eu grymuso i wneud eu dewisiadau eu hunain. Mae trosglwyddo'r arian canlyniadol ymlaen yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol i wneud hyn. Yn wahanol i Aelodau eraill, rydym ni yn cydnabod nad yw gwir ddatganoli a lleoliaeth yn dechrau ac yn gorffen ym mae Caerdydd. Tu hwnt i fae Caerdydd, ac yng Nghymru benbaladr, ni fydd pobl yn malio dim am y sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol a all ddigwydd heddiw. Yn hytrach, byddant yn ein barnu ar ein record o segurdod. Rwyf yn annog yr holl Aelodau i gefnogi'r cynnig heddiw ar y sail y gallai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn fod wedi rhewi'r dreth gyngor i roi hwb i economïau lleol a rhoi help llaw i drethdalwyr, ar yr un pryd â darparu ysgogiad economaidd, petaem wedi dewis gwneud hynny.

*Amendment 1 Jocelyn Davies*

*In point 1a delete 'a council tax freeze' and replace with 'increased spending on infrastructure'.*

*Amendment 2 Jocelyn Davies*

*In point 1 delete all after the first 'in' and replace with 'England and believes this should be used to stimulate the Welsh economy, including helping SMEs in Wales.'*

*Amendment 5 Jocelyn Davies*

*Insert at end of point 2: 'including making better use of infrastructure spending'.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I move amendments 1, 2 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

I am very pleased to move the amendments to this motion, where the Welsh Conservatives seem to be saying that what is beneficial to local authorities across Wales is that they should listen to what is being proposed in Westminster by David Cameron and George Osborne, and that that will benefit local authorities across Wales. The Conservatives must realise that the situation in Wales varies from one local authority to another. Freezing council tax may be beneficial. The local authority in Caerphilly, for example, which is an exceptionally innovative authority, has

flaengar, wedi rhewi'r dreth am ddwy flynedd yn olynol. Ar ben hynny, mae Caerffili wedi llwyddo i greu 160 o brentisiaethau, sydd wedi rhoi cyfle i bobl ifanc yng Nghaerffili gael eu hyfforddi ar gyfer swyddi, a'r gobaith yw y byddant yn cael cyfle i fynd ymlaen â'u gyrfaedd wedi dilyn y prentisiaethau hynny. Mewn ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru, mae awdurdodau lleol sy'n cael eu harwain gan Plaid Cymru sydd wedi cymryd cyfeiriad gwahanol. Yng Ngwynedd, er enghraifft, mae cynllun i greu cronfa sy'n cynnig benthyciadau i gwmnïau ac y mae wedi sicrhau neu greu 350 o swyddi. A yw'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn mynd i ddadlau heddiw ei bod yn fwy buddiol i rewi'r dreth gyngor yng Ngwynedd na chreu neu sicrhau 350 o swyddi?

**Antoinette Sandbach:** The proposal, Rhodri, is to give councils the choice and the opportunity to have that flexibility to deal with local issues and pressures. Councils in Wales were not given that choice. Where councils have been given that choice in Scotland and England, 85% of the English councils took up that offer.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n rhaid nad oeddech chi'n gwranddo ar yr hyn roeddwn yn ei ddweud yn gynharach, Antoinette. Yng Nghaerffili, dan arweiniad Plaid Cymru, edrychwyd ar y sefyllfa, a phenderfynodd y cyngor i rewi'r dreth gyngor am ddwy flynedd yn olynol, oherwydd ei fod yn credu mai dyna oedd fwyaf buddiol yng Nghaerffili. Yng Ngwynedd, awdurdod arall sy'n cael ei arwain gan Plaid Cymru, cymerwyd penderfyniad gwahanol oherwydd bod y cyngor yno'n sylweddoli bod y sefyllfa'n wahanol, ac mai'r hyn oedd angen ei wneud oedd sicrhau bod modd creu cyfleoedd yn yr economi lleol i sicrhau swyddi. Yng Nghaerdydd, sy'n awdurdod lle mae Plaid Cymru mewn partneriaeth â'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—ac nid yn aml iawn rwy'n dweud pethau canmoliaethus am y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—mae cronfa cyfalaf Caerdydd wedi creu 600 o swyddi. Y cwestiwn yw: sut yn union mae modd sicrhau bod yr economi yn cynnig cyfleoedd i bobl lleol ac yn diogelu gwasanaethau lleol drwy Gymru?

frozen the tax for two years in a row. In addition, Caerphilly has succeeded in creating 160 apprenticeships that have given young people in Caerphilly an opportunity to be trained for jobs, and the hope is that they will have an opportunity to take their careers forward having completed those apprenticeships. In other areas of Wales, there are local authorities led by Plaid Cymru that have gone down a different route. In Gwynedd, for example, there is a scheme in place to create a fund that offers loans to companies and it has safeguarded or created 350 jobs. Are the Welsh Conservatives going to argue today that it is more beneficial to freeze council tax in Gwynedd than to create or safeguard 350 jobs?

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Y cynnig, Rhodri, yw rhoi'r dewis a'r cyfle i gynghorau gael yr hyblygrwydd hwnnw i ddelio â materion a phwysau lleol. Ni chafodd cynghorau Cymru'r dewis hwnnw. Pan roddwyd y dewis hwnnw i gynghorau yn yr Alban a Lloegr, manteisiodd 85 y cant o gynghorau Lloegr ar y cynnig hwnnw

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Antoinette, you cannot have been listening to what I said earlier. In Caerphilly, under the leadership of Plaid Cymru, the situation was looked at and the council decided to freeze council tax for two years in a row, because it believed that that was what would be most beneficial to Caerphilly. In Gwynedd, another authority that is led by Plaid Cymru, a different decision was taken because the council there realised that the situation was different and that what needed to be done was to ensure that there was a way of creating opportunities in the local economy to safeguard jobs. In Cardiff, which is an authority where Plaid Cymru is in partnership with the Liberal Democrats—and it is not often that I say complimentary things about the Liberal Democrats—the capital Cardiff fund has created 600 jobs. The question is: how exactly can we ensure that the economy offers opportunities to local people and safeguards public services throughout Wales?

**Nick Ramsay:** Are you not missing the point, Rhodri? You talk about the choice that a council faces between freezing council tax on the one hand and providing opportunities on the other; both of which I can see the benefits of. However, the fact is, if those local authorities had had the money they should have had from this place, they would not have had to make that choice; they would have had the flexibility to do both.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am glad that you mentioned ‘the money they should have had’, because, of course, council tax benefits will be devolved—[*Interruption.*] Yes, you walked into that one, unfortunately. Council tax benefits will be devolved and your Government together with the Liberal Democrats in Westminster are devolving it with a 10% shortfall, which means that local authorities in Wales are facing an additional tax of £23.4 million, which the Labour Government here is refusing to make good. Therefore, you can argue among yourselves; I do not care whether it is the Labour Government here or the Conservatives and Lib Dems in Westminster that claim responsibility for the fact that taxpayers in Wales are facing an additional local government tax of £23.4 million. However, all three parties are responsible for that taxation, and that will mean that the choices available to local authorities in Wales will reduce.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You are out of time.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I have an extra minute, because I took an intervention.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You took two, and you have been allowed time.

*Gwelliant 3 Peter Black*

*Ar ddiwedd pwynt 1b, ychwanegu:*

*‘ac yn croesawu’r pecyn ysgogi economaidd a gyllidwyd ganddo.’*

*Gwelliant 4 Peter Black*

**Nick Ramsay:** Onid ydych yn methu’r pwynt, Rhodri? Rydych yn siarad am y dewis y mae cyngor yn ei wynebu rhwng rhewi’r dreth gyngor ar un llaw a darparu cyfleoedd ar y llaw arall; gallaf weld manteision y naill a’r llall. Fodd bynnag, y gwir amdani yw, petai’r awdurdodau lleol hynny wedi cael yr arian y dylent fod wedi’i gael o’r lle hwn, ni fyddai’n rhaid iddynt fod wedi gorfod gwneud y dewis hwnnw; byddent wedi cael yr hyblygrwydd i wneud y naill a’r llall.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rwyf yn falch eich bod wedi dweud ‘yr arian y dylent fod wedi’i gael’ oherwydd, wrth gwrs, bydd budd-daliadau’r dreth gyngor yn cael eu datganoli—[*Torri ar draws.*] Oeddech, roeddech wedi cerdded i mewn i honno ar eich pen, yn anffodus. Bydd budd-daliadau’r dreth gyngor yn cael eu datganoli a’ch Llywodraeth chi, gyda’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn San Steffan sy’n eu datganoli gyda diffyg o 10 y cant, sy’n golygu bod awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn wynebu treth ychwanegol gwerth £23.4 miliwn, y mae’r Llywodraeth Lafur yma yn gwrthod ei thalu. Felly, gallwch chi ddadlau ymysg eich gilydd; nid wyf yn malio ai’r Llywodraeth Lafur yma neu’r Ceidwadwyr a’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn San Steffan sy’n hawlio’r cyfrifoldeb am y ffaith bod trethdalwyr yng Nghymru yn wynebu treth llywodraeth leol ychwanegol gwerth £23.4 miliwn. Fodd bynnag, mae’r tair plaid yn gyfrifol am y dreth honno, a bydd hynny’n golygu y bydd llai o ddewisiadau ar gael i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae gennyf funud ychwanegol oherwydd i mi dderbyn ymyriad.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Roeddech wedi derbyn dau, ac rydych wedi cael amser.

*Amendment 3 Peter Black*

*At the end of point 1b, add:*

*‘and welcomes the economic stimulus package it was used to fund.’*

*Amendment 4 Peter Black*



*Dileu pwynt 1c ac 1d.*

*Delete point 1c and 1d.*

*Gwelliant 6 Peter Black*

*Amendment 6 Peter Black*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Yn nodi bod 16 Cyngor Ceidwadol yn Lloegr ac un yng Nghymru wedi methu â dilyn polisi'r blaid Geidwadol wrth iddynt gynyddu'r dreth gyngor eleni.*

*Notes that 16 Conservative councils in England and one in Wales have failed to follow Conservative party policy and are increasing council tax this year.*

**Peter Black:** I move amendments 3, 4 and 6 in my name.

**Peter Black:** Cynigaf welliannau 3, 4 a 6 yn fy enw i.

The Liberal Democrats believe in localism, and we always have done. What localism actually means is leaving local councils to make their own decisions about how they spend their money, not dictating from this Chamber whether they should, or should not, freeze council tax.

Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn credu mewn lleoliaeth, ac rydym bob amser wedi gwneud hynny. Yr hyn mae lleoliaeth yn ei olygu mewn gwirionedd yw caniatáu i gynghorau lleol wneud eu penderfyniadau eu hunain ynghylch sut y maent yn gwario eu harian, peidio â gorchymyn o'r Siambr hon a ddylent rewi'r dreth gyngor ai peidio.

Four councils in Wales have chosen to freeze council tax: a Conservative council in Monmouth, a Labour council in Bridgend, a Plaid Cymru council in Caerphilly and a Liberal Democrat-led council in Swansea. All of those councils have taken that decision after properly managing their finances, ensuring that they are able to deliver no increase in council tax in order to ensure that their council tax payers do not have to carry that extra burden, and that was a proper thing for them to do.

Mae pedwar cyngor yng Nghymru wedi dewis rhewi'r dreth gyngor: cyngor Ceidwadol ym Mynwy, cyngor Llafur ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, cyngor Plaid Cymru yng Nghaerffili a chyngor o dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Abertawe. Mae'r holl gynghorau hynny wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw ar ôl rheoli eu harian yn briodol, gan sicrhau nad oes angen iddynt gynyddu'r dreth gyngor er mwyn sicrhau nad oes yn rhaid i'w trethdalwyr ysgwyddo'r baich ychwanegol hwnnw, a dyna oedd y peth priodol iddynt ei wneud.

Other councils have not been able to freeze their council tax. The Vale of Glamorgan Council, for example, which is a Conservative-led council, has put its council tax up by 1.7% this year. *[Interruption.]* Yes, that was its choice. However, surely, as a Conservative council, it would have done everything possible to freeze its council tax. Is not freezing council tax what Conservative policy is all about? We are being dictated to in the Chamber and told by the Conservatives that we have to freeze council tax, yet the Conservatives are not delivering that in councils that they control.

Nid yw cynghorau eraill wedi gallu rhewi eu treth gyngor. Mae Cyngor Bro Morgannwg, er enghraifft, sy'n gyngor o dan arweiniad y Ceidwadwyr, wedi codi ei dreth gyngor 1.7 y cant eleni. *[Torri ar draws.]* Ydy, dyna oedd ei ddewis. Fodd bynnag, siawns, ac yntau yn gyngor Ceidwadol, y byddai wedi gwneud popeth y gallai fod wedi ei wneud i rewi ei dreth gyngor. Onid yw polisi'r Ceidwadwyr i gyd yn ymwneud â rhewi'r dreth gyngor? Rydym yn cael ein gorchymyn yn y Siambr gan y Ceidwadwyr ac maent yn dweud wrthym ei bod yn rhaid i ni rewi'r dreth gyngor, ond nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn gwneud hynny yn y cynghorau maent yn eu rheoli.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** The point is that this money was available and, in the current climate, a sensible use of that money would be to pass it straight back to ratepayers so that they could spend that money locally. That is localism at the end of the day.

**Peter Black:** Surely, Andrew, in the current climate, a sensible use of that money is to try to make up the capital shortfall that we are experiencing as an Assembly and a Welsh Government, simply because we have to try to stimulate the economy, build houses that people need, and create the jobs that people need. This is a balancing act that every government and local council has to look at. In Swansea, although we have frozen the council tax, we have also introduced an £80 million investment in council houses over three years, which will create jobs and are taking on apprentices as a result. This £38.9 million, which we have now debated at least three or four times as a result of Conservative motions, has been put to good use. We have a young recruits programme.

4.15 p.m.

Skills Growth Wales has had an extra £3 million to assist 1,200 people; we have had capital investment in schools; we have the Ely mill housing project to create homes for people; we have the Arbed scheme and more money for social housing and 130 affordable homes; and, of course, £3.5 million is going into enterprise zones, on which the Conservatives have said they would like the money to be spent. Are you saying that we should withdraw money from all those projects? Are you saying that we should no longer support those extra jobs and that investment so that we can freeze council tax? Is that really what the Conservatives think?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I am grateful to the Member for being so generous in allowing a second intervention. Had he listened to the Conservatives' local government spokesperson, he would have heard that the

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Y pwynt yw roedd yr arian hwn ar gael ac, yn yr hinsawdd sydd ohoni, byddai wedi bod yn gall defnyddio'r arian hwnnw i'w roi yn syth yn ôl i'r trethdalwyr er mwyn iddynt allu gwario'r arian hwnnw'n lleol. Dyna yw lleoliaeth yn y pen draw.

**Peter Black:** Andrew, siawns yn yr hinsawdd sydd ohoni, mai ffordd gall o ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw yw ceisio lleihau'r diffyg cyfalaf rydym yn ei wynebu fel Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cymru, oherwydd mae'n rhaid i ni geisio ysgogi'r economi, adeiladu tai y mae eu hangen ar bobl, a chreu'r swyddi y mae eu hangen ar bobl. Mae'n fater o sicrhau cydbwysedd y mae'n rhaid i bob llywodraeth a chyngor lleol edrych arno. Yn Abertawe, er ein bod wedi rhewi'r dreth gyngor, rydym hefyd wedi cyflwyno buddsoddiad gwerth £80 miliwn mewn tai cyngor dros dair blynedd, a fydd yn creu swyddi ac rydym yn cyflogi prentisiaid o ganlyniad i hynny. Mae'r £38.9 miliwn hwn, rydym nawr wedi cael dadl yn ei gylch o leiaf dair neu bedair gwaith o ganlyniad i gynigion gan y Ceidwadwyr, wedi cael ei ddefnyddio'n dda. Mae gennym raglen recriwtiaid ifanc.

Mae Sgiliau Twf Cymru wedi cael £3 miliwn ychwanegol i helpu 1,200 o bobl; rydym wedi cael buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn ysgolion; rydym wedi cael prosiect tai Ely mill i greu cartrefi i bobl; rydym wedi cael y cynllun Arbed a rhagor o arian ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol a 130 o dai fforddiadwy; ac, wrth gwrs, mae £3.5 miliwn yn mynd i ardaloedd menter, y mae'r Ceidwadwyr wedi dweud yr hoffent wario'r arian arnynt. A ydych yn dweud y dylem dynnu'r arian yn ôl o'r holl brosiectau hynny? A ydych yn dweud na ddylem gefnogi'r buddsoddiad a'r swyddi ychwanegol hynny mwyach er mwyn i ni allu rhewi'r dreth gyngor? Ai dyna'r hyn y mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn ei feddwl mewn gwirionedd?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am fod mor hael a chaniatáu ail ymyriad. Petai wedi gwrandao ar lefarydd y Ceidwadwyr ar lywodraeth leol, byddai wedi clywed mai £21.3 miliwn yw cost rhewi'r

cost of freezing council tax is £21.3 million. Therefore, many of the schemes that you have touched on, such as the £3.5 million for enterprise zones, could also have been achieved with the settlement of £38 million from Westminster.

**Peter Black:** The sum of £21.3 million still creates many jobs and builds many houses, Andrew. Frankly, we have to make a choice. When the Welsh Liberal Democrats supported the Welsh Government in its budget, we made that choice simply because we felt that that investment was necessary and because councils are also able to make choices. Councils can freeze council tax if they so wish. Although this £21.3 million is not a huge amount of money, it works out as roughly £1 million per council, which is fairly easy to find from the budget if you really put your mind to it. It is not a huge amount of money when it comes to using reserves or using money in a different way. That has been proven by those councils that have frozen council tax. Those councils that have not done so, of which the Vale of Glamorgan is a very good example, have shown that they are not capable of managing their finances properly so as to deliver the Conservative policy of which they are meant to be in favour.

I just want to say a few words about the amendments before I conclude. We would be happy to support all the amendments, but we will not support amendment 2 because it is seeking to spend money that has already been spent. It has been said that money should be used to stimulate the Welsh economy, but I believe that it has been. The point is that, having spent the money once, we are not able to spend it again. Therefore, with that proviso, the Welsh Liberal Democrats will be rejecting this motion. However, I think that the correct decision was made about the money that came from the UK Government as a result of the budget. We had the right to spend that money differently from how it wanted us to spend it. Yes, councils had that choice, but the Government also had that choice and it made the decision, as it should have done, to invest in the economy as well. Therefore, we cannot support this motion.

dreth gyngor. Felly, byddid hefyd wedi gallu cyflawni nifer o'r cynlluniau rydych chi wedi'u crybwyll, fel y £3.5 miliwn i ardaloedd menter, gyda'r setliad o £38 miliwn o San Steffan.

**Peter Black:** Mae £21.3 miliwn yn dal yn creu nifer o swyddi ac yn adeiladu nifer o dai, Andrew. A dweud y gwir, mae'n rhaid i ni ddewis. Pan gefnogodd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Lywodraeth Cymru gyda'i chyllideb, gwnaethom y dewis hwnnw oherwydd ein bod yn teimlo bod angen buddsoddi a bod cynghorau hefyd yn gallu gwneud dewisiadau. Gall cynghorau rewi'r dreth gyngor os ydynt yn dymuno gwneud hynny. Er nad yw'r £21.3 miliwn hwn yn swm enfawr o arian, mae'n golygu rhywbeth fel £1 miliwn y cyngor, sy'n weddol hawdd ei ganfod o'r gyllideb os rhowch eich meddwl ar waith. Nid yw'n swm enfawr o arian yng nghyswllt defnyddio arian wrth gefn neu ddefnyddio arian mewn ffordd wahanol. Mae hynny wedi cael ei brofi gan y cynghorau hynny sydd wedi rhewi'r dreth gyngor. Mae'r cynghorau nad ydynt wedi gwneud hynny, mae Bro Morgannwg yn enghraifft dda iawn, wedi dangos nad ydynt yn gallu rheoli eu harian yn iawn er mwyn cyflawni polisi'r Ceidwadwyr y maent i fod o'i blaid.

Mae arnaf eisiau siarad ychydig am y gwelliannau cyn i mi gloi. Byddem yn fodlon cefnogi'r holl welliannau, ond ni wnawn gefnogi gwelliant 2 oherwydd mae'n ceisio gwario arian sydd eisoes wedi cael ei wario. Dywedwyd y dylid defnyddio'r arian i ysgogi economi Cymru, ond credaf fod hynny wedi cael ei wneud. Y pwynt yw, ar ôl gwario'r arian unwaith, ni allwn ei wario eto. Felly, gyda'r amod hwnnw, bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn gwrthod y cynnig hwn. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y penderfyniad cywir wedi cael ei wneud am yr arian a ddaeth gan Lywodraeth y DU o ganlyniad i'r gyllideb. Roedd gennym hawl i wario'r arian hwnnw mewn ffordd wahanol i sut yr oedd arni eisiau i ni ei wario. Oedd, roedd y dewis hwnnw gan gynghorau, ond roedd y dewis hwnnw hefyd gan y Llywodraeth a phenderfynodd, fel y dylai fod wedi'i wneud, fuddsoddi yn yr economi hefyd. Felly, ni allwn gefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

**Byron Davies:** With Wales going to the polls tomorrow to decide who runs our councils, there can be no more timely debate than this. Our Labour Government in Wales and its comrades in local government have no real interest in supporting residents across Wales at this difficult time. If it did, why did it not pass along the funds for a council tax freeze? The UK Conservative-led Government clearly gave ample resources to deliver a freeze across Wales. As Janet Finch-Saunders touched on in her opening remarks, it really does add insult to injury that the Government had to use only £21.3 million of the £38.9 million allocated from the UK Government to freeze council tax. It has clearly and unequivocally let down the people of Wales.

On this side of the Chamber, we believe that a council tax freeze would put more money into the pockets of local people across Wales, giving them the option to spend it as they see fit in their local communities or further afield. I am pleased to say that every Welsh Conservative candidate fighting tomorrow's election feels the same way. That is a clear indication that we are the only party in the Chamber that listens and acts on behalf of the people of Wales. We are on their side.

**Mick Antoniw:** In view of the anger that you obviously hear on the doorstep, do you think that it is likely that, after Thursday, you will have more or fewer councillors?

**Byron Davies:** Frankly, I have not experienced much anger. *[Interruption.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have made an intervention, so please listen to the response.

**Byron Davies:** There is anger, because people would have liked to have the money put in their pockets. The First Minister, of course, said that he cannot see how giving people £3 to £5 a month will help the local economy. Therefore, it will come as no great

**Byron Davies:** Mae hon yn ddadl amserol iawn gan fod pobl Cymru yn pleidleisio yfory i benderfynu pwy fydd yn rhedeg ein cynghorau. Nid oes gan ein Llywodraeth Lafur yng Nghymru na'i chymheiriaid mewn llywodraeth leol ddim gwir ddiddordeb mewn cefnogi trigolion ledled Cymru yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn. Petai ganddi ddiddordeb, pam na drosglwyddodd yr arian i rewi'r dreth gyngor? Roedd Llywodraeth y DU, o dan arweiniad y Ceidwadwyr, yn amlwg wedi rhoi digon o adnoddau i allu rhewi'r dreth gyngor ledled Cymru. Fel y dywedodd Janet Finch-Saunders yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, mae'n rhoi halen yn y briw mai dim ond £21.3 miliwn roedd yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ei ddefnyddio i rewi'r dreth gyngor o'r £38.9 miliwn a ddyrannwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU. Yn amlwg ddigon ac yn ddigamsyniol, mae wedi siomi pobl Cymru.

Ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr, rydym yn credu y byddai rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn rhoi rhagor o arian ym mhocedi pobl leol ledled Cymru, gan roi'r dewis iddynt ei wario yn ôl eu dymuniad yn eu cymunedau lleol neu ymhellach i ffwrdd. Rwyf yn falch o ddweud bod pob un o ymgeiswyr y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig a fydd yn sefyll yn yr etholiad yfory o'r un farn. Mae hynny'n arwydd clir mai ni yw'r unig blaid yn y Siambr sy'n gwrando ac yn gweithredu ar ran pobl Cymru. Rydym ar eu hochr nhw.

**Mick Antoniw:** Yng ngoleuni'r dicter rydych chi'n amlwg yn ei glywed ar garreg yr aelwyd, a ydych yn meddwl y bydd gennych fwy neu lai o gynghorwyr ar ôl dydd Iau?

**Byron Davies:** A dweud y gwir, nid wyf wedi gweld llawer o ddicter. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rydych wedi gwneud ymyriad, felly gwrandewch ar yr ymateb.

**Byron Davies:** Ceir dicter, oherwydd byddai pobl wedi hoffi gweld yr arian yn cael ei ddychwelyd i'w pocedi. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, wrth gwrs, na allai weld sut y bydd rhoi £3 i £5 y mis i bobl yn helpu'r economi leol. Felly, ni fydd yn ddim syndod

surprise to hear me reiterate that Labour in Wales and at Westminster has proven time and again that, when it has held the purse strings at a UK level, it cannot manage budgets or make the right decisions with the money available. This is further proof of that.

It is worth noting that while Carwyn Jones has opposed a freeze in council tax, Labour-run Bridgend County Borough Council has ignored him and frozen council tax this year. Carwyn Jones's influence does not even extend to his own backyard. There are serious concerns about how Bridgend will afford this, and we could see a far bigger council tax increase in the next financial year to balance the books. That would not need to happen if Labour had passed the money on.

Council tax has more than doubled under Labour since 1997. In England, councils have had the opportunity to freeze council tax for two successive years. In Scotland, it is five years. However, in Wales, Labour refuses to do the same, driving up bills for households across the country. The Welsh Conservatives would freeze council tax across Wales, relieving the burden on hard-pressed households and families.

As we look around the Chamber at other parties' records—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** If you are working out the effect on local taxpayers, can you tell me what effect the shortfall in council tax benefits of £23.4 million, which has been imposed on local authorities in Wales by the Westminster coalition, will have on them?

**Byron Davies:** I think that we have heard that one enough today, Rhodri. [*Laughter.*]

Let us look around the Chamber at other parties' records. The decision to divert the £38.9 million consequential from the council tax freeze into other areas was taken with the backing of the Welsh Liberal Democrats. Plaid Cymru warmly welcomed the decision

fy nghlywed yn ailadrodd bod Llafur yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan wedi profi, dro ar ôl tro, na all reoli cyllidebau na gwneud y penderfyniadau iawn gyda'r arian sydd ar gael pan fydd yn gyfrifol am y pwrs ar lefel y DU. Mae hyn yn dystiolaeth bellach o hynny.

Mae'n werth nodi er bod Carwyn Jones yn erbyn rhewi'r dreth gyngor bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr o dan arweiniad Llafur wedi ei anwybyddu ac wedi rhewi'r dreth gyngor eleni. Nid oes gan Carwyn Jones ddylanwad yn ei filltir sgwâr ei hun hyd yn oed. Ceir pryderon difrifol ynghylch sut y bydd Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn fforddio hyn, a gallem weld cynnydd uwch o lawer yn y dreth gyngor yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf i gydbwysu'r llyfrau. Ni fyddai hynny wedi gorfod digwydd petai Llafur wedi trosglwyddo'r arian yn ei flaen.

Mae'r dreth gyngor wedi mwy na dyblu o dan Llafur er 1997. Yn Lloegr, mae cynghorau wedi cael y cyfle i rewi'r dreth gyngor am ddwy flynedd o'r bron. Yn yr Alban, maent wedi cael y cyfle hwnnw ers pum mlynedd. Fodd bynnag, yng Nghymru, mae Llafur yn gwrthod gwneud yr un peth, gan godi'r biliau i gartrefi ar hyd a lled y wlad. Byddai'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn rhewi'r dreth gyngor ar draws Cymru, gan liniaru'r baich ar gartrefi ac unigolion sydd o dan bwysau.

Wrth i ni edrych o amgylch y Siambr ar record y pleidiau eraill—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Os ydych yn cyfrifo'r effaith ar drethdalwyr lleol, a allwch ddweud wrthyf beth fydd effaith y diffyg mewn budd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor gwerth £23.4 miliwn—a ddaeth drwy law'r glymblaid yn San Steffan—ar awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru?

**Byron Davies:** Credaf ein bod wedi clywed hynny ddigon am heddiw, Rhodri. [*Chwerthin.*]

Gadewch i ni edrych o amgylch y Siambr ar record y pleidiau eraill. Roedd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi cefnogi'r penderfyniad i ddargyfeirio'r £38.9 miliwn o arian canlyniadol oddi wrth rewi'r dreth gyngor ac at feysydd eraill. Roedd Plaid

to refuse assistance to council tax payers, and the leader at the time, Ieuan Wyn Jones, said as much on 12 October, 2011. So, the message is clear: only the Welsh Conservatives would freeze council tax to support hard-pressed families and households across Wales. Only the Welsh Conservatives are on the side of the people of Wales.

**Mike Hedges:** Am I the only person who thinks that this is like *Groundhog Day*? We seem to have the same debate almost continually on this issue. The interesting thing is that the motion was not tabled for next week, after the council elections.

The Welsh Labour Government has provided a fair settlement to local authorities, given the savage cuts imposed on Wales by the Tories and their helpers, the Liberal Democrats, at Westminster. In order to meet the urgent priorities of the people of the Wales, the Welsh Labour Government has used a £38.9 council tax consequential from the UK Government to fund an economic stimulus package. That package is an important part of efforts to boost the Welsh economy, to support the construction industry, and to develop key public services, generating immediate benefits for our economy and the people of Wales.

Council tax rises in Wales are set to be at a record low this year, at an average of 2.1%, and Welsh households will continue to pay less than those in England. Over the past decade on the whole, the average band D council tax charge in Wales has been up to 25% lower than in England. Average council tax levels in Wales remain at around 19%, or £466, lower than those in England owing to the high proportion of support that the Welsh Government provides to local government spending in Wales. In fact, four local authorities in Wales have frozen council tax.

What would have happened to the money had it been given to these councils—added to reserves? If they have already frozen council tax, what else would they do with the

Cymru wedi rhoi croeso cynnes i'r penderfyniad i wrthod rhoi cymorth i'r rheini sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor, a dywedodd yr arweinydd ar y pryd, Ieuan Wyn Jones, hynny ar 12 Hydref, 2011. Felly, mae'r neges yn glir: dim ond y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig fyddai'n rhewi'r dreth gyngor i gefnogi teuluoedd a chartrefi sydd o dan bwysau ledled Cymru. Dim ond y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig sydd ar ochr pobl Cymru.

**Mike Hedges:** Ai fi yw'r unig un sy'n meddwl bod hyn fel *Groundhog Day*? Mae'n teimlo ein bod yn cael yr un ddatl byth a beunydd ar y mater hwn. Yr hyn sy'n ddifur yw na chafodd y cynnig ei gyflwyno ar gyfer wythnos nesaf, ar ôl etholiadau'r cynghorau.

Mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru wedi rhoi setliad teg i awdurdodau lleol, o ystyried y toriadau llym a roddwyd ar Gymru gan y Toriaid a'u cynorthwywyr, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn San Steffan. Er mwyn diwallu blaenoriaethau brys pobl Cymru, mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru wedi defnyddio £38.9 miliwn o arian canlyniadol y dreth gyngor gan Lywodraeth y DU i ariannu pecyn ysgogiad ariannol. Mae'r pecyn hwnnw'n rhan bwysig o ymdrechion i roi hwb i economi Cymru, i gefnogi'r diwydiant adeiladu, ac i ddatblygu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol, gan gynhyrchu manteision ar unwaith i'n heconomi ac i bobl Cymru.

Bydd y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru eleni yn is nag erioed o'r blaen, ar gyfartaledd o 2.1 y cant, a bydd cartrefi Cymru yn dal i dalu llai na'r rheini yn Lloegr. Dros y degawd diwethaf ar y cyfan, mae cost treth gyngor band D cyfartalog yng Nghymru wedi bod hyd at 25 y cant yn is nag yn Lloegr. Mae lefelau treth cyngor cyfartalog yng Nghymru yn dal yn oddeutu 19 y cant, neu £466, yn is na'r rheini yn Lloegr oherwydd y gyfran uchel o gymorth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei roi i wariant llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Mewn gwirionedd, mae pedwar awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru wedi rhewi'r dreth gyngor.

Beth fyddai wedi digwydd i'r arian petai wedi cael ei roi i'r cynghorau hyn—a fyddai wedi cael ei ychwanegu at arian wrth gefn? Os ydynt eisoes wedi rhewi'r dreth gyngor,

additional money? Is that really how we want to spend our money—building up council reserves? However, you might say ‘We would not give it to them’. If they did not get it, they would apply for a judicial review to say that they had been unfairly treated. It would also lead to every local authority saying, ‘We will put up council tax as much as we like, because the Welsh Government will give us the money to pay it out’.

I have read the amendments, and a new euphemism seems to have been introduced to the political vocabulary of Wales by the Liberal Democrats: ‘careful financial management of Welsh Liberal Democrat-led local authorities’ means cuts to education and reductions to school budgets.

**Eluned Parrott:** In what sense does a cut take a local authority such as Cardiff Council from being the second worst funder of education under Labour to being the second best funder of education under the Liberal Democrats?

**Mike Hedges:** I cannot answer for Cardiff, but I can answer for Swansea, which is twenty first of the 22 local education authorities when it comes to funding for education. The headteachers’ forum says that funding within Swansea’s schools is significantly lower than that of all our South West and Mid Wales Consortium, SWAMWAC, partners, putting city schools at a considerable disadvantage when regionalism gathers pace.

Sixteen Conservative authorities in England have increased council tax this year, among them Tory-led Surrey at 2.99%, Tory-led South Hams at 2.5%, Tory-led Cambridgeshire at 2.95%, and Tory-led Peterborough at 2.95%. Welsh local authorities had a better settlement than English authorities, even including the council tax freeze money given in England. Would it have helped local government in Wales if, instead of the settlement being given to them at the beginning, it was given to them in two parts?

beth arall fyddent yn ei wneud gyda’r arian ychwanegol? Ai dyna sut y mae arnom eisiau gwario ein harian mewn gwirionedd—cronni arian wrth gefn cynghorau? Fodd bynnag, gallech ddweud ‘Ni fyddem yn ei roi iddynt’. Os na fyddent yn ei gael, byddent yn gwneud cais am adolygiad barnwrol i ddweud eu bod wedi cael eu trin yn annheg. Byddai hefyd yn arwain at bob awdurdod lleol yn dweud ‘Fe wnawn godi’r dreth gyngor cymaint ag y dymunwn, oherwydd bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn rhoi’r arian i ni i’w dalu’.

Rwyf wedi darllen y gwelliannau, ac mae’n ymddangos bod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi cyflwyno ymadrodd newydd i eirfa wleidyddol Cymru: ‘rheolaeth ariannol ofalus awdurdodau lleol o dan arweiniad Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru’ sy’n golygu toriadau i addysg a lleihau cyllidebau ysgolion.

**Eluned Parrott:** Ym mha ffordd y mae toriad yn mynd ag awdurdod lleol fel Cyngor Caerdydd o fod yr ail gyllidwr addysg gwaethaf o dan Lafur i fod yr ail gyllidwr addysg gorau o dan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol?

**Mike Hedges:** Ni allaf ateb ynghylch Caerdydd, ond gallaf ateb ynghylch Abertawe, sydd yn yr unfed safle ar hugain o’r 22 awdurdod addysg lleol yng nghyswllt ariannu addysg. Mae fforwm y penaethiaid yn dweud bod cyllid yn ysgolion Abertawe yn is o lawer na’n holl bartneriaid Consortiwm De-orllewin a Chanolbarth Cymru, SWAMAC, gan roi ysgolion dinas o dan anfantais sylweddol wrth i ranbartholaeth gyflymu.

Mae un deg chwech o awdurdodau Ceidwadol yn Lloegr wedi codi’r dreth gyngor eleni, yn eu mysg mae Surrey o dan arweiniad y Torïaid gyda 2.99 y cant, South Hams o dan arweiniad y Torïaid gyda 2.5 y cant, Swydd Caergrawnt o dan arweiniad y Torïaid gyda 2.95 y cant, a Peterborough o dan arweiniad y Torïaid gyda 2.95 y cant. Cafodd awdurdodau lleol Cymru setliad gwell nag awdurdodau Lloegr, hyd yn oed ar ôl cynnwys arian rhewi’r dreth gyngor a roddwyd yn Lloegr. A fyddai wedi helpu llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru petai’r setliad

wedi cael ei roi iddynt mewn dwy ran yn hytrach nag ar y dechrau?

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** How do you think people going to the polls tomorrow will feel about your party leaving the United Kingdom, including Wales, with a deficit that results in the accumulation of £120 million a day in debt interest?

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Sut yr ydych yn meddwl y bydd y bobl a fydd yn pleidleisio yfory yn teimlo am eich plaid yn gadael y Deyrnas Unedig, gan gynnwys Cymru, gyda diffyg sy'n arwain at gronni £120 miliwn y dydd mewn llog ar y ddyled?

**Mike Hedges:** I am not one for predicting election results, but I think it is fair to predict that Labour will end up with more councillors in Wales than the Conservatives.

**Mike Hedges:** Nid wyf yn un am ddarogan canlyniadau etholiad, ond rwyf yn credu ei bod yn deg darogan y bydd gan Lafur fwy o gynghorwyr yng Nghymru na'r Ceidwadwyr.

If the Welsh Government could have done that, it could have given out part of the money and then given the rest later on, but that would have been fundamentally dishonest. It might have been politically advantageous to us, because we control very few authorities and we could have blamed all the other parties for running authorities badly and not saving the money. However, it went out in one block, which is fair and just. This is really an area that splits right-wing and left-wing parties though, is it not? Parties on the left want to spend money on infrastructure, getting people back into work, reflating the economy and trying to support people. The right-wing parties support such things as tax cuts for millionaires and council tax freezes, which again benefit the rich in their mansions more than anyone else. What I find strange—

Petai Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gallu gwneud hynny, byddai wedi rhoi rhan o'r arian ac wedyn rhoi'r gweddill yn nes ymlaen, ond byddai hynny wedi bod yn anonest. Efallai y byddai wedi bod yn fanteisiol i ni'n wleidyddol, oherwydd nid ydym yn rheoli llawer iawn o awdurdodau a byddem wedi gallu taflu'r bai ar y pleidiau eraill i gyd am redeg awdurdodau'n wael a pheidio ag arbed yr arian. Fodd bynnag, aeth allan mewn un bloc, sydd yn deg ac yn gyfiawn. Mae hwn yn faes sy'n rhannu'r pleidiau asgell dde a'r pleidiau asgell chwith, onid ydyw? Mae'r pleidiau ar y chwith am wario'r arian ar seilwaith, cael pobl yn ôl i waith, atchwyddo'r economi a cheisio cefnogi pobl. Mae pleidiau'r asgell dde yn cefnogi pethau fel torri trethi miliwnyddion a rhewi'r dreth gyngor, sydd unwaith eto er budd y cyfoethog yn eu plastai yn anad neb arall. Yr hyn sy'n od i mi—

**Bethan Jenkins:** Will you give way?

**Bethan Jenkins:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Mike Hedges:** Of course.

**Mike Hedges:** Wrth gwrs.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. There is no time for a further intervention. Please sit down. Mike Hedges, please proceed.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes amser ar gyfer ymyriad pellach. Eisteddwech i lawr. Mike Hedges, ewch yn eich blaen.

**Mike Hedges:** It depends how you want Wales to develop, and I am pleased that the additional money is being used to support the Welsh economy for the benefit of the people of Wales.

**Mike Hedges:** Mae'n dibynnu ar sut yr ydych chi am i Gymru ddatblygu, ac rwyf yn falch bod yr arian ychwanegol yn cael ei ddefnyddio i gefnogi economi Cymru er budd pobl Cymru.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** It is absolutely clear that council tax is a significant expense for many hard-working Welsh householders, and the Welsh Labour Government should be

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Mae'n gwbl glir bod y dreth gyngor yn gost sylweddol i nifer o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n gweithio'n galed, a dylai Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru fod yn achub



seizing any opportunity to put money back into taxpayers' pockets. Mike Hedges might like to remember that it is the lowest paid who have been taken out of tax, with the personal tax allowance being increased by more than £1,000 this year, returning money to people's pockets so that they get the choice about how they want to spend their money. Significant pressures on the household budget from food, electricity costs and so on mean that the saving of £2 or £3 a week would have made a huge difference to council tax payers here in Wales.

The average council tax for a band D property in Wales in 2012-13 is forecast to be £1,187.84. In 1997-98, it was £495. That is an increase of nearly £1,000 in that time. That is why it is so important to return money to people's pockets, which can then circulate in the local economy. Freezing council tax was an affordable policy. The figure of £21.3 million, which Janet Finch-Saunders referred to, has been researched by the Research Service here in the Assembly, which is widely respected as an independent research service. It would have left this Government an extra £17.6 million for an additional stimulus. When Peter Black indicated what had been achieved, that would still have allowed £3.5 million to be invested in the enterprise zones, and that is in addition to the money from the UK Government. It would still have permitted £9.26 million to be invested in schools and £4.84 million to be invested in the young recruits programme, which would have helped 1,785 potential—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am interested in your equation. Have you taken into account the £23.4 million, which I may have mentioned earlier? [*Laughter.*] As far as your Government in Westminster is concerned, with regard to devolving council tax benefits, there is a shortfall of £23.4 million.

4.30 p.m.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Rhodri, it is quite clear that there are a number of funds that come here to Wales that this Assembly decides to spend differently. That is a matter for the UK Government. It has decided to

ar unrhyw gyfle i roi arian yn ôl ym mhocedi'r trethdalwyr. Efallai byddai Mike Hedges yn hoffi cofio mai'r rheini sy'n cael y tâl isaf sydd wedi cael eu codi allan o dreth, gyda'r lwfans treth personol yn cael ei godi dros £1,000 eleni, gan ddychwelyd arian i bocedi pobl er mwyn iddynt gael y dewis ynghylch sut y mae arnynt eisiau gwario eu harian. Mae pwysau sylweddol ar gyllideb y cartref yn sgîl bwyd, costau trydan ac ati yn golygu y byddai arbed £2 neu £3 yr wythnos wedi gwneud byd o wahaniaeth i'r rheini sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yma yng Nghymru.

Rhagwelir y bydd y dreth gyngor gyfartalog ar gyfer eiddo band D yng Nghymru yn 2012/13 yn £1,187.84. Ym 1997-98, roedd yn £495. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o bron i £1,000 dros y cyfnod hwnnw. Dyna pam ei bod mor bwysig dychwelyd arian i bocedi pobl, sydd wedyn yn gallu cylchdroi yn yr economi leol. Roedd rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn bolisi fforddiadwy. Mae'r Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yma yn y Cynulliad wedi ymchwilio i'r ffigur o £21.3 miliwn, y cyfeiriodd Janet Finch-Saunders ato. Mae hwnnw'n wasanaeth ymchwil annibynnol ac uchel ei barch. Byddai wedi gadael £17.6 miliwn ychwanegol i'r Llywodraeth hon ar gyfer ysgogiad ariannol ychwanegol. Pan ddywedodd Peter Black beth oedd wedi cael ei gyflawni, byddai hynny'n dal wedi caniatáu buddsoddi £3.5 miliwn yn yr ardaloedd menter, ac mae hynny ar ben yr arian gan Lywodraeth y DU. Byddai'n dal wedi caniatáu buddsoddi £9.26 miliwn mewn ysgolion a buddsoddi £4.84 miliwn yn y rhaglen recriwtiaid ifanc, a fyddai wedi helpu 1,785 o ddarpar—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb yn eich hafaliad. A ydych wedi ystyried y £23.4 miliwn, efallai i mi gyfeirio at y ffigur hwn yn gynharach? [*Chwerthin.*] Wrth ystyried eich Llywodraeth yn San Steffan, gyda golwg ar ddatganoli budd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor, ceir diffyg o £23.4 miliwn.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Rhodri, mae'n eithaf clir bod nifer o gronfeydd yn dod yma i Gymru y mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn penderfynu eu gwario'n wahanol. Mae hynny'n fater i Lywodraeth y DU. Mae wedi penderfynu

devolve a different amount. It clearly gives money to this Assembly for specific purposes, and it does not get used for those purposes. That is the matter for this Assembly, but we would say that there is so much waste here. Hundreds of thousands of pounds are spent on useless surveys by the Welsh Government. More than £500 million during the term of an Assembly is given to third sector organisations, and we only have to look at what happened with the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association to see how that was spent. [*Interruption.*]

**Peter Black:** Thank you for taking an intervention. I was interested in your list of what could be spent. Are the Conservatives saying, therefore, that they do not want to spend money on young recruits or Skills Growth Wales and that they would actually cut the money for Arbed? Is that what you are actually proposing?

**Antoinette Sandbach:** No, I am saying that there would have been an enormous amount of choices. You could still have delivered savings back into the pockets of council tax payers so that that money could be recycled into the local economy, which could be used to support local businesses and local industry. The Welsh Conservatives believe that you should put power back in the hands of local people, and we say that we should be devolving those kinds of decisions to the local authority level. We should have given councils the choice, as Nick said earlier. They could have done both schemes that Rhodri Glyn Thomas referred to in relation to Gwynedd: they could have provided loans to companies and small businesses and frozen the council tax. We would argue that there should be further devolution and that this policy would have put that decision making back in the hands of local councillors.

**Mohammad Asghar:** It is a fact that, for the second year running, the coalition Government at Westminster has provided funding to help councils in Wales freeze council tax. As a result, every English council froze council tax last year and 85% have done so again this year. The coalition

datganoli swm gwahanol. Yn amlwg mae'n rhoi arian i'r Cynulliad hwn at ddibenion penodol, ac nid yw'n cael ei ddefnyddio at y dibenion hynny. Dyna yw'r mater i'r Cynulliad hwn, ond byddem yn dweud bod cymaint o wastraff yma. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwario cannoedd o filoedd o bunnoedd ar arolygon diwerth. Yn ystod tymor Cynulliad rhoddir dros £500 miliwn i fudiadau'r trydydd sector, ac nid oes ond angen i ni edrych ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd gyda Chymdeithas Lleiafrifoedd Ethnig Cymru Gyfan i weld sut y cafodd hwnnw ei wario. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Peter Black:** Diolch i chi am dderbyn ymyriad. Roedd gennyf ddi-ddordeb yn eich rhestr o'r hyn y gellid ei wario. A yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn dweud, felly, nad oes arnynt eisiau gwario arian ar recriwtiaid ifanc na Sgiliau Twf Cymru ac y byddent yn torri'r arian i Arbed? Ai dyna'r hyn rydych yn ei gynnig mewn gwirionedd?

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Na, rwyf yn dweud y byddid wedi cael llawer iawn o ddewisiadau. Byddech yn dal wedi gallu darparu arbedion yn ôl i bocedi'r rheini sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor er mwyn gallu ailgylchu'r arian hwnnw yn yr economi leol, y gellid ei ddefnyddio i gefnogi busnesau lleol a diwydiant lleol. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn credu y dylech chi roi pŵer yn ôl yn nwylo pobl leol, ac rydym yn dweud y dylem fod yn datganoli'r math hynny o benderfyniadau i lefel awdurdodau lleol. Dylem fod wedi rhoi'r dewis i gynghorau, fel y dywedodd Nick yn gynharach. Byddent wedi gallu gwneud y ddau gynllun y cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas atynt mewn perthynas â Gwynedd: byddent wedi gallu darparu benthyciadau i gwmnïau a busnesau bach a rhewi'r dreth gyngor. Byddem yn dadlau y dylid cael rhagor o ddatganoli ac y byddai'r polisi hwn wedi rhoi'r penderfyniadau hynny'n ôl yn nwylo cynghorwyr lleol.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae'n ffaith ar gyfer yr ail flwydd o'r bron bod y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan wedi darparu arian i helpu cynghorau yng Nghymru i rewi'r dreth gyngor. O ganlyniad, roedd pob cyngor yn Lloegr wedi rhewi'r dreth gyngor y llynedd ac mae 85 y cant wedi gwneud hynny

Government has recognised the pressure on household budgets that exists at present and has acted to ease the tax burden on hard-pressed families and pensioners.

The director general of the Confederation of British Industry, John Cridland, said:

‘Family budgets have been under great pressure, and by putting more money in the pockets of ordinary people, the Chancellor has provided a much-needed confidence boost.’

Even Ed Miliband recognises the need to relieve the burden. In launching Labour’s action plan for family budgets he said:

‘I’ve met so many people who say it’s so difficult to make ends meet. Who say that prices are just going up and up...In these tough times, many are finding it harder than ever to afford to pay the gas and electricity bill.’

That is a shame, and I agree with him. Everyone recognises the need to help families and pensioners in these tough times, everyone, that is, except the Welsh Labour Government. Westminster has given the Welsh Government nearly £39 million to extend the benefit of freezing council tax to Welsh families and pensioners. However, Welsh Labour has decided to use the money for its own purposes. It is not as if people in Wales do not need the help.

Council tax in Wales has more than doubled since Labour came to power in 1997. That is a shame—it has already doubled. Disposable household income in Wales is lower than in any other UK region, which is a shame on Labour. Average wages are lower than those in England, which is a shame on Labour. Yet, when faced with the opportunity to take action to relieve the council tax burden in Wales, Welsh Labour has returned to its comfort zone and has decided to do what it always does: to tax and spend. It believes that it knows best how to spend the money rather than leaving it in the pockets of the Welsh people. In this Chamber, on 12 October last

eto eleni. Mae’r Llywodraeth glymblaid wedi cydnabod y pwysau sydd ar gyllidebau cartrefi ar hyn o bryd ac wedi gweithredu i liniaru’r baich treth ar deuluoedd a phensiynwyr sydd o dan bwysau.

Dywedodd cadeirydd Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, John Cridland:

Mae cyllidebau teuluoedd wedi bod o dan gryn bwysau, a drwy roi rhagor o arian ym mhocedi pobl gyffredin, mae’r Canghellor wedi rhoi hwb mawr ei angen i hyder.

Mae hyd yn oed Ed Miliband yn cydnabod bod angen lliniaru’r baich. Wrth lansio cynllun gweithredu Llafur ar gyfer cyllidebau teuluoedd, dywedodd:

Rwyf wedi cwrdd â chynifer o bobl sy’n dweud ei bod mor anodd cael dau ben llinyn ynghyd. Sy’n dweud bod prisiau yn codi ac yn codi...Yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn, mae nifer yn ei chael hi’n anoddach nag erioed o’r blaen i dalu’r bil nwy a thrydan.

Mae hynny’n gywilydd, ac rwyf yn cytuno ag ef. Mae pawb yn cydnabod bod angen helpu teuluoedd a phensiynwyr yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn, pawb, hynny yw, ac eithrio Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru. Mae San Steffan wedi rhoi bron i £39 miliwn i Lywodraeth Cymru i ymestyn budd rhewi’r dreth gyngor i deuluoedd ac i bensiynwyr Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae Llafur Cymru wedi penderfynu defnyddio’r arian at ei dibenion ei hun. Ni ellid dweud nad oes angen y cymorth ar bobl yng Nghymru.

Mae’r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru wedi mwy na dyblu ers i Lafur ddod i rym ym 1997. Mae hynny’n gywilydd—mae eisoes wedi dyblu. Mae incwm gwario cartrefi yng Nghymru yn is nag mewn unrhyw ranbarth arall yn y DU, sydd yn gywilydd ar Lafur. Mae cyflogau cyfartalog yn is na’r rheini yn Lloegr, sydd yn gywilydd ar Lafur. Er hynny, wrth wynebu’r cyfle i weithredu a lliniaru’r baich dreth gyngor yng Nghymru, mae Llafur Cymru wedi dychwelyd i’r hyn sy’n gyfarwydd iddynt ac wedi penderfynu gwneud yr hyn maen nhw bob tro’n ei wneud; trethu a gwario. Maent yn credu mai nhw sy’n gwybod orau sut y mae gwario’r

year, the First Minister said that he could not

arian yn hytrach na'i adael ym mhocedi pobl Cymru. Yn y Siambr hon, ar 12 Hydref y llynedd, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog na allai weld

'see that giving people £3 to £5 a month... will help the local economy.'

y bydd rhoi £3 i £5 y mis i bobl...yn helpu'r economi leol.

What a thing to say to poor people in Blaenau Gwent, Torfaen and Islwyn. It is to his shame. This demonstrates the economic short-sightedness of the Welsh Labour Government. He is probably living in a different world to people up in the Valleys. Putting money in people's pockets stimulates the local economy. That is a fact, as stated by Dr Eurfyl ap Gwilym, who said that

Am beth i'w ddweud wrth bobl dlawd ym Mlaenau Gwent, Tor-faen ac Islwyn. Mae'n gywilydd arno. Mae hyn yn dangos na all Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru weld yn bell yn economaidd. Mae'n debyg ei fod yn byw mewn byd gwahanol i bobl i fyny yn y Cymoedd. Mae rhoi arian ym mhocedi pobl yn ysgogi'r economi leol. Mae honno'n ffaith, fel y dywedwyd gan Dr Eurfyl ap Gwilym, a ddywedodd

'people on low incomes don't save money. It gets rapidly recycled in the local economy on food and clothing, on essential items.'

nid yw pobl ar incwm isel yn cynilo arian. Mae'n cael ei ailgylchu'n gyflym yn yr economi leol ar fwyd ac ar ddillad, ar eitemau hanfodol.

Since 99% of businesses in Wales are small and medium-sized enterprises, these would benefit most from giving people increased spending power.

Gan fod 99 y cant o fusnesau yng Nghymru yn gwmnïau bach a chanolig, y rhain fyddai fwyaf ar eu hennill o roi mwy o bŵer gwario i bobl.

Council tax has been frozen in Scotland, and it will be frozen in 85% of councils in England. The Welsh Labour Government had the opportunity to freeze council tax throughout Wales. It refused to do so, to its shame. Welsh Labour has shown that it does not care about relieving the pressure on Welsh families and pensioners, again, to its shame. It has let the people of Wales down.

Mae'r dreth gyngor wedi cael ei rhewi yn yr Alban a chaiff ei rhewi yn 85 y cant o'r cyngorau yn Lloegr. Mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru wedi cael y cyfle i rewi'r dreth gyngor ledled Cymru. Gwrthododd wneud hynny, sy'n gywilydd arni. Mae Llafur Cymru wedi dangos nad yw'n malio am liniaru'r pwysau sydd ar deuluoedd a phensiynwyr Cymru, unwaith eto, sy'n gywilydd arni. Mae wedi siomi pobl Cymru.

**The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant):** Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer, for the opportunity to respond to this debate yet again. We enjoyed two debates on council tax last week, there are two this week and, hopefully, we will have two more next week to discuss council tax and the results of the election tomorrow. The debate is about how the Welsh Government spends the £39 million of consequential funding that we are receiving in 2011-12, as a consequence of the additional funding being made available in England to support a council tax freeze. It is important to make it clear that decisions on

**Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant):** Diolch i chi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, am y cyfle i ymateb i'r ddatl hon unwaith eto. Roeddem wedi mwynhau dwy ddatl ar dreth gyngor yr wythnos diwethaf, ceir dwy'r wythnos hon a, gobeithio, cawn ddwy arall yr wythnos nesaf i drafod y dreth gyngor a chanlyniadau'r etholiad yfory. Mae'r ddatl hon yn ymwneud â sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwario'r £39 miliwn o arian canlyniadol rydym yn ei dderbyn yn 2011-12, o ganlyniad i'r cyllid ychwanegol sydd ar gael yn Lloegr i gefnogi rhewi'r dreth gyngor. Mae'n bwysig egluro mai Llywodraeth Cymru sydd i wneud y

how to spend consequential that come to Wales are for the Welsh Government to make. It is also important to note that the priority of the Government has been to invest in jobs and growth rather than fund a one-year council tax freeze that will put the equivalent of around 60p per week back into people's pockets—hardly worth a pint of milk, not that George Osborne would have known what a pint of milk costs—in this tight budget that funds the consequential from England.

I was surprised by the direct attack that Antoinette Sandbach made on the third sector in terms of its funding. I was pretty astonished by that, and Mohammad Asghar might want to respond to his constituents, whom he says that he talks to often about how prices are going up and up, by telling them about the VAT increases and the welfare reform from his Government in Westminster, which are having a direct impact on the people of Wales. It is ironic that it has chosen to do this—a freeze that helps the rich more than the poor at a time when it is slashing council tax benefit for the poorest by 10%, which Rhodri Glyn may have made reference to today, while they suffer job losses, service cuts and welfare cuts. The Welsh Government is the Government that will stand up for the people of Wales.

It is important to be clear that local authorities are the bodies responsible for setting council tax, not the Welsh Government, or, indeed, the UK Government.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** I am grateful to you for giving way, Minister. You will have heard earlier today, in the question I posed to Leighton Andrews, that the Welsh Labour Government did not bother to respond to the consultation on housing benefit. Therefore, when you stand there and say that you will speak up for the people of Wales, why, if you are so concerned about housing benefit changes, did you not submit a response to the first consultation in 2010?

**Carl Sargeant:** I will tell you what I did hear: your direct attack on the voluntary

penderfyniadau ynghylch sut y mae gwario'r arian canlyniadol a ddaw i Gymru. Mae'n bwysig nodi mai'r flaenoriaeth i Gymru fu buddsoddi mewn swyddi a thwf yn hytrach nag ariannu rhewi'r dreth gyngor am flwyddyn a fydd yn rhoi'r hyn sy'n gyfystyr â 60c yr wythnos yn ôl ym mhocedi pobl—sydd prin werth peint o laeth, er na fyddai George Osborne yn gwybod beth yw cost peint o laeth—yn y gyllideb dynn hon sy'n talu am yr arian canlyniadol o Loegr.

Cefais fy synnu gan ymosodiad uniongyrchol Antoinette Sandbach yn erbyn y trydydd sector o ran ei gyllid. Cefais fy syfrdanu gan hynny, ac efallai y byddai ar Mohammad Ashgar eisiau ymateb i'w etholwyr, sydd yn ei ôl ef yn siarad yn aml am sut y mae prisiau yn codi ac yn codi, drwy ddweud wrthynt am y cynnydd mewn TAW a'r cynlluniau diwygio lles gan ei Lywodraeth yn San Steffan sy'n cael effaith uniongyrchol ar bobl Cymru. Mae'n eironig ei bod wedi dewis gwneud hyn—rhewi sy'n helpu'r cyfoethog yn fwy na'r flawd ar adeg pan mae'n torri budd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor i'r bobl dlotaf 10 y cant, efallai fod Rhodri Glyn wedi cyfeirio at hynny heddiw, wrth iddynt ddiodeff colli swyddi, toriadau mewn gwasanaethau a thoriadau mewn lles. Llywodraeth Cymru yw'r Llywodraeth a fydd yn sefyll i fyny dros bobl Cymru.

Mae'n bwysig bod yn glir mai awdurdodau lleol yw'r cyrff sy'n gyfrifol am osod y dreth gyngor, nid Llywodraeth Cymru, nac ychwaith Llywodraeth y DU.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i chi am ildio, Weinidog. Byddwch wedi clywed yn gynharach heddiw y cwestiwn a ofynnais i Leighton Andrews, nad oedd Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru wedi trafferthu ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad ar fudd-dal tai. Felly, pan rydych chi'n sefyll yna ac yn dweud y byddwch chi'n siarad ar ran pobl Cymru, pam, os ydych chi'n poeni gymaint am newidiadau i fudd-dal tai, nad oeddech chi wedi cyflwyno ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad cyntaf yn 2010?

**Carl Sargeant:** Dywedaf wrthyich yr hyn a glywais: eich ymosodiad uniongyrchol ar y

sector this afternoon, and I will make sure that everyone in that sector is aware of that.

As for the Welsh Liberal Democrats' amendments, the evidence from England on the council tax freeze for 2012-13 is not altogether positive and far from the gold-plated cash cow it is presented to us as being. To those Members who wish to use one side of the equation, I will tell them that 63 of England's 421 authorities decided not to accept the one-off funding available for a council tax freeze. These authorities decided to reject the proposals and opt for a council tax rise. In addition, nearly half of England's police authorities increased their precept. Again, the facts speak for themselves.

Despite the availability of funding for a council tax freeze, council tax in England will actually rise by around 0.3%. In the north-east in particular, council tax will rise by just under 1%. In fact, we can see this council tax freeze melting before our eyes. This is not surprising when you learn that the funding for England's council tax freeze for 2012-13 is only for one year. This means that authorities that freeze the tax in 2012-13 will need to meet the ongoing costs of future years, along with subsequent decisions to increase council tax. So, local taxpayers and service users will be paying for the Tories' attempt to get a bit of positive press this year. Of course, after Osborne's pasty tax, Cameron's horse-riding proposals and Jeremy Hunt's relationship—possibly—with Rupert Murdoch, they are desperate for a little bit of good news.

**Mohammad Asghar:** I just want to put the record straight. Your Chancellor in the previous Government said that he would have increased VAT to 20% if you had won the election. So, we are agreed on that much.

**Carl Sargeant:** You may have been thinking back to when you were in Plaid Cymru; you got your facts wrong then, as well.

sector gwirfoddol y prynhawn yma, a gwnaf yn siŵr bod pawb yn y sector hwnnw'n ymwybodol o hynny.

O ran gwelliannau Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, nid yw'r dystiolaeth gan Loegr ynghylch rhewi'r dreth gyngor ar gyfer 2012-13 yn gwbl gadarnhaol ac mae'n bell o fod yn ffynhonnell werthfawr o arian fel sy'n cael ei gyfleu i ni. I'r Aelodau hynny sy'n dymuno defnyddio un ochr o'r hafaliad, dywedaf wrthynt fod 63 o 421 o awdurdodau Lloegr wedi penderfynu peidio â derbyn cyllid un-tro sydd ar gael ar gyfer rhewi'r dreth gyngor. Penderfynodd yr awdurdodau hyn wrthod y cynigion a chodi'r dreth gyngor. Ar ben hynny, roedd bron i hanner awdurdodau heddlu Lloegr wedi cynyddu eu praesept. Unwaith eto, mae'r ffeithiau'n dweud y cyfan.

Er gwaethaf y ffaith bod cyllid ar gael ar gyfer rhewi'r dreth gyngor, bydd y dreth gyngor yn Lloegr yn cynyddu oddeutu 0.3 y cant. Yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr yn benodol, bydd y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor ychydig o dan 1 y cant. Mewn gwirionedd, gallwn weld rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn meirioli o flaen ein llygaid. Nid yw hynny'n syndod pan glywch mai dim ond ar gyfer un flwyddyn y mae'r dreth gyngor yn cael ei rhewi yn Lloegr, sef 2012-13. Mae hyn yn golygu y bydd angen i'r awdurdodau sy'n rhewi'r dreth yn 2012-13 dalu am gostau parhaus blynyddoedd y dyfodol, ynghyd â'r penderfyniadau dilynol i gynyddu'r dreth gyngor. Felly, bydd trethdalwyr lleol a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau'n talu am ymgais y Torïaid i gael ychydig o sylw cadarnhaol yn y wasg eleni. Wrth gwrs, ar ôl treth Osborne ar basteiod, cynigion marchogaeth Cameron a pherthynas Jeremy Hunt—o bosibl—â Rupert Murdoch, mae gwir angen ychydig o newyddion da arnynt.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae arnaf eisiau cywiro pethau. Dywedodd eich Canghellor yn y Llywodraeth flaenorol y byddai wedi cynyddu TAW i 20 y cant os byddech wedi ennill yr etholiad. Felly rydym yn cytuno ynghylch hynny.

**Carl Sargeant:** Efallai eich bod wedi bod yn meddwl am yr adeg pan roeddech chi ym Mhlaid Cymru; roedd eich ffeithiau yn

[*Laughter.*] I am happy to support the Plaid amendment advocating the Welsh Government's approach, which is to use the consequential to support the longer term economic strategy. This will deliver more sustainable benefits than would be achieved through a one-off council tax freeze.

I do not believe that these are gimmicks: extending the number of apprenticeship programmes and the young recruits programme; preparatory work for the Ely mill housing project; creating new job opportunities; investing in road infrastructure associated with enterprise zones; continuing the extension and expansion of Arbed; and delivering more affordable homes pan-Wales. None of these are the gimmicks the Welsh Conservatives wish to refer to them as.

I would perhaps suggest that there are many more candidates on the opposition benches who would be fantastic on their party political broadcasts—they would do wonders for them. We will see what the results are tomorrow following the election, which is why I believe this debate was tabled for today's business.

By working with some of the opposition parties, we have been able to invest in jobs and economic growth in our communities rather than in the short-term, short-sighted council tax freeze that the opposition Conservative Party wishes to support. This is how this Labour Government is supporting councils in keeping council tax lower than it is in England, year on year—it is not just a one-off—and we are doing this while investing in jobs and growth. I would suggest that they could learn a few lessons from us and perhaps pass them through to their masters in Westminster.

**Angela Burns:** I pay tribute to you, Deputy Presiding Officer, for managing to control most of us during what has been a highly rambunctious debate. I will state at the outset that I will not be taking any interventions from Rhodri Glyn Thomas, unless he is going to talk about something other than what he has consistently raised so far in interventions.

anghywir bryd hynny, hefyd. [*Chwerthin.*] Rwyf yn fodlon gefnogi gwelliant Plaid yn eiriol dull gweithredu Llywodraeth Cymru, sef defnyddio'r arian canlyniadol i gefnogi'r strategaeth economaidd tymor hwy. Bydd hyn yn cyflawni mwy o fanteision cynaliadwy na fyddai'n cael eu cyflawni drwy rewi'r dreth gyngor am flwyddyn.

Nid wyf yn credu mai gimigau yw'r rhain: cynyddu nifer y rhaglenni prentisiaeth a'r rhaglen recriwtiaid ifanc; gwaith paratoi ar gyfer prosiect tai Ely mill; creu cyfleoedd swyddi newydd; buddsoddi mewn seilwaith ffyrdd sy'n gysylltiedig â'r ardaloedd menter; parhau i ymestyn a thyfu Arbed; a darparu rhagor o dai fforddiadwy ledled Cymru. Nid oes dim o'r rhain yn gimigau fel y mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn dymuno cyfeirio atynt.

Byddwn efallai'n awgrymu bod nifer yn rhagor o ymgeiswyr ar feinciau'r wrthblaid a fyddai'n ffantastig ar eu darllediadau gwleidyddol—byddent yn gwneud gwrthiau iddynt. Byddwch yn gweld beth fydd y canlyniadau yfory ar ôl yr etholiad, sef y rheswm rwyf yn credu i'r ddadl gael ei chyflwyno ar gyfer busnes heddiw.

Drwy weithio gyda rhai o'r gwrthbleidiau, rydym wedi gallu buddsoddi mewn swyddi a thwf economaidd yn ein cymunedau yn hytrach nag mewn rhewi'r dreth gyngor sydd yn rhywbeth tymor byr nad yw'n edrych ymhell i'r dyfodol y mae'r Blaid Geidwadol yn dymuno ei gefnogi. Dyma sut y mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon yn cefnogi cynghorau i gadw'r dreth gyngor yn is nag ydyw yn Lloegr, o un flwyddyn i'r llall—nid rhywbeth un-tro yw hyn—ac rydym yn gwneud hyn ar yr un pryd â buddsoddi mewn swyddi a thwf. Byddwn yn awgrymu y gallent ddysgu ychydig o wersi oddi wrthym ac efallai eu trosglwyddo i'w meistri yn San Steffan.

**Angela Burns:** Talaf deyrnged i chi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, am lwyddo i reoli'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn ystod dadl a fu'n danbaid dros ben. Dywedaf ar y cychwyn cyntaf na fyddaf yn derbyn dim ymyriadau gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas, oni bai ei fod am sôn am rywbeth ar wahân i'r hyn y mae wedi'i godi'n gyson mewn ymyriadau hyd yn hyn.

Minister, you responded to our debate in a manner that causes me a slight degree of concern. I would just like to bring us back to what it is we have tabled. We have said that we wish the National Assembly for Wales to note the benefits that a council tax freeze would bring to the Welsh economy. Now, there is a dispute there, and I am prepared to talk about that in just a moment. Surely, there is nothing wrong with noting the £38.9 million consequential from the UK Government as a result of its funding for a council tax freeze in England—that is indisputable. Nor can we dispute that the cost of a council tax freeze for the 2012-13 financial year would be significantly lower than the £38.9 million consequential. We can argue strongly that benefits that could be realised with those moneys would help small and medium-sized enterprises.

4.45 p.m.

The second point of our motion, which few Members have paid regard to, is the call for

‘full transparency, accountability and efficiency in public expenditure in Wales’.

I note the slightly manufactured outrage that was hissed across the Chamber when Antoinette Sandbach made her contribution and mentioned third sector organisations. Let us be clear about this: they are not sacred cows. There are some third sector organisations that are not spending your money, our money, the public’s money, very wisely. There are others that are absolutely outstanding, but what she was talking about was the waste in the third sector funding. We know that from the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association. I know that no-one likes talking about it, but the Public Accounts Committee is also looking at some other organisations, so it does happen. No organisation anywhere is perfect. We want total transparency, which is why Welsh Conservatives believe that every single item of expenditure over £500 for any county council should be made public for the armchair auditors. Let us be clear about it: *The Daily Telegraph* exposed the problems with MPs’ expenses, and it was onerous and time-consuming, but we are in a different

Weinidog, roeddech wedi ymateb i’n dadl mewn ffordd sy’n peri rhywfaint o bryder i mi. Hoffwn fynd â ni’n ôl i’r hyn rydym wedi’i gyflwyno. Rydym wedi dweud ein bod yn dymuno i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru nodi’r manteision i economi Cymru yn sgîl rhewi’r dreth gyngor. Nawr, ceir anghydfod yna, ac rwyf yn fodlon siarad am hynny yn y man. Siawns nad oes dim byd o’i le ar nodi’r £38.9 miliwn o arian canlyniadol gan Lywodraeth y DU o ganlyniad i’w chyllid ar gyfer rhewi’r dreth gyngor yn Lloger—ni ellir gwadu hynny. Ni allwn ychwaith wadu y byddai cost rhewi’r dreth gyngor ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol 2012-13 yn is o lawer na’r £38.9 o arian canlyniadol. Gallwn ddadlau’n gryf y gellid gwireddu manteision gyda’r arian hwnnw a fyddai’n helpu busnesau bach a chanolig.

Mae ail bwynt ein cynnig, na chafodd lawer o sylw gan Aelodau, yn galw am

‘dryloywder, atebolrwydd ac effeithlonrwydd llwyr mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru’.

Nodaf y dicter a gafodd ei gyfleu yn ffals braidd ar draws y Siambr yn ystod cyfraniad Antoinette Sandbach a phan soniodd am fudiadau’r trydydd sector. Gadewch i ni fod yn glir am hyn: nid ydynt yn bethau cysegredig. Ceir rhai mudiadau trydydd sector nad ydynt yn gwario eich arian chi, ein harian ni, arian y cyhoedd, yn ddoeth iawn. Ceir eraill sydd yn holl wych, ond yr hyn roedd hi’n siarad amdano oedd y gwastraff mewn cyllid trydydd sector. Rydym i gyd yn ymwybodol o hynny drwy Gymdeithas Lleiafrifoedd Ethnig Cymru Gyfan. Gwn nad oes neb yn hoffi siarad am y peth, ond mae’r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus hefyd yn edrych ar rai mudiadau eraill, felly mae hyn yn digwydd. Nid oes unrhyw fudiad yn unman yn berffaith. Mae arnom eisiau tryloywder llwyr, dyna pam mae’r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn credu y dylai pob un eitem o wariant dros £500 ar gyfer unrhyw gyngor sir fod yn gyhoeddus ar gyfer yr archwilwyr cadair freichiau. Gadewch i ni fod yn glir am hyn: roedd *The Daily Telegraph* wedi datgelu’r problemau gyda



place, and it is absolutely right and proper—I have no problem with people looking at my expenses, and I do not expect any councillor or council official, or any council, to have any issues with that.

I will move on to some of the other matters that were discussed. Nobody would say that it is a waste of money, or inappropriate, to be spending money on schemes like Arbed, or on social housing or the Young Recruits programme. Our point is that we could have given to many of those schemes and also given money back to councils to make their own choices about whether they want to put that money back in the hands of the people of Wales.

**Carl Sargeant** *rose*—

**Angela Burns:** I will give way shortly, Minister.

The point that I wish to make is that, if you take the £6 million that is going to Ely Mill housing project, as wonderful as that project is, it will benefit only a small slice of the population. A council tax freeze, whereby we could put some of the extra money back into people's pockets, would have given far more people an extra few pounds, and believe me, as Antoinette said, the cost of food, fuel and even the simple things in life is really hurting people—especially those on low incomes. The Plaid Cymru finance spokesman in the House of Commons clearly said that it would be of great benefit.

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for her measured response, as always. I wonder if she regrets the way that other Members referred to our proposals for investment in jobs, the economy and growth as a gimmick.

**Angela Burns:** I do not recollect that, and I do not believe that we have any issue with anybody who wishes to invest in the economy, in growth and in getting young people into work. These things are vital. However, this is about fairness, and we wanted to look at this consequential and say,

threuliau ASau, ac roedd yn feichus ac wedi cymryd llawer o amser, ond rydym mewn lle gwahanol, ac mae'n hollol iawn ac yn briodol—nid oes gennyf broblem gyda phobl yn edrych ar fy nhreuliau, ac nid wyf yn disgwyl i unrhyw gynghorydd na swyddog cyngor, nac unrhyw gyngor, fod â phroblem ynghylch hynny.

Symudaf ymlaen at rai o'r materion eraill a drafodwyd. Ni fyddai neb yn dweud ei bod yn wastraff arian, nac yn amhriodol, gwario arian ar gynlluniau fel Arbed, neu ar dai cymdeithasol neu'r rhaglen Recriwtiaid Ifanc. Ein pwynt ni yw y gallem fod wedi rhoi arian i nifer o'r cynlluniau hynny ar yr un pryd â rhoi arian yn ôl i gynghorau i wneud eu dewisiadau eu hunain ynghylch a ydynt am roi'r arian hwnnw'n ôl yn nwylo pobl Cymru.

**Carl Sargeant** *a gododd*—

**Angela Burns:** Ildiaf cyn bo hir, Weinidog.

Y pwynt mae arnaf eisiau ei wneud yw os cymerwch chi'r £6 miliwn sy'n mynd i brosiect tai Ely Mill, er mor wych yw'r prosiect hwnnw, dim ond cyfran fach o'r boblogaeth fydd yn elwa ohono. Byddai rhewi'r dreth gyngor, lle gallem roi rhywfaint o'r arian ychwanegol yn ôl ym mhocedi pobl, wedi rhoi ychydig o bunnoedd ychwanegol i nifer fwy o bobl, a chredwch chi fi, fel y dywedodd Antoinette, mae cost bwyd, tanwydd a hyd yn oed y pethau syml mewn bywyd yn brifo pobl—yn enwedig y rheini ar incwm isel. Dywedodd llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar gyllid yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin y byddai'n amlwg yn fudd mawr.

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf yn diolch i'r Aelod am ei hymateb cytbwys, fel bob amser. Tybed a yw'n gresynu'r ffordd y cyfeiriodd Aelodau eraill at ein cynigion i fuddsoddi mewn swyddi, yr economi a thwf fel gimig?

**Angela Burns:** Nid wyf yn cofio hynny, ac nid wyf yn credu bod gennym unrhyw broblem ag unrhyw un sy'n dymuno buddsoddi yn yr economi, mewn twf ac mewn cael pobl ifanc i waith. Mae'r pethau hyn yn hollbwysig. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn ymwneud â thegwch, ac roedd arnom eisiau

‘Right, we have two issues: we have to make things fair for as many people in Wales as possible, and, because times are incredibly tough at the moment, let us give a little money back’. I know that many people will think, as the First Minister did, that an extra £2, £3 or £4 in someone’s pocket is nothing, but when you have very little, it is a huge amount.

The second part of the equation is to get the local economy going—for example, trying to keep the butcher in my village in business, so that people can buy their lamb chops or stewing steak there. The Federation of Small Businesses has said that this would be of benefit. The Confederation of British Industry has said the same, as have Conservative economists. Plaid Cymru economists have said that it would be of benefit. It is about trying to get that broad balance in ensuring that everybody gets a little bit of good, if you like, back in their pockets, and it is about getting the economy going.

I wish to address Peter Black’s comment that our policy is to freeze council tax. It is not; our policy is to say to the people who run our local councils, ‘You have a choice’. This would not be the first time that the Assembly looked at a consequential from London and said, ‘Let us spend it on what caused the consequential’. I think that all of us who were here in the last Assembly signed up to the Disabled Children Matter Wales issue when we had that extra consequential from London; we all wanted it to be spent on disabled children. None of this is new. It is about giving choice back to people, and trying to be fair to as many people as we possibly can at a time when it is incredibly tough for everybody in Wales.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad, felly gohiriaf bob pleidlais ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Voting deferred until voting time.*

edrych ar yr arian canlyniadol hwn a dweud, ‘Iawn, mae gennym ddau fater: rhaid i ni wneud pethau’n deg i gynifer o bobl yng Nghymru â phosibl, ac, oherwydd ein bod mewn cyfnod arbennig o anodd ar hyn o bryd, gadewch i ni roi ychydig o arian yn ôl’. Gwn y bydd nifer o bobl yn meddwl, yn yr un modd â’r Prif Weinidog, nad yw £2, £3 neu £4 ym mhoced rhywun yn ddim byd, ond mae’n swm enfawr pan nad oes gennych chi fawr ddim.

Yr ail ran o’r hafaliad yw rhoi hwb i’r economi—er enghraifft, drwy geisio cadw’r cigydd yn fy mhentref mewn busnes, er mwyn i bobl allu prynu eu cig oen neu eu stêc yno. Mae’r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach wedi dweud y byddai hyn o fudd. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain wedi dweud yr un peth, yn yr un modd ag economegwyr Ceidwadol. Mae economegwyr Plaid Cymru wedi dweud y byddai o fudd. Mae’n ymwneud â cheisio cael y cydbwysedd cyffredinol hwnnw o sicrhau bod pawb yn cael rhywfaint bach o ddaioni, os hoffwch chi, yn ôl yn eu pocedi, ac mae’n ymwneud â rhoi hwb i’r economi.

Hoffwn ddelio â sylw Peter Black mai ein polisi yw rhewi’r dreth gyngor. Nid yw hynny’n wir: ein polisi yw dweud wrth y bobl sy’n rhedeg ein cynghorau lleol, ‘Mae gennych chi ddewis’. Nid dyma fyddai’r tro cyntaf i’r Cynulliad edrych ar arian canlyniadol o Lundain a dweud, ‘Gadewch i ni ei wario ar yr hyn a achosodd yr arian canlyniadol’. Credaf fod pob un ohonom a oedd yma yn y Cynulliad diwethaf wedi ymrwymo i’r mater Plant Anabl yn Cyfri Cymru pan gawsom yr arian canlyniadol ychwanegol hwnnw o Lundain; roedd arnom i gyd eisiau ei wario ar blant anabl. Nid yw hyn yn ddim byd newydd. Mae’n ymwneud â rhoi dewis yn ôl i bobl, a cheisio bod yn deg â chynifer o bobl ag sy’n bosibl mewn cyfnod arbennig o anodd i bawb yng Nghymru.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is that the motion be agreed unamended. Are there any objections? I see that there are. Therefore, all votes on this item are deferred until voting time.

**Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru  
Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate**

**Llywodraeth Leol  
Local Authorities**

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw William Graham.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of William Graham.

*Cynnig NDM4973 Peter Black*

*Motion NDM4973 Peter Black*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Yn croesawu'r rheolaeth ariannol ofalus a gaiff ei chyflawni gan awdurdodau lleol a arweinir gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru sydd wedi'u galluogi i gadw'r codiadau yn y dreth gyngor yn isel dros yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf.*

*Welcomes the careful financial management of Welsh Liberal Democrat-led local authorities which has enabled them to keep council tax rises low over the last eight years.*

**Peter Black:** I move the motion.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiau y cynnig.

We have a unique opportunity to debate local government today; I am not sure how many times we have debated it over the last few weeks. As Mike Hedges has already pointed out, there is no doubt that we will not be debating it next week. However, it is important that, when people face a choice in local elections, as they will face tomorrow, they understand the records of the various parties. I am not shy of saying how well the Welsh Liberal Democrats have done in running local councils in Wales, not only in terms of the financial probity of those councils and in keeping council tax down, as most Liberal-Democrat-led councils have done, but also in terms of the extra benefits that they have delivered for local people.

Mae gennym gyfle unigryw heddiw i drafod llywodraeth leol; nid wyf yn siŵr faint o weithiau yr ydym wedi trafod hyn yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. Fel y mae Mike Hedges wedi dweud yn barod, mae'n siŵr na fyddwn yn ei thrafod yr wythnos nesaf. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd pobl yn wynebu dewis mewn etholiadau lleol, fel y byddant yfory, mae'n bwysig eu bod yn deall record y pleidiau amrywiol. Rwy'n falch o ddweud bod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi cael hwyll dda iawn ar y gwaith o redeg cynghorau lleol yng Nghymru, drwy sicrhau gonestrwydd ariannol y cynghorau hynny a chadw'r dreth gyngor yn isel, fel y mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r cynghorau sy'n cael eu harwain gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi ei wneud, a hefyd drwy ddarparu budd ychwanegol i bobl leol.

Like the rest of the Welsh population, the Welsh Government and local government are finding that times are tough. Settlements from the Welsh Government have made times even harder for councils, but I acknowledge that those settlements have largely reflected those that have come from Westminster, certainly since the first year of the One Wales Government. As such, I do

Fel pawb arall yng Nghymru, mae Llywodraeth Cymru a llywodraeth leol yn teimlo'r esgid yn gwasgu. Mae'r setliadau gan Lywodraeth Cymru wedi gwneud pethau'n anos fyth i gynghorau, ond rwy'n cydnabod bod y setliadau hynny wedi adlewyrchu'r setliadau sydd wedi dod o San Steffan i raddau helaeth, yn sicr ers blwyddyn gyntaf Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un. Felly, nid

not think that the Welsh Government can complain that it has been hard done by in the money that it has been receiving.

Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that council tax is one of the most unfair taxes in society, as it hits the poorest hardest. That is why we have continuously worked to keep council tax low, as well as argued that it should be replaced by a tax that is more reflective of people's ability to pay. We understand that low council tax is not the be-all and end-all—people want high-quality services as well—and Welsh Liberal Democrats have constantly sought to make services more efficient without cutting vital services. Welsh Liberal Democrats have reformed the way that services are delivered to ensure that Welsh taxpayers have received the best possible value for money.

I am not only going to talk about Swansea, but colleagues from Cardiff and Wrexham will talk about their respective councils, so I will not repeat what they have to say. I know that in Swansea's case, the council has saved £35 million over its four-year term, and in doing so, it has managed to increase investment in education by more than £2.4 million—more than the Minister asked for—and has provided money for a literacy fund. It has also put £2 million into social services, and has invested extra money in creating employment, with £80 million spent over three years on council housing; that will create jobs in Swansea and will enable the council to take on more apprentices. That is the sort of record that people will respect, and I hope that, when they come to vote tomorrow, they will recognise that record and vote accordingly.

Most Liberal Democrat councils throughout Wales have proved that, with good financial management and prudent spending, front-line services can be protected while delivering the lowest council tax rises over the past eight years. Over that period, Wrexham and

wyf yn credu y gall Llywodraeth Cymru gwyno ei bod wedi cael cam o ran yr arian y mae wedi bod yn ei gael.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n credu mai'r dreth gyngor yw un o'r trethi mwyaf annheg mewn cymdeithas, gan mai'r rhai tlotaf sy'n cael eu taro waethaf. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi gweithio'n ddi-baid er mwyn cadw'r dreth gyngor yn isel, yn ogystal â dadlau y dylid cyflwyno treth arall yn ei lle sy'n adlewyrchiad gwell o allu pobl i dalu. Rydym yn deall nad treth gyngor isel yw'r unig beth pwysig—mae ar bobl eisiau gwasanaethau o safon uchel hefyd—ac mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi ymdrechu'n gyson i wneud gwasanaethau'n fwy effeithlon heb dorri gwasanaethau hanfodol. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi diwygio'r ffordd y mae gwasanaethau'n cael eu darparu er mwyn sicrhau bod trethdalwyr Cymru'n cael y gwerth gorau posibl am arian.

Nid wyf yn mynd i siarad am Abertawe yn unig, ond bydd cyd-Aelodau o Gaerdydd a Wrecsam yn siarad am eu cynghorau perthynol hwy, felly ni wnaf ailadrodd yr hyn sydd ganddynt hwy i'w ddweud. Gwn yn achos Abertawe, fod y cyngor wedi arbed £35 miliwn yn ystod ei dymor o bedair blynedd, ac wrth wneud hynny, ei fod wedi llwyddo i sicrhau cynnydd o fwy na £2.4 miliwn yn y buddsoddiad mewn addysg—mwy nag y gofynnodd y Gweinidog amdano—yn ogystal â darparu arian ar gyfer cronfa lythrennedd. Mae hefyd wedi rhoi £2 miliwn i wasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac wedi buddsoddi arian ychwanegol er mwyn creu gwaith, gan wario £80 miliwn dros dair blynedd ar dai cyngor; bydd hynny'n creu swyddi yn Abertawe a bydd yn galluogi'r cyngor i dderbyn mwy o brentisiaid. Dyna'r math o record y bydd pobl yn ei pharchu, ac rwy'n gobeithio, pan fyddant yn dod i bleidleisio yfory, y byddant yn cydnabod y record honno ac yn pleidleisio yn unol â hynny.

Mae'r rhan fwyaf o gynghorau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ledled Cymru wedi profi bod modd diogelu gwasanaethau rheng flaen, â rheolaeth ariannol dda a gwariant doeth, a chyflwyno'r codiadau isaf yn y dreth gyngor yn ystod yr wyth mlynedd

Cardiff, I think, have had the lowest council tax rises of all of the 22 councils, on average. I hope that that, too, will be reflected in the way that people vote tomorrow.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** In extolling the virtues of Cardiff and Wrexham, for some reason you forgot to mention that, in both places, you are supported by Plaid Cymru county councillors, who have kept you in check and have ensured that you are delivering value for money. [*Laughter.*]

**Peter Black:** Rhodri, you forgot to mention that a Plaid Cymru councillor is a member of the administration in Swansea as well. You are absolutely right. I am happy to give credit where credit is due, because the Welsh Liberal Democrats believe in working with other parties, as we have done in the Assembly, as we do in Westminster and as we do in local councils. We work with other parties because we believe that that is the best way to deliver best value and the best services for local people. If you do not have a majority, you have to work with other parties, and the fact that other parties are prepared to work with us is a recognition that Welsh Liberal Democrats have good ideas and are able to deliver good policies and good value for money. I am glad that Rhodri has acknowledged that, as well.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You talk about working with other parties, and you are, of course, working with the Conservative Party in Westminster. There is the small matter of a shortfall of £23.4 million in council tax benefits that councils in Wales will have to face. How do you justify that?

**Peter Black:** I am not going to justify it, because I share your concerns at that shortfall and at the way that council tax benefits are being devolved. That decision has not yet been taken. Representations need to be made to the UK Government about the exact settlement that comes down to us, and those representations need to make clear that Wales is a deprived area where people struggle to

diwethaf. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, o'r 22 cyngor, Wrecsam a Chaerdydd, rwy'n credu, oedd â'r codiadau isaf yn y dreth gyngor, ar gyfartaledd. Rwy'n gobeithio y bydd hynny, hefyd, yn cael ei adlewyrchu yn y ffordd y bydd pobl yn pleidleisio yfory.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Wrth sôn am rinweddau Caerdydd a Wrecsam, am ryw reswm anghofiasoch ddweud eich bod yn cael eich cefnogi, yn y ddau le, gan gynghorwyr sir Plaid Cymru, sydd wedi bod yn cadw golwg arnoch ac yn sicrhau eich bod yn cynnig gwerth am arian. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Peter Black:** Rhodri, anghofiasoch chwithau ddweud bod cynghorydd Plaid Cymru yn aelod o'r weinyddiaeth yn Abertawe. Rydych yn hollol gywir. Rwy'n barod i roi clod lle mae'n ddyledus, oherwydd mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n credu mewn gweithio gyda phleidiau eraill, fel yr ydym wedi gwneud yn y Cynulliad, ac fel yr ydym yn gwneud yn San Steffan ac mewn cynghorau lleol. Rydym yn gweithio gyda phleidiau eraill gan ein bod yn credu mai dyna'r ffordd orau o ddarparu'r gwerth gorau a'r gwasanaethau gorau i bobl leol. Os nad oes gennych fwyafrif, rhaid ichi weithio gyda phleidiau eraill, ac mae'r ffaith bod pobl eraill yn barod i weithio gyda ni yn gydnabyddiaeth bod gan Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru syniadau da a'u bod yn gallu cynnig polisiau da a gwerth da am arian. Rwy'n falch bod Rhodri wedi cydnabod hynny hefyd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Rydych yn sôn am weithio gyda phleidiau eraill ac, wrth gwrs, rydych yn gweithio gyda'r Blaid Geidwadol yn San Steffan. Mae mater bach o ddiffyg o £23.4 miliwn mewn budd-daliadau treth gyngor y bydd yn rhaid i gynghorau yng Nghymru ei wynebu. Sut yr ydych yn cyfiawnhau hynny?

**Peter Black:** Nid wyf yn mynd i'w gyfiawnhau, oherwydd rwyf finnau'n pryderu ynglŷn â'r diffyg hwnnw a'r ffordd y mae budd-daliadau treth gyngor yn cael eu datganoli. Nid yw'r penderfyniad hwnnw wedi cael ei wneud eto. Mae angen cyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â'r union setliad sy'n dod i ni, ac mae angen i'r sylwadau hynny nodi'n glir bod Cymru'n

meet their council tax bills and they need that benefit money.

I have taken many interventions; I want to get on with what I have to say. In terms of Welsh Government settlements, it is not just opposition parties that have been unhappy with some of the settlements. Back in 2007, Derek Vaughan, who was then leader of Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council and leader of the Welsh Local Government Association felt that the settlements were punitive to local authorities and felt that it would be difficult to manage council tax given the real-term decreases in the overall spending for local councils. Although that was many years ago, his premise that it was difficult to manage with a declining real-terms income from the Welsh Government is not right, and that has been borne out by the record of Welsh Liberal Democrat councils. They have not only managed the council tax, but have managed to have low council tax rises, to invest in front-line services and, in some cases, to freeze council tax. That is an important point, which needs to be made.

**Jenny Rathbone:** I want to make sure that you acknowledge that, in Cardiff, the Labour Party has committed to a freeze on council tax, bearing in mind that wages are not going to go up very much and that it is impossible to expect people to increase the amount that they pay. However, the Liberal Democrats will increase council tax by 2.7%.

**Peter Black:** It is generous of you to suggest that Labour in Cardiff would freeze council tax, but when Labour ran the city, Cardiff had some of the highest council tax rises in Wales—11% on average. It also paid its senior councillors some of the highest wages—I think that Russell Goodway was the highest-paid council leader in Wales. Labour's record does not bear scrutiny when it comes to your premise that Labour would have delivered lower council tax in Cardiff. When Labour ran the city, not only did it have high council tax, it also had the worst record on recycling and one of the worst education records in Wales. The Liberal

ardal ddifreintiedig lle mae pobl yn cael trafferth i dalu eu biliau treth gyngor a bod arnynt angen y budd-daliadau hynny.

Rwyf wedi cymryd llawer o ymyriadau; rwy'n awyddus i fynd ymlaen â'r hyn sydd gennyf i'w ddweud. O ran setliadau Llywodraeth Cymru, nid y gwrthbleidiau yw'r unig rai sydd wedi bod yn anfodlon â rhai o'r setliadau. Yn 2007, teimlai Derek Vaughan, a oedd yn arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot ar y pryd, ac yn arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, fod y setliadau'n cosbi awdurdodau lleol ac y byddai'n anodd rheoli'r dreth gyngor oherwydd y lleihad mewn termau real yn y gwariant cyffredinol ar gyfer cynghorau lleol. Er bod hynny flynyddoedd yn ôl, nid yw ei osodiad ei bod yn anodd rheoli pan fo'r incwm gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n lleihau mewn termau real yn gywir, a chadarnhawyd hynny gan record cynghorau Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Yn ogystal â rheoli'r dreth gyngor, maent hefyd wedi llwyddo i gadw codiadau'r dreth gyngor yn isel, i fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau rheng flaen ac, mewn rhai achosion, i rewi'r dreth gyngor. Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig y mae angen ei wneud.

**Jenny Rathbone:** Mae arnaf eisiau gwneud yn siŵr eich bod yn cydnabod bod y Blaid Lafur, yng Nghaerdydd, wedi ymrwmo i rewi'r dreth gyngor, gan gofio nad yw cyflogau'n mynd i godi llawer iawn ac na ellir disgwyl i bobl dalu mwy. Fodd bynnag, bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cynyddu'r dreth gyngor 2.7 y cant.

**Peter Black:** Rydych yn hael iawn yn awgrymu y byddai Llafur yng Nghaerdydd yn rhewi'r dreth gyngor, ond pan oedd Llafur yn rhedeg y ddinas, gwelodd Caerdydd rai o'r codiadau treth gyngor mwyaf yng Nghymru—11 y cant ar gyfartaledd. Roedd yr uwch gynghorwyr hefyd ymhlith y rhai a oedd yn cael y cyflogau mwyaf—credaf fod Russell Goodway yn cael mwy o gyflog nag unrhyw arweinydd cyngor arall yng Nghymru. Nid yw record Llafur yn cadarnhau eich datganiad y byddai Llafur wedi sicrhau treth gyngor is yng Nghaerdydd. Pan oedd Llafur yn rhedeg y ddinas, roedd ganddi dreth gyngor uchel, roedd ganddi

Democrats have certainly transformed the city in that respect.

Before I finish, Presiding Officer, I want to highlight one other point, which is another good example of partnership in Swansea, in relation young people not in education, employment or training. Swansea is in the running for a national award as a result of the work that has been done. This is not down to the Liberal Democrats as such; this is down to the council working with other partners in the city. It is worth highlighting that fact, because Swansea has reduced the number of school leavers not in education, employment or training from 371 in 2005 to just 79, giving it some of the best and most improved performances in Wales. The scheme that it runs is an exemplar, not only in Wales, but in the UK.

5.00 p.m.

I say to everyone in the Chamber today that they should ask their local councils to look at what Swansea has done in that respect, because I think that if other councils replicated the partnership working that Swansea carried out on that particular issue, we could make a big difference in terms of getting young people into jobs around Wales.

*Gwelliant 1 William Graham*

*Dileu'r cyfan a rhoi yn ei le:*

*Yn annog rheolaeth ariannol ofalus ar ran pob awdurdod lleol i'w galluogi i rewi'r dreth gyngor.*

*Gwelliant 2 William Graham*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd.*

*Yn gresynu wrth fethiant Llywodraeth Cymru i drosglwyddo'r £38.9 miliwn o arian canlyniadol er mwyn gallu rhewi'r dreth gyngor ledled Cymru.*

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** I move amendments

record waeth na neb am ailgylchu, ac roedd ei record ym myd addysg yn un o'r rhai gwaethaf yng Nghymru. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn sicr wedi trawsnewid y ddinas yn hynny o beth.

Cyn imi orffen, Lywydd, hoffwn dynnu sylw at un pwynt arall, sef enghraifft dda arall o bartneriaeth yn Abertawe, yng nghyd-destun pobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant. Mae Abertawe'n cael ei hystyried ar gyfer gwobr genedlaethol o ganlyniad i'r gwaith a gyflawnwyd yno. Nid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sy'n gyfrifol am hyn fel y cyfryw; mae'n deillio o waith a gyflawnwyd gan y cyngor a phartneriaid eraill yn y ddinas. Mae'n werth tynnu sylw at y ffaith honno, oherwydd mae Abertawe wedi lleihau nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n gadael ysgol a heb fod mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant o 371 yn 2005 i ddim ond 79, gan sicrhau rhai o'r perfformiadau gorau, a'r gwelliannau mwyaf yng Nghymru. Mae ei chynllun yn esiampl i eraill, yng Nghymru, ac yn y DU.

Dywedaf wrth bawb sydd yn y Siambr heddiw y dylent ofyn i'w cynghorau lleol edrych ar yr hyn y mae Abertawe wedi'i wneud yn y cyswllt hwnnw oherwydd, yn fy marn i, pe bai cynghorau eraill yn efelychu'r trefniadau partneriaeth a welwyd yn Abertawe â'r mater penodol hwn, gallem wneud gwahaniaeth mawr a chael pobl ifanc i waith ledled Cymru.

*Amendment 1 William Graham*

*Delete all and replace with:*

*Encourages careful financial management on the part of all local authorities to enable them to implement a council tax freeze.*

*Amendment 2 William Graham*

*Add new point.*

*Regrets the failure of the Welsh Government to pass on the £38.9 million consequential in order to ensure a Wales-wide council tax freeze.*

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Cynigiau welliannau

1 and 2 in the name of William Graham.

I am pleased to move amendments 1 and 2 today, tabled, again, in the name of William Graham. I must say that when I saw the motion I had already come to the conclusion, with respect, that my colleague's sense of humour is almost as colourful as his ties.

Although today's motion tries to present the Lib Dems as friends of Welsh ratepayers, the fact of the matter is that they support Labour's policy of council tax rises, and it should be a cause of deep regret that, apart from the Welsh Conservatives, all parties in this Assembly support Labour's decision not to pass on £39 million of consequential funding to local authorities, thus denying taxpayers a much needed helping hand. Furthermore, our amendment 1 encourages all local authorities, regardless of their political composition, to manage their finances in a way that is sustainable and that provides real value for money.

**Peter Black:** I understand what you are saying about what we think about council tax. However, the Welsh Liberal Democrat councils in Wales have a better record on council tax than those of the Conservatives.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** It is not necessarily the case that voting for Liberal Democrat councillors is the best way to achieve that. Indeed, people would be right to question the competence of a party that, in control of Cardiff Council, thought it was acceptable to pay a private company treble time to dig a hole and fill it with rubbish allegedly destined for recycling.

Only the Welsh Conservatives have a serious agenda for change when it comes to empowering individuals and communities to scrutinise local authority spending. We would empower people by publishing all council expenditure online and provide communities with a referendum lock on excessive council tax rises. My colleague Antoinette Sandbach made reference to the fact that 85% of those councils in England have chosen to do just that. The Minister asked me what advantage a

1 a 2 yn enw William Graham.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gynnig gwelliannau 1 a 2 heddiw, sydd hefyd wedi cael eu cyflwyno yn enw William Graham. Rhaid imi ddweud, pan welais y cynnig, fy mod eisoes wedi dod i'r casgliad, â phob dyledus barch, fod synnwyr digrifwch fy nghyd-Aelod bron mor lliwgar â'i deis.

Er bod cynnig heddiw'n ceisio cyflwyno'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fel ffrindiau i dalwyr ardrethi Cymru, y gwir amdani yw eu bod yn cefnogi polisi Llafur o godi'r dreth gyngor, a dylai fod yn achos gofid mawr bod pob plaid yn y Cynulliad hwn, ar wahân i Geidwadwyr Cymru, yn cefnogi penderfyniad Llafur i beidio â throsglwyddo £39 miliwn o arian canlyniadol i awdurdodau lleol, a thrwy hynny'n amddifadu trethdalwyr o gymorth mawr ei angen. Yn ychwanegol at hynny, mae ein gwelliant rhif 1 yn annog pob awdurdod lleol, beth bynnag ei gyfansoddiad gwleidyddol, i reoli ei gyllid mewn ffordd gynaliadwy sy'n cynnig gwerth gwirioneddol am arian.

**Peter Black:** Rwy'n deall yr hyn rydych yn ei ddweud am ein barn ynglŷn â'r dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, mae record cynghorau Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yng nghyd-destun y dreth gyngor yn well nag un y Ceidwadwyr.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Nid pleidleisio dros gynghorwyr y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw'r ffordd orau o gyflawni hynny o reidrwydd. Yn wir, byddai pobl yn iawn i amau hyfedredd plaid a oedd yn credu, wrth reoli Cyngor Caerdydd, ei bod yn dderbyniol talu tair gwaith cymaint ag arfer i gwmni preifat wneud twll a'i lenwi â sbwriel yr honnid ei fod yn mynd i gael ei ailgylchu.

Dim ond Ceidwadwyr Cymru sydd ag agenda go iawn ar gyfer newid drwy roi grym i unigolion a chymunedau graffu ar wariant awdurdodau lleol. Byddem yn rhoi grym i bobl drwy gyhoeddi holl wariant cynghorau ar-lein a darparu clo refferendwm ar godiadau gormodol yn y dreth gyngor i gymunedau. Cyfeiriodd fy nghyd-Aelod Antoinette Sandbach at y ffaith bod 85 y cant o gynghorau Lloegr wedi dewis gwneud hynny. Gofynnodd y Gweinidog imi beth



referendum would have and what effect the referendum lock would have. We have always said that it acts as a deterrent, and the fact that 85% are working with a council tax freeze in England is testament to that. Whereas we would empower the people by publishing—

**David Rees:** In previous debates, we have heard how council tax in England has been frozen, and we have challenged you on that point. You are now talking about a figure of 85%, so that figure has fallen. How many of that 15% that are increasing taxes are Conservative councils?

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** It is fair to say that a great number of them are Conservative-led councils. We know that here, in Wales, we have Conservative-led councils that are already implementing a council tax freeze.

Only the Welsh Conservatives have a real and serious agenda for change when it comes to empowering individuals and communities to scrutinise local authority spending. Whereas we would empower people by publishing all council expenditure online and provide communities with a referendum lock on excessive council tax rises, the parties opposite want to stymie true transparency and accountability. Previously, in this Chamber, the Lib Dems have opposed our local referenda to safeguard low council tax rises, and the Labour Minister for local government has described publishing expenditure as onerous. Well, shame. Onerous or not, that is what the people of Wales want. These are disappointing responses from parties that are devoid of ideas on how to enhance democracy at the local level.

Finally, we have proven earlier today that it would have been possible to fund a blanket council tax freeze in Wales and still have enough money left to fund an added fiscal stimulus. Unfortunately, only the Welsh Conservatives support a council tax freeze as a matter of principle, and the people of Wales should be made aware of that.

fyddai mantais refferendwm a pha effaith y byddai'r clo refferendwm yn ei chael. Rydym bob amser wedi dweud ei fod yn gweithredu fel ataliad, ac mae'r ffaith bod 85 y cant yn gweithio mewn sefyllfa lle mae'r dreth gyngor wedi ei rhewi yn Lloegr yn brawf o hynny. Tra byddem ni'n rhoi grym i'r bobl drwy gyhoeddi—

**David Rees:** Mewn dadleuon blaenorol, clywsom sut y mae'r dreth gyngor yn Lloegr wedi cael ei rhewi, ac rydym wedi eich herio ynglŷn â'r pwynt hwnnw. Rydych yn siarad yn awr am ffigur o 85 y cant, felly mae'r ffigur hwnnw wedi gostwng. Faint o'r 15 y cant hwnnw sy'n cynyddu trethi sy'n gyngorau Ceidwadol?

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Mae'n deg dweud bod cryn dipyn ohonynt yn gyngorau sy'n cael eu harwain gan y Ceidwadwyr. Gwyddom, yma yng Nghymru, fod cyngorau sy'n cael eu harwain gan y Ceidwadwyr, eisoes yn rhewi'r dreth gyngor.

Dim ond Ceidwadwyr Cymru sydd ag agenda go iawn ar gyfer newid, ac sy'n edrych o ddifrif ar bethau, drwy roi grym i unigolion a chymunedau graffu ar wariant awdurdodau lleol. Tra byddem ni'n rhoi grym i bobl drwy gyhoeddi holl wariant cyngorau ar-lein a darparu clo refferendwm ar godiadau gormodol yn y dreth gyngor i gymunedau, mae ar y pleidiau gyferbyn eisiau atal gwir dryloywder ac atebolrwydd. Yn y gorffennol, yn y Siambr hon, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi gwrthwynebu ein refferenda lleol i ddiogelu codiadau isel yn y dreth gyngor, ac mae'r Gweinidog Llafur dros lywodraeth leol wedi disgrifio cyhoeddi gwariant fel rhywbeth beichus. Rhag ei gywilydd! Beichus neu beidio, dyna beth y mae ar bobl Cymru ei eisiau. Mae'r rhain yn ymatebion siomedig gan bleidiau nad oes ganddynt unrhyw syniad sut i wella democratiaeth leol.

Yn olaf, rydym wedi profi yn gynharach heddiw y byddai wedi bod yn bosibl inni ariannu cost rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru a bod â digon o arian ar ôl o hyd ar gyfer hwb ariannol ychwanegol. Yn anffodus, dim ond Ceidwadwyr Cymru sy'n cefnogi rhewi'r dreth gyngor fel mater o egwyddor, a dylid

sicrhau bod pobl Cymru'n ymwybodol o hynny.

**Eluned Parrott:** I had the most extraordinary dream: I dreamt that the Welsh Conservatives told us that theirs was the party of devolution and local government, and they were not laughing. I also dreamt that someone accused Peter Black of having a sense of humour, but that is not the case, as far as we are aware. [*Laughter.*] However, I have been looking forward to what I am sure will be a lively and interesting debate today.

**Eluned Parrott:** Cefais freuddwyd rhyfedd iawn: breuddwydiais fod Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi dweud wrthym mai eu plaid hwy oedd plaid datganoli a llywodraeth leol, ac nid oeddent yn chwerthin. Breuddwydiais hefyd fod rhywun wedi cyhuddo Peter Black o fod â synnwyr digrifwch, ond nid yw hynny'n wir, hyd y gwyddom. [*Chwerthin.*] Fodd bynnag, rwyf wedi bod yn edrych ymlaen at ddadl sy'n siŵr o fod yn un fywiog a diddorol heddiw.

I will address the amendments in a moment, but first I would like to consider some of the core principles that underpin good local government. Being a councillor is a difficult and challenging vocation and it is right that we all recognise the contribution that hard-working councillors make to their communities and to public life in Wales. I would like to take a moment to thank those individuals from all parties, as well as those who belong to no party, who give up their time to serve their communities. We have very high expectations of our local authorities, and rightly so, because they have huge power to deliver services that transform people's lives. That is why, over the past year, I have been so proud to work alongside the hard-working Lib Dem councillors across my region, but particularly the truly visionary leadership of Cardiff Council, where we share control with colleagues from Plaid Cymru.

Byddaf yn rhoi sylw i'r gwelliannau mewn munud, ond yn gyntaf hoffwn ystyried rhai o'r egwyddorion craidd sy'n sail i lywodraeth leol dda. Mae bod yn gynghorydd yn alwedigaeth anodd, sy'n cynnig her, ac mae'n briodol ein bod i gyd yn cydnabod y cyfraniad y mae cynghorwyr sy'n gweithio'n galed yn ei wneud i'w cymunedau ac i fywyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Hoffwn oedi am ychydig i ddiolch i'r unigolion hynny o bob plaid, yn ogystal â'r rhai hynny nad ydynt yn perthyn i unrhyw blaid, sy'n rhoi eu hamser i wasanaethu eu cymunedau. Mae gennym ddisgwyliadau uchel iawn o'n hawdurdodau lleol, yn gwbl briodol, oherwydd mae ganddynt bŵer aruthrol i gyflenwi gwasanaethau sy'n trawsnewid bywydau pobl. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi bod mor falch, yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, o gael gweithio ochr yn ochr â chynghorwyr y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sy'n gweithio'n galed iawn yn fy rhanbarth i, ac yn fwyaf arbennig, yn falch o arweiniad gwirioneddol weledigaethol Cyngor Caerdydd, lle rydym yn rhannu rheolaeth â chyfeillion o Blaid Cymru.

Central to the undoubted success of that administration has been a sense of balance, delivering the best possible services while keeping council tax low. Times are tough and people are struggling with the after-effects of Labour's catastrophic failure to manage the economy. Therefore, I am proud that Cardiff has delivered the lowest average council tax rises in the whole of Wales over the last four years. Those living in an average band D home in our capital city pay £936 per year; in stark contrast, in Labour-led Rhondda Cynon Taf, those living in band D homes pay a

Elfen ganolog o lwyddiant diamheuol y weinyddiaeth honno yw'r ymdeimlad o gydbwysedd, gan gyflenwi'r gwasanaethau gorau posibl a chadw'r dreth gyngor yn isel. Mae'n gyfnod anodd ac mae pobl yn ymlafnio ag ôl-ffeithiau methiant trychinebus Llafur i reoli'r economi. Felly, rwy'n falch bod Caerdydd wedi sicrhau'r codiadau treth gyngor isaf ar gyfartaledd drwy Gymru yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Mae'r rhai hynny sy'n byw mewn cartref band D cyffredin yn ein prif ddinas yn talu £936 y flwyddyn; mewn

staggering £1,149.

gwrthgyferbyniad llwyr, mae'r rhai hynny sy'n byw mewn cartrefi band D yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, dan arweiniad Llafur, yn talu swm aruthrol o £1,149.

**David Rees:** Will you take an intervention?

**David Rees:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

**Eluned Parrott:** In a moment.

**Eluned Parrott:** Mewn munud.

Do the residents of Rhondda Cynon Taf really believe that they are getting services that are worth £213 per year more than those in Cardiff, or are they simply paying through the nose to keep their council leader, Russell Roberts, in the lifestyle to which he has become accustomed? Of course, under Labour, Cardiff was a byword for huge council tax rises and huge egos to go with it. However, that is just half the picture: we have kept council taxes low while delivering exceptional local services and transforming Cardiff into the vibrant, modern and ambitious capital city that we are all so proud of. We have shown leadership and vision to drive forward Cardiff's economy and create new jobs and facilities—investing in the city centre and facilities such as St David's 2. The administration in Cardiff has invested a record £180 million in school buildings; it has saved the iconic Cathays library and others threatened with closure by Russell Goodway's disastrous Labour administration, and opened new ones; it has created community hubs around those places so that local people have a place to enjoy the services that we are delivering for them. We have also worked with local communities to deliver alley gates, to tackle anti-social behaviour and, at a stroke, halve the cost of clearing fly tipping, saving £0.5 million every year and, at the same time, removing a blight from people's lives. This is clever, effective local government of which we and Plaid Cymru are justly proud.

A yw trigolion Rhondda Cynon Taf yn credu mewn gwirionedd bod y gwasanaethau y maent hwy'n eu cael yn werth £213 y flwyddyn yn fwy na'r rhai hynny yng Nghaerdydd, ynteu a dynt yn talu drwy eu trwynau er mwyn sicrhau bod arweinydd eu cyngor, Russell Roberts, yn gallu cadw'r ffordd o fyw y mae wedi arfer â hi? Wrth gwrs, dan Lafur, roedd Caerdydd yn ddihareb am ei chodiadau treth gyngor aruthrol ac am ei hunanfalachder hefyd. Fodd bynnag, dim ond hanner y darlun yw hynny: rydym ni wedi cadw'r dreth gyngor yn isel gan ddarparu gwasanaethau lleol eithriadol a thrawsnewid Caerdydd i'r brifddinas fywiog, fodern ac uchelgeisiol yr ydym i gyd mor falch ohoni. Rydym wedi dangos arweiniad a gweledigaeth i hybu economi Caerdydd a chreu swyddi a chyfleusterau newydd—buddsoddi yng nghanol y ddinas ac mewn cyfleusterau fel Dewi Sant 2. Mae'r weinyddiaeth yng Nghaerdydd wedi buddsoddi £180 miliwn mewn adeiladau ysgolion, sy'n fwy nag erioed o'r blaen; mae wedi arbed llyfrgell eiconig Cathays ac eraill a oedd dan fygythiad o gael eu cau dan weinyddiaeth Lafur drychinebus Russell Goodway, ac agor rhai newydd; mae wedi creu canolfannau cymunedol o amgylch y lleoedd hynny er mwyn i bobl leol gael lle i fwynhau'r gwasanaethau rydym yn eu darparu iddynt. Rydym hefyd wedi gweithio gyda chymunedau lleol i ddarparu clwydi clo, i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a haneru cost clirio tipio anghyfreithlon ar unwaith, gan arbed £0.5 miliwn bob blwyddyn a chael gwared ar y felltith hon ar fywydau pobl yr un pryd. Mae hon yn llywodraeth leol glyfar, effeithiol y mae gennym ni a Phlaid Cymru le i fod yn falch ohoni.

Turning to the amendments, I absolutely agree with the principle of careful financial management that the Conservatives have

Gan droi at y gwelliannau, rwy'n cytuno'n llwyr â'r egwyddor o reolaeth ariannol ofalus y cyfeiriodd y Ceidwadwyr ati, ond ni allwn

mentioned, but we cannot support amendment 1, obviously, as it deletes most, or all, of our motion. We will also not be supporting amendment 2. It might have been mentioned in passing that we were very pleased to support the targeting of money towards creating apprenticeships, boosting the economy and tackling fuel poverty in our poorest communities by working in a spirit of collaboration with the Welsh Labour Government. I make no apologies for that, because, frankly I am proud of it.

**Mike Hedges:** First, I would like to say that it does the National Assembly for Wales no good whatsoever to be seen fighting the local government elections in Wales by proxy. I hope that, after Thursday, it will be decided that local government debates should not take place in the Chamber during the purdah period prior to council elections. We are the law-making body in Wales and here we are engaging in the fourth local government debate since returning after the Easter recess. I am deeply interested in local government, but even I think that that might be slightly excessive. I will be very interested to see whether we have the same level of interest next year when local government elections will be held only in Ynys Môn.

The Liberal Democrats want us to welcome the careful financial management of the Liberal Democrat-led authorities that has enabled them to keep council tax rises low over the last eight years. I only know about one Liberal Democrat-led authority, and that is Swansea, so my remarks will be solely about that.

First, let us look at council tax. Council tax in Swansea has increased by £234.42 since the Liberal Democrats started to set it eight years ago. That represents an almost £20 a month rise. My constituents are not convinced that this is keeping council tax rises low. Yes, the council tax has been frozen this year, but that has been done by putting money into a contingency fund each year and using it in an election year to freeze council tax. That is a cynical ploy that I am sure that the electorate in Swansea will see through.

gefnogi gwelliant 1, wrth gwrs, gan ei fod yn dileu'r rhan fwyaf, os nad y cyfan, o'n cynnig ni. Ni fyddwn ychwaith yn cefnogi gwelliant 2. Mae'n bosibl bod rhywun wedi dweud wrth fynd heibio ein bod yn falch iawn o gefnogi targedu arian tuag at greu prentisiaethau, hybu'r economi a mynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd yn ein cymunedau tlotaf drwy symud ymlaen mewn ysbryd o gydweithio â Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru. Nid wyf yn ymddiheuro am hynny, oherwydd, yn y bôn, rwy'n falch o hynny.

**Mike Hedges:** Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddweud nad yw'n gwneud unrhyw les o gwbl i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gael ei weld yn ymladd etholiadau llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru drwy ddirprwy. Rwy'n gobeithio, ar ôl dydd Iau, y penderfynir na ddylai dadleuon llywodraeth leol gael eu cynnal yn y Siambr yn ystod y cyfnod purdah cyn etholiadau cynghorau. Ni yw'r corff gwneud deddfau yng Nghymru a dyma ni'n cael y bedwaredd ddadl ar lywodraeth leol ers dychwelyd ar ôl toriad y Pasg. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb mawr mewn llywodraeth leol, ond yr wyf fi hyd yn oed yn meddwl y gallai hynny fod yn ormod. Bydd yn ddiddorol iawn gweld a fydd yr un diddordeb yn cael ei ddangos y flwyddyn nesaf pan gynhelir etholiadau lleol ar Ynys Môn yn unig.

Mae ar y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol eisiau inni groesawu rheolaeth ariannol ofalus yr awdurdodau sy'n cael eu harwain gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sydd wedi eu galluogi i gadw codiadau'r dreth gyngor yn isel yn ystod yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf. Abertawe yw'r unig awdurdod dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol y gwn i amdano, felly bydd fy sylwadau'n ymwneud â hynny yn unig.

Yn gyntaf, gadewch inni edrych ar y dreth gyngor. Mae'r dreth gyngor yn Abertawe wedi cynyddu £234.42 ers i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddechrau ei phennu wyth mlynedd yn ôl. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o bron £20 y mis. Nid yw fy etholwyr wedi eu hargyhoeddi bod hyn yn cadw codiadau'r dreth gyngor yn isel. Do, mae'r dreth gyngor wedi cael ei rhewi eleni, ond gwnaethpwyd hynny drwy roi arian mewn cronfa wrth gefn bob blwyddyn a'i ddefnyddio mewn blwyddyn etholiad i rewi'r dreth gyngor.

Stynt sinigaidd yw hynny ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd yr etholwyr yn Abertawe'n gweld drwyddi.

Next, I want to talk about the council's IT system, namely 'service@Swansea'. [*Interruption.*] We shall see what the electorate says. Let us wait for the results tomorrow. The debate on the £0.75 million spent on an abandoned payroll system was held in private so that it could not be reported in the press. Then, because the opposition councillors wanted to hold the debate in public, every single one of them was reported to the ombudsman. Tens of millions of pounds have been spent on new IT systems that have failed to achieve the proposed savings. Those that said that the systems would never deliver the proposed savings were derided as Luddites, although we were proven to be correct as, one by one, the savings failed to materialise.

Yn nesaf, hoffwn sôn am system TG y cyngor, sef 'service@Swansea'. [*Torri ar draws.*] Cawn weld beth fydd gan yr etholwyr i'w ddweud. Gadewch inni aros am y canlyniadau yfory. Cafodd y ddadl ar y £0.75 miliwn a wariwyd ar system gyflogres y rhoddwyd y gorau iddi ei chynnal yn breifat fel na ellid adrodd amdani yn y wasg. Yna, gan fod ar gynghorwyr yr wrthblaid eisiau cynnal y ddadl yn gyhoeddus, anfonwyd enw pob un ohonynt at yr ombudsmen. Gwariwyd miliynau ar filiynau o bunnoedd ar systemau TG newydd sydd wedi methu â chyflawni'r arbedion arfaethedig. Cafodd y rhai hynny a ddywedodd na fyddai'r systemau byth yn cyflawni'r arbedion arfaethedig eu gwatwar am beidio â symud gyda'r oes, ond ni welwyd yr arbedion, a phrofwyd ni'n gywir.

Savings have been made, especially in education. Swansea is twenty first of the 22 Welsh local authorities in terms of the level of expenditure on schools—it has gone down from being twentieth last year. Before the Lib Dems say that it is all the fault of the Welsh Government, which seems to be their default position on most things, Swansea had the seventeenth highest education indicator-based assessment, so why is it twenty first on education expenditure? It is about Lib Dem priorities: new IT systems over our children's education.

Mae arbedion wedi cael eu gwneud, yn enwedig ym maes addysg. Mae Abertawe yn unfed ar hugain o'r 22 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru o ran gwariant ar ysgolion—mae wedi disgyn o fod yn yr ugeinfed safle y llynedd. Cyn i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddweud mai bai Llywodraeth Cymru yw hyn oll, a dyna beth y maent yn ei ddweud am y rhan fwyaf o bethau, roedd Abertawe yn yr ail safle ar bymtheg o ran yr asesiad addysg sydd wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion, felly pam y mae yn yr unfed safle ar hugain o ran gwariant addysg? Mae a wnelo hyn â blaenoriaethau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol: rhoi systemau TG newydd cyn addysg ein plant.

**Peter Black:** You will also know that Swansea is the seventh highest local education authority in terms of key stage 4 GCSE results. Are you not more concerned about the outcomes rather than how much money is going in?

**Peter Black:** Byddwch hefyd yn gwybod bod Abertawe yn y seithfed safle ar restr yr awdurdodau addysg lleol ar sail canlyniadau TGAU cyfnod allweddol 4. Onid yw'r canlyniadau'n bwysicach na faint o arian sy'n cael ei wario?

**Mike Hedges:** I am certainly keen on the outcomes, but I think that you said earlier this year that we needed more money for education. In fact, that is how we got the budget through the Assembly, because you said that more funding would improve outcomes. So, you are saying that money

**Mike Hedges:** Rwy'n sicr yn awyddus i weld y canlyniadau gorau, ond credaf eich bod wedi dweud yn gynharach eleni bod arnom angen rhagor o arian ar gyfer addysg. Yn wir, dyna sut y cawsom y gyllideb drwy'r Cynulliad, gan eich bod chi wedi dweud y byddai rhagor o arian yn gwella canlyniadau.

sometimes helps, but sometimes it does not.

Only 97.7 of the education indicator-based assessment in Swansea is being spent on education, which equates to a £3 million shortfall in spending on schools. As the headteachers' forum said, funding in Swansea schools is significantly lower than in the schools of all our South West and Mid Wales Consortium partners, putting city schools at a considerable disadvantage when regionalisation gathers pace. [*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Please do not make comments from a sedentary position. I would also advise speakers not to answer them when they are made, as that will be ruled as being out of order.

**Mike Hedges:** I was expecting an intervention about the shortfall in the money coming from central Government.

On social services, children's services in Swansea were in special measures for years. There were also massive annual overspends, giving the appearance of a complete lack of control.

Finally, in some places the Lib Dems would be ruled as being out of order because it is factually wrong. I urge everyone to agree that, post Thursday, debates on local government, much as I enjoy them and would hope to have one every week, should not take place in the local government purdah period. They do not do this Assembly any good whatsoever, even though I really do enjoy them.

**Aled Roberts:** I hope that most of you do not come to the conclusion that I have been invited to speak third in this debate on the basis that my colleague Eluned Parrott is trying to get the support of Plaid Cymru for the motion because they are our coalition partners in Cardiff, whereas I need to ensure that the Conservatives vote for this motion, because, in fact, the Conservatives and Plaid

Felly, rydych yn dweud bod arian yn helpu ambell waith, ond dro arall nad yw.

Dim ond 97.7 o'r asesiad addysg wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion yn Abertawe sy'n cael ei wario ar addysg, ac mae hyn yn cyfateb i ddiffyg o £3 miliwn mewn gwariant ar ysgolion. Fel y dywedodd y fforwm penaethiaid, mae cyllid ysgolion Abertawe yn llawer iawn llai nag ysgolion pob un o'n partneriaid yng Nghonsortium De-orllewin a Chanolbarth Cymru, sy'n golygu y bydd ysgolion y ddinas dan anfantais fawr pan fydd mwy o gyfrifoldebau'n cael eu datganoli i'r rhanbarthau. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Peidiwch â gwneud sylwadau ar eich eistedd os gwelwch yn dda. Byddwn yn cynghori siaradwyr i beidio â'u hateb pan fyddant yn cael eu gwneud, gan y bydd hynny'n cael ei ystyried allan o drefn.

**Mike Hedges:** Roeddwn yn disgwyl ymyriad ynglŷn â'r diffyg yn yr arian sy'n dod oddi wrth y Llywodraeth ganolog.

O ran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, roedd gwasanaethau plant yn Abertawe yn destun mesurau arbennig am flynyddoedd. Roedd yno hefyd orwariant blynyddol aruthrol, ac roedd hynny'n rhoi'r argraff nad oedd unrhyw reolaeth o gwbl.

Yn olaf, mewn rhai lleoedd byddai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cael eu hystyried allan o drefn gan fod y ffeithiau'n anghywir. Rwy'n mwynhau dadleuon am lywodraeth leol a byddwn yn hoffi cael un bob wythnos, ond rwy'n annog pawb i gytuno, ar ôl dydd Iau, na ddylai dadleuon ar lywodraeth leol gael eu cynnal yn ystod cyfnod purdah llywodraeth leol. Rwy'n eu mwynhau'n fawr, ond nid ydynt yn gwneud unrhyw ddaioni i'r Cynulliad hwn.

**Aled Roberts:** Rwy'n gobeithio nad yw'r rhan fwyaf ohonoch yn dod i'r casgliad fy mod wedi cael gwahoddiad i siarad yn drydydd yn y ddadl hon oherwydd bod fy nghyd-Aelod Eluned Parrott yn ceisio cael cefnogaeth Plaid Cymru i'r cynnig gan mai hwy yw ein partneriaid clymblaid yng Nghaerdydd, tra mae arnaf fi angen sicrhau bod y Ceidwadwyr yn pleidleisio o blaid y

Cymru are within the coalition in Wrexham.

cynnig hwn, gan fod y Ceidwadwyr a Phlaid Cymru, mewn gwirionedd, yn rhan o'r glymblaid yn Wrecsam.

Careful financial planning does not just result in lower council tax bills, but can also lead to more effective services. With regard to Mike Hedges's point about the backdrop to the two opposition debates this afternoon, although I as a Liberal Democrat want to underline the achievements of the Liberal Democrats in Wrexham, I also want to acknowledge the fact that the council system in Wrexham is based on a politically balanced executive board, where all parties are represented and feature in the discussions.

Mae cynllunio ariannol gofalus yn arwain at filiau treth gyngor is, a gall hefyd arwain at wasanaethau mwy effeithiol. O ran pwynt Mike Hedges ynglŷn â'r hyn sydd y tu ôl i ddwy ddadl yr wrthblaid y prynhawn yma, er fy mod i fel Democrat Rhyddfrydol yn awyddus i bwysleisio llwyddiannau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Wrecsam, rwyf hefyd yn awyddus i gydnabod bod system y cyngor yn Wrecsam yn seiliedig ar fwrdd gweithredol sydd â chydbwysedd gwleidyddol, lle mae pob plaid yn cael ei chynrychioli ac yn cymryd rhan yn y trafodaethau.

5.15 p.m.

In the seven years that I was council leader, I would have welcomed a situation in which the Labour group could have accepted portfolios on the executive board, something it could not do because of internal party rules, because I felt that there were members of the Labour group who could have contributed to the running of the council administration in Wrexham. However, on that basis, 40 of the 52 councillors in Wrexham took part in the preparation of the budget this year, and I have to say that the Labour opposition supported the budget in the council.

Yn y saith mlynedd y bŵm yn arweinydd y cyngor, byddwn wedi croesawu sefyllfa lle byddai'r grŵp Llafur wedi gallu derbyn portffolios ar y bwrdd gweithredol, rhywbeth na allai ei wneud oherwydd rheolau mewnol y blaid, gan fy mod yn teimlo y byddai rhai aelodau o'r grŵp Llafur wedi gallu cyfrannu tuag at redeg gweinyddiaeth y cyngor yn Wrecsam. Fodd bynnag, ar y sail honno, cymerodd 40 o'r 52 cynghorydd yn Wrecsam ran yn y gwaith o baratoi'r gyllideb eleni, a rhaid imi ddweud bod yr wrthblaid Llafur wedi cefnogi'r gyllideb yn y cyngor.

I believe that the actions of the Wrexham local authority have led to costs being contained while there has been an improvement in many of the council's services. This has been seen in areas such as elderly social care, where, rather than having one process for all elderly adaptations, which would mean residents waiting months on end for, in some cases, quite simple work to be carried out, initial assessments were fast-tracked and not assessed by an occupational therapist. This has reduced waiting times from more than five months to two weeks. In the same way, the reshaping of the in-house homecare service allowed for the introduction of a reablement service led by the council's in-house team. This means that all people discharged from hospital have support from the in-house homecare team for the first six weeks. As a result, 40% of

Credaf fod gweithredoedd awdurdod lleol Wrecsam wedi llwyddo i gadw costau dan reolaeth ynghyd â gwella llawer o wasanaethau'r cyngor. Gwelwyd hyn mewn meysydd megis gofal cymdeithasol i'r henoed. Yn hytrach na chael un broses ar gyfer yr holl addasiadau ar gyfer yr henoed, a fyddai'n golygu, mewn rhai achosion, bod preswylwyr yn aros am fisoedd lawer am waith digon syml, cafodd y broses asesiadau cychwynnol ei chyflymu drwy beidio â chynnwys asesiad gan therapydd galwedigaethol. Mae hyn wedi lleihau'r amser aros o dros bum mis i bythefnos. Yn yr un modd, o ganlyniad i ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth gofal cartref mewnol roedd modd inni gyflwyno gwasanaeth ail-alluogi dan arweiniad tîm mewnol y cyngor. Mae hyn yn golygu bod pawb sy'n cael ei ryddhau o'r ysbyty'n cael cefnogaeth gan y tîm gofal

residents who would previously have been automatically transferred to homecare no longer require the service. That meant that that budget could be reinvested to ensure that more people were allowed to live independent lives, while the council maintained the financial prudence our residents should all expect.

In the same way, the way forward is not to get too tied up with ideology, which means that, although you allow for mixed service provision, you ensure that there are robust monitoring arrangements to maintain standards while keeping budgets under control. It was important that part of the approach taken by the Lib Dems in Wrexham meant that we were able to maintain cross-party consensus for the introduction of these mixed systems of work and reject other ideological techniques, such as electronic tendering, which would have meant that the emphasis was on price alone rather than quality.

There have been difficult decisions along the way. We increased the spend on education, not by as much as we wanted, but we have done it. The involvement of all political parties in the process, albeit under Liberal Democrat leadership, has led to people seeing a real improvement in services in Wrexham while ensuring that council tax rises were kept under control.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae Aled Roberts, wrth gyfeirio at waith yr awdurdod lleol yn Wrexham, eisoes wedi cyfeirio at gyfraniad y tri aelod Plaid Cymru a'u cyfraniad i'r modd mae'r cyngor wedi'i weithredu. Yng Nghaerdydd, bu cydnabyddiaeth o'r ffaith bod chwe aelod Plaid Cymru yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at y modd mae Cyngor Caerdydd yn darparu gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl yn y brifddinas. Mae hyd yn oed Peter Black wedi cydnabod bod cael un aelod Plaid Cymru yn Abertawe sydd yn gadeirydd pwyllgor craffu yn gallu gwneud byd o wahaniaeth i'r ffordd mae Dinas a Chyngor Abertawe yn cael ei weinyddu gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

cartref mewnol am y chwe wythnos gyntaf. O ganlyniad, nid oes ar 40 y cant o'r preswylwyr a fyddai wedi cael eu trosglwyddo'n awtomatig i ofal cartref cyn hyn angen y gwasanaeth hwnnw mwyach. Felly, gellid ail-fuddsoddi'r gyllideb honno er mwyn sicrhau bod mwy o bobl yn gallu byw bywydau annibynnol, tra byddai'r cyngor yn cadw'r doethineb ariannol y dylai pob un o'n preswylwyr ei ddisgwyl.

Yn yr un modd, y ffordd ymlaen yw peidio ag ymwneud gormod ag ideoleg, hynny yw, er eich bod yn sicrhau bod modd darparu gwasanaethau cymysg, rydych yn sicrhau bod trefniadau monitro cadarn yn bodoli er mwyn cadw safonau a chadw cyllidebau dan reolaeth. Roedd yn bwysig bod rhan o'r dull gweithredu a fabwysiadwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Wrexham yn golygu ein bod yn gallu cadw consensws trawsbleidiol ynglŷn â chyflwyno'r systemau gwaith cymysg hyn a gwrthod technegau ideolegol eraill, megis tandro electronig, a fyddai wedi golygu bod y pwyslais ar bris yn unig yn hytrach nag ansawdd.

Mae penderfyniadau anodd wedi cael eu gwneud. Cynyddasom y gwariant ar addysg, nid cymaint ag y byddem wedi hoffi gwneud, ond yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny. Gan fod pob un o'r pleidiau gwleidyddol wedi bod yn rhan o'r broses, dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, mae pobl yn gweld gwelliant gwirioneddol mewn gwasanaethau yn Wrexham ac mae codiadau yn y dreth gyngor yn cael eu cadw dan reolaeth.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Aled Roberts, in referring to the local authority in Wrexham, has already mentioned the contribution made by the three Plaid Cymru members and their contribution to the way in which the council has operated. In Cardiff, there has been recognition of the fact that the six Plaid Cymru members contribute a great deal to the way in which Cardiff Council makes provision for people in the capital city. Even Peter Black has recognised that having one Plaid Cymru member in Swansea who is the chair of a scrutiny committee can make a world of difference to the way the City and County of Swansea is administered by the Liberal Democrats.



Rhaid i mi gyfaddef, pan welais fod y cynnig hwn wedi cael ei gyflwyno gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, tybiais fod Peter wedi bod yn pendroni yn hwyr y nos ynghylch beth y gallai cynnig fel dadl ar awdurdodau lleol cyn y pleidleisio yfory a'i fod wedi penderfynu yn y pen draw y byddai'n sôn am lwyddiannau awdurdodau a arweinir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Rwyf yn falch iawn ei fod ef yn y pen draw wedi cyfeirio at y mae aelodau Plaid Cymru wedi dylanwadu ar y penderfyniadau yn y tri awdurdod hynny a arweinir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'i fod yn cydnabod bod Plaid Cymru, hyd yn oed yn Abertawe, lle dim ond un aelod sydd gennym, yn gwneud byd o wahaniaeth i'r modd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn darparu ar gyfer pobl yng Nghymru. Felly, rwy'n hapus i orffen fy nghyfraniad gyda hynny a dweud ein bod yn ddiolchgar i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gyfeirio'r etholwyr yng Nghymru at y ffaith bod Plaid Cymru yn gwneud gwahaniaeth o ran y modd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn gwasanaethu pobl Cymru.

**Kenneth Skates:** Thank you for letting me speak in this important debate today. I am somewhat concerned about how this debate will be perceived outside of this Chamber. I might be new and somewhat naive but, even to me, the purpose of today's debate is painfully transparent and cynical in its intentions. After all, the debate has been introduced by someone who is seeking re-election tomorrow as a Lib Dem Swansea councillor. It is a bit like the host of the Oscars using his platform to promote his latest movie; it just feels wrong. That said, I agree that tomorrow's elections are a critical judgment on local performance. However, they are also, in part, a verdict on the UK coalition Government and on the Welsh Labour Government. No election takes place in splendid isolation. It would be naive to think so, and it would be disingenuous to claim so.

In Wrexham county borough, my vote on polling day will be cast in favour of a fresh start, against the current political leadership

I must admit that, when I saw that this motion had been tabled by the Liberal Democrats, I thought that Peter must have been thinking long and hard late into the night about what he could propose as a debate on local authorities before the votes tomorrow and that he eventually decided that he would talk about the successes of Liberal Democrat-led local authorities. I am very pleased that he eventually made reference to the way in which Plaid Cymru members have influenced the decisions in those three authorities led by the Liberal Democrats and that he acknowledges the fact that Plaid Cymru, even in Swansea, where we only have one member, can make a world of difference to the way that local authorities provide for people in Wales. Therefore, I am pleased to conclude my contribution with that and to say that we are grateful to the Liberal Democrats for pointing the voters in Wales to the fact that Plaid Cymru makes a difference in terms of how local authorities serve the people of Wales.

**Kenneth Skates:** Diolch am adael imi siarad yn y ddadl bwysig hon heddiw. Rwyf braidd yn bryderus ynglŷn â sut y bydd y ddadl hon yn cael ei gweld y tu allan i'r Siambr hon. Efallai fy mod yn newydd ac ychydig yn naïf ond, hyd yn oed i mi, mae pwrpas dadl heddiw yn boenus o dryloyw ac yn sinigaidd ei bwriadau. Wedi'r cyfan, mae'r ddadl wedi cael ei chyflwyno gan rywun sy'n ceisio cael ei ailethol yfory fel cynghorydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Abertawe. Mae'n debyg i ryw raddau i gyflwynydd yr Oscars yn defnyddio'i lwyfan i hyrwyddo'i ffilm ddiweddaraf; nid yw'n teimlo'n iawn. Wedi dweud hynny, rwy'n cytuno bod etholiadau yfory'n ddyfarniad hollbwysig ar berfformiad lleol. Fodd bynnag, maent hefyd, yn rhannol, yn ddyfarniad ar Lywodraeth glymblaid y DU ac ar y Llywodraeth Lafur yng Nghymru. Nid oes unrhyw etholiad yn digwydd mewn arwahanrwydd gogoneddus. Byddem yn naïf pe baem yn tybio hynny, a byddem yn anonest pe baem yn honni hynny.

Ym mwrdeistref sirol Wrecsam, bydd fy mhleidlais i ar y diwrnod pleidleisio'n cael ei bwrw o blaid dechrau newydd, yn erbyn yr

in Wrexham and the current political leadership in Westminster, which it sadly mirrors, but which adds Plaid Cymru to the mix. The Lib Dem leadership that we currently have at Wrexham Guildhall is not providing the vision, the ideas or the competent political management we need. A perfect example of this is the poor partnership working in relation to which I was asked to intervene very recently. It involved the chaotic nature of school transport funding. The decision of Wrexham council to stop funding school buses between Ysgol Dinas Brân and its traditional catchment area of Chirk caused uproar and considerable anxiety. The impasse was only resolved when the school in Llangollen chose to put pupils first and paid itself for the future transport costs for learners that were vital to the future survival of the school. I applaud the school and its dynamic team of governors and teachers for leading on this issue. However, that was something that the governing political leadership at Wrexham Guildhall should have taken responsibility for. The Liberal Democrats talk about holding down council tax, but neglect to admit that the cost is a hit on education.

**Aled Roberts:** Ken, would you accept that the policy was passed following two years of debate and that it allows for the transport of pupils to their nearest school? Would you also accept that the nearest school for most of those pupils is Ysgol Rhiwabon in Ruabon, which is a band 1 school? Would you also pay tribute to the teachers at that school for their achievements?

**Kenneth Skates:** Absolutely. Actually, Ysgol Dinas Brân is also a band 1 school. The problem here is small mindedness and a refusal to collaborate—not by the officers; the officers have been engaged in collaboration. It is a political problem. The politicians at Wrexham council have refused to collaborate with Denbighshire, and that is what has held it back. For all of their attempts to take us on some magical mystery tour of Kodak moments for their party, the Liberal

arweiniad gwleidyddol presennol yn Wrecsam a'r arweiniad gwleidyddol presennol yn San Steffan, y mae'n anffodus yn ei adlewyrchu, ond yn ychwanegu Plaid Cymru at y cyfuniad. Nid yw'r arweiniad presennol sydd gennym yn Neuadd y Dref, Wrecsam, dan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn darparu'r weledigaeth, y syniadau na'r rheolaeth wleidyddol hyfedr sydd ei hangen arnom. Enghraifft berffaith o hyn yw'r bartneriaeth wael y gofynnwyd i mi ymyrryd yn ei chylch yn ddiweddar iawn. Roedd yn ymwneud â llanastr llwyr â'r trefniadau ariannu cludiant i ysgolion. Arweiniodd penderfyniad cyngor Wrecsam i roi'r gorau i ariannu bysiau ysgol rhwng Ysgol Dinas Brân a'i dalgylch traddodiadol yn y Waun at gryn stŵr a llawer iawn o bryder. Ni lwyddwyd i ddatrys y sefyllfa nes i'r ysgol yn Llangollen ddewis rhoi disgyblion yn gyntaf a thalu costau cludiant dysgwyr ei hun yn y dyfodol, gan eu bod yn hanfodol i oroesiad yr ysgol. Rwy'n canmol yr ysgol a'i thîm dynamig o lywodraethwyr ac athrawon am ddangos arweiniad â'r mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr arweiniad gwleidyddol mewn grym yn Neuadd y Dref yn Wrecsam ddylai fod wedi ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb am hyn. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn siarad am gadw'r dreth gyngor yn isel, ond nid ydynt yn cyfaddef mai addysg fydd yn talu'r gost.

**Aled Roberts:** Ken, a fydddech yn derbyn bod y polisi wedi cael ei basio yn dilyn dwy flynedd o drafod a'i fod yn caniatáu i ddisgyblion gael eu cludo i'w hysgol agosaf? A fydddech hefyd yn derbyn mai'r ysgol agosaf i'r rhan fwyaf o'r disgyblion hynny yw Ysgol Rhiwabon, sy'n ysgol band 1? A fydddech hefyd yn rhoi teyrnged i'r athrawon yn yr ysgol honno am yr hyn y maent wedi ei gyflawni?

**Kenneth Skates:** Yn sicr. Fel mae'n digwydd, mae Ysgol Dinas Brân hefyd yn ysgol band 1. Y broblem yma yw meddyliau unplyg a chyndynrwydd i gydweithredu—nid ar ran y swyddogion; mae'r swyddogion wedi bod yn cydweithio. Problem wleidyddol yw hon. Mae'r gwleidyddion yng nghyngor Wrecsam wedi gwrthod cydweithio â sir Ddinbych, a dyna sydd wedi dal popeth yn ôl. Er gwaethaf eu holl ymdrechion i fynd â ni ar ryw daith ddirgel hudolus o eiliadau Kodak

Democrats' greatest achievement in an entire generation is their grubby claim on power in Westminster, achieved through the ditching of their principles. Right now, Nick Clegg looks like Pinocchio on fantasy island, enjoying the opulence of Westminster power, but struggling to take responsibility for his actions. It is fine for him; in two years' time, he will probably be given another unelected place in the European Commission, but his legacy will remain. He has transformed his party members into subordinate Tory poodles. Their principles have drained away, just like their colour. Whereas they were once a strong orange, the colour of carrots, they are now just a bunch of lemons. Tomorrow, the good people of Wales will deliver them a short, sharp and damning verdict.

**The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant):** I am grateful for the opportunity to respond to this debate. I refer Members to the debates last week with regard to the Government's position in terms of my response. The Government's position has not changed.

I place on record my thanks to the many councillors of many parties and independent councillors across Wales for the work that they have done for their local communities. I wish them all well. Regardless of the interventions made by many Members in the Chamber today, the reality in terms of the democratic process is what will take place tomorrow. I have a slight political bias in hoping that there will be a pro-Welsh Labour response on the ground tomorrow, but we have seen the polls and we will possibly have another debate on the outcome of the local elections. As I said, I wish them all well and wish Members a hasty retreat from the doorstep tomorrow.

**Kirsty Williams:** If nothing else, after the local elections tomorrow, I expect that it will be another 12 months before we talk about local government again, and Carl Sargeant will be able to take a weight off. I am sure that he will miss the opportunity to speak on Wednesday afternoons. I will begin with the contribution of Janet Finch-Saunders. I am

eu plaid, llwyddiant mwyaf y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol mewn cenedlaeth gyfan yw crafu i hawlio grym yn San Steffan, a thrwy daflu eu hegwyddorion o'r neilltu y maent wedi cael hynny. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Nick Clegg yn edrych fel Pinocchio â'i ben yn y cymylau, yn mwynhau ysblander grym San Steffan, ond yn methu'n glir ag ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb am ei weithredoedd. Mae'n iawn iddo ef; ymhen dwy flynedd, mae'n debyg y bydd yn cael cyfle anetholedig arall yn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, ond bydd ei waddol yn aros. Mae wedi troi aelodau ei blaid yn gŵn bach Toriaidd israddol. Maent wedi colli eu hegwyddorion, yn ogystal â'u lliw. Lle'r oeddent unwaith yn lliw oren cryf, fel moron, maent bellach yn debycach i lemonau. Yfory, bydd pobl Cymru'n rhoi dyfarniad byr, llym a damniol iddynt.

**Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant):** Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i ymateb i'r ddadl hon. Cyfeiriaf yr Aelodau at y dadleuon yr wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â safbwynt y Llywodraeth yng nghyswllt fy ymateb i. Nid yw safbwynt y Llywodraeth wedi newid.

Hoffwn gofnodi fy niolch i'r cynghorwyr niferus o wahanol bleidiau ac i'r cynghorwyr annibynnol ledled Cymru am y gwaith caled y maent wedi ei wneud er budd eu cymunedau lleol. Dymunaf yn dda i bob un ohonynt. Er gwaetha'r ymyriadau a wnaethpwyd gan lawer o Aelodau yn y Siambr heddiw, y realiti o ran y broses ddemocrataidd yw'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd yfory. Mae gennyf rywfaint o ragfarn wleidyddol gan fy mod yn gobeithio y bydd cefnogaeth i Lafur Cymru ar lawr gwlad yfory, ond rydym wedi gweld yr arolygon barn ac mae'n bosibl y bydd gennym ddadl arall ar ganlyniad yr etholiadau lleol. Fel y dywedais, dymunaf yn dda i bob un ohonynt gan obeithio y bydd yr Aelodau yn ôl o garreg y drws yn fuan yfory.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn anad dim, ar ôl yr etholiadau lleol yfory, disgwyliaf y bydd 12 mis arall yn mynd heibio cyn y byddwn yn siarad am lywodraeth leol eto, ac y bydd llai o bwysau ar Carl Sargeant. Rwy'n siŵr y bydd yn colli'r cyfle i siarad ar brynhawn Mercher. Dechreuaf â chyfraniad Janet Finch-Saunders. Mae arnaf ofn ei bod yn

afraid that she is wrong: Peter Black does not have a sense of humour, and there is nothing funny about the ties that he wears. However, that is not the only thing that she got wrong in her contribution today. The reality with regard to landfill in Cardiff is that Cardiff puts some 6% of its refuse into landfill, which is way below the national average, and we have seen a huge rise in the amount of recycling that has gone on in Cardiff since the Liberal Democrats took over leadership of the council.

May we finally put to bed this issue around the council tax consequential? You would swear, from the way that the Tory party goes on about this money, that Carl Sargeant has kept it for his personal pie fund. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] That is not the case. Carl Sargeant has not kept this money to himself. It has been used to create jobs and training opportunities, to build new homes, to increase the energy efficiency of some of our poorest households, to improve our school buildings, and to kick-start the construction industry in Wales—goodness knows that if ever there were an industry that needs a kick-start, it is the construction industry.

I do not understand your obsession with referenda on council tax. The Welsh Liberal Democrats do not need a referendum to keep council tax low; they do it as a matter of course, because they understand that that is what local communities need.

My colleagues Eluned and Aled, with great panache, talked about the improvements that have occurred in Cardiff and Wrexham under the leadership of Liberal Democrat councillors, ably assisted by Plaid Cymru members—although I suspect, Rhodri Glyn, that Bethan could have done without the constant reminders that you have just one councillor in Swansea. However, we are grateful for their contribution. If we are talking about Swansea, we have to talk about Mike Hedges. Mike, the reality with regard to council tax in Swansea is that it has gone up in the last eight years, but it has gone up at half the rate that it was going up in the time when you were in that chamber. Under the

anghywir: nid oes gan Peter Black synnwyr digrifwch, ac nid oes dim byd yn ddoniol am y teis y mae'n eu gwisgo. Fodd bynnag, nid dyna'r unig beth a gafodd yn anghywir yn ei chyfraniad heddiw. Y gwir amdani, o ran tirlenwi yng Nghaerdydd, yw bod Caerdydd yn anfon tua 6 y cant o'i gwastraff i safleoedd tirlenwi, sy'n llawer is na'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol, ac yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd aruthrol mewn ailgylchu yng Nghaerdydd ers i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ddod i arwain y cyngor.

A gawn ni roi taw unwaith ac am byth ar y mater hwn ynghylch arian canlyniadol y dreth gyngor? Byddech yn taeru, o'r ffordd y mae'r blaid Doriaidd yn rhygnu ymlaen am yr arian hwn, bod Carl Sargeant wedi ei gadw ar gyfer ei gronfa basteiod ei hun. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Nid yw hynny'n wir. Nid yw Carl Sargeant wedi cadw'r arian hwn iddo ef ei hun. Mae wedi cael ei ddefnyddio i greu swyddi a chyfleoedd hyfforddiant, i adeiladu cartrefi newydd, i gynyddu effeithlonrwydd ynni rhai o'n haelwydydd tlotaf, i wella adeiladau ein hysgolion, ac i roi hwb i'r diwydiant adeiladu yng Nghymru—os bu ar unrhyw ddiwydiant angen hwb erioed, yna'n sicr i chi, y diwydiant adeiladu yw hwnnw.

Nid wyf yn deall eich obsesiwn â refferenda ar y dreth gyngor. Nid oes ar Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru angen refferendwm er mwyn cadw'r dreth gyngor yn isel; maent yn gwneud hynny fel mater o drefn, gan eu bod yn deall mai dyna beth y mae ar gymunedau lleol ei angen.

Siaradodd fy nghyd-Aelodau, Eluned ac Aled, yn huawdl iawn, am y gwelliannau sydd wedi'u gwneud yng Nghaerdydd ac yn Wrecsam dan arweiniad cynghorwyr y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, â chymorth medrus aelodau Plaid Cymru—er fy mod yn amau, Rhodri Glyn, y byddai'n well gan Bethan pe na bai wedi cael ei hatgoffa fwy nag unwaith mai dim ond un cynghorydd sydd gennych yn Abertawe. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn ddiolchgar am eu cyfraniad. Os ydym yn siarad am Abertawe, rhaid inni siarad am Mike Hedges. Mike, y realiti o ran y dreth gyngor yn Abertawe yw ei bod wedi codi yn yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf, ond ar hanner y cyflymder yr oedd yn codi pan

Labour Party, council tax rises in Swansea averaged 8% per year. Under the Liberal Democrat-led council, council tax rises have been less than 4% a year, half of what your lot was doing. It is also useful to remind you that council tax levels for a band D property in Swansea are some £230 lower than they are in the neighbouring Neath Port Talbot authority.

**Mike Hedges:** I think that we get hung up on percentages. The percentage figures are right, but the actual amount is roughly the same in terms of pounds, and people spend pounds, not percentages. Neath Port Talbot and other local authorities were in the position that they were in following reorganisation and always have higher council tax rates than the big cities.

**Kirsty Williams:** The reality is that council tax levels in Swansea have risen at half the rate at which they were rising when the city was under Labour control and, of course, this year, they have been frozen.

Ken, like Janet Finch-Saunders, fundamentally misunderstands the character of my colleague Peter Black. His approach to writing motions is like his ties—there is nothing subtle about it. However, what was really worrying about Ken's contribution this afternoon was when he said that he was going to vote for change in his constituency tomorrow, but he could not outline a single thing that the Labour Party in Wrexham is proposing.

5.30 p.m.

Your contribution was exactly the same as the messages that have characterised everything that the Labour Party has said in this election campaign. It is not about its vision for Wrexham, Cardiff, Swansea or any of our other communities; the only thing that you have said is to send a message to Westminster. There has been no vision or ambition for the communities of Wales.

**Kenneth Skates:** Perhaps you can tell us

oeddech chi yn y siambr honno. Dan y Blaid Lafur, roedd codiadau'r dreth gyngor yn Abertawe yn 8 y cant y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd. Dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, mae'r cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor wedi bod yn llai na 4 y cant y flwyddyn, hanner y cyflymder dan eich criw chi. Mae hefyd yn werth eich atgoffa bod y dreth gyngor ar gyfer eiddo band D yn Abertawe tua £230 yn is nag ydyw yn awdurdod cyfagos Castell-nedd Port Talbot.

**Mike Hedges:** Rwy'n credu ein bod yn poeni'n ormodol am ganrannau. Mae'r canrannau'n gywir, ond mae'r gwir swm yr un fath fwy neu lai o ran punnoedd, a phunnoedd y mae pobl yn eu gwario, nid canrannau. Roedd Castell-nedd Port Talbot ac awdurdodau lleol eraill yn y sefyllfa yr oeddent ynddi ar ôl ad-drefnu ac mae ganddynt bob amser gyfraddau treth gyngor uwch na'r dinasoedd mawr.

**Kirsty Williams:** Y realiti yw bod y dreth gyngor yn Abertawe wedi codi ar hanner y cyflymder yr oedd yn codi pan oedd y ddinas dan reolaeth Llafur ac eleni, wrth gwrs, mae wedi cael ei rhewi.

Nid yw Ken, na Janet Finch-Saunders, yn deall cymeriad fy nghyd-Aelod Peter Black o gwbl. Mae ei ddull ef o ysgrifennu cynigion yn debyg i'w deis—yn lliwgar. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn yn poeni'n fawr iawn ynglŷn â chyfraniad Ken y prynhawn yma pan ddywedodd ei fod yn mynd i bleidleisio o blaid newid yn ei etholaeth yfory, ond ni allai amlinellu un peth y mae'r Blaid Lafur yn Wrecsam yn ei gynnig.

Roedd eich cyfraniad yr un fath yn union â'r negeseuon sydd wedi bod yn nodweddiadol o bopeth y mae'r Blaid Lafur wedi ei ddweud yn yr ymgyrch etholiadol hon. Nid oes a wnelo hyn â'i gweledigaeth ar gyfer Wrecsam, Caerdydd, Abertawe nac unrhyw gymuned arall; yr unig beth yr ydych wedi sôn amdano yw anfon neges i San Steffan. Ni welwyd unrhyw weledigaeth nac uchelgais i gymunedau Cymru.

**Kenneth Skates:** Efallai y gallwch ddweud

why Nick Clegg, during his visit to Wrexham, decided to run away from voters and go into the meeting by the back door? Are you proud of Nick Clegg and his alliance with the Conservatives at Westminster?

**Kirsty Williams:** Ken, I remember when Labour Ministers were closing my Remploy factory in Ystradgynlais and would not show us the courtesy of looking at the individual circumstances of those people. I am not to take any lectures from a Labour Party politician on the future of Remploy, because I have seen at first hand the contempt in which you have held those people. If only your colleagues could have been as excited about Remploy then as they claim to be now. My colleagues at Westminster are making tough decisions, clearing up the mess left behind by your party. If you had a vision for Wrexham or anywhere else in Wales, you would have focused on that in recent weeks rather than on trying to turn this into a referendum on London.

Tomorrow, people will have their opportunity to send people from their communities to represent them in county halls across Wales. The Welsh Liberal Democrats have demonstrated what they can do when they have control over those councils. That is a record that I am particularly proud of, and one that I am clear about and happy to fight on.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly gohiriaf bob pleidlais o dan yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Voting deferred until voting time.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before we proceed to voting time, are there three Members who wish for the bell to be rung?

**William Graham:** Yes, please.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Clerk, ring the bell. *[Interruption.]* I beg your pardon. I had assumed that three Members of your

wrthym pam y penderfynodd Nick Clegg, yn ystod ei ymweliad â Wrecsam, osgoi'r pleidleiswyr a mynd i'r cyfarfod drwy'r drws cefn? A ydych yn falch o Nick Clegg a'i gynghrair â'r Ceidwadwyr yn San Steffan?

**Kirsty Williams:** Ken, rwy'n cofio pan oedd Gweinidogion Llafur yn cau fy ffatri Remploy yn Ystradgynlais ac yn rhy anghwrtais i edrych ar amgylchiadau unigol y bobl hynny. Nid wyf am wrando ar bregeth am ddyfodol Remploy gan wleidydd o'r Blaid Lafur, oherwydd yr wyf wedi gweld drosaf fy hun y ffordd yr ydych wedi dirmygu'r bobl hynny. Gresyn na fyddai eich cyd-Aelodau wedi gallu bod mor gyffrous ynglŷn â Remploy bryd hynny ag y maent yn honni eu bod yn awr. Mae fy nghydweithwyr yn San Steffan yn gwneud penderfyniadau anodd, wrth glirio'r llastr a adawyd gan eich plaid chi. Pe bai gennych weledigaeth ar gyfer Wrecsam neu unrhyw le arall yng Nghymru, byddech wedi canolbwyntio ar hynny yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf yn hytrach na cheisio troi hyn yn refferendwm ar Lundain.

Yfory, bydd cyfle i bobl anfon unigolion o'u cymunedau i'w cynrychioli mewn neuaddau sir ledled Cymru. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi dangos beth y gallant ei wneud pan fydd ganddynt reolaeth dros y cynghorau hynny. Mae honno'n record yr wyf yn falch iawn ohoni, ac yn un yr wyf yn ei deall yn iawn ac yn barod i frwydro drosti.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is that the motion be agreed without amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there are objections, and so I defer all voting on this item until voting time.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn symud ymlaen i'r cyfnod pleidleisio, a oes tri Aelod yn dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu?

**William Graham:** Oes, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Glerc, canwch y gloch. *[Torri ar draws.]* Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Roeddwn wedi cymryd bod tri Aelod o'ch

group supported that request, William. grŵp yn cefnogi'r cais hwnnw, William.  
 However, as that is not the case, we will Fodd bynnag, gan nad oes, awn ymlaen.  
 proceed.

### Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Cynnig NDM4972: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
 Motion NDM4972: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Byron  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Ramsay, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniwi, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Keith  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Julie  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Parrott, Eluned  
 Powell, William  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Rees, David  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Skates, Kenneth  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4972: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 10.  
 Amendment 1 to NDM4972: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniwi, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Chapman, Christine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Byron

Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Keith  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Julie  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Parrott, Eluned  
 Powell, William  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Rees, David  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Skates, Kenneth  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Ramsay, Nick

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4972: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.  
 Amendment 2 to NDM4972: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniwi, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Keith  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Julie  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Byron  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Parrott, Eluned  
 Powell, William  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Williams, Kirsty



Rees, David  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Cafodd gwelliannau 3 a 4 eu dad-ddethol.  
Amendments 3 and 4 were deselected.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM4972: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5 to NDM4972: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Keith  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Julie  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Ramsay, Nick  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Williams, Kirsty

Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 6 i NDM4972: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 17.  
Amendment 6 to NDM4972: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 17.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Keith  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Julie  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Ramsay, Nick  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4972 fel y'i diwygiwyd:*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. Yn nodi:*

*a) y manteision i economi Cymru a fyddai'n dod yn sgîl rhagor o wariant ar seilwaith;*

*b) yr arian canlyniadol gwerth £38.9m gan Lywodraeth y DU o ganlyniad i gyllido rhewi'r dreth gyngor yn Lloegr ac yn credu y dylid defnyddio'r arian hwn i ysgogi economi Cymru, gan gynnwys helpu busnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru.*

*Motion NDM4972 as amended:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Notes:*

*a) the benefits increased spending on infrastructure would bring to the Welsh economy;*

*b) the £38.9m consequential from the UK Government as a result of funding for a council tax freeze in England and believes this should be used to stimulate the Welsh economy, including helping SMEs in Wales.*

2. *Yn galw am dryloywder, atebolrwydd ac effeithlonrwydd llwyr mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, yn cynnwys gwneud gwell defnydd o wariant ar seilwaith.*
2. *Calls for full transparency, accountability and efficiency in public expenditure in Wales, including making better use of infrastructure spending.*
3. *Yn nodi bod 16 Cyngor Ceidwadol yn Lloegr ac un yng Nghymru wedi methu â dilyn polisi'r blaid Geidwadol wrth iddynt gynyddu'r dreth gyngor eleni.*
3. *Notes that 16 Conservative councils in England and one in Wales have failed to follow Conservative party policy and are increasing council tax this year.*

*Cynnig NDM4972 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 10.  
Motion NDM4972 as amended: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Keith  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
James, Julie  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Ramsay, Nick

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig NDM4972 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM4972 as amended agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4973: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 41.  
Motion NDM4972: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 41.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter  
Parrott, Eluned  
Powell, William  
Roberts, Aled  
Williams, Kirsty

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Keith  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Julie  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Ramsay, Nick  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Sargeant, Carl  
Skates, Kenneth  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4973: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 1 to NDM4973: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Byron  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Ramsay, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Keith  
Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina

Hedges, Mike  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Julie  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Parrott, Eluned  
 Powell, William  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Rees, David  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Skates, Kenneth  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4973: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
 Amendment 2 to NDM4973: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Byron  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Ramsay, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniwi, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Keith  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Julie  
 Jenkins, Bethan  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Parrott, Eluned  
 Powell, William  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Rees, David  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Skates, Kenneth  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon

Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment not agreed.*

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Gofal Hosbis a Gofal Lliniarol yng Nghymru Hospice and Palliative Care in Wales

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I ask those Members leaving the Chamber please to do so quickly and quietly. I call Mark Isherwood to introduce the subject that he has chosen.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A fyddai'r Aelodau hynny sy'n gadael y Siambr cystal â gwneud hynny'n gyflym ac yn dawel os gwelwch yn dda. Galwaf ar Mark Isherwood i gyflwyno'r pwnc y mae wedi'i ddewis.

**Mark Isherwood:** I am chair of the cross-party group on hospices and palliative care, and my speech today is composed entirely of contributions made by people and professionals working in the sector. I will be taking contributions from Andrew R.T. Davies, William Graham and Kirsty Williams. I also thank Jenny Rathbone for her e-mail wishing me good luck for this debate.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fi yw cadeirydd y grŵp trawsbleidiol ar hosbisau a gofal lliniarol, ac mae fy araith heddiw wedi'i llunio'n gyfan gwbl gyda chyfraniadau gan bobl a gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n gweithio yn y sector. Byddaf yn derbyn cyfraniadau gan Andrew R.T. Davies, William Graham a Kirsty Williams. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i Jenny Rathbone am ei neges e-bost yn dymuno'n dda imi ar gyfer y ddadl hon.

It is now five and a half years since I organised an event in the Assembly attended by representatives of almost every hospice based or working in Wales. They had argued for years that they had provided respite care, residential palliative care and hospice care in the home as add-on services that save the NHS money. As the population ages and people approach the end of life with ever more complex care needs, facilitating access to cost-effective, high-quality palliative and end-of-life care will become ever more important.

Mae pum mlynedd a hanner wedi mynd heibio bellach ers imi drefnu digwyddiad yn y Cynulliad a fynychwyd gan gynrychiolwyr o bron bob hosbis a oedd wedi'i lleoli yng Nghymru neu'n gweithio yng Nghymru. Roeddent wedi dadlau ers blynnyddoedd eu bod yn darparu gofal seibiant, gofal lliniarol preswyl a gofal hosbis yn y cartref fel gwasanaethau ychwanegol a oedd yn arbed arian i'r GIG. Wrth i'r boblogaeth heneiddio ac wrth i bobl nesáu at ddiwedd eu hoes gydag anghenion gofal mwy a mwy cymhleth, bydd hwyluso mynediad at ofal lliniarol a gofal diwedd oes costeffeithiol o safon uchel yn dod yn fwyfwy pwysig.

Hospice care is one of Wales's greatest success stories. Across Wales, local charitable hospices care for more than 5,000 people affected by terminal illnesses each year. Hospices are owned by the communities they serve, commanding widespread public support. The latest figures show that demand for hospice care is increasing. There is growing acknowledgement across the health and

Mae gofal hosbis yn un o lwyddiannau mwyaf Cymru. Bob blwyddyn, ar hyd a lled Cymru, bydd hosbisau elusennol lleol yn gofalu am fwy na 5,000 o bobl y mae salwch angheuol yn effeithio arnynt. Mae'r hosbisau'n eiddo i'r cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethu, ac meant yn mynnu cefnogaeth eang gan y cyhoedd. Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf yn dangos bod y galw am ofal hosbis ar gynnydd. Ar draws y

social care sectors of the benefits of hospice and palliative care for people who have cancer and non-cancer diagnoses, and the commitment to increasing care that supports people to die where they choose.

The number of people who die each year in Wales is expected to rise, and our ageing population means that hospices are also increasingly seeing people with complex health needs, often involving care for more than one condition. The number of new patients seeking support from local independent hospices across the UK has increased by more than 15% during the past four years. There are lessons the NHS can learn from hospices, especially about the integration of care services in the home, community, hospital and hospice. Despite the pressures of public spending, NHS investment in palliative care must be sustained. It is vital that hospices be given three-year service level agreements as a minimum at current funding levels to enable them to continue to deliver their invaluable services.

During 2011, more than £500 million was input by the independent hospice sector across the UK, including more than £22 million in Wales. The average statutory funding varies greatly across the UK. In England, 34% of funding is received from the statutory sector. In Scotland, it is 39% and in Northern Ireland, 29.5%. However, Wales receives just 24%, with significant variations across the country. For every £1 that the Welsh Government invests in local charitable hospices—and I include the Welsh NHS in that—hospices deliver around £4-worth of care for people who have life-limiting and terminal illnesses and their families.

Hospice in-patients across Wales would also benefit greatly from a capital investment programme for hospice care, which would enable local charitable hospices to modernise their facilities and continue to provide them. Evidence from other parts of the UK

sectorau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, mae mwy a mwy o gydnabyddiaeth yn cael ei rhoi i fanteision gofal hosbis a gofal lliniarol i bobl â chanser a phobl â chyflyrau nad ydynt yn ganser, ac i'r ymrwymiad i sicrhau rhagor o ofal sy'n cynorthwyo pobl i farw lle maent yn dewis.

Disgwylir y bydd cynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n marw bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru, ac mae ein poblogaeth sy'n heneiddio yn golygu bod hosbisau hefyd yn gweld mwy a mwy o achosion o bobl ag anghenion iechyd cymhleth, gan olygu gofal ar gyfer mwy nag un cyflwr yn aml iawn. Mae nifer y cleifion newydd sy'n ceisio cymorth gan hosbisau annibynnol lleol ledled y DU wedi cynyddu mwy na 15 y cant yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Gall y GIG ddysgu gan hosbisau, yn enwedig ynghylch integreiddio gwasanaethau gofal yn y cartref, yn y gymuned, mewn ysbytai ac mewn hosbisau. Er gwaethaf pwysau gwariant cyhoeddus, rhaid cynnal buddsoddiad y GIG mewn gofal lliniarol. Mae'n hollbwysig bod hosbisau'n cael cytundebau lefel gwasanaeth tair blynedd o leiaf ar y lefelau cyllido presennol, er mwyn eu galluogi i barhau i ddarparu eu gwasanaethau amhrisiadwy.

Yn ystod 2011, roedd cyfraniad y sector hosbisau annibynnol ledled y DU yn fwy na £500 miliwn, gan gynnwys mwy na £22 miliwn yng Nghymru. Mae'r cyllid statudol cyfartalog yn amrywio'n fawr ar draws y DU. Yn Lloegr, derbynnir 34 y cant o gyllid gan y sector statudol. Yn yr Alban, mae'r ffigur yn 39 y cant ac yng Ngogledd Iwerddon mae'n 29.5 y cant. Fodd bynnag, dim ond 24 y cant y mae Cymru'n ei dderbyn, gydag amrywiadau sylweddol ar draws y wlad. Am bob £1 y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei buddsoddi mewn hosbisau elusennol lleol—ac rwyf yn cynnwys GIG Cymru yn hynny—mae hosbisau'n darparu gwerth oddeutu £4 o ofal ar gyfer pobl â salwch angheuol neu salwch sy'n cyfyngu ar eu hoes, ynghyd â'u teuluoedd.

Byddai cleifion mewnol mewn hosbisau ar hyd a lled Cymru hefyd yn elwa'n fawr o raglen buddsoddi cyfalaf ar gyfer gofal hosbis, a fyddai'n galluogi hosbisau elusennol lleol i foderneiddio eu hadnoddau a pharhau i'w darparu. Mae tystiolaeth o rannau eraill

demonstrates that such investment has a dramatic impact on the experience of care for people affected by terminal illness. The NHS and local hospices should work in partnership to care for their local communities. Investment in hospice care by the NHS maximises the support provided to local people and helps the NHS to deliver improvements in care.

The Chartered Society of Physiotherapy reports that, in north Wales, the allied health professions are looking at how the cancer rehabilitation standards are implemented. There are only a handful of professionals who are specialists in the field of palliative care, and they report significant clinical workloads. A significant proportion of the posts are paid for by the third sector. In north-east Wales, physiotherapy posts at the hospice are fully funded by the hospice. In central north Wales, the post at the hospice is on a service level agreement with the health board, but is funded by the hospice. In north-west Wales, only 14 hours a week are funded by the health board. In the past, the hospice there had a breathlessness clinic, funded by Macmillan Cancer Support for two years, but there was no commitment from the health board to continue to fund it, so it was stopped.

The Chartered Society of Physiotherapy believes that there is a clear need for the health boards to work with the hospices on the provision of services and supporting clinicians who are specialists in their field. Physiotherapy can prevent admissions to hospital and support patients with challenging complex conditions, such as motor neurone disease, to stay at home. Physiotherapists work closely with health professionals in the community and in hospital settings, yet resources are limited. Services from professions like physiotherapy will be ever more vital to provide people with a quality of life in the palliative care phase of their lives. Health and social care planners need to build this into workforce planning and organisational development.

The Motor Neurone Disease Association's

o'r DU yn dangos bod buddsoddiad o'r fath yn cael effaith ddramatig ar brofiadau gofal pobl y mae salwch angheuol yn effeithio arnynt. Dylai'r GIG a hosbisau lleol weithio ar y cyd i ofalu am eu cymunedau lleol. Os yw'r GIG yn buddsoddi mewn gofal hosbis, mae hynny'n golygu bod y cymorth gorau posibl yn cael ei ddarparu i bobl leol, gan helpu'r GIG i wella'r gofal sy'n cael ei ddarparu.

Yn ôl y Gymdeithas Siartredig Ffisiotherapi, yn y gogledd, mae'r proffesiynau perthynol i iechyd yn edrych ar y modd y mae'r safonau adsefydlu ar ôl canser yn cael eu gweithredu. Dim ond llond llaw o weithwyr proffesiynol sy'n arbenigo ym maes gofal lliniarol, a soniant am nifer uchel o lwythi gwaith clinigol. Y trydydd sector sy'n talu am gyfran sylweddol o'r swyddi. Yn y gogledd-ddwyrain, mae swyddi ffisiotherapi yn yr hosbis yn cael eu cyllido'n llawn gan yr hosbis. Yng nghanol y gogledd, mae'r swydd yn yr hosbis ar gytundeb lefel gwasanaeth gyda'r bwrdd iechyd, ond mae'n cael ei chyllido gan yr hosbis. Yn y gogledd-orllewin, dim ond 14 awr yr wythnos y mae'r bwrdd iechyd yn ei gyllido. Yn y gorffennol, roedd gan yr hosbis honno glinig diffyg anadl, a oedd yn cael ei gyllido gan Gymorth Canser Macmillan am ddwy flynedd, ond nid oedd unrhyw ymrwymiad gan y bwrdd iechyd i barhau i'w gyllido, felly daeth y clinig i ben.

Mae'r Gymdeithas Siartredig Ffisiotherapi yn credu bod angen clir i'r byrddau iechyd weithio gyda'r hosbisau i ddarparu gwasanaethau ac i gefnogi clinigwyr sy'n arbenigwyr yn eu maes. Gall ffisiotherapi atal derbyniadau i'r ysbyty a chynorthwyo cleifion â chyflyrau cymhleth a heriol, fel clefyd niwronau motor, i aros gartref. Mae ffisiotherapyddion yn gweithio'n agos gyda gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn y gymuned ac mewn ysbytai, ac eto mae'r adnoddau'n gyfyngedig. Bydd gwasanaethau proffesiynol fel ffisiotherapi yn fwy hanfodol byth i roi ansawdd bywyd i bobl sydd yn y cyfnod gofal lliniarol o'u bywydau. Mae angen i gynllunwyr iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol sicrhau bod hyn yn rhan o'r prosesau ar gyfer cynllunio'r gweithlu a datblygu sefydliadol.

Mae adroddiad y Gymdeithas Clefyd



report, 'Meeting the needs of people with MND in Wales', calls on the Welsh Government to ensure access to specialist palliative care, adding that:

'There has been significant progress made in providing specialist palliative care for people with MND in Wales although there is still some way to go.'

Welsh hospices provide high-quality care to patients, families and carers, as well as training and support for other health and social care professionals. Hospices also work with other care settings, such as care homes or prisons, visiting patients as required and providing ongoing support and monitoring of patients as well as support and education to staff. Charitable hospices continue to face various obstacles that statutory and private providers do not. For example, hospices are unusual in that they face dual regulation, both as healthcare providers and as charities. Costs and delays result from duplication and one-size-fits-all regulatory requirements.

Charitable providers of hospice and palliative care across the UK have expressed concern at the inequity of the NHS being able to recover value-added tax on certain non-business supplies, while the charitable providers of NHS services cannot—the VAT trap. Help the Hospices and Hospices Cymru are currently supporting the UK Treasury in its review of this issue. It is important to recognise that hospice and palliative care is not simply about providing a healthcare service. In a more competitive environment, intelligent commissioning should also give consideration to social value.

5.45 p.m.

Charitable providers of hospice care generate significant amounts of social capital, engaging communities in a number of different ways, be that through fundraising, volunteering or in the wider sense of the hospice belonging to the community. In

Niwronau Motor, 'Diwallu anghenion pobl â Chlefyd Niwronau Motor (MND) yng Nghymru', yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau mynediad at ofal lliniarol arbenigol, gan ychwanegu:

'Bu cynnydd arwyddocaol yn y ddarpariaeth gofal lliniarol arbenigol i gleifion MND yng Nghymru, er bod llawer o le i wella.'

Mae hosbisau Cymru yn darparu gofal o safon uchel i gleifion, eu teuluoedd a'u gofalgwyr, ac yn rhoi hyfforddiant a chefnogaeth i weithwyr iechyd a gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol proffesiynol eraill. Mae hosbisau'n gweithio gyda chanolfannau gofal eraill hefyd, fel cartrefi gofal neu garchardai, gan ymweld â chleifion yn ôl yr angen, darparu cymorth parhaus a monitro cleifion, yn ogystal â rhoi cymorth ac addysg i staff. Mae hosbisau elusennol yn parhau i wynebu gwahanol rwystrau nad yw darparwyr statudol a phreifat yn eu hwynebu. Er enghraifft, mae hosbisau'n anarferol gan eu bod yn wynebu rheoleiddio deuol—fel darparwyr gofal iechyd ac fel elusennau. Maent yn gorfod wynebu costau ac oedi o ganlyniad i ddyblygu a gofynion rheoleiddio sydd yr un fath i bawb.

Mae'r rheini sy'n darparu gofal hosbis a gofal lliniarol elusennol ledled y DU wedi mynegi pryder ynghylch annhegwch y ffaith bod y GIG yn gallu adennill treth ar werth ar rai cyflenwadau nad ydynt yn ymwneud â busnes, ond nad oes modd i ddarparwyr elusennol gwasanaethau'r GIG wneud hynny—y trap TAW. Mae Help the Hospices a Hosbisau Cymru wrthi'n cynorthwyo Trysorlys y DU i adolygu'r mater hwn. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod mwy i ofal hosbis a gofal lliniarol na darparu gwasanaeth gofal iechyd. Mewn amgylchedd mwy cystadleuol, dylai prosesau comisiynu deallus ystyried gwerth cymdeithasol hefyd.

Mae darparwyr gofal hosbis elusennol yn cynhyrchu llawer o gyfalaf cymdeithasol, gan ymgysylltu â chymunedau mewn nifer o wahanol ffyrdd, boed hynny drwy godi arian, drwy wirfoddoli neu yn yr ystyr ehangach lle mae'r hosbis yn perthyn i'r gymuned. Yn

addition to providing care to more than 5,000 patients across Wales each year, local charitable hospices give advice and support to other organisations such as the NHS and care homes.

All children's hospice and palliative care in-patient units in Wales—two with 15 beds—are run by the voluntary sector. Seven adult palliative care in-patient units are run by independent voluntary hospices, with the voluntary sector providing 83 adult in-patient beds, compared with 59 provided by the NHS. A total of 73% of hospice-at-home care is provided by independent voluntary hospices, with 11 voluntary sector providers compared with four NHS providers. Most hospice care is provided in people's own homes, but care is provided in a variety of settings, including day care and in-patient hospices when people are not able or do not wish to stay at home. Most hospices in Wales offer a 24-hour service, which is accessible to families and healthcare professionals at any time during daytime hours, evenings, nights and weekends. Hospices provide homecare services throughout Wales, with 10 charitable providers of homecare. Over half of day care is provided by independent voluntary hospices, with 12 voluntary sector providers providing day care services.

Hospices contribute significantly to health and social care in Wales. As stated, independent hospices spend more than £22 million per year caring for patients, carers and families. The majority of funding to support the work of local hospices comes from the communities that they serve. Levels of statutory funding for hospices in Wales as a proportion of expenditure have fallen over recent years, to just 24% of costs. As in England, there has been great variation between the funding levels of different hospices, between 19% and 49%, but overall, hospices in Wales receive less Government

ogystal â darparu gofal i fwy na 5,000 o gleifion ledled Cymru bob blwyddyn, mae hosbisau elusennol lleol yn rhoi cyngor a chefnogaeth i sefydliadau eraill fel y GIG a chartrefi gofal.

Mae pob hosbis i blant a phob uned gofal lliniarol ar gyfer cleifion mewnol yng Nghymru—dau ohonynt gyda 15 gwely—yn cael eu rhedeg gan y sector gwirfoddol. Mae saith uned gofal lliniarol ar gyfer oedolion sy'n gleifion mewnol yn cael eu rhedeg gan hosbisau gwirfoddol annibynnol, gyda'r sector gwirfoddol yn darparu 83 o welyau ar gyfer oedolion sy'n gleifion mewnol, o'i gymharu â'r 59 sy'n cael eu darparu gan y GIG. Mae cyfanswm o 73 y cant o ofal hosbis yn y cartref yn cael ei ddarparu gan hosbisau gwirfoddol annibynnol, gydag 11 o ddarparwyr yn y sector gwirfoddol o'i gymharu â'r pedwar darparwr GIG. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o ofal hosbis yn cael ei ddarparu yng nghartrefi pobl, ond darperir gofal mewn amrywiaeth o leoliadau, gan gynnwys mewn hosbisau gofal dydd a hosbisau sy'n derbyn cleifion mewnol pan na fydd pobl yn gallu aros yn eu cartrefi, neu pan nad ydynt yn dymuno gwneud hynny. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o hosbisau yng Nghymru yn cynnig gwasanaeth 24 awr, sy'n hygyrch i deuluoedd ac i weithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol ar unrhyw adeg yn ystod oriau dydd, fin nos, dros nos ac ar benwythnosau. Mae hosbisau'n darparu gwasanaethau gofal cartref ledled Cymru, gyda 10 o ddarparwyr gofal cartref elusennol. Mae dros hanner y gofal dydd yn cael ei ddarparu gan hosbisau gwirfoddol annibynnol, gyda 12 o ddarparwyr yn y sector gwirfoddol yn darparu gwasanaethau gofal dydd.

Mae hosbisau'n cyfrannu'n sylweddol at iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Fel y nodwyd, mae hosbisau annibynnol yn gwario mwy na £22 miliwn y flwyddyn yn gofalu am gleifion, gofaluwyr a theuluoedd. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r cyllid ar gyfer cefnogi gwaith hosbisau lleol yn dod o'r cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethu. Mae lefelau cyllido statudol hosbisau yng Nghymru fel cyfran o'r gwariant wedi gostwng dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, i ddim ond 24 y cant o'r costau. Fel yn Lloegr, bu gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng lefelau cyllido gwahanol hosbisau—rhwng 19 y cant a 49 y cant—ond

funding as a proportion of expenditure than those in England, Scotland or Northern Ireland. Funding also varies widely across Wales and can change year-on-year, subject to service level agreements with local health boards. Investment in hospice care is cost-effective, maximises the support provided to local people and helps the NHS to deliver improvements in care.

A hospice is not just a building; it is a way of caring for people. Hospice care aims to improve the lives of people whose illness may not be curable. It helps people to live as actively as possible after diagnosis for the end of their lives. Hospice care helps people to live well before they die. The care is tailored to patients' individual needs and supports their friends and families, too. Your local hospice is an integral part of your community, providing essential services, including pain control, symptom relief, skilled nursing care, counselling, complementary therapies, spiritual or religious support, creative activities, physiotherapy and bereavement support. Children's hospices in Wales and across the border in England also provide essential support for children and young people in Wales with life-limiting or life-threatening conditions who are not expected to reach adulthood. Where days cannot be added to life, the hospice movement adds life to days.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I congratulate my colleague Mark Isherwood on securing this debate and raising such a key subject, and I commend him on the work that he has done on the all-party group over many years. I wish to touch on two areas that are of concern to me. The first is the transition from being designated a child in the eyes of the law to being an adult, and the problems that that causes for hospices. In my own region, I have Tŷ Hafan and Holme Tower Hospice. There is a real issue in the eyes of the law that, if someone enters a hospice when they are 17 and a half or 17 and three quarters, they do so as a child, but once they reach the age of 18, they are designated by law as being an adult. That poses massive problems

ar y cyfan, mae hosbisau yng Nghymru yn cael llai o gyllid gan y Llywodraeth fel cyfran o'r gwariant na'r rheini yn Lloegr, yr Alban neu Ogledd Iwerddon. Mae'r cyllid hefyd yn amrywio'n fawr ar draws Cymru ac yn gallu newid o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, yn amodol ar gytundebau lefel gwasanaeth gyda byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae buddsoddi mewn gofal hosbis yn gosteffeithiol, yn sicrhau bod y bobl leol yn cael cymaint o gymorth ag y bo modd, ac yn helpu'r GIG i wella'r gofal sy'n cael ei ddarparu.

Nid dim ond adeilad yw hosbis; mae'n ffordd o ofalu am bobl. Bwriad gofal hosbis yw gwella bywydau pobl nad oes modd gwella eu salwch. Mae'n helpu pobl i fyw bywydau llawn ar ôl cael gwybod bod ganddynt salwch anghueol. Mae gofal hosbis yn helpu pobl i fyw yn fodlon cyn iddynt farw. Mae'r gofal yn cael ei deilwra i anghenion pob claf yn unigol ac yn cefnogi ffrindiau a theulu'r claf hefyd. Mae eich hosbis leol yn rhan annatod o'ch cymuned, yn darparu gwasanaethau hanfodol, gan gynnwys rheoli poen, lleddfu symptomau, gofal nyrsio medrus, cwnsela, therapïau cynhwysol, cymorth ysbrydol neu grefyddol, gweithgareddau creadigol, ffisiotherapi a chymorth mewn profedigaeth. Mae hosbisau plant yng Nghymru ac ar draws y ffin yn Lloegr hefyd yn darparu cymorth hanfodol i blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru â salwch sy'n peryglu eu bywydau neu sy'n cyfyngu ar eu hoes ac nad oes disgwyl iddynt dyfu'n oedolion. Pan mae'r dyddiau'n brin, mae hosbisau'n gallu cyfoethogi'r dyddiau hynny.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Hoffwn longyfarch Mark Isherwood, fy nghyd-Aelod, am gyflwyno'r ddadl hon ac am godi pwnc mor allweddol. Rwyf yn ei ganmol am y gwaith y mae wedi'i wneud ar y grŵp hollbleidiol dros nifer o flynyddoedd. Hoffwn grybwyll dau faes sy'n peri pryder imi. Y cyntaf yw'r newid o fod yn blentyn yng ngolwg y gyfraith i fod yn oedolyn, a'r problemau y mae hynny'n ei achosi i hosbisau. Mae Tŷ Hafan a Hosbis Holme Tower ill dau wedi'u lleoli yn fy rhanbarth i. Os bydd rhywun yn mynd i hosbis pan mae'n 17 a hanner neu'n 17 a thri chwarter, mae'n mynd yno fel plentyn. Ond, pan fydd yr unigolyn hwnnw'n 18 oed, mae'n oedolyn yng ngolwg y gyfraith. Mae hynny'n broblem wirioneddol yng ngolwg y gyfraith

to Tŷ Hafan. I would be grateful if the Minister could indicate whether there have been any discussions around creating a transition stage so that this ambiguity could be cleared up.

The second area of concern is the ability to offer assistance to people who wish to have their last days, weeks and months at home, and the palliative care options that could be provided. As someone who nursed his own mother 30 years ago, entering the experience as a boy and coming out the other side a man was hugely rewarding. Obviously, I would not have chosen for my mother to pass away, but there is a postcode lottery in the service across Wales, and many people, when they have a diagnosis that informs them that they have a condition that may shorten their lives, would benefit from being able to pass away at home in the company of their loved ones. I would be grateful if the Minister could touch on that.

**William Graham:** Thank you, Mark, for bringing this debate before us today. My contribution is a good news story. The St David's Foundation in Newport is beginning a new era in opening the first day hospice in Newport for more than a decade. The much needed day hospice at Blackett Avenue in Malpas, which serves the whole of Gwent, will open its doors to patients later this month, providing treatment and palliative care for terminally ill patients.

As well as housing a chemotherapy outreach clinic, the £2.9 million centre will offer complementary therapies, art therapy, children support services, carers and bereavement groups. The foundation's chief executive remarks that it can make such a difference to people, as it is not always about medicine but about everything that patients face. As well as providing palliative care to patients across the area, the charity also helps to train district nurses and care home staff to care for terminally ill patients. The new centre will offer conference and meeting rooms where training sessions will be held.

ac yn achosi problemau enfawr i Dŷ Hafan. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog ddweud a fu unrhyw drafodaethau ynghylch creu cyfnod pontio er mwyn cael trefn ar yr amwysedd hwn.

Yr ail faes sy'n peri pryder imi yw'r gallu i gynnig cymorth i bobl sy'n dymuno treulio'u dyddiau, eu hwythnosau a'u misoedd olaf gartref, a'r opsiynau ar gyfer y gofal lliniarol y gellid ei ddarparu. Fel rhywun a nyrsiodd ei fam ei hun 30 mlynedd yn ôl, bachgen oeddwn pan ddechreuais wneud hynny, ond ar ddiwedd y cyfnod roeddwn yn ddyn. Roedd yn brofiad gwerthfawr iawn. Yn amlwg, nid oedd arnaf eisiau colli fy mam, ond ceir loteri cod post yn y gwasanaeth ar draws Cymru, a byddai llawer o bobl—pan maent yn cael gwybod bod ganddynt gyflwr a allai fyrhau eu bywydau—yn falch o gael marw gartref yng nghwmni eu hanwyliaid. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog roi ei sylwadau ynghylch hynny.

**William Graham:** Diolch, Mark, am ddod â'r ddatl hon ger ein bron heddiw. Stori newyddion da yw fy nghyfraniad i. Mae Sefydliad Dewi Sant yng Nghasnewydd yn dechrau ar gyfnod newydd wrth agor yr hosbis dydd cyntaf yng Nghasnewydd ers dros ddegawd. Ar ôl llawer o alw, bydd yr hosbis dydd hon yn Blackett Avenue ym Malpas—a fydd yn gwasanaethu Gwent i gyd—yn agor ei drysau i gleifion yn ddiweddarach yn ystod y mis, gan ddarparu triniaeth a gofal lliniarol i gleifion â salwch angheuol.

Yn ogystal â chynnig clinig cemotherapi allgymorth, bydd y ganolfan gwerth £2.9 miliwn yn cynnig therapïau cyflenwol, therapi celf, gwasanaethau cefnogi plant, a grwpiau gofalwyr a phrofedigaeth. Yn ôl prif weithredwr y sefydliad, gall y ganolfan wneud llawer iawn o wahaniaeth i bobl, gan ei bod yn rhoi sylw i bopeth y mae cleifion yn ei wynebu, nid dim ond i feddyaeth. Yn ogystal â darparu gofal lliniarol i gleifion ym mhob cwr o'r ardal, mae'r elusen hefyd yn helpu i hyfforddi nyrsys ardal a staff cartrefi gofal i ofalu am gleifion â salwch angheuol. Bydd gan y ganolfan newydd ystafelloedd ar gyfer cyfarfodydd a chynadledau, lle bydd sesiynau hyfforddi yn cael eu cynnal.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank Mark Isherwood for bringing this important subject to the Chamber today. I reiterate the points of the importance of allowing people to die in their own home, if that is what they wish. In order to do that, families and carers need a great deal of support that is timely and appropriate. There is a postcode lottery surrounding the comprehensiveness of such support, and I would be grateful if the Minister could address that in her comments this afternoon, because those who wish to die at home should have the opportunity to do so.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths):** Mark Isherwood is absolutely right in saying that facilitating access to cost-effective, high-quality palliative and end-of-life care is becoming ever more important. As a newly elected Assembly Member, in 2007, I set up and chaired the all-party hospice group, which Mark now chairs. We all recognise that life expectancy is increasing and people are living longer and, as such, their care needs are becoming more complex. It is, therefore, crucial that local health boards and hospices, working with other partners, such as social services and GPs, take a co-ordinated and multidisciplinary approach to planning and delivering a patient's care.

I believe that people have a right to die with dignity, in comfort and in the setting of their choice. For many people, as Kirsty Williams pointed out, their choice is to die at home. Well-planned and high-quality palliative and end-of-life care, especially with the increased availability of outreach and hospice-at-home services will enable this to happen. Kirsty made a point about the postcode lottery, and we need to look at that to ensure that if that is what a person chooses to do, they and their families and carers should have the support to do so.

I want to focus on the improvements we have seen in these important services. Before I do so, I would like to pay tribute to all our hospices right across Wales and the fantastic work that they carry out. I have visited

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch i Mark Isherwood am godi'r pwnc pwysig hwn yn y Siambr heddiw. Rwyf yn ategu'r pwyntiau ynghylch pwysigrwydd caniatáu i bobl farw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, os dyna yw eu dymuniad. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, mae angen i deuluoedd a gofalwyr gael llawer iawn o gefnogaeth sy'n amserol ac yn briodol. Mae loteri cod post ynghlwm wrth ehangder y gefnogaeth honno, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog roi sylw i hynny yn ei sylwadau y prynhawn yma, oherwydd dylai'r rheini sy'n dymuno marw gartref gael y cyfle i wneud hynny.

**Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths):** Mae Mark Isherwood yn llygad ei le wrth ddweud bod hwyluso mynediad at ofal lliniarol a gofal diwedd oes costeffeithiol o safon uchel yn dod yn fwy a mwy pwysig. Ar ôl imi gael fy ethol yn Aelod Cynulliad yn 2007, euthum ati i sefydlu a chadeirio'r grŵp hollbleidiol ar hosbisau, sy'n cael ei gadeirio gan Mark erbyn hyn. Mae pob un ohonom yn sylweddoli bod disgwyliad oes pobl yn cynyddu a bod pobl yn byw'n hwy. O'r herwydd, mae eu hanghenion gofal yn mynd yn fwy cymhleth. Mae'n hanfodol, felly, fod byrddau iechyd lleol a hosbisau, drwy weithio gyda phartneriaid eraill, fel gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a meddygon teulu, yn mabwysiadu dull gweithredu cydlynol ac amlddisgyblaethol i gynllunio a darparu gofal i gleifion.

Credaf fod gan bobl hawl i farw gydag urddas, yn gyfforddus, ac mewn lleoliad o'u dewis. I lawer o bobl, fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams, eu dewis yw marw gartref. Bydd gofal lliniarol a gofal diwedd oes o safon uchel sydd wedi'i gynllunio'n dda, yn enwedig gyda chynnydd yn y gwasanaethau allgymorth a hosbis yn y cartref sydd ar gael, yn galluogi hyn i ddigwydd. Soniodd Kirsty am y loteri cod post, ac mae angen inni edrych ar hynny i sicrhau, os mai dyna yw dymuniad unigolyn, ei fod ef a'i deulu a'i ofalwyr yn cael y cymorth i wneud hynny.

Rwyf am ganolbwyntio ar y gwelliannau a welwyd yn y gwasanaethau pwysig hyn. Cyn imi wneud hynny, hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'n holl hosbisau ledled Cymru ac i'r gwaith ardderchog y maent yn ei gyflawni. Rwyf

several since I was appointed Minister for health, and I always find them to be such positive places; you hear so much laughter in hospices, when you never expect to do so. In the hospices, we have dedicated and committed staff and volunteers. Mark is very right when he says that they are invariably deeply respected and loved and cherished places in their local communities.

Last year, my predecessor launched the palliative care implementation board's report 'Dying Well Matters', which covers developments in the three years since the publication of the Sugar report into palliative care services, which was published in 2008. These achievements include: seven-day working by specialist nurses providing care across Wales; consultants in palliative medicine participating in on-call rotas to provide advice to any healthcare professional at any time; the establishment of hospice-at-home services in Pembrokeshire, Ceredigion, Gwent, Gwynedd and Flintshire; initiation of public engagement using patient and carer and public feedback to check services are meeting the needs of patients; and the establishment of a part-time all-Wales post to address the issues that exist in the transition of care between paediatric and adult services for children with life-limiting conditions, which Andrew R.T. Davies mentioned in his contribution.

More recently, since I have become Minister for health, we now have what are called 'just in case' boxes being implemented across Wales, providing improved access to drugs in an emergency in the patient's home.

The clinical information programme, Canisc, went live in December 2011. All voluntary hospices are now included in the programme and clinicians are already reporting that having access to the information, particularly during emergency and out-of-hours treatment, has improved the care that they are able to provide to patients. Every patient has an individual Canisc number and all clinical

wedi ymweld ag amryw ers imi gael fy mhenodi'n Weinidog Iechyd, a byddaf bob amser yn meddwl eu bod yn llefydd cadarnhaol iawn; rydych yn clywed llawer iawn o chwerthin mewn hosbisau, ac ni fyddech yn disgwyl hynny. Yn yr hosbisau, mae gennym staff a gwirfoddolwyr ymroddedig ac ymrwymedig. Mae Mark yn llygad ei le i ddweud eu bod bob amser yn fannau sy'n cael eu parchu, eu gwerthfawrogi a'u trysori'n fawr iawn yn eu cymunedau lleol.

Y llynedd, lansiodd fy rhagflaenydd adroddiad y Bwrdd Gweithredu Gofal Lliniarol, 'Marw gydag Urddas', sy'n rhoi sylw i ddatblygiadau yn ystod y tair blynedd ers cyhoeddi adroddiad Sugar ar wasanaethau gofal lliniarol yn 2008. Mae'r cyflawniadau hyn yn cynnwys: nyrsys arbenigol sy'n darparu gofal saith diwrnod yr wythnos ledled Cymru; ymgynghorwyr ym maes meddygaeth liniarol yn cymryd rhan mewn rota ar alwad i roi cyngor i unrhyw weithiwr gofal iechyd proffesiynol ar unrhyw adeg; sefydlu gwasanaethau hosbis yn y cartref yn sir Benfro, Ceredigion, Gwent, Gwynedd a sir y Fflint; dechrau ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd gan ddefnyddio adborth cleifion, gofalwyr a'r cyhoedd i weld a yw gwasanaethau'n diwallu anghenion y cleifion; a sefydlu swydd ran-amser ar lefel Cymru gyfan i roi sylw i'r materion sy'n bodoli yn y cyfnod pontio gofal rhwng gwasanaethau pediatrig a gwasanaethau oedolion ar gyfer plant â chyflyrau sy'n cyfyngu ar eu hoes, y soniodd Andrew R.T. Davies amdanynt yn ei gyfraniad.

Yn fwy diweddar, ers imi gael fy mhenodi'n Weinidog Iechyd, rydym wrthi'n rhoi yr hyn a elwir yn flychau 'rhag ofn' ar waith ledled Cymru, gan ddarparu gwell mynediad at gyffuriau mewn argyfwng yng nghartref y claf.

Cafodd y rhaglen gwybodaeth glinigol, sef System Gwybodaeth Rhwydweithiau Canser Cymru (Canisc), ei rhoi ar waith ym mis Rhagfyr 2011. Mae pob hosbis wirfoddol wedi'i chynnwys yn y rhaglen erbyn hyn, ac mae clinigwyr eisoes yn dweud bod cael mynediad at y wybodaeth, yn enwedig yn ystod triniaethau mewn argyfwng a'r tu allan i oriau, wedi gwella'r gofal y maent yn gallu

data about patients will be held on the system. For example, if a patient is known to a team at a hospice and is admitted to hospital or seen by a specialist service out of hours, that team can access the most up-to-date information regarding that patient, which can often be vital in determining a treatment plan.

Every hospice and specialist palliative care team in Wales received funding for data clerks to ensure the success of this very important role. Each consultant has been provided with the appropriate technical equipment to access this information remotely. This will help to inform their decision making. A champion has been appointed within the voluntary sector to ensure that any obstacles to the seamless provision of this information are overcome.

A set of service standards has been developed by the palliative care implementation board to help to improve the quality of care. These standards will be issued to the NHS and its partners very shortly. Planning for peer review for palliative care services is now well advanced and implementation will begin across Wales from September.

I believe that effective partnership working is the key to success with palliative care. The third sector plays a vital role. In the past, hospices have struggled to plan their services in a sustainable way. Now, we have three-year funding agreements in place, based on an all-Wales formula, designed to fund and ensure the quality of the specialist palliative clinical care provided by our hospices. These funding agreements are reviewed and confirmed annually and are based on the previous year's progress with service development objectives. Advice is provided to the Welsh Government by the palliative care implementation board on the level and use of funding for the following financial year.

To support all of these improvements in

ei ddarparu i gleifion. Mae gan bob claf rif Canisc personol, a bydd holl ddata clinigol y cleifion yn cael eu cadw ar y system. Er enghraifft, os yw tîm mewn hosbis yn gyfarwydd â chlaf sy'n cael ei dderbyn i'r ysbyty neu'n cael ei weld gan wasanaeth arbenigol y tu allan i oriau, gall y tîm hwnnw weld y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y claf hwnnw, ac mae hynny'n aml yn gallu bod yn hollbwysig wrth benderfynu ar gynllun triniaeth.

Cafodd pob hosbis a thîm gofal lliniarol arbenigol yng Nghymru gyllid ar gyfer clerod data i sicrhau llwyddiant y rôl hollbwysig hon. Mae pob ymgynghorydd wedi cael yr offer technegol priodol i gael mynediad at y wybodaeth hon o bell. Bydd hyn yn eu helpu i wneud penderfyniadau. Mae hyrwyddwr wedi cael ei benodi yn y sector gwirfoddol i sicrhau bod unrhyw rwystrau i ddarparu'r wybodaeth hon yn ddi-dor yn cael eu goresgyn.

Mae'r Bwrdd Gweithredu Gofal Lliniarol wedi datblygu cyfres o safonau gwasanaeth er mwyn helpu i wella ansawdd gofal. Bydd y safonau hyn yn cael eu dosbarthu i'r GIG a'i bartneriaid yn fuan iawn. Mae'r gwaith cynllunio ar gyfer adolygu gwasanaethau gofal lliniarol gan gymheiriaid yn mynd rhagddo'n dda, a bydd yn dechrau cael ei roi ar waith ledled Cymru o fis Medi ymlaen.

O ran gofal lliniarol, rwyf o'r farn mai gweithio mewn partneriaeth yn effeithiol yw'r allwedd i lwyddiant. Mae'r trydydd sector yn chwarae rhan hanfodol. Yn y gorffennol, mae hosbisau wedi'i chael yn anodd cynllunio'u gwasanaethau mewn ffordd gynaliadwy. Nawr, mae gennym gytundebau cyllido tair blynedd, sy'n seiliedig ar fformiwla ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, a gynlluniwyd i gyllido ac i sicrhau ansawdd y gofal clinigol lliniarol arbenigol a ddarperir gan ein hosbisau. Mae'r cytundebau cyllido hyn yn cael eu hadolygu a'u cadarnhau'n flynyddol. Maent yn seiliedig ar gynnydd y flwyddyn flaenorol gydag amcanion datblygu gwasanaeth. Mae'r Bwrdd Gweithredu Gofal Lliniarol yn cynghori Llywodraeth Cymru ynghylch lefel y cyllid a'r modd y'i defnyddir ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol ganlynol.

I gefnogi pob un o'r gwelliannau hyn ym

palliative care, we have made £6.88 million available each year, of which approximately £2.4 million goes to hospices. The remainder of the funding is made available to local health boards to improve their local services and to support all-Wales initiatives. Looking to the future and the increasing level of demand for these key services, I recognise how important it is for services to continue to improve. They can do this by building on the success of the past few years.

The forthcoming NHS quality delivery plan for 2012-16 signals the development that, by October 2012, we will have a range of outcome indicators and performance measures designed to monitor the effectiveness of the NHS in delivering high-quality, patient-centred care, including care planning and end-of-life care. The quality delivery plan sets the context for our efforts to develop new clinically focused targets, now being called performance measures, to drive continuous improvement in the quality of care. These service or condition-specific performance measures will be published as part of our series of national delivery plans and will form the basis of the way in which we hold the NHS to account.

The palliative care implementation board is currently working with partners, including local health boards and hospices, to develop a delivery plan for palliative care services. This delivery plan will set out the outcomes we want to achieve for people who need palliative and end-of-life care. The plan will identify the outcome indicators and performance measures that we will use to measure how well the needs of individual people right across Wales are met. To guide activity, the plan will also set out key themes for action by the NHS and its partners over the period up to 2016. I expect to issue the draft delivery plan for consultation later this year.

In conclusion, there has been a significant amount of effort and achievement to celebrate in the past few years and we should

maes gofal lliniarol, rydym wedi darparu £6.88 miliwn bob blwyddyn, ac mae oddeutu £2.4 miliwn o hwnnw yn mynd i hosbisau. Mae gweddill y cyllid yn cael ei ddarparu i fyrddau iechyd lleol i wella eu gwasanaethau lleol ac i gefnogi mentrau ar lefel Cymru gyfan. Gan edrych i'r dyfodol ac ar y galw cynyddol am y gwasanaethau allweddol hyn, rwyf yn sylweddoli pa mor bwysig ydyw bod y gwasanaethau'n parhau i wella. Gallant wneud hyn drwy adeiladu ar lwyddiant y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Mae cynllun cyflawni ansawdd y GIG sydd ar y gweill ar gyfer 2012-16 yn nodi'r datblygiad y bydd gennym, erbyn mis Hydref 2012, ystod o ddangosyddion canlyniadau a mesurau perfformiad wedi'u cynllunio i fonitro effeithiolrwydd y GIG wrth ddarparu gofal o safon uchel sy'n canolbwyntio ar y claf, gan gynnwys ym maes cynllunio gofal a gofal diwedd oes. Mae'r cynllun cyflawni ansawdd yn gosod y cyd-destun ar gyfer ein hymdrechion i ddatblygu targedau newydd clinigol eu ffocws, a elwir yn awr yn fesurau perfformiad, i hybu gwelliant parhaus yn ansawdd y gofal. Bydd y mesurau perfformiad hyn sy'n benodol i'r cyflwr neu'r gwasanaeth yn cael eu cyhoeddi fel rhan o'n cyfres o gynlluniau cyflenwi cenedlaethol, a byddant yn sail i'r modd rydym yn dal y GIG yn gyfrifol.

Mae'r Bwrdd Gweithredu Gofal Lliniarol wrthi'n gweithio gyda phartneriaid, gan gynnwys byrddau iechyd lleol a hosbisau, i ddatblygu cynllun cyflawni ar gyfer gwasanaethau gofal lliniarol. Bydd y cynllun cyflawni hwn yn nodi'r canlyniadau rydym am eu sicrhau i bobl sydd angen gofal lliniarol a gofal diwedd oes. Bydd y cynllun yn nodi'r dangosyddion canlyniadau a'r mesurau perfformiad y byddwn yn eu defnyddio i fesur i ba raddau y mae anghenion unigol pobl ledled Cymru yn cael eu diwallu. I arwain y gweithgareddau, bydd y cynllun hefyd yn nodi themâu allweddol i'r GIG a'i bartneriaid weithredu arnynt hyd at 2016. Rwyf yn gobeithio cyhoeddi fersiwn ddrafft y cynllun cyflawni er mwyn ymgynghori arno yn ddiweddarach eleni.

I gloi, bu cryn dipyn o ymdrechion a llwyddiannau i'w dathlu yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a dylem gydnabod



acknowledge this. This means that we have a strong base on which to build in order to work in a co-ordinated way to plan and deliver palliative and end-of-life services to meet the future needs of the people of Wales.

hyn. Mae hyn yn golygu bod gennym sylfaen gref i adeiladu arni er mwyn gweithio mewn ffordd gydlynol i gynllunio a darparu gwasanaethau lliniarol a diwedd oes a fydd yn diwallu anghenion pobl Cymru yn y dyfodol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Minister. That concludes today's business.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch, Weinidog. Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.59 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.59 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Antoni, Mick (Llafur – Labour)  
 Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Byron (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Keith (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Suzy (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Drakeford, Mark (Llafur – Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Rebecca (Llafur – Labour)  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 George, Russell (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gething, Vaughan (Llafur – Labour)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hedges, Mike (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Julie (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Julie (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Parrott, Eluned (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Powell, William (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Price, Gwyn R. (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Rathbone, Jenny (Llafur – Labour)

Rees, David (Llafur – Labour)  
Roberts, Aled (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Sandbach, Antoinette (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Skates, Kenneth (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Simon (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
Whittle, Lindsay (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)